Volume XXXII
Number 1
1990

Anthropologica

FEATURE ARTICLES

Editorial Policy

Open to contributors from Canada and abroad, *Anthropologica* publishes, in French and English, articles and reviews in all areas of cultural and social anthropology. All manuscripts are refereed anonymously by two reviewers.

Politique éditoriale

La revue *Anthropologica* publie, en français et en anglais, des articles et comptes rendus produits par des chercheurs canadiens and étrangers oeuvrant dans les divers domaines de l'étude académique de l'anthropologie culturelle et sociale. Chaque manuscrit est soumis pour évaluation à deux lecteurs anonymes.

Anthropologica **ISSN 0003-5459**

Published at Wilfrid Laurier University Press, Waterloo, Ontario
Publiée à Wilfrid Laurier University Press, Waterloo, Ontario.
Published with the assistance of Wilfrid Laurier University.
Publiée avec l'aide de l'Université Wilfrid Laurier.

Printed in Canada / Imprimé au Canada.
This journal has been produced from a manuscript supplied in electronic form by the editors. / Cette revue a été produite d'un manuscrit en forme électronique fournit par les rédacteurs.

ANTHROPOLOGICA

Volume XXXII, No. 1, 1990

CONTENTS / SOMMAIRE

BOOK REVIEWS / COMPTES RENDUS

DEFORESTATION IN A GHANAIAN RURAL COMMUNITY

George S. Dei
University of Windsor

Abstract: The case study examines the processes of deforestation in a Ghanaian rural community. The paper discusses the interrelated socio-economic, political, ecological and historical factors that account for the problem of deforestation. It is argued that knowledge of such micro-level processes of tree cutting in rural communities today may perhaps help provide some understanding or insights into the problem of deforestation and guide the search for its general solutions.

Résumé: Cette étude de cas examine le processus de déboisement dans une communauté rurale du Ghana. Elle discute les facteurs socio-économiques, politiques, écologiques et historiques—ainsi que leurs interactions—qui expliquent le problème de déboisement.

Introduction

The importance of the tropical rainforests cannot be overemphasized. They turn carbon dioxide (a greenhouse gas) back into oxygen, thereby cooling the atmosphere. They prevent flooding by supplying enough plant life to soak up heavy rain, and the roots of forest trees hold the soil in one spot. Forest plants are also invaluable for their medicinal and pharmacological uses (Burley and Styles 1976; Longman 1974). Consequently, deforestation has become one of the major environmental problems confronting humankind today (Caufield 1986; Adams and Solomon 1985).

A disproportional amount of the blame for deforestation has been heaped on the poor rural farmers of developing countries. But it is important to stress that deforestation is rooted in interrelated socio-economic, political and historical developments with both external and internal linkages that began with colonialism and the development of cash crop export economies in most developing countries (Ellis 1987). To the extent that many traditional communities in Africa, Asia and Latin America managed their forests well before the advent of colonialists, one can safely argue that the wanton de-

Anthropologica XXXII (1990) 3-27

struction of the forest is a relatively modern phenomenon (Brokensha et al. 1980). In Australia, the forest survived the Aborigines. It is in the last two hundred years that white settlers have cleared two-thirds of *native* forests. In India and in most of East and West Africa, local people conserved their trees over generations until the British started exploiting them for commercial purposes.[1]

The introduction of cash cropping on a massive scale in colonial West Africa, and particularly in the modern Sahel, resulted in the gradual degradation of the forest environment (Franke and Chasin 1980; Grainger 1982; Timberlake 1985). These external forces are still at work today, this time through the activities of largely multinational corporations. The situation has been worsened by the corruption and incompetence of some state governments of the developing world. National development policy goals fail to protect the poor and their environments from any undue *external* encroachments. The current trends in deforestation can partly be attributed to the expansion of industry geared to exports as developing nations boost their resource industries such as logging and mining. As industrial development and projects proceed, the need for more dams to supply power also increases.

In South and Central America, people are turning the forests into pasture on a large scale to supply a major export market for beef (Maguire and Brown 1986; Sinclair 1986). This large-scale, capital-intensive agriculture for the production of cash (export) crops, dominated by multinational corporations and governments, has been a fundamental cause of the destruction of the Amazon forest. The motivations for forest exploitation are the production of beef cattle, hardwood and pulp for export, as well as the construction of large-scale hydro-electric dams for power supply, as in Brazil. The creation of the dams has resulted in the total flooding of thousands of acres of former forest land.[2] A serious problem associated with the clearing and flooding of the forest (as a policy of national economic development) for the poor rural farmers is soil erosion. The use of heavy technology strips the land of its ability to nourish other plants and the local soils are left open to serious erosion.[3] As the debt crisis worsens for these countries, governments continue to use all available national assets, including forest resources. Unfortunately, the hard-earned foreign currency is barely enough to service the interest on these debts and to pay for the overpriced manufactured products that they must import from the industrialized countries.

A similar situation exists in parts of Africa. It has been estimated that the continent loses about 2.7 million hectares of forest every year (Timberlake 1985; FAO 1967). Since the 1950s, the Sahel has lost nearly 50 percent of its forests. Among the major reasons for tree cutting in the Sudan-Sahel region are the logging of timber for export, clearing the land for agricultural

purposes, grazing land for livestock, and the provision of fuelwood and other basic household necessities. Nearly 90 percent of the Sahelian population utilizes wood as fuel to satisfy energy requirements and for cooking purposes (Timberlake 1985; Weber 1981; Foley et al. 1984). Other basic household uses for forest trees include constructing house poles, handles for hoes, ploughs and fibre for ropes. Given the differing cultures and micro-ecological variations in the forest regions of the developing world, perhaps micro-level examinations of the processes and the mechanisms involved in tree cutting may help to guide any general and concerted efforts at finding solutions to the problem of deforestation.

The Study Community

This case study was conducted as part of a major research project in Ghana, during which the author examined the adaptive responses of the people of Ayirebi to seasonal food supply cycles, as well as to the general crisis in the national economy in the 1980s. Ayirebi is a food farming community of about 5805 people[4] who are predominantly Twi-speaking belonging to the matrilineal Akan sub-group known as the Akyem. It is located in southeastern Ghana, about 45 km from the nearest urban centre, Akyem Oda, and nearly 180 km north of the Ghanaian capital, Accra. The town covers an area of approximately one and three-quarter square kilometres. The community lacks electricity and a piped water supply. The common source of fuel and power is firewood in addition to kerosene that is used for lamps and lanterns. The water supply comes from local streams, wells and rainfall. The Ayirebi district is basically a moist, semi-deciduous forest zone consisting of moderately-grouped lofty trees (about 60 m in average height) with a matted undergrowth (Manoukian 1964; Hall and Swaine 1981). Within this forest region, trees occupy either the lower or the upper storey. Those in the lower storey are usually evergreen, while the taller members of the same species in the higher storey may be deciduous. The latter group of trees exhibit their deciduous characteristics during the long dry season from November to March. Scholars have commented on the sheer mass or variety of the vegetal and animal resources available in this forest region (Irvine 1961; Wills 1962). It is important to point out, however, that such prolonged human activities as felling trees for timber, clearing land and burning trees for agricultural purposes, and the introduction of new plants have caused great changes in the structure and composition of the climate-climax vegetation of the region. The result is that less than 30 percent of the primary forest remains, and most of what is left is actually secondary forest. This secondary vegetation consists of climbers, shrubs and soft woody plants. The areas of true forest are to be found in the forest reserves where cultiva-

tion and indiscriminate extraction of timber are forbidden by the national government (Boateng 1959).

The two major soil types in the Ayirebi district are forest ochrosols and forest oxysols (Ahn 1970). Forest ochrosols are predominant and have developed from highly-weathered parent materials under reduced amounts of rainfall. Unlike the forest oxysols which are highly leached, yellowish, very acidic and nutrient-poor, the forest ochrosols are less leached, reddish, slightly acid to neutral and better supplied with nutrients (Hall and Swaine 1981). Generally, these local soils are light and sandy, and thus easily cultivated. However, they are poor and rapidly lose their rich organic matter (leaves, animal matter) and are liable to damage by rains unless they are efficiently manured, cultivated, drained, and mulched.

Nearly 90 percent of the town's adult population depend directly on farming for their livelihood, producing both subsistence and cash crops. As food farmers, they produce such staple crops as plantains, manioc, maize, cocoyams, rice, and green leafy vegetables (tomatoes, pepper, okra, onions, garden eggs or eggplant), as well as citrus fruits and tree crops such as cocoa, kola nut and oil palm. Unlike other food crops, the production of vegetables has been on a much smaller scale, intended for household and local consumption. Other economic activities engaged in by the people include hunting and gathering of wild forest resources, raising of livestock, and the production of arts and crafts. The traditional subsistence economy is articulated with the national market economy through the sale of food crops and wage labour in the major Ghanaian urban centres of Akyem Oda, Akyem Swedru, Koforidua and Accra, as well as through the production of cash crops (kola nuts, oil palm and cocoa).

There are four major identifiable climatological and ecological periods in this community (Dei in press). There is a main dry season between January and March when the farming season begins with preparation of the farm fields (i.e., cutting trees, burning and tilling of farm land). The mean monthly rainfall during this time is less than 100 mm. It is followed by the main rainy season from April to June when farming activities continue with the sowing of seeds and crop planting. The heaviest rains fall in June. The period between July and September marks the pre-harvest, lean season devoted to weeding farm fields and attending to crops. There are two brief intermediate climatic seasons during this period. July and August bring low rainfall and moderate dry conditions, while September and October mark the beginning of the second rains. The main harvest season, October to December, witnesses the beginning of the dry conditions that continue and intensify through March. The intense dry period is locally referred to as the *harmattan*[5] period. Until the late 1970s (Dei 1988) annual rainfall in Ayirebi averaged over 1650 mm.[6] The most characteristic feature about the

climate of this region (as in Ghana generally) is humidity. The average relative humidity for the Ayirebi zone is between 85 and 90 percent. Temperature variation is slight. The mean monthly maximum temperature in the hottest months (February-March) ranges from thirty-one to thirty-three degrees Celsius, while the mean monthly minimum in the coldest months (December-January and August) ranges from nineteen to twenty-two degrees Celsius (Hall and Swaine 1981).

With regard to the traditional structures of food production, ideally the individual household, made up of a man, wife, children, and one or two members of a spouse's kinfolk, constitute the basic production unit. This group could form either the sole production unit occupying a house or compound, or part of a large group occupying a compound. In the latter instance, the compound would be subdivided into a number of separate (and independent) production units. It was also possible for a large group, organized around a segment of the matrilineage (an elder woman and her sister or daughters; or a man and his sister's children), to be the sole production unit within the compound or dwelling (Dei 1986; Hill 1975).

Members of the household share farming activities, working together on the farmland acquired either through the matrilineage and/or the custodian of the stool (i.e., village chief or sub-chief) or through the individual's personal effort (i.e., outright purchase) (Dei 1987). During periods of major economic importance (e.g., preparation of the land for farming, or harvesting of farm produce) when agricultural work intensifies, households may request the assistance of available extended family labour. Other "external" sources of labour available to the household production unit include seasonal migrants from the northern parts of the country and casual wage labour provided by the town youth. There is also the formation of such partnerships as *nnoboa*, collective self-help groups of age-mates helping each other in farming activities (Arhin 1983). The adult males perform the task of clearing the forest and preparing the land for farming. Women, the young and the elderly in the households do the planting and harvesting of crops, occasionally receiving some assistance from the adult males. The principal methods of farming are shifting cultivation on bush farms, and intensive cultivation in the gardens and farm plots closer to the homesteads.

Contemporary Adaptation and the Forest Vegetation

Farming activities in Ayirebi are largely devoted to the production of food crops for household consumption as well as the local market and the wider Ghanaian market. Historically, the cultivation of non-food cash crops such as cocoa has been relatively unsuccessful in the community. Among the factors accounting for this development are ecological problems (drought,

bushfires, soil erosion), diseases (such as swollen shoot), the problem of agricultural labour, and the failure of successive Ghanaian governments to provide adequate incentives to cocoa farmers (Senyah 1984). Moreover, because of the declining revenues of Ghanaian cocoa farmers, individual attempts have been made by the few cocoa producers of Ayirebi to devote the land to the cultivation of foodstuffs for both domestic and commercial purposes (Atsu 1984).[7] Cocoa production in the past was a major reason for extensive tree cutting in the forest zones of southern Ghana.

Ayirebi farmers, using a wide variety of farm methods and other food procurement systems, have successfully adapted to short and long term environmental problems as well as socio-economic forces in southeastern Ghana (Dei 1988, 1990). The resourcefulness and creativity of the farmers is worth emphasizing (Gadgil 1985, 1987). Cultural appraisal of natural resources (i.e., the ethno-ecological or practical knowledge of soils, topography, climate) has allowed the farmers to overcome the difficulties posed by the environment (e.g., humidity, poor soils, weeds, lack of rainfall, pests) on the one hand and to exploit the fullest potential of the environment on the other (Richards 1985; Brokensha et al. 1980; Osunade 1988). Farming methods are well adapted to the social and geographical environments in the region. The farmers do, however, have special problems to contend with relating to soil fertility. Specifically, these include the presence of light soils, relatively low in plant nutrients, that quickly lose their fertility through leaching and rapid oxidation, and the fact that torrential rains tend to carry essential minerals down to the subsoil, out of reach of the growing plants. The two basic elements in the local farming system, the protection of the ground surface and a long fallow period (and to some extent the use of manures), have been designed to deal with these problems (Jones 1961; Brokensha et al. 1980; Glaeser 1984; Richards 1986).

The partial clearing of the natural cover on proposed plots, whereby some forest trees are left standing, serves to provide shade and protection to the soil and to assist re-forestation. As farm plots in the community generally tend to be small and isolated fields, they are easily recaptured by natural vegetation. Farming is characterized by mixed and sequential cropping (Ruthenberg 1980; Dei 1990a). The goal is to maintain constant vegetative cover over the soil so as to reduce the damage of rain and sun. Also by allowing for a long fallow period, the bush is helped to produce its own fertilizer in the form of dead leaves, grass, plant roots, branches and other organic material which decompose (decay) in and on the soil. These materials increase the soil's organic matter, which in turn has a net effect on soil fertility.

Under the traditional system of bush fallow, a plot of land is cropped for at most two years and then allowed to return to bush for a period ranging

from three to ten years (depending on the amount of farmland available to the farmer), after which it is cultivated again. Since the early 1960s the growing subsistence needs of an increasing population, and the requirements of external markets have called for the gradual expansion of the local food economy. With regard to spatial organization of land use, Ayirebi farmers are moving from the lands of permanent cultivation and intensive fallow systems into the fields of bush and extensive shifting cultivation. When idle or virgin lands are not put into cultivation, fallow periods are being shortened. As the length of the fallow period becomes insufficient for the forest vegetation to regenerate itself, local farmers have had to rely on constant manuring to sustain the fertility of their fields of permanent tillage or intensive cultivation. On such fields, certain local farmers are now attempting to replace the nutrients removed by cultivated plants by incorporating crop residues into the soil, using manure, fertilizer, and compost of animal and occasionally human excreta or refuse.

An equally important feature of the farming system, and particularly of bush fallow, is the use of fire for clearing vegetation. Among the criticisms of bush burning is that nitrogen and sulphur in the fallow litter are lost in the burning process, and that the practice builds up fire-tolerant, low-productive species and causes soil erosion (Wilde 1966). Burning also exposes the soil to the detrimental effects of the sun and torrential rains until the first crop forms an effective protective cover. After the burning, the farm plot is still uneven, with tree stumps, roots and termite mounds. As the farmers till the land, they disturb, loosen and move small amounts of surface soil before the actual seed planting takes place (Spencer 1966). They also clear any unwanted tree stumps or other weeds that may appear to cause unnecessary harm to a germinating food plant. The danger of soil erosion can be profound when the soil structure is greatly disturbed by either the use of plough or the extensive uprooting of tree stumps.

Most of the cultivated food crops are annuals, and farm plots have to be prepared afresh every year using the traditional farm implements of *sekan* (machete), *aso* (hoe), *abonua* (steel axe), *akuma* (pick-axe or mattock) and *soso* (digging stick or long blade) to cut the forest and/or clear the vegetation. Traditionally, most of these implements have been obtained from local blacksmiths known as *tumfuo* (Ahrin 1983). A survey of food farm plots owned by sampled Ayirebi populations showed an average farming household to have between two and three separate farms. The study also showed household differentiation in the size of farm plots. For example, of the total of 412 research sample households, representing one-quarter of all Ayirebi households in 1982-83, 124 (i.e., 30%) households each had between 0-3 hectares of food farm plots; 140 households (i.e., 34%) had 3-6 hectares; 86 households (i.e., 20.9%) had 6-9 hectares; 41 households (i.e., 10%) had

9-12 hectares; and 21 households (i.e., 5.1%) had over 12 hectares (Dei 1987).[8] Apart from individual household farm plots, the research period witnessed the establishment of a number of communal and co-operative farms. This was one of the local measures to combat the effects of the drought and bush fires on the local food economy (see Dei 1988). Much of the forest vegetation had to be cleared for these relatively large-sized farms with an average size of about 3 hectares. In one study of the communal rice farm plot cultivated by the women in one section of the community (Zongo ward), at least 12 large and tall trees had to be cut using a bulldozer and a chain-saw rented from a private co-operative firm in Akyem Oda.

There is a gradual encroachment on the small amount of virgin forest left in the Ayirebi-Akyem Oda district. The encroachment cannot, however, be attributed solely to agricultural purposes. The noted trend towards deforestation in the recent decade has become an important issue of concern for the local leadership. In March 1982, the Ayirebi chief instructed the Town Development Committee (TDC) and the Committee for the Defence of the Revolution (CDR) to keep track of major tree-cutting activities in the community.[9] Other factors accounting for tree cutting in Ayirebi include logging for timber, cutting trees for firewood both to satisfy basic household requirements including arts and crafts, and for construction of a road. The latter is a project initiated by the Ghanaian government in the late 1970s and now under joint management with a major private road construction firm. It is aimed at transforming the existing dirt road into a bituminized trunk road linking Akyem Oda, Ayirebi and Nkawkaw, another major urban centre.

Table 1 presents data regarding tree-cutting in Ayirebi between September 1982 and August 1983. Corresponding data for the fall of 1989 show that in September, 6 trees were cut, 11 were cut in October, 15 in November and 12 in December.The data refers to large trees with an average height of about 60 metres felled by chain saw, axe or bulldozer. These were cases reported by the Town Development Committee as well as those which came to this researcher's attention during the study period. Appendix 1 contains a listing of some of the trees found in the Ayirebi community. The most common woods are *papaonua* (*Afzelia bella*), *odwen* (*Baphia nitida*), *mfia* (Rattan, *Calamus deeratus*), *onyina* (Kapot, *Ceiba petandra*), *odum* (*Chlorophora excelsa*), *sapele* (*Entandrophragma cylindericum*), *fruntum* (*Funtumia elastica*), *anyanyanfrowa* (*Mallotus oppositifolius*), *odwuma* (*Musanga smithii*), *ofram* (*Terminalia superba*), *sofo* (gum tree, *Sterculia tragacantha*), *wawabima* (*Sterculia rhinopetala*) and *wawa* (*Triplochiton scleroxylon*) (see also Irvine, 1961).

Table 2 gives a breakdown regarding those responsible for the tree-cutting data presented in Table 1. The data show that 41.7 percent (63 out of 151 trees) of the cuttings in the Ayirebi forest in 1982-83 were attributable

Table 1
Tree Cutting in Ayirebi, 1982-83

Month	No. of Trees Cut
September 1982	7
October 1982	12
November 1982	25
December 1982	11
January 1983	13
February 1983	23
March 1983	21
April 1983	9
May 1983	6
June 1983	3
July 1983	12
August 1983	9
Total	151
Mean	12.6

Table 2
Responsibility for Tree Cutting in Ayirebi, 1982-83

Agent(s)	No. of Trees Cut	% of Total (151)
Local farmers and farming activities	40	26.5
Road construction firm	27	17.9
State and private-owned logging firm	36	23.8
Town returnees from Nigeria	19	12.6
Other – includes individual sale and purchase of trees	29	19.2
Total	151	100

to the activities of state and private firms (i.e., as a result of logging and road construction activities). The breakdown of the data with regard to the 44 trees cut in the fall of 1989 also shows that local farmers and farming activities were responsible for cutting down 18 trees (40.9%), that logging firms cut down 17 (38.6%) and that individual sale or purchase of trees (for woodcarving, charcoal and firewood) accounted for the remaining 9 (20.5%). In 1989, the private road construction firm had suspended its activities. In Table 3 data are presented in terms of the ownership or type of the land on which these trees were cut. The data shows that the majority, 70.9 percent (i.e., 107 of 151), of the trees cut came from communal lands (i.e.,

lineage and the stool land entrusted to the local chief and elders). This is supported by the data for 1989 which shows that 20 (45.5%) were on lineage land, 12 (27.3%) were on stool land, 9 (20.4%) were on land acquired by outright purchase, and 3 (6.8%) were on rental land, including tenancies, leases and mortgaged lands (see Dei 1987 and forthcoming). The forest environment of Ayirebi and its surrounding communities has supplied a steady amount of timber for the four privately owned saw mills at Akyem Oda. The logging company pays royalties for its trees to the landowners. These owners are usually the local chief as custodian of stool land, lineage heads as caretakers of lineage lands, individual landowners in the community, and absentee landlords. The payment for a tree ranged from ₵150 to ₵250 in 1982-83 to between ₵1000 and ₵1500 in 1989[10] depending on its size. The timber is processed into sawn timber, plywood and paper, primarily for export and also for the wider Ghanaian market.[11]

Table 3
Type or Ownership of Land Regarding Tree Cutting in Ayirebi, 1982-83

Type/Ownership	No. of Trees Cut	% of Total (151)
Lineage	72	47.7
Stool	35	23.2
Outright purchase	29	19.2
Rent (includes tenancy, lease and mortgaged lands)	15	9.9
Total	151	100

Plantation agriculture in the form of state cocoa and oil palm plantations exists in the Akyem Oda district. Only a handful (less than 100) Ayirebi residents have gained employment as agricultural workers with these state farms. In 1983 and in 1989, there was talk of the government acquiring a portion of land in the Ayirebi zone in future years to expand its farms. Should this happen, the necessity to clear vegetation will lead to a further loss of trees. The history of state farms in Ghana reveals a great deal of mismanagement and corruption which have led to the farms suffering huge losses. At the same time these farms have not benefitted the rural poor majority in any substantial way (Atsu 1984). The state oil palm plantation in the Akyem Oda district has, however, encouraged some Ayirebi farmers to embark upon the cultivation of this cash crop in the 1980s. In 1982 and 1983 a total of 25 Ayirebi residents were noted to have cleared a combined area of about 16 hectares for the planting of oil palm trees. Among a sample of 450 farming households in 1989, 22 (4.9%) had established oil palm

fields with an average size of one hectare. Like cocoa farming which was gradually re-emerging in the town in 1989, the land for such cash tree-cropping was obtained by outright purchase and through the lineage. Unlike food-farming, tree-cropping tends to exacerbate the problem of deforestation since all trees have to be cut from the land (see also Dei forthcoming).

In early 1983, 298 Ayirebi citizens (representing 7 percent of the town's population) returned to the community as a result of the Nigerian government's deportation of nearly 1.2 million Ghanaian illegal residents. The returnees brought 10 chain-saws as part of the booty acquired while in Nigeria. These machines assisted in the farming activities insofar as their owners used them to clear the vegetation on the new lands acquired, which had been granted to them by the wider community in order to assist in their resettlement and rehabilitation efforts. The chain-saws were also available on a for-hire basis to local farmers and were utilized by the absentee landlords in particular to bring additional lands under cultivation. The fee for cutting a tree ranged from ₵60 to ₵150 in addition to the cost of fuel. In 1989, only 3 of the chain-saws used by the community were functioning.

The sale of trees to local artisans (e.g., woodcarvers, carpenters, trappers and other craftsmen and women), as well as to traders or sellers of burnt charcoal and wood as firewood is another feature of the local economy. There was a marked resurgence in arts and crafts, particularly among the male population, during the study period. The surrounding forest environment provided enough raw materials that could be exploited to produce a wide variety of handicrafts sold on the local and external markets. Appendix 1 provides a list of the varied uses of forest plants in the community other than for food and medicinal purposes. It shows how the local people utilized the raw materials available in their immediate environment (Dei in press). The observed local handicrafts included blacksmithing, basket-weaving, straw-work and barkcloth-making, woodcarving, mud-brick and tile-making. These were viable economic opportunities that enabled the practitioners who usually worked part-time to supplement their household cash income. The importance of blacksmiths in the community has increased in the past decade because of the absence from the local market of ready imports of such farm implements as machetes, knives, and axes. Local blacksmiths are relied upon to produce these implements. They accept old farm implements back from the local farmers and reforge them for recycling (Posnansky 1980). Their work, like tin-smithing, is heavily dependent upon the use of wood and burnt charcoal. In 1982-83 hoes and machetes that were being recycled in the community sold for ₵30 and ₵25 respectively. Woodcarving, like blacksmithing and tin-smithing, tends to be a specialized activity. Among the products of woodcarvers are mortars and household furniture (stools, chairs and tables). A medium-size wooden mor-

tar sells for ₵75, while a child's stool or chair cost ₵5 and a table, ₵20. Information obtained from some local artisans reveal that the average estimates of the yearly income derived solely from these part-time economic activities in 1982 are ₵1000 for the basket weaver; ₵3000 for a blacksmith, a tin-smith or bricklayer; and ₵2500 for the woodcarver (Dei 1986). Corresponding figures for 1989 are basket weaver, ₵6 000; blacksmith, tin-smith or bricklayer, ₵13 000; and woodcarver, ₵11 000.

Table 4
A Householder's Search for Firewood

Female Householder	Age	Household size	Time of Travel (approx. hr.)	Total Distance of Travel (approx. km)
1	42	5	3	1.5
2	15	8	2.5	5
3	10	3	2.5	4
4	65	6	4	5
5	43	5	4	5
6	64	6	2.5	1.5
7	71	8	4	5
8	12	2	4.5	4.5
9	12	5	3	3
10	21	3	5	3.5
Total	355	51	35	38
Mean	35.5	5.1	3.5	3.8

The selling of wood and burnt charcoal is an important source of income to Ayirebi women in particular. During the research period, there was a count of 24 and 5 Bedford trucks in 1982-83 and 1989 respectively, coming to the town to cart firewood and charcoal for sale in the Ghanaian urban centres and towns. Some Ayirebi residents act as brokers and women between the tree cutters and the wood and charcoal dealers in the cities and towns. As these activities intensify together with the other noted reasons for tree cutting, fewer trees will remain to provide the poor rural farmers with their only energy source, firewood. Today, energy shortage is a problem faced by many rural peoples of West Africa (Weber 1981; Morgan and Moss 1984). In Ayirebi, the problem, though not yet acute, is reflected in the data in Table 4. A detailed study of the total distance and time of travel (to and from) in search of a day's firewood was conducted among 10 females selected from 10 Ayirebi households. The data show that an extensive distance and amount of travel time is required to satisfy the firewood needs of the average household. Household heads were unanimous in point-

ing out that in the past a day's firewood could be obtained within a few minutes walk (less than 1 km) from the house or compound. Today, as firewood becomes scarce, most landowners are vehemently protesting (some even laying charges before the local polity) about the activities of firewood collectors on their farms.

Discussion

The knowledge of local processes and dynamics of sustainable forestry is essential if forest resource conservation is to become an integral part of a wider sustainable development agenda in the developing world. It is important that we gain an understanding of the strategies of forest resource exploitation and utilization before changes are introduced to improve upon the contemporary adaptation of local communities (Vayda, Colfer and Brotoksumo 1985). These communities cannot be expected to put an end to the use of firewood as the major source of household energy supply unless suitable and affordable alternatives are readily available. Similarly, if the tree-cutting activities of local artisans are to be halted, there ought to be the development of other income-generating sources for the tree cutters. The state and the wider international community must also regard trees as producers of food, shelter, fodder and firewood rather than as money-spinning cash crops.[12] What is needed is sustainable forestry, the development of community forestry projects which help people meet their needs directly without devastating the environment (Sachs 1978; Winterbottom and Hazelwood 1987; WCED 1987; FAO 1981; Carpenter 1984).

In the face of contemporary economic and ecological pressures (Dei 1986, 1988) the Ayirebi community is searching for alternative techniques and strategies to promote the judicious use of the remaining forest lands. There is an increased awareness in the community of the deleterious effects of tree cutting. The local polity and the various town committees and bodies (e.g., church and women's groups) have intensified education efforts on the judicious use of the local forest and the consequences of tree cutting. A local ban on the indiscriminate cutting of major trees and setting of bush fires in order to hunt game (Dei 1989) was in effect in mid-July 1983. Those who violated the ban were liable to a ₵500 fine and community service. Official government assistance for local educational efforts has been slow in reaching the people. While the government's appeal to all Ghanaian residents to join in a tree-planting exercise had caught the interest of some local residents as far back as 1984, the community still awaits the nursery tree stocks that were to be raised by the Ghana Forest Commission, and the information about what to plant, where and when. Among the more recent local initiatives of 1988-89 is the decision by the Town Development Com-

mittee (TDC) and the local Committee for the Defence of the Revolution (CDR) to study an idea for the development of a community forest reserve and woodlot project from land to be provided by the local polity. There are also some discussions about regulating commercial felling of trees and farming in the community forest reserves and about requiring that logging firms adopt tree planting as part of their activities in the area.

There is evidence that in some rural communities of the developing world (e.g., India), the indigenous peoples are capitalizing on their traditions of sustainable forestry. Trees are used to meet the basic needs of the poor by working within ecological constraints (Twose 1984; Winterbottom and Hazelwood 1987; WCED 1987). The reallocation or redistribution of land to the poor so that they can plant and manage their own trees once more is a positive sign. However, tree planting involves more than the mere planting of trees. Its success in terms of fostering sustainable development would depend on the consideration of some crucial factors. These include planting the right tree species (i.e., ecologically adaptable species) by the right people (i.e., women and others so identified as the pivot of the domestic farming economy) during the right period (i.e., the beginning of the cropping season), and in the right places (i.e., on the intensively cultivated plots which have suffered the most from repeated tree cutting) (Skutch 1983).

While the rural communities of the developing world take local initiatives to redress the problems of deforestation, it is important that the governments and citizens of the industrial world, as well as development and aid agencies, make concerted efforts to become part of the solution to the problem. Such steps as using fewer trees by recycling paper and other waste and opposing development projects that are not socially and environmentally sound are but a few of the contributions that the industrial world can make. At the global level there is informed consent on what the ultimate devastation of the rainforest will mean. It is predicted that there will be floods of unprecedented severity with large losses of human life and property as well as plant and animal resources. Specific grim assessments include droughts, starvation and destructive climatic change. The *greenhouse* warming effect resulting from the addition of carbon dioxide into the atmosphere is a matter of increasing concern to the industrialized world today. The lesson here is that the industrial community cannot escape the consequences or effects of events in small and distant rural communities of the developing world.

Acknowledgments

This paper is based on part of the material collected in Ghana in 1982 and 1983 for my doctoral dissertation in Anthropology at the University of Toronto, and a 1989 SSHRC post-doctoral study. For those sections of my dissertation which appear in this paper, I am thankful for the comments and criticisms of Professors Richard Lee and Maxine Kleindienst, co-supervisors of my Ph.D. program, and professor Alejandro Rojas of the Faculty of Environmental Studies, York University. I would also like to acknowledge the specialist assistance given me in this study by Mr. D.K. Abbiw of the Botany Department, University of Ghana, Legon and Messrs. C.K. Manu and N.K. Ankudey of the Ghana Forest Commission, Accra, Ghana. I am particularly grateful to the chief and people of Ayirebi, near Akyem Oda, in southeastern Ghana, for granting me permission to conduct this study. I am thankful for the financial support received for this study from the University of Toronto, the University of Windsor, and the Social Science Research and Humanities Council of Canada.

Appendix 1
Household Uses of Ayirebi Forest Plants

Scientific Name	Local Name	Comment
A. Fibre and Fibre-Working		
Plants used as fibre:		
Baphia nitida	odwen	rope-making and binding material
Bombax buonopozense	akonkodie	root bark used as wads for guns; also floss for pillows
Calamus deeratus	mfia	rope-making and building material
Canthium hispidium	ogyapam	used in making baskets
Carapa procera	kwakuobese	serves as chewstick
Carpolobia lutea	ofewa	”
Ceiba pentandra	onyina	produces floss for pillows
Chlorophora excelsa	odum	fibre
Cocus nucifera	kube	root fibre used in the making of mats and brooms
Cola gigantea	watapuo	bast fibre
Craterispermum caudatum	duade	serves as chewsticks
Dialium guineënsis	asenaa	”
Diospyros heudelotii	omenewabene	”

Elaeis guineënsis	abe	used as fibre for snares and in making brushes and brooms
Funtumia africana	okae	produces floss for pillows
Funtumia elastica	fruntum	”
Garcinia kola	tweapia	roots used as chewstick
Glyphaea brevis	foto	used for rope making and chewsticks
Grewia mollis	kyapotoro	fibre used as sponge for washing
Griffonia simplicfolia	kegya	used as chewsticks
Hymenostegia afzelli	takorowa	”
Landolphia owariensis	abontere	”
Mallotus oppositifolius	anyanyanfrowa	”
Monodora tenuifolia	motokuradua	binding material
Napoleona vogelii	obua	used as chewsticks.
Raphia hookeri	adobe	making brooms, hats, mats and ropes
Rothmannia longiflora	samankube	used as chewsticks
Sphenocentrum jollyanum	kraman-kote	”
Sterculia tragacantha	sofo	bast fibre

B. General House Construction Purposes

For use in house construction
(e.g., house post, fences, hut poles, and roofing purposes):

Afzelia bella	papaonua	used as planks for house construction, and for some household furniture
Albizia adianthifolia	pampena	used as rafters
Albizia zygia	okoro	general purpose in house construction
Baphia nitida	odwen	for the construction of house posts, fences and rafters
Baphia pubescens	odwenkobiri	general household construction work
Bersama abyssinica	esonodua	constructing house posts
Blighia sapida	akye	for working household furniture
Blighia unijugatus	akyebiri	general building purposes
Bombax buonopozense	akonkodie	bark used for thatch roofing
Calpocalyx brevibraeteatus	atrotre	used as wooden planks
Canthium hispidium	ogyapam	used in woodworking or carving

Carapa procera	kwakuobese	bark used as thatch for roofing; stem as house posts and for carving objects, as well as for making boxes and coffins
Ceiba pentandra	onyina	bark used as thatch for roofing; stem as house posts and for carving objects, as well as for making boxes and coffins
Celtis zenkeri	esafufuo/esakoko	for general wooden construction, as well as posts for farm sheds
Chlorophora excelsa	odum	bark can be used as thatch for roofing; stem is timber for heavy construction work, as well as simple household furniture
Cocos nucifera	kube	rachis used as rafters and house posts; leaves also used for thatch roofing
Cola gigantea	watapuo	wood for house construction
Cola lateritia	watapuobene	wood for house construction as well as leaves for thatch roofing
Cola nitida	bese	wood for house construction and for carving objects
Cola verticillata	bese	”
Copaifera salikounda	entedua	used as veneers
Daniella ogea	ehyedua	for general interior house construction purposes
Dialium guineënsis	asenaa	posts for farm sheds
Diospyros canaliculata	otwabere	wood for building purposes
Diospyros kamerunensis	omenewa	used in the construction of house posts
Diospyros piscatoria	benkyi	used in household construction
Drypetes chevalieri	katrika	”
Drypetes gilgiana	adwea/katrikanini	”
Entandrophragma cylindericum	sapele	planks may be used for roofing purposes
Elaesis guineënsis	abe	rachis used for hut poles
Entandrophragma angolense	edinam	serves as veneers, windows

Funtumia africana	okae	for making doors and carving objects
Funtumia elastica	fruntum	used for carving objects
Hannoa klaineana	fotie	used as planks for the making of doors
Hunteria umbellata	kanwene-akoa	used in construction of house posts
Khaya ivorensis	dubini	used as veneers and in other household furniture work
Lannea welwitschii	kumanini	timber for construction purposes
Mallotus oppositifolius	anyanyanfrowa	used to erect yam poles
Monodora myristica	wedeaba	timber for general construction purposes
Monodora tenuifolia	motokuradua	"
Musanga smithii	odwuma	planks for house construction (doorway) and household furniture
Octoknema borealis	wisuboni	for the construction of house posts
Oxyanthus speciousus	korantema	used to erect poles
Pachypodanthium staudtii	kumadwie	for erecting house poles; bark may be used for hut walls
Raphia hookeri	adobe	provide hut poles; also when split can be used as house screens and rafters. Rachis can be used as roof beams or thatch
Sterculia oblonga	ohaa	planks for house construction and household furniture
Sterculia rhinopetala	wawabima	timber used as roof beams and also in household furniture work
Sterculia tragacantha	sofo	hut poles and for carving objects (e.g., shoots)
Terminalia superba	ofram	used in the construction of fence poles (i.e., pilings) as well as house posts
Tetrapleura tetraptera	prekese	for constructing hut poles and frames
Trichilia prieuriana	kakadikuro	timber used in house construction work

Vitex rivularis	otwentorowa	''
Xylopia staudtii	duanan	primarily used as poles; bark can also be used as partitions and in household furniture work (e.g., chairs).
Xylopia villosa	obaafufuo	''

C. Other Specific Uses in The Local Domestic Economy

(i.) Used in the making of farm implements:

Baphia nitida	odwen	for making such implements as knives and axe handles
Dialium guineënse	asenaa	used for making hoes and axe-handles
Diospyros kamerunensis	amenewa	''
Hunteria umbellata	kanwene-akoa	general tool handles
Khaya ivorensis	dubini	''
Monodora myristica	wedeaba	axe-handles
Monodora tenuifolia	motokuradua	used in making axe and hoe handles
Napoleona vogelii	obua	general tool handles
Newbouldia laevis	sesemasa	knife-handles
Rothmannia whitfieldii	sabode	hoe-handles
Strombosia glaucescens	afena	axe-handles
Xylopia villosa	obaafufuo	''

(ii.) Hunting and trapping implements:

Aulacocalyx jasminiflora	ntwenson	used in setting traps
Baphia nitida	odwen	''
Carapa procera	kwakuobese	used in making gun stocks
Cola nitida	bese	''
Glyphaea brevis	foto	used in setting traps
Klaineodoxia gabonensis	kroma	''
Microdesmis puberula	ofema	''

(iii.) Cooking implements
(e.g., spoons,bowls, ladles, mortars, pestles, and mallets):

Baphia nitida	odwen	used in making mortars and pestles
Bombax buonopozense	akonkodie	used in making such domestic utensils as ladles
Celtis zenkeri	esafufuo/esakoko	used to make pestles
Chlorophora excelsa	odum	used in the making of mortars

Cocos nucifera	kube	shells used as cups for drinking palm wine, water, etc.
Funtumia africana	okae	for making ladles
Griffonia simplicifolia	kegya	fruits can be used for making spoons
Rinorea oblongifolia	mpawutuntum	"
Triplochiton scleroxylon	wawa	used to make large plates on which foodstuffs such as tomatoes, peppers and fish are sold on the market
(iv.) Miscellaneous:		
Albizia adianthifolia	pampena	produces gum
Albizia zygia	okoro	gum/resin
Baphia nitida	odwen	dye, and also leaves can be used as foodwrappers
Blighia sapida	akye	can be used as fish poison
Blighia unijugatus	akyebiri	"
Bombax buonopozense	akonkodie	gum/resin
Carapa procera	kwakuobese	produces red dye, also gum/resin
Carpobolia lutea	ofewa	can be used as a walking stick, gum
Ceiba pentandra	onyina	gum
Cola gigantea	watapuo	gum, also leaves as foodwrappers
Cola nitida	bese	black dye
Daniella ogea	ehyedua	gum
Dracaena arborea	ntomme	used to protect young yam shoots
Elaeis guineënsis	abe	kernal oil used to make soap and pomade
Griffonia simplicifolia	kegya	used as black colouring material
Monodora myristica	wedeaba	can be used as walking stick
Monodora tenuifolia	motokuradua	"
Raphia hookeri	adobee	used to make pomade
Tetrapleura tetraptera	prekese	gum/resin
Rinorea oblongifolia	mpawutuntum	used as walking stick
Sterculia tragacantha	sofo	leaves as food-wrappers; also produces gum

See also Irvine (1961) and Hall and Swaine (1981).

Notes

1. The reader is referred to an article entitled "Rainforests: A Race Against Time" which appeared in the *Third World Centre Newsletter*, Windsor, Ontario, No. 42, April-May, 1988, p. 4 for similar observations.
2. The editorial comment in *The Toronto Star*, December 4, 1988, p. C4, reports that under the auspices of the World Bank, Brazil plans to build 136 dams in the next 22 years to flood about 26 000 sq. km of forest land.
3. Figures from the Rainforest Action Network in San Francisco reveal that the area subject to flooding in India has doubled since 1950, and that 6 billion tonnes of soil are washed away each year. The point to be made here is that the roots of a healthy forest hold the soil which in turn hold the water in the wet seasons, allowing it to run evenly into rivers as the weather dries. With the trees gone, the water washes quickly off the land flooding down rivers and carrying with it the thin layer of top soil.
4. This figure is made up of 2783 males and 3022 females and is based on the national population census data obtained from the Ghana Government Statistician for 1982.
5. "Harmattan" is a term used since medieval times to refer to the dry, parching land wind that blows along the coast of Upper Guinea during the months of November through March, raising a red dust-cloud that fogs the air.
6. Ghana Meteorological Services, Annual Rainfall Report, Headquarters, Accra.
7. Hill (1963) has detailed the crucial role played by a group of migrants from Akuapem, Ga and Shai in the hills above Accra in creating the Ghanaian cocoa industry. Starting in 1892, they migrated eastward to the present state of Akyem Abuakwa where they bought large tracts of uncultivated land from absentee landlords. These migrants occupied an area further to the southeast of Ghana than the Ayirebi town is located, and their settlements post-date the known early history and evolution of the Ayirebi community. The early settlers of Ayirebi were food producers. In later years, when the successful cocoa enterprise of the Akuapem migrants became generally known, cocoa growing became a feature in the Ayirebi economy. However, the cocoa farmers of Ayirebi (unlike those migrants of Akuapem) primarily relied on lineage and stool lands, as well as family labour, and combined their cocoa farming activities with food production (see also Wilks 1977).
8. The more recent 1989 study also reported similar findings. Of the 450 research sample households, 152 (33%) households each had between 0 and 3 hectares of farm plots; 144 households (32%), 3-6 hectares; 90 households (20%), 6-9 hectares; 34 households (7.5%), 9-12 hectares; and 30 (6.7%), over 12 hectares.
9. The members of the Town Development Committee (TDC) are selected by the local chief in consultation with his elders. Membership of the Committee for the Defence of the Revolution (CDR) is open to all town residents. This latter body was formerly called the People's Defence Committee (PDC). It is a more recent political action group, the idea of which was introduced nationwide by the ruling Provisional National Defence Council (PNDC) government since 1982.
10. In 1982-83 when this study was conducted, the exchange rate of the local currency, cedi (₵), was ₵2.45 to $1.00 Cdn. By the time of the second study in 1989, the rate was ₵240 to $1.00 Cdn.
11. Prior to the 1980s, two of the sawmills were jointly owned by the state and private firms. Today, the private logging companies are encroaching on the forest reserves in the Akyem Oda-Ofoase district—which includes Ayirebi and its surrounding villages. In fact, in the fall of 1989, this researcher observed at least two timber trucks almost daily transporting timber through the Ayirebi town. The drivers would not admit to the source of their timber load although the majority of Ayirebi residents agree that the timber is mostly from the forest reserves. In a forthcoming monograph, this author

hopes to explore the effects of the activities of the logging companies, particularly their gradual encroachment on the forest reserves in the Akyem Oda-Ofoase district.

12. See also *Third World Resource Centre Newsletter*, No. 42, April-May 1988, p. 6.

References Cited

Adams, P., and L. Solomon
1985 In the Name of Progress: The Underside of Foreign Aid. Toronto: Doubleday.

Ahn, P.M.
1970 West African Soils. London: Oxford University Press.

Arhin, K.
1983 Peasants in 19th-Century Asante. Current Anthropology 24(4): 471-479.

Atsu, S.Y.
1984 The Effect of Government Policies on the Increased Production and Food Self-Sufficiency in Ghana. Paper read at the International Conference on Food Self-Sufficiency in West Africa. University of Ghana, Legon, May 1-3, 1984, Accra.

Boateng, E.A.
1959 A Geography of Ghana. London: Cambridge University Press.

Brokensha, E.A., D.W. Warren and D. Warner
1980 Indigenous Knowledge Systems and Development. Lanham, Maryland: University Press of America.

Burley, J., and T. Styles, eds.
1976 Tropical Trees. New York and London: Academic Press.

Carpenter, R., ed.
1984 Assessing Tropical Forest Lands: Their Suitability for Sustainable Uses. East-West Center, Paris: UNESCO.

Caufield, C.
1986 In the Rainforest: Report of a Strange, Beautiful Imperiled World. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Central Bureau of Statistics
1982 Census Office Report. Legon, Ghana: Institute of Statistical, Social, and Economic Research.

Dei, G.J.S.
1986 Adaptation and Environmental Stress in a Ghanaian Forest Community. Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation. Department of Anthropology, University of Toronto. Ann Arbor, Michigan: University microfilms.
1987 Land and Food Production in a Ghanaian Forest Community. Africa Development 12(1):101-124.
1988 Crisis and Adaptation in a Ghanaian Forest Community. Anthropological Quarterly 62(1):63-72.
1989 Hunting and Gathering in a Ghanaian Rain Forest Community. Ecology of Food and Nutrition 22(3):225-244.
1990 Indigenous Knowledge and Economic Production: The Food Crop Cultivation, Preservation and Storage Methods of a West African Community. Ecology of Food and Nutrition 24(1):1-20.

In press The Indigenous Responses of a Ghanaian Rural Community to Seasonal Food Supply Cycles and the Socio-Environmental Stresses of the 1980s. *In* Development from Within: Survival in Rural Africa, edited by D.R.F. Taylor and F. Mackenzie. New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

forthcoming The Changing Land Use and Allocation Patterns of a West African Community.

Ellis, W.S.
1987 Africa's Stricken Sahel. Washington, D.C.: National Geographic.

Foley, G., P. Moss, and L. Timberlake
1984 Stoves and Trees. London: Earthscan.

Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO)
1967 Timber Trends and Prospects in Africa. Rome: FAO and United Nations Economic Commission for Africa.
1981 Forestry and Rural Development. Rome: FAO Forestry Paper, No 26.

Franke, R.W., and B.H. Chasin
1980 Seeds of Famine. New Jersey: Allanheld, Osmun.

Gadgil, M.
1985 Cultural Evolution of Ecological Prudence. Landscape Planning 12:285-299.
1987 Social Restraints on Exploiting Nature: The Indian Experience. Development: Seeds of Change 1:26-30.

Glaeser, B.
1984 Ecodevelopment in Tanzania: An Empirical Contribution on Needs, Self-Sufficiency, and Environmentally-Sound Agriculture on Peasant Farms. Berlin: Moncton Publishers.

Grainger, A.
1982 Desertification. London: Earthscan.

Hall, J.B., and M.D. Swaine
1981 Geobotany: Distribution and Ecology of Vascular Plants in a Tropical Rainforest. London: Junk Publishers.

Hill, P.
1963 The Migrant Cocoa Farmers of Southern Ghana. London: Cambridge University Press.
1975 The West African Farming Household. *In* Changing Social Structure in Ghana, edited by J. Goody, pp. 119-136. London: International African Institute.

Irvine, F.R.
1961 Woody Plants of West Africa. Economic Botany 6:23-40.

Jones, W.O.
1961 The Food and Agricultural Economics of Tropical Africa: A Summary Review. Food Research Institute Studies 2:3-20. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Longman, K.A.
1974 Tropical Forest and Its Environment. London: Longman.

Maguire, A., and J.M. Brown
1986 Bordering on Trouble: How Resource Management Shapes Latin American Politics and Economies. Ambio 15(4).

Manoukian, M
1964 Akan and Ga-Adangme Peoples. London: Oxford University Press.

Morgan, W.B., and R.P. Moss
1984 Fuelwood and Rural Energy Production and Supply in the Humid Tropics. Tokyo: United Nations University.

Osunade, M.A.
1988 Soil Suitability Classification by Small Farmers. Professional Geographer 40(2):194-201.

Posnansky, M.
1980 How Ghana's Crisis Affects a Village. West Africa No. 3306 (Dec.):2418-2420.

Richards, P.
1985 Indigenous Agricultural Revolution: Ecology and Food Production in West Africa. London: Hutchinson.
1986 Coping with Hunger: Hazard and Experiment in an African Rice-Farming System. London: Allen and Unwin.

Ruthenberg, H.
1980 Farming Systems in the Tropics. 3rd ed. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Sachs, I.
1978 Environment and Development. A New Rationale for Domestic Policy Formulation and International Co-operation Strategies. Ottawa: CIDA.

Senya, J.
1984 Ghana Cocoa: More Than Just a Bean. West Africa No. 3482 (May):1018-1019.

Sinclair, L.
1986 World Economy Can Expand Without Destroying Natural Resources. Ambio 15(1):45-46.

Skutch, M.
1983 Why People Don't Plant Trees: Village Case Studies, Tanzania. Washington, D.C.: Resources for the Future.

Spencer, J.
1966 Shifting Cultivation in Southeastern Asia. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Timberlake, L.
1985 Africa in Crisis. Philadelphia: New Society Publishers.

Twose, N.
1984 Cultivating Hunger. Oxford: Oxfam Report.

Vayda A.P., C.J.P. Colfer, and M. Brotokusumo
1985 Interactions Between People and Forests in East Kalimantan. *In* Culture and Conservation: The Human Dimension in Environmental Planning, edited by J. McNeely and D. Pitts, pp. 120-146. London: Croom Helm.

Weber, F.
1981 Village Woodlot Firewood Protection. Dakar, Senegal: Africare.
Wilde, S.A.
1966 Influence des méthodes de Plantation sur la croissance du Pin en sols Argileux. Montréal: Université Laval.
Wilks, I.
1977 Land, Labour, Capital and the Forest Kingdom of Asante: A Model for Change. *In* The Evolution of Social Systems, edited by J. Freidman and M. Rowlands, pp. 487-534. San Pablo, California: Duckworth.
Wills, J.B., ed.
1962 Agriculture and Land Use in Ghana. London: Oxford University Press.
Winterbottom, R., and P.T. Hazelwood
1987 Agroforestry and Sustainable Development: Making the Connection. Ambio 16(2-3):100-110.
World Commission on Environment and Development (WCED)
1987 Our Common Future. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

IDENTITY AND INEQUALITY AMONG THE WAWAGA VALLEY BARAI, ORO PROVINCE, PNG

T. R. Barker

Abstract: The question of leadership among the Barai, a Papuan mountain people, is considered. Although Barai ceremonial exchange is not incremental and thus not capable of providing a single gradient on which to rank the "bigness" of men, degrees of male power as expressed through identification with a hierarchy of totems serve to distinguish group leaders. The conflicts between the elder and younger brothers, and between contenders for leadership within one group are discussed in relation to inheritance, sorcery and the control of resources. It is concluded that hierarchy and competition have a different locus among the Barai than among peoples where incremental and enchained exchanges exist.

Résumé: Il s'agit du "leadership" parmi les Barai, un peuple montagnard de Papoua. Même si l'échange cérémonieux chez les Barai n'est pas accroissant donc, incapable d'offrir un gradient de la "grandeur" des hommes, il semble que l'étendu du pouvoir est exprimé par l'identification avec une hiérarchie de totems. Les conflits entre frères ainés et cadets, ainsi que ceux qui occurent entre concurrents pour le pouvoir, sont examinés par rapport aux héritages, à la sorcellerie et au contrôle des ressources. L'auteur conclut que l'hiérarchie et la rivalité assument, chez les Barai, un lieu autre que chez les peuples ayant des échanges accroissants et enchainés.

For the groups of people lying between the Central Highlands and the Papuan Gulf it was felt that a "distinctive set of models of leadership was necessary" (Strathern 1982:161 fn. 9). One set of models would be indicated for societies where leadership was a function of control of the products of labour, another set of models for those where this was not, or was substantially less markedly the case. It would seem that the Wawaga Barai also demand an alternate set of models.

Anthropologica XXXII (1990) 29-54

In what are perhaps over-general terms, social systems such as those of the Barai are assumed not to be able to support "real" bigmanship and incremental exchange (Gregory 1980:641). This assumption is made by some writers for those societies where the preferred form of marriage is sister exchange, where production levels are "low" and, where, as among the Barai, enchainment and increment (Strathern 1969), of and in exchange are, for practical purposes, absent.

This article attempts to deal with the question of whether there is a single gradient, or multiple gradients identifiable in the constitution and development of leadership. Morauta (1972) indicated simultaneous economic and religious criteria for leadership in groups found in the foothills behind Lae. Godelier (1982, 1986) seems to have proposed something similar for the Baruya Anga. This model of differentially constituted specialists—warrior, shaman, cassowary hunter and salt maker creates a picture reminiscent of caste-like organic solidarity.[1]

It will be shown that for the Wawaga Barai there is a single gradient of leadership. Further, the significance of this gradient will be demonstrated through an examination of some of the political and material bases of the totemic system. The suggestion is that degrees of communally valuated male power are reflected in the identification of individuals with a hierarchy of emblems.

In contrast to Sahlins (1970:206; 1974:136), it is argued that the demonstration of a single gradient of leadership does not logically entail the use of "bigman" as a political title. This absence of logical entailment is derived from several levels of analysis. An *e bo* is literally "big man" or "eldest man." The Barai leader is not simply a "man of renown." Nor does this "bigman" emerge definitively from the "careful" deployment of the products of labour and the resultant debt of others (1974:136). Barai leadership, as presented here, shares Sahlins' materialist bent, but it is not satisfactorily reducible to control or management of wealth as products. It does however conform to the control of wealth as the means of production, of land, labour and technology.[2]

The Barai

The Wawaga Barai comprise a small population (about 900) of Papuan mountain people (Weiner 1988a:3) surrounded by fragmented, but broadly riverine and foothill traditions. The Barai group in question, the Wawaga Barai, inhabits the Wawaga Valley. The valley is formed by the headwaters of the Kumusi River, descending the northern slopes of the Owen Stanley Range in the Oro Province of Papua New Guinea. The population of the Wawaga Valley in 1975 was 1887 (Awoma 380, Emo River 272, Emo River

#2 150, Ijaro 231, Kovio 149, Managube 183, Namanaija 293, Tetebede 97, Ujilo 87, Muni 45). The Wawaga Barai are concentrated on the banks of the O River, a tributary of the Kumusi River, and share boundaries with Managalasi Barai, Mimai River Barai, Mountain Koiari and Ömie speakers. All of these groups have in common a pervasive system of emblems at whose apex stands the hornbill associated with a common myth of origin. Although totemic references appear in the writings of several authors on "highland fringe" type societies, as well as on the Sepik, such systems have not been given due consideration in the more recent discussions of group formation and the development of leadership. Williams, (1925; 1969) writing of the Orokaiva, attempted to link clan totems—assuming they are not cut, killed or eaten—and the plant emblem specifically to the founding ancestor of the group and bigmen (1925:417). He thus associated the concept with analytical notions of descent. The Barai system of emblems or *ma'i ma'i*, as well as those of neighbouring mountain peoples, is perhaps more emphasised than those of other Papuan Mountain groups, and it is hoped that by demonstrating its significance as a codification of male inequality, a dimension will be added to the understanding of the political process in small scale, low production societies.

Barai Clans

Throughout the Wawaga Valley, the Ai'i, Ömie and Mountain Koiari, are sets of paired clans with contiguous territories invariably divided by a river. The principal settlements which they form were until recent times defended with stockades, trenching, and overlooked by a watchtower (*so*). Present day settlements are surrounded by gardens. The clan territories are a patchwork of such settlements and more distant garden and hunting lands. These garden settlements are the sites of pig sacrifices and in some cases form paired-clan villages (*are*).

Wawaga Barai paired-clans, a prominent feature of the late colonial period, are tied together by a dense series of intermarriages and by an extensive calendar of ritual events. The pairing of clans and intermarriage results in statements of community solidarity in the idiom of consanguineal relationship such as "we are one blood." A single localized clan states that its members are "one father."

Traditionally Wawaga Barai clans lived in longhouses. These were ideally occupied by brothers and the partners to simultaneous, double sister exchanges. The opposite longhouse, or a section of a single longhouse under the best conditions, might house the affines produced by double sister exchange with the principal clan. The preferred marriage was and still is with *siba*, the "wild" or "unknown" person. This is the person with whom nei-

ther sharing (*waju*) nor formal exchange (*ehi*) relations exist; in such a way new alliances are formed. This preference complements another, marriage with the *vine* or cross-cousin. The ideal form of marriage is direct sister exchange. The major marriage prohibition is with a person of the same plant emblem. The plant emblem is known as *ani* (see also Williams 1925; 1969).

Barai, and their neighbours, frame virtually all references to levels of political organisation and leadership in terms of *ma'i ma'i*. It is for this reason that the *ma'i ma'i* and their major interrelations are examined here. A *ma'i ma'i* may be a species or class of flora, fauna or, geographical features such as large boulders, streams, caves and the like. There is a hierarchy of *ma'i ma'i*. Barai *ma'i ma'i* are "forbidden" or *itaho* to those who subscribe to them. They may not be killed or eaten by those associated with them. Clan territories are distinguished by a name, for example, Gudire (grease) and, at the second most inclusive level, by the named New Guinea eagle, or *buru* (*Harpyopsis novae guineae*).[3]

The *buru* or proper name + *duna* or *tuna* may also be a simple appellation. Many invocations of the *buru* or *duna ma'i ma'i* have the form of "Na . . . ," whichever totem is referred to, for example, "*Na Vaburaduna.*" "I am Vaburaduna." To declare identification with the named eagle is to claim formal leadership. By contrast in the context of successful hunting and warfare any man who is a member of a clan may use the eagle *ma'i ma'i* name. However it is used only in the form of "*Sa gigigigigigi Vaburaduna*!" The same invocation is found in the investiture which accompanies first mankilling. The mankiller "perches" in the branches of a tree like a bird of prey, but rather than being accorded identity with a *buru* at this time, he is again met with "*Sa gigigigigigi Vaburaduna*!"[4] There is no statement of equivalence between man and *ma'i ma'i* in these instances. This form is invoked in connection with successful completion of any significant activity which is considered a matter of competition.[5]

The name of the eagle *ma'i ma'i* is invoked most often in inter-clan affairs. Its wings are likened to the roof of the longhouse under which reside all other *ma'i ma'i* and men. A less common form of invocation of the eagle *ma'i ma'i* is "I am Vaburaduna, I am over the pig." In this form, a man asserts his leadership. He also states that he is "over" or has control of the totemic grandmother pig which, in the case of Vaburaduna, is Awahaja. The invocation is explained as the right of the leader to direct formal exchanges, and to adjudicate disputed formal exchanges and determine whether or not any sanction is applicable.

Each named eagle has associated with it a named tree (*ma'i ma'i*) and named pool of water (*a'a*).[6] Although *ma'i ma'i* can refer to the collectivity of clan emblems, its more exact referent is a large, named, usually banyan-like tree. This tree is central to the clan territory. In the extended example of

Vaburaduna clan, their *ma'i ma'i* is called *Sunamo*. *Sunamo* may be referred to as a *buru*, *ani* or *ma'i ma'i*. It is thought of as the residence of the named eagle, other associated emblems, and as the principal residence of agnatic spirits (*juoe*). The *ma'i ma'i* is invoked, by a leader, principally in the context of war rites designed to enlist the aid of the clan (*tabaibo*) snake and the most ancient spirits.

Also thought to live in the pool are a named snake, an eel and grandmother pig. The name of the pig is used only during formal pig sacrifices or during the negotiations of leaders. Verbal challenges issued in formal exchange procedures incorporate the donor's pig name, or *ihi ma*. Named stones, *mui*, exist in association with the pools. In addition to these major *ma'i ma'i*, we should also mention minor items such as the named cassowary, cuscus and wallaby.

The "sacred" pool and its associated *ma'i ma'i* are central to the social, political and territorial definition of a clan. In the Wawaga Valley each clan *ma'i ma'i* centre is conceived of as identical to all others. This can be taken as underlining the ecological homogeneity of territories, while emphasising the individuality and independent productive capacity of clans. These are the principal features of the politico-emblem system. It remains for us to consider the finer divisions of the political system.

In Wawaga Barai mythology it was the python named Simo who created the rivers and creeks which bound tracts of garden and hunting land. The actual boundaries of garden and hunting land are referred to as *idua ihi*, "water names." More frequently invoked to describe parcels of garden land and their personnel are the named birds of paradise or *rabijo*. *Rabijo* refer to the two-wire bird of paradise (*Paradisiae raggianna*) of a particular garden, at a particular time. The *rabijo* names have the suffix *-bire* meaning "flesh." Similar to *ma'i ma'i* are *idi maruri*, the named breadfruit tree. The breadfruit tree is planted in a particular garden.[7] It is central to the group of trees, palms, lianas and cultigens known as *eje*. The *rabijo* of a garden is thought to live in the *eje*. The *eje*, other than the breadfruit, usually includes all the valued non-staple food and utilitarian trees, bushes and vines: black-palm for making weapons, the drumwood tree, *mara*, a fig-type tree, *okari*, the tree whose bark is used in making cloth, the vine used in fire making, ginger, and dependent upon the altitude, red oil pandanus.

Eje and faunal and floral emblems which live in and around them represent the "first man," "father," and possibly the founder of a garden. By contrast the current owner of a men's or women's longhouse, or yam house on a certain garden tract is the "man with the lifeforce of the longhouse" (*do oi'i*). *Oi* is compared to mist or breath. It is the force of man which resides under the breast bone (*do*) and which parts on death. The *bo aja* is the person who may become the *do oi'i*. He may eventually, allowing for fallow

periods and political vicissitudes, form a pig-killing village, or *are*. *Oi* is coterminous with, but separate from "spirit" or *arui*.

The possession of, or association with, the spirits of the dead buried in conjunction with an *eje* indicate pre-eminence over a specific tract of garden land which is the distinguishing attribute of the "father" (*asoi*) or controller. Ties with spirits are concretized in the fact of claiming a *rabijo*, and its associated *eje*. The *rabijo* denotes a garden, its *eje* and its "father." It is the named bird of paradise which "calls out for its owner" at his death. The man who claims responsibility or is thought responsible for the death of another adds the plumage of the bird of paradise, again a *rabijo*, to his headdress. At the death of the owner of a garden, all or selected plants and trees of the eje may be cut down. This is the temporality of the garden *rabijo*. Ownership of and use rights in garden land are determined and expressed by claim to the *eje* or right of access to its products. Equally the establishment of or claim to pig fencing, drainage channels, longhouses, yam houses, burials and births in conjunction with the *eje* of a named garden tract is equivalent to ownership. Collectively those who garden a certain named tract of land are "men of the ground." Principal settlements or villages usually combine many such groups in residence.

The village or principal settlement may be described as having a set of *ma'i ma'i* which indicate the dominant person or persons resident. The village can be spoken of as having an *ani bo* and *rabijo bo*, that is, a "big" named plant emblem and a "big" named bird of paradise emblem. Ideally, the "big" plant and bird of paradise emblems resident in the village or *are* coalesce in the political identity of the person of the leader. The majority of men who are resident can only make claim to these emblems indirectly through ties with the leader of the principal settlement. Complementary to the designation of men with *ma'i ma'i* is the application of totems in transactions.

In formal transactions, participants may be conceptualized as a "line" (*da*) of men or "men of the line." The "line" may, analytically and representationally, be made to support contentions of genealogy, descent and filiation. It is at base, however, a category based upon nurturance. More specifically it relates to the meat of wild animals and pigs consumed by men of the line. It is used to distinguish exchange units. These exchange units are spatially and politically represented by *rabijo* within the clan. In formal exchanges between clans, recipients are physically identified by donors with their plant emblem, not their *rabijo*. Entitlement to a "plant emblem" is gained through inheritance of hunting grounds, the creation of new hunting grounds and new plant emblems and, rarely, through the combination of two or more plant emblems. As much as the *rabijo* is composed of a number of elements and relations, it also represents a particular commensal unit.

The named *rabijo* in its basic form represents a unit of consumption of the flesh of all animals (*simie*), especially pig, cassowary and human flesh. It is also the primary form or unit which has identifiable leaders. This unit may also be referred to as "his men" or *e ahui*. In this way leadership is constituted in the ownership of hunting grounds, the plant emblem and the control, in every sense, of specified garden land.

If the "small" *rabijo* also constitutes a male unit in the consumption of flesh, the plant emblem identifies participants in exchange and exchange lines as *dahai*, the hunting ground, or morphophonemically, the "line of breastbones." The human breastbone is *hai* and represents the male spirit.[8] The convergence of "small" plant emblen and named bird of paradise totem in the one person represents leadership in its elemental form. This is the nascent leadership of the *bo aja*, the elder brother with the power. The convergence of "big" plant emblem and bird of paradise is the *aja bo*, the political leader of the village or *are*. Most males (72%) use the same *buru*, or named eagle, as their fathers, but only a minority exploit the same garden lands.

Table 1

Clan Name	Using Father's *buru*	Not Using Father's *buru* or Undecided
Vaburaduna (1)*	38	9
Aredaduna (1)	13	8
U'iduna (2)	15	13
I'eduna (2)	13	2
Uronebire (2)	5	1
Gogoduna (3)	16	3
Gara'iduna (3)	11	4
Jasisahuwa (4)	2	0
Misoiduna (4)	21	6
Jovaduna (5)	7	4
Sigaveduna (6)	4	1
Nanievaduna(6)	5	6
Munibaduna (7)	4	1

* Numerals indicate pairing, a third clan in a pairing is small and effectively "joins" with one of the others.

For the thirteen principal Barai, or predominantly Barai, clans of the valley the numbers of fully adult resident males using and not using their fathers' *buru* are listed in Table 1. In Table 1, 31 percent of those not using their father's *buru* claim one or more of their father's principal gardens, while 18 percent of those using their father's *buru* lay claim to and signifi-

cantly exploit their father's major gardens. An average of 58 percent of adult males maintain extensive gardens with contiguous clans, beyond the paired clan, and 23 percent of these had, or effectively had, changed their set of *ma'i ma'i* identities to suit their new garden-hunting ground sets. 76 percent of the latter changes occurred outside the context of a ceremonial mother's brother relationship, that is, not through a matrilateral link. It is in the context of these processes of adjustment, realignment and change that an average of 68 percent of men changed their principal garden-hunting ground within the clan, the paired clan or contiguous clan. Absolute change as in the situation which finds a man or group definitively moving to unoccupied or non-contiguous clan land is less than 0.5 percent. These changes were recorded for the period 1958-75, seventeen years.

The vast majority of these changes of principal gardens and hunting grounds within the clan represents the normal process of shifting cultivation (three to seven years dependent upon soil type and altitude). However, over the two-year period in question, 9.4 percent of those adult males who were interviewed described themselves as having, for various reasons, been attracted to acknowledged competing groups within the clan, paired clan and/or contiguous clan set. It is proposed that these attractions and the labour they represent are the practical foundation of the development and exercise of leadership.

Attributes of Leadership

It is commonplace in the literature on Papua New Guinean leadership that an "ethno-catalogue of dimensions of inequality" (Modjeska 1982:92) is offered. These descriptive attributes run the range of ability in speech making, "grease," physical prowess, success in transaction and the like. More generally they relate in economics to production and distribution, superiority in ritual and its content and social-psychological traits requisite in conflictual and normal affairs. Two interrelated attributes, public speaking and success in transaction, will be examined as aspects of Barai leadership practices.

Fundamental to the art of public speaking (*uwa remo*) among the Wawaga Barai are certain ideas concerning individuals who speak with both authority and persuasiveness. The formal speech of a man prominent in modern endeavours would be categorized as *uwa remo*. He might better be referred to as a spokesman rather than leader. Only the traditional Barai leader speaks the "truth" (*ijui*) and the prescriptions (*aniu*) of *seni seni*. *Seni seni* is the word of the "first men" or *e ma'i*. It encompasses history, truth, mythology and cultural appropriateness. *Seni seni* is invoked only in the context of ultimate leadership decisions around crucial events and activ-

ities, such as warfare and general management of gardens. In this context, it is not that the leader is able to convince his listeners. Rather his word is *aruvo*. It is authority in its simplest sense. For this reason such a man is "set apart" or *agwoe*. The leader speaks and "his word is done," He speaks softly (*sahi sahi*). He maintains an air of humbleness or *mamui*. He is not an *e hiahia'i*, a "rough man." *Aruvo* is especially significant in intergroup transaction. In speaking the middle finger of the leader is crossed over the index fingers. This is said to resemble the beak of the hornbill. This gesture is called *i bubwori duana uwa*, "finger-hand hornbill on top of message." The hornbill or *buboi* is the ultimate composite emblem and refers to the most ancient of spirits. Facility in public speaking, an attribute of leadership cited in the literature, follows closely on the Barai notion of strength and ability, but also, among the Barai, it must be seen as more than the persuasiveness of the leader. Authoritative speech is an enactment and acceptance of group solidarity around the figure of the *e bo*. The limits of authoritative speech are tested by any catastrophe which threatens the integrity of the group, epidemic, defeat in war, widespread damage to cultigens, pigs, hunting dogs and failures of garden management.

The second attribute referred to in the literature on leadership is wealth. Here wealth will be linked to the notion of increment in transaction. In a formal transaction Barai seek equivalence (*niriare*) between donor and recipient. To close an exchange cycle, negotiated adjustments are made. In the course of an exchange or in ending a cycle a recipient may reject or claim a particular item or items in order to achieve balance. All exchanges are judged by the form of the presentation, as to whether they correspond to the normative prescriptions (*seni seni*). In exchange, one may offer more than agreed but it is considered a "bad thing." Such action may be interpreted as competition, as an indication of an intent to ensorcell, or, in the case of affinal exchanges, as evidence of intention to "return" the donor's wife to her brother or to kill him. This must not be taken to mean that Barai have no accepted form of competition. It is found in the multiple dance competitions between donor and recipient groups which precede actual transactions and includes "shoulder knocking" (*ginyaravano*). Shoulder knocking was banned by the colonial administration in the 1950s, since it is always violent and often lethal. Competition is also expressed in the quality of all items exchanged and consumed. At another level, the integrity of the recipient is judged by whether presentations are accepted and removed without "slipping," "sliding" or "falling," that is, without being overwhelmed by the donor's generosity.

Foodstuffs and wealth items to be given away are identified with the plant emblem of the leader who directs the exchange. The recipient jumps to his feet and calls out the name of his *buru*. Moreover, received items of wealth

may not be exchanged, or worn, until their equivalent has been given to the original donor. The transactional set implies a system of "alternating disequilibrium" (Strathern 1979:152, fn. 1) between donor and recipient, their respective clans and villages. What links *aruvo*, or the authoritative speech of a Barai leader and a transaction is not the possibility of the advantage gained or demonstrated through increment, but the fact that the leader is the negotiator and arbiter of the overall transaction. It is *aruvo* which determines the form of the exchange for donors and recipients. Control of wealth is renounced for control of the means of production. What is suggested is that in the context of formal exchanges transaction and production are near equivalents. Such prestations necessarily entail the demonstrated control of cultigens, tubers, game, domestic animals for consumption, the range of manufactured items and those who produced them. The control of wealth, which is what these things may be thought to objectify is secondary.[9] For these reasons and in these circumstances Barai may well view production and transaction as more or less equivalent.

In sum, the social, psychological, religious and physical characteristics of the leader must be recognized as descriptive attributes only, secondary to the fact of leadership and secondary to the grounding of leadership in male power expressed in *ma'i ma'i*. There are many technical specialists reported in the literature, and many among the Barai. Their expertise may be in hunting, fighting, singing, dancing, salt-making, exorcism, shamanism,[10] divination or in particular varieties of sorcery. These, however, do not constitute leadership in its formal sense, nor are they complementary forms of leadership. Among the Barai all specialists are subject to leadership. These specialists are overridden by the recognized increment of male power manifested in the "powerful" man (the *aja bo*) the junctures of which are given by identity as *ma'i ma'i*.

Male Inequality and the Disaffected Individual

It is inappropriate to discuss the process whereby individuals are recognized as leaders and identified with group *ma'i ma'i* without discussing a concomitant and complementary notion, that of inequality. Two points can be considered here. First, as with the Foi (Weiner 1987), Barai have no terminology for a man who is not "big," except as a lesser man, an *e seibia*, or a younger or "raw" man, *io*. This does not necessarily imply that the ideology of the community is that "all men are equal." Rather, there is an equality of aspiration. Societies like the Wawaga Barai are no less competitive than those of the Melpa type. What distinguishes the two is the locus of the gradient line. Barai affairs are dominated by a single gradient line mapping the intrinsic identity of men at various stages of their lives within the hierar-

chy of *ma'i ma'i*. This local model of the single gradient of inheritance seems to mask the articulation of politico-historical "trajectories" of individuals and groups (see Godelier 1986; Barker 1991). However there are a number of senses in which *ma'i ma'i* are injured, destroyed, abandoned, created, recreated and combined. Further, inheritance is "as much a matter of receiving as getting, keeping and using."

The explanation of inequality among men can proceed from an examination of the development of identity with *ma'i ma'i* during the course of the life cycle. Consider the example of Hallpike's (1977) Tuade who are neither dissimilar nor distant from the Wawaga Barai.[11] Tuade also share a conceptualization of leadership which involves identification with the *tuna* or *duna*, the named New Guinea Eagle. When demonstrating differential status Barai focus on those objects and aspects of inheritance directly related to male power and its acquisition as *ijia rumugu*. Their view encompasses inheritance as evidenced in the description of male power as the inclusive patrimony. Material and immaterial patrimony is also known as *ihi*, the "memory" or "name" of the deceased.

The measure of male inequality, in the local model, concentrates on older and younger brothers and power (*aja*). For these purposes the elder sibling becomes the *bo aja*, the elder brother with the power, and potentially the *aja bo*, the "big" power. This older-younger brother dichotomy will be examined.

The ability of the leader to attract adherents is, in substantial part, represented in the continuum of *bo aja—aja bo*. The older brother is the recipient of the most detailed ritual attention relative to his siblings. This observation would certainly conform to Modjeska's (1982:107) suggestion that "ritual hierarchy tends to replace economic inequality" in areas of low production. As much as this seems a common sense matter it is also entangled with the practicalities of access to the means of production. Inequality of access to the means of production and resources generally is perceived by the *ive*, "tail" or youngest brother, as injustice. The juniors are attracted to a new or competing gardening-hunting (*rabijo*) unit, either as a temporary result of the older brother's intimidation or as a permanent change of *rabijo* unit, but this tendency can be obviated in the case of the sons of leaders. In the local model it is often only the eldest and youngest brother who are the objects of complete investiture. In practice, however, it is only the oldest, the *bo aja*. One way in which such inequality may be redressed might consist in the junior's witholding his service to his older brother. The service is usually labour. But it is not possible for the younger brother directly to withhold meaningful cooperation or labour. Rather there is a cultural mechanism universal to the region which allows the resolution of this conflict.

Labour denied to an older brother is offered to another *e bo*.[12] In this manner adherents are attracted temporarily or permanently. The ritual state-

ment of attraction involves the offering of cooked pork to the disaffected junior by an *e bo* of another *rabijo* unit. The pork is offered in a specific manner: "*ji abe haigera ma.*" This may be translated as "take this small piece of pig meat." The spoken, and usually clandestine offer, deliberately omits the kinship relation and proper name of the recipient.[13] Since *rabijo* are conceptually the units for the production and consumption of flesh, accepting cooked pork from another *rabijo* unit is in effect entertaining a change of *rabijo* within the clan or paired-clan. In this way affiliation and political leadership in clan or clan segments may be achieved, negotiated and changed within the paired-clan settlement.

The mechanism described above may involve any meat, not just pig or cassowary. Further, it is an exchange which is not clearly classified as either *waju*, the informal and ideologically unreciprocated prestation, or *ehi*, reciprocated formal prestation. This particular presentation of pig meat across *rabijo* lines is of a different order. It is interstitial and in a real sense contravenes past, present and future transactions. The acceptance of meat in the context of the disaffected younger brother's proposed change of *rabijo* unit does not truly fall into the categories of *waju* or *ehi* because it is in effect a liminal rite. Nevertheless, if the consumption of cooked meat in this context is left unreciprocated it brings the recipient into a *waju* relationship with the *bo aja* or leader and represents a potential change of *rabijo* and political affiliation. At a more practical level, it is clearly the case that the ingested meat is located in the context of formal commensality, and that such meat is completely equated with the spirit and labour of the unit which produced it (see also Modjeska 1982:95).[14] This does not mean that all other things produced for exchange are incompletely identified with the labour of the unit which produced them. It does mean that the particular rite of change of *rabijo* formally links a particular product, meat, with identity—even though incipient—and affiliation of the individual. Other, more general, forms of partial or complete transformation of kinship relationship, referred to as "making" and "unmaking," for example, *siba me'a* or "made a marriageable partner," are accomplished through the change or creation of the exchange categories (*waju*/*ehi*). Such changes are viewed as enhancing exchange or trade relationships, and more usually as accommodating what are considered to be "close" marriages. In these situations the question of identity is secondary to affiliation proper.

When an individual moves to a new *rabijo* unit, his subsequent service to his new *e bo* is constituted primarily by garden work. The products of such labour represent an alienable surplus to the new *bo aja*. Such work is a temporary situation similar in length to the period of garden service owed by a sister's son to his ceremonial mother's brother, two to three years. At issue

is the final identity of the junior, i.e. who will assist the junior with maternal and affinal exchanges and where he will garden. In spite of the temporary or permanent change of partial identity the obligations owed to maternal kin remain to be discharged.

It has already been suggested that sons of leaders are at an advantage in becoming leaders. The sons of leaders are less susceptible to change of *rabijo* whereas it is a commonplace for others. One aspect of this advantage is that a leader may have several gardens, represented by several *eje* and *rabijo*. A leader may distribute these gardens almost individually among his sons, or he may distribute the births of his children strategically over different gardens. This practice may eventually maintain the unity of the male siblings by reducing the frequency and intensity of conflicts over garden and hunting land. However, there is a centrifugal force at work. It falls upon the *bo aja* to "retrace his father's gardens." That is, he is expected, when appropriate, to garden in the same places as his father. This is done to assure that no claims to land lapse. As a result, the first-born son of a leader is again advantaged because he chronologically precedes his brothers. The institution whereby the eldest son "retraces his garden" acts to his advantage in the disposition of any later claims to it advanced by his younger siblings and himself. Nevertheless, there is still the strong possibility that younger siblings are able to develop separate *rabijo* units by maintaining separate gardens.

The active attempt on the part of a junior to change *rabijo*, or the attempt of a leader to attract a junior to his *rabijo* unit is founded on rational economic grounds. These include the choice of marriage partner, disputes over land, despotism and general violence.[15] Such efforts are, then, not exclusively matters of perceived socio-psychological disadvantage. The latter are a commonplace and usually settled within a short period of time. What has been described above is not a horticultural strategy of small productive units (see Strathern 1984:117). It involves not merely the maintenance and exploitation of two tracts of named garden land and their associated hunting grounds, but rather the entire process of horticultural production in the locality. It affects horticultural production generally because the individual changing production unit will also provide labour to many other gardens encompassed or assisted by his new *bo aja*.

Leaders depend heavily on unmarried brothers, very junior brothers and married brothers. They are also dependent upon polygyny to maintain pigs, and in connection with weeding and the transportation of garden produce. They rely only in small part on the produce of their wives' gardens. Women's gardens are within current named garden lands of their husbands, or if unmarried, of their natal kinsmen. The garden segments and gardens of a leader's sons and brothers produce as much as possible of subsistence

needs, leaving the *bo aja's* garden surplus for designated formal exchanges. If the younger brother attempts a change of *rabijo* unit because of perceived economic injustice, he is often actively encouraged in his quest to create a surplus to support life-cycle and compensation payments. The need to create such a horticultural surplus fluctuates. Major pig sacrifices occur at intervals of four to seven years. Consequently, the demand for surplus labour and attempts to change *rabijo* coincide with the periods of intensification associated with pig-sacrifices. However, despite the oscillatory nature of the discharge of maternal and affinal obligations, there is a linear progression. The paired-clan village becomes a potential source of labour. Large production units are formed. While the finalization of *rabijo*, *ani* and clan identity within the paired-clan units generates smaller, larger and new clan segments, it also determines the balance of power between clans of the village and between segments of a clan.

The process of changing of *rabijo* acts, and is perceived to act, as a direct check on the despotic tendencies in leadership and male inequality generally. It is important to state that the redress of social inequality and injustice, as discussed, acts contrapuntally to competition for political ascendancy within a clan, the creation of new clans and change of residence or migration.

Contested Leadership

The extant sorcery specialists of the Wawaga Valley and the region are those who have lost in the bid for a particular leadership. They perceive themselves as having been victimized and scapegoated while their reputations grow with the number of deaths attributed to them. Often they reach such an impasse because of the number of aspirants for leadership and their own lack of sibling support. They sometimes live uxorilocally, with or in association with a mother's brother. Most often they have changed their linguistic affiliation. The sorcerer's perfected form of sorcery, or any new forms which they may develop are usually associated with or inspired by the differentiating characteristics of the host group. The most powerful of the remaining sorcerers are thought to locate themselves on particular trade routes, or ideally, at the convergence of several such routes. They are usually brothers or cross-cousins to successful leaders with different "small" plant and "small" bird of paradise emblems. Along these same lines one may speak of "false" (*arui*) and "true" (*ho*) brothers and co-resident first cousins (see Kelly 1977:85-6). The "false" brother is one who "misleads," "tricks," and ultimately, practises or is thought to practise sorcery against his closest kin.

The sorcery expert himself is assumed to be a threat to whole communities. His power (*aja*) is perceived as a threat because it is not a function of

legitimate augmentation of power associated with the natal group and its land. The conditions under which a failed leader left the community are usually recorded in secondary hunting ground narratives. Each set of such narratives are particular to specific hunting grounds. Leadership at the level of the clan implies, as given, the communally acknowledged right to identity with the *buru* or individually named eagle of the clan. The sorcerer, at a distance, claims the secondary totem, the named grandmother pig. In his narrative, he may state that the pig has "followed him" to his new area. The implication is that his father's clan is, as a result of his departure, less able to acquit itself in inter-clan pig sacrifices and in inter-clan affairs generally. Furthermore, the leader of the father's clan can no longer exhort that he is "over the pig," the director of the sacrifices.

Like political leaders, sorcery experts capitalize on their personal situation to attract politically disenchanted persons to their cause. Equally, since all calamity is initially assumed to be the manifestation of the displeasure of agnatic spirits, adept sorcerers may and should be able to convince others of their ability to resolve such problems. The sorcery expert is sorcerer, diviner and exorcist. He is also the practical, institutionalized opposition to a particular leadership (see Lindenbaum 1979). Failure to successfully challenge the leader identified with the *buru* or *duna,* and failure to gain public support leads to loss of resources and the abandonment of claims whereby male power is normally augmented. The sorcerer can no longer lay claim to any of the hierarchy of *ma'i ma'i* except that it may be said that he was followed by a secondary emblem, such as a clan pig. Moreover, he may recount meeting a secondary *ma'i ma'i* animal by chance. Such assertions serve only to underscore the rivalry between groups, which is manifested in such activities as feasting, hunting and horticultural production, as well as the residual legitimacy of the sorcerer's claim to his former *ma'i ma'i.*[16]

Conflictual ascendancy to a *buru*, which is rare, evolves over the better part of the lifespan of the claimants. More generally, in the Barai approach to the issues of male identity and equality, there exist strong implied and direct elements of incremental time. As the disputed ascendancy to leadership indicates, the possibility of there being a niche, leadership, which the elder succeeds to, simply by becoming an *elder*, is denied. Hallpike (1977:138) also judged the notion of *elder*, to be inappropriate for the Tuade. For Barai, late accession to leadership appears as the normal progression of life for a male (also see Weiner 1987). According to Hallpike's (1977) interpretation of the Tuade, late accession, coupled with a primacy and exclusivity granted to individual social relations as opposed to inter-group relations, confirms the non-existence of *elders* as a general social category. Wawaga Barai are certainly not unconcerned with inter-clan relations. They do not, however,

foreclose the possibility of accession to a leadership status to all but the most senior male.

Wawaga Barai ethnography indicates that male identity with territorial groups, the land and its products is acquired by individual men through communally recognized degrees of the attainment of male power symbolized in a hierarchy of emblems. The group itself, the *buru*, is constituted by those individuals subsumed by the "big" emblems. These individuals are involved in economic relations with the leader and exploit parts of the hunting and garden lands he comes to represent. This point is crucial to the analysis, since it dictates a reversal of the relationship between group composition and leadership (see also Weiner 1988). The group is not a descent-ordered organism attending succession of an elder to leadership. Such an interpretation would yield the chieftaincy of Hallpike. Rather, the *ma'i ma'i* await a claimant. Everything else is in flux. Conflictual claimants to ascendancy and, possibly, sorcerers who live at a distance from their communities are exaggerated examples of the same basic process which can disunite male siblings. The process which disunites the siblings is the direct access to the means of production itself.

In summary, some of the ideological bases of *aja*, or male power have been presented along with its material bases. The augmentation of *aja* has been taken as fundamental to leadership in the village and garden settlement, and is linked to the "big" and "small" ranges of emblems and the hierarchy the *ma'i ma'i* form. There are many such emblems, which are common to the clans of the Wawaga Valley, as is their hierarchal system. Only certain key emblems are considered in this paper: *ma'i ma'i, duna* or *buru, ani* and *rabijo*. Their relation to garden, hunting and village land, and the resources of each have been indicated. "Small" plant emblems, the hunting ground and its spirits, and "small" named birds of paradise define a specific unity, not simply geographically, but in relation to production, labour and elemental leadership. Likewise, in the higher range, convergence of "big" *ani* and "big" *rabijo* denotes potential leadership in the context of the paired-clan. Conflict over unequal access to resources and sibling inequality in general contains the possibility of the exchange of identity for labour and the potential of surplus it generates. Conflict for ascendancy at the most inclusive levels, claim to *buru* or *duna*, can result only in the expulsion of the loser. Expulsion involving either change of group or *ma'i ma'i* set is the limit of the gradient of leadership.

Barai Symbolic Classification: Sorcery and Male Power

For the Barai, the first born son or daughter is the *ami gama* or "sunrise child." A first born male is referred to as the *bo aja*, literally the "eldest

with the power," or the "elder brother with the power." It is here that an element of succession appears. Male power is transmitted through proximity to the father and his land by various forms of investiture, and through the inheritance of his sacra. These sacra consist of magical stones of various classes, especially a pair of male and female yam stones, feasting stones and garden protection stones, sorcery exuviae, hunting implements and weapons, specific shell ornaments, dwellings, seed yams, the esoteric names of ancestors and corresponding rites and, in particular, the father's lime gourd and spatula. The previous items and shell ornaments are collectively referred to as *ijia rumugu*, "ancestor things." This term is sometimes used in a general way to refer to wealth objects and secret incantations. The latter are most often secret or "hidden" names of remote ancestors. *Ijia rumugu* largely pertains to the *bo aja*. Barai state that a first-born male is advantaged in the bid for the status of leader (see also Strathern 1971:210).

In general, these observations about the attainment of political leadership among the Barai do not deny the role of directed political activity in leadership. They do, however, indicate that achievement can be analytically overvalued, or that leadership is a function of more than minimal ascription. Inheritance of one's father's things, by virtue of being a first-born son, presents the possibility of succession to leadership. Notwithstanding this, there is a culturally recognized mechanism to establish individual identity which circumvents inheritance as a precondition of the possibility of leadership. The following account attempts to describe this aspect of Wawaga Barai leadership.

The major life-cycle exchanges concern the acquisition of male power. Such investiture includes birth, marriage, the first eating of what are categorized as female yams, first naming, bestowal of the perineal band, first hair dressing, first hair cutting, nose piercing, second naming, first ceremonial dressing with the shell and bone nose ornaments and final dressing of the complete man upon man-killing. These rites, in part, represent male power directly in the form of the eel which may also be referred to as *aja*. The eel may be presented as an initiatory gift before all major exchanges. Its anal section is ingested by the bride at the time of the birth of the first male child; a newborn is groomed with a live, young eel, and its tails are worn woven into the hair of males during investiture. This ritual use of the eel is practised by leaders as well as lesser men for their juniors, but there is also a degree of male power which is set apart, "hot power."

The form of power associated directly with the substance of leadership is *aja huhuta*. *Aja huhuta* is "hot power." It is gained progressively from association with the pool of a clan. In particular it is gained and expended in conjunction with yam planting rites (*iro ina*) in which lichen and moss scrapings from the abode of ancestral spirits, the named clan stones, and

water from pools are sprayed, by mouth, over seed yams. Such scrapings are likened to the excreta of the named clan eel. Similarly, the tails of young eels from the sacred pool, and their protective mucus coating may be used in planting rites. Yams themselves are seen as having spirits. Spent seed yams receive a burial much like that of human beings. As a result of the conceptualization of yams as spirit-persons there is a direct and reversible relation between yam rites, birth rites and curative and prophylactic rites. Heightened male power is evidenced in the prohibitions surrounding the various rites and activities. The *aja huhuta* of the leader is evidenced in the manner in which it affects quotidian affairs.

The deaths of wives and younger persons are frequently categorized as *aja ugave*, "dead of male power" (1.4% of all deaths).[17] Inadvertently or as a result of malice, persons are thought to die because of untimely or contextually inappropriate exposure to heightened male power. In one instance, it was said, a big man was digging a post-hole for his new house and his wife approached too closely. She was believed to have been killed by his *aja* which had descended into the hole in the form of his "sweat" and "smell." It had subsequently drawn her *aja* into the hole, causing her to sicken and die. The matter of whether the woman's death was premeditated remained open. The possibility of causing such death remains a prerogative of the "bigman." This heightened male power is thought to develop in the context of horticultural rites as can be seen from the restrictions surrounding them.

Food prohibitions (*agwoe*) are observed before and after the execution of yam planting rites. During the procedures all but the leader performing the ritual are banned from the garden. At its completion the leader avoids contact with all other members of his clan. He reduces his *aja* to a level acceptable to others primarily through drinking and bathing in cold, running water and not entering the village for a period of three days. The use of the eel and its products in yam planting rites are among the normally expected public and private expressions of the source of heightened male power or *aja huhuta*. By contrast, female power is "cold" and "weak."[18] In these ways, "hot" male power is predicated in Barai leadership. If exposure to heightened male power may result in death, it is possible to consider it in the context of the Wawaga Barai generic form of sorcery.

The regional form of sorcery is known as *iri*, and its practitioners as *e iri*, or "man mouth." All men are capable of it in varying degrees. What permits the variation in degree is the level of *aja* attained by the individual. Just as with yam planting rites there are food prohibitions which apply. In particular the sorcerer must avoid cold running water. He must also avoid contact with the victim and all others during the activity. It is likely that the *exuviae*[19] of the victim represents his *aja*. The *aja* attracts the victim's spirit when heated. The *exuviae* may then be eaten by the sorcerer who believes

that he takes the form of a flying fox for the purpose. Alternatively, the heated *exuviae* may be crushed or incinerated. The victim subsequently dies within three days. *Aja* is relative in its concentration. The augmentation of *aja* of the sorcerer is greater than that of ordinary men but the leader is believed to be impervious to sorcery attack. In the form of sorcery which is basic to the Wawaga Barai, *iri*, there is no formal distinction between the practitioner of *iri* and the leader.[20] Heightened male power associated with yam production rites and associated *ma'i ma'i* defines the leader. The leader or *e bo* is thought to be unassailable except in one respect.

The Wawaga Barai visualize the leader as a man who is subject to *navae* which may tentatively be translated as a specific set of signs of death. The leader wears the nose ornaments *e* and *mui*. It is believed that these give him the appearance of the eel. His reflection as an eel is a premonition of his death. Leaders are not thought to be vulnerable to mystical attack. Power builds up within them to the point where they visit the clan pool and their reflection in the pool is that of the eel. They are identified with power and are consumed by it. For Barai, the final consumption of the leaders by *aja* is the obvious localized theoretical limit of the augmentation of male power. It is also viewed as the ultimate mechanism in redressing inequality between males, especially leaders and younger adult males.[21]

The foregoing manifestations of male power and its correlates underscore its extrinsic, material quality. It is clear, however, that there has been an internalization of male power as well. Male power is literally incorporated into the person. The sweat, spittle, breath and exhaled tobacco smoke of leaders are believed to be lethal. Because of the close association of these elements, the lime gourd and spatula are central to generic sorcery and power generally. To illustrate the interrelation of internal and external qualities of male power and their political expression it is necessary to consider the system of *ma'i ma'i*. Emblems converge to demarcate individuals and land to produce social, and more correctly, political beings.

Wawaga Barai provide a generalized scale which goes beyond the simple idea of leaders (*e bo*) and "smaller" men (*e seibia*). The scale is not represented in the number of reeds symbolizing pig transactions as among the Melpa, nor is it found in the differentiation of titles claimed by various powerful men. The Wawaga Barai distinguish degrees of male power and acknowledge transactional performance in the communally acceded right of men to construct an identity from spatially, temporally and resource-typed sets of major and minor hierarchized emblems which converge differentially.[22]

Separately and, to a degree, independently, one may claim a plant emblem and a named bird of paradise. These may be "small" or "large" indicating the degree of increment of male power. But it is with the hierarchy

and interrelation of *ma'i ma'i* that Barai express the political and economic differences between men. Identification with "big" emblems or *ma'i ma'i* reflects the area of land a man has the right to exploit. It also reflects the labour that he can marshall in the form of men and women whose identities are subsumed by these "larger" emblems, and the male power perceived as a precondition of production using these resources.

Conclusions

The Wawaga Valley Barai provide a single cultural focus or principle in which male inequality and competition are codified. The single gradient is the degree of male power (*aja*), seen as informing and enabling human action, whose variation is expressed in a hierarchical system of emblems generating the identity of leaders. The system of emblems is itself defined by the degree of male power. This contrasts with, for example, Modjeska's assertion that Duna ascendancy is based on the evaluated qualities of oratory, knowledge, wealth, transaction and warfare. He sees Duna leadership as a "pretotalization . . . of the more unitary ideal of the leader in high production societies" (Modjeska 1982:86). It is clear though that in the statement of principal leadership types, big man, great man and despot, Duna like the Barai are interstitial. They fall somewhere between the Big Man and Great Man forms but appear to tend toward the Great Man pattern.

Barai male power (*aja*) may be analyzed as the epistemological basis of male agency. Culturally circumscribed, its augmentation can be seen to be founded in control of land and the resources of land and labour. It is obvious that Wawaga Barai must be considered a "low" production society.[23] However, Barai are no less concerned with production of surplus for all that. Nor are they exclusively reliant on the appropriation of the labour of women either ideologically or practically. Again, the codification of inequality among men is related to the hierarchy of *ma'i ma'i*. It is not found exclusively in the amount they transact, nor in finance of exchanges, nor in being "good at something or other." By extension, the list of attributes of "what makes a bigman" cannot structurally determine Barai leadership. It is, in part, what makes a good cassowary hunter, salt maker or other technical specialist, but not a leader.

The simple fact of a man being identified with the *rabijo* of a garden, the *ani* of a hunting ground, or the *buru* of a clan illustrates that *aja* accompanies success or failure in all activities. The elder brother as the *bo aja* and village leader as the *aja bo* present leadership and group formation as a singular and unified process. This is best exemplified in the exchange of identity for labour, an exchange of equivalences. Godelier conveniently pondered when the exchange of equivalences is supplanted against "labour

and the product of labour'' (1982:33). It is clear that Wawaga Barai redefine extant relations, redress inequality between males of the clan segment, clan, paired-clan and contiguous clans through exchange of identities against labour and the surplus it generates. But it is equally clear that this occurs along an ''unequivocal'' cultural gradient of male power expressed as individual identity with a given *ma'i ma'i*. Stated differently, leadership positions are attained by appropriating the labour of others, bestowed by others for lesser rights of identity in consideration of their labour. In the end there may be no redress gained in change of affiliation, or positive effects may be achieved. In any case the individual believes he has removed himself from a non-productive situation.

The expression of inequality between men may be said to speak to a ritual hierarchy in low production societies. However, the attainment of various positions in the hierarchy is open to competition. It is a competition for the control and deployment of basic resources on the basis of a number of cardinal factors: devolution of these resources, and willingness to exchange labour for new or incipient identity for another. Inequality and hierarchy among the Barai have a different locus from that found in societies which utilize increments and enchainments in transactions.[24]

Acknowledgments

Research on which this paper is based was conducted from May 1973 to February 1975 with the support of the Canada Council through the Papua Communications Project of the University of Toronto. I am indebted to Nicholas Modjeska for his comments.

Notes

1. Leadership specialists comprising a necessary whole are conceived along the same lines as groups specializing in particular economic activities. The point is that some totemic systems in Papua New Guinea have been presented as a matter of organic solidarity. As noted, Avatip (Harrison 1988) ''exchange'' the ''pre-conditions of production.'' This is not the occasion for a review of the Papua New Guinea totemism literature. It is important to note that Forge (1972:531) categorically denies the possibility of organic solidarity in non-Melanesian groups of the interior. Forge states, ''Here mechanical solidarity reigns supreme''(p. 531). He illustrates the point with the Iatmul where the homology between environment and human groups is not tenable as each clan has the same set of totems differentiated only by the names with which they are vested. This type of totemic system stands firmly in contrast to those analyzed by Lévi-Strauss (1963).
2. This interpretation of Barai power and leadership applies to a particular period of *pax australiana* The delineation of early to late colonial periods through modernism is considered in Barker and Rohatynskyj (n.d.). This article does not exhaust ideas of identity and inequality in the two modes of exchange. It ignores ''free giving'' and ''gift-economic'' exchange.

3. *Buru, duna* and *tuna* in formal usage refer to any bird of prey or "diving bird" and to the named New Guinea Eagle of a clan. *Duna* and *tuna* are equivalent. They are also the affixes applied to the names of the clan eagles. For example, the eagle named Vabura becomes Vaburaduna or Vaburatuna. The use of such forms is a commonplace among the Barai of the Mimai River system, the Ömie, the Mountain Koiari of the Northern and Central Provinces, and extends to some Managalase groups and to the Orokaiva of Sirorata, Sairope and the Wasida. In lower areas *duna* may refer more regularly to Doria's hawk. F. E. Williams (1969:128) speaks of the "children of the eagle-hawk." This particular emblem is also present among the Biage and Chirima. Hallpike (1977:156; see pp. 264, 265) states that "it was clear that there was a vital association in their minds between the principal chiefs and birds (especially the *tuna*, a bird of prey) and sacred oaks."
4. *Sa gigigigigi* itself is without translation, it is from a stock of phrases referred to as the "first people's language." It may be equated to a "battle cry."
5. The activities may be as diverse as the felling of a large tree or litigation at the sub-District Office.

   There are also small hardwood trees which have proper names without affixes. Their names are invoked in "fights" within the paired clan. They are employed when invocation of a *buru* would not be appropriate, or when defeat is a likelihood. I do not classify these items as part of the *ma'i ma'i* set proper.
6. Certain hunting grounds are considered to be *ai urie* or "wild places," The central *ma'i ma'i* sites are found in such places. The very places themselves and their attendant spirits revolt at alien things, whether European or female.
7. If such an *idi maruri* falls, or dies it is replanted and renamed.
8. The *hai*, as the carved breastbone of the cassowary, was replaced in the last 60 or so years by a bailer shell. This shell often has a tortoise skin inlay. The cassowary breastbone and the bailer shell are symbolic representations of the human breastbone which is the location of the living spirit of man.
9. Gregory (1982:41) differentiates systems which objectify people and systems which personify things (M. Strathern 1988:18).
10. Shamanism exists among the Barai as a technical specialty. It is potentially practised by all leaders. There is usually an adept. This adept does not have a title. The medium has a named spirit familiar. These spirits are a class apart. They live under the rivers which bound territories at Horotihaha and are referred to as Horu. These spirits, for the most part, punish infractions of rules of propriety—especially, but not exclusively, of a sexual nature (cf. Kelly 1977:62 fn. 28, 29). Horu are considered to be unpredictable.
11. Intense trade existed between the Fuyughe, Chirima, Biage and the Tuade.
12. As regards the formerly few Local Government Council positions, various committee men and modern entrepreneurial activity the following may be observed. There was a clear division between younger and older siblings: the younger ones concentrating on these activities as opposed to traditional activities. Barai consciously held the question of traditional leadership apart from modern activities. They actively excluded modernists from almost every aspect of traditional leadership. Similarly European goods, clothing and cultigens are forbidden from most hunting grounds and many gardens. However there was a pronounced tendency for such enterprises as experimental trade stores to be promoted by the traditional leadership as a matter of inter-clan rivalry while they denigrated their operators publicly.

    I have said little of these matters because there was no form of entrepreneurial activity that actually succeeded in the time in which I was in the Valley; nor is there now. This continual record of failure did not of course mean that the practitioner had any choice but to continue along his road.

13. The consumption of cooked meat is similar to the gifts of cooked pork which an unrelated female receives clandestinely as an invitation to sexual intercourse. Whether the former indicates illegitimate sexual relations and the latter illegitimate affiliation is appealing to consider but not demonstrable.
14. Barai do not believe that ingested meat is excreted, rather it goes directly to form muscle.
15. The despotic leader who "forces people to do heavy work" is rare but in the two known examples expulsion and assassination were the result.
16. The regional belief that the clan grandmother pig and her children can be sent to destroy the gardens of individuals and groups of villages is known as *mahe*. It is greatly feared and a determinant of behaviour.
17. The figure of 1.4% represents the number of persons generally agreed to have died from *aja* in the village of Emo River in ego's generation and the two ascending and descending generations. It is fairly evenly divided as to age categories and sex.
18. Barai female power, *aja babaimo*, the "power the wife makes" is explored elsewhere. *Aja*, power, is attributed to both men and women. The wife's power is seen as an ability to arrest male projects but it is not conceptualized as being generically different. It is "weak" and "less," but not inherently "other." This observation might be contrasted with that of Young (1987:229) who sees the power of men as "incremental, something extrinsic to be appropriated" while female power remains "intrinsic."
19. The word *exuviae*' is used in an extended sense as those food remains discarded by the individual, anything which is thought to be contacted by his breath, saliva, excrement, sweat, blood. In fact anything closely associated with or carried by the individual.
20. There are several qualifications to present here. First, the sorcery form, *iri* is considered here in its quotidian aspect. The matter of the specialist, or *e iri dinu* is held apart. It is the rule that such a specialist is not a leader. Second, notwithstanding the first point, the *e bo* who makes recourse to *iri* has in a sense put his standing in question. The Barai view does not preclude the leader from being competent and/or excelling in sorcery, hunting or some other endeavour. It means simply that he is not a "base" or "root" man in the practice.
21. At each locally recognized politico-historical juncture Barai *navae* remains the limit on male power – barring cult reversals. At the time of research it was the practical limit on horticultural production (*iro ina*). This produced regional cults and extreme sexual antagonism. The foundation of sexual antagonism being the insistence of a general male parthenogenesis in opposition to female reproduction or *ina* (Barker and Rohatynskyj 1989). At a mundane level *navae* connotes a specific set of signs of death.
22. As noted, *e ma'i* refers to the demarcation between hunting-gathering and domesticated pig traditions. The full set of major clan emblems is referred to as *namie* which is a direct reference to *mie* the class of marsupials including cassowary.
23. I have used the phrase "low production society" throughout. Its use is justified by the fact that pig herds over the Wawaga Valley do not surpass 0.7 per capita. The peak periods of pig production for large pig sacrifices (maximum of 25) does not significantly alter the average. Pigs are fed cooked food perhaps once a day, after which they forage. Only in the last 6 to 9 months before its sacrifice is a large pig blinded to keep it near to hand when it is more intensively fed.

    Approximately 30 varieties of yam are culturally central to Barai ideas of production. Production levels for them are obviously limited. Sweet potato is cultivated on an extremely restricted scale and resisted. Taro is cultivated for ritual purposes as a vestige of a cult and is left to putrify as fertilizer for yams, but is not otherwise significant. There is no real scarcity of marsupials and birds in the higher forest. Similarly gather-

ing in the strict sense of the term forms a significant part of diet and there is a seasonal reliance on it. There is also a seasonal reliance on red oil pandanus and breadfruit.

24. A wider comparative net could be cast in terms of the determinacy of male power in matters of male inequality and identity. The Wawaga Valley Barai ideas of efficacy and male agency provide a very different starting point, from say Melpa *ndating*. *Ndating* is identified by Strathern as the "paternal substance," and a proximate descent principle (Strathern 1972:10-13). Although *ndating* may also be interpreted as enabling effective action, Barai *aja* must be seen to diverge distinctly. Given Strathern's interpretation of *ndating* it is not surprising, in the Melpa case, that the extrinsic attributes of male power should thus turn toward increment in inter-group transaction and appear to be determinant of a particular type of New Guinea society.

References Cited

Barker, T.R.
1979 Barai Group Formation. Ph.D. Dissertation, Department of Anthropology, University of Toronto.
1991 Small Bands of Strangers: The Contrapuntal Lineage Reconsidered. Anthropos 86, forthcoming.

Barker, T.R., and M. Rohatynskyj
1989 Cult and Male Agency in North-Central Papua. Unpublished manuscript.

Forge, A.
1972 The Golden Fleece. Man n.s. 7(4):527-540.

Godelier, M.
1982 Social Hierarchies among the Baruya of New Guinea. *In* Inequality in New Guinea Highland Societies, edited by A. Strathern, pp. 3-49. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
1986 The Making of Great Men: Male Domination and Power among the New Guinea Baruya, [1982]. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press and Editions de la Maison des Sciences de l'Homme.

Gregory, C.
1980 Gifts to Men and Gifts to God: Gift Exchange and Capital Accumulation in Contemporary Papua. Man n.s. 15(4),626-52.
1982 Gifts and Commodities. London: Academic Press.

Hallpike, C.
1977 Bloodshed and Vengeance in the Papuan Mountains: The Generation of Conflict in Tuade Society. Oxford: The Clarendon Press.

Harding, T., and B. Wallace, eds.
1970 Culture of the Pacific: Selected Readings. London: Collier-Macmillan Ltd.

Harrison, S.
1988 Magical Exchange of the Preconditions of Production in a Sepik River Village. Man n.s. 23:319-333.

Holy, L., ed.
1979 Segmentary Lineage Systems Reconsidered. The Queen's University Papers in Social Anthropology. Belfast: The Queen's University Press.

Kelly, R.
1977 Etoro Social Structure: A Study in Structural Contradiction. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Lévi-Strauss, Claude
1963 Totemism. London: Merlin Press

Lindenbaum, S.
1979 Kuru Sorcery. Palo Alto: Mayfield.

Modjeska, N.
1982 Production and inequality: Perspectives from Central New Guinea. *In* Inequality in New Guinea Highlands Societies, edited by A. Strathern, pp. 50-108. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Morauta, L.
1973 Traditional Polity in Madang. Oceania 44:127-56.

Sahlins, M.
1970 Poor Man, Rich Man, Big-Man, Chief: Political Types in Melanesia and Polynesia. *In* Culture of the Pacific: Selected Readings [1963], edited by T. Harding and B. Wallace, pp. 203-215. London: Collier-MacMillan.
1974 Stone Age Economics [1972]. Chicago: Aldine.

Strathern, A.
1969 Finance and Production: Two strategies in New Guinea Highland Exchange Systems. Oceania 40(1):42-67.
1971 The Rope of Moka: Big-Men and Ceremonial Exchange in Mount Hagen, New Guinea. Cambridge Studies in Social Anthropology, No. 4. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
1972 One Father, One Blood: Descent and Group Structure among the Melpa People. Canberra: ANU Press.
1979 We Are All One Father Here: Models of Descent in New Guinea Highlands Societies. *In* Segmentary Lineage Systems Reconsidered. The Queen's University Papers in Social Anthropology, edited by L. Holy, pp. 137-157. Belfast: The Queen's University.
1982 Two Waves of Models in the New Guinea Highlands. *In* Inequality in New Guinea Highland Societies, edited by A. Strathern, pp. 35-49. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
1984 A Line of Power. London: Tavistock Publications.

Strathern, A., ed.
1982 Inequality in New Guinea Highlands Societies. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Strathern, M.
1988 The Gender of the Gift: Problems with Women and Problems with Society in Melanesia. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Weiner, J.
1987 Diseases of the Soul: Sickness, Agency and the Men's Cult among the Foi of New Guinea. *In* Dealing With Inequality: Analyzing Gender Relations in Melanesia and Beyond, edited by M. Strathern, pp. 255-277. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

1988 Mountain Papuans: Historical and Comparative Perspectives from New Guinea Fringe Highlands Societies. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

1988a Introduction: Looking at the New Guinea Highlands from its Edge. *In* Mountain Papuans: Historical and Comparative Perspectives from New Guinea Fringe Highlands Societies, edited by J. Weiner, pp. 1-38. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press.

Williams, F.E.

1925 Plant Emblems among the Orokaiva, Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute 55:405-424.

1969 Orokaiva Society. [1930] Oxford: The Clarendon Press.

Young, Michael W.

1987 The Tusk, the Flute and the Serpent: Disguise and Revelation in Goodenough Mythology *In* Dealing with Inequality: Analyzing Gender Relations in Melanesia and Beyond, edited by M. Strathern, pp. 229-254. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

CONTROLLING TEXTUALITY: A CALL FOR A RETURN TO THE SENSES

David Howes[1]
Concordia University

Abstract: This essay traces the involution of anthropological understanding from the 1950s to the present. It is shown that as the conception of "doing ethnography" changed from sensing patterns to reading texts, and from reading texts to writing culture, so too did the content of anthropological knowledge change from being multi-sensory to being self-centred. The essay also proposes a way of escaping the tunnel-vision of contemporary (post-modern) ethnography – namely, by treating cultures as constituted by a particular interplay of the senses which the ethnographer must simulate *before* making any attempt to describe or evoke the culture under study.

Résumé: Cet article trace l'enchevêtrement qu'a subi l'étude de l'anthropologie depuis les années cinquante à nos jours. L'auteur démontre que le concept de "faire de l'ethnographie" a changé radicalement – de la perception sensorielle à la lecture des textes et de cette lecture à l'acte d'écrire une culture. Également, le contenu des connaissances anthropologiques a subi un changement du multi-sensoriel à l'égocentrique. L'article propose comment s'éloigner du champ de vue plutôt étroit de l'ethnographie contemporaine (dite post-moderne) en suggérant que les ethnographes traitent les cultures telles que constituées par l'action réciproque particulière des sens qui doivent être simulés avant que les ethnographes puissent essayer de décrire ou d'évoquer la culture en question.

> For us, the world is the ensemble of references opened up by the texts.
> – Paul Ricoeur (1971:535-536)

> Perception has nothing to do with it.
> – Stephen Tyler (1986:137)

Anthropologica XXXII (1990) 55-73

This essay traces the involution of anthropological understanding from the 1950s to the present. It is shown that as the conception of "doing ethnography" changed from sensing patterns to reading texts, and from reading texts to writing culture, so too did the content of anthropological knowledge change from being multi-sensory to being self-centred. The essay begins and ends with a critique of the position that "Ethnography . . . might be a kind of writing" (Geertz 1988:1). It is shown that this position can only be described as pathological in view of the epistemological anaesthesia it induces. To escape from this anaesthetized state, anthropologists must learn to control their textuality instead of letting it control them. What is more, they could strive for the restoration of the project of "making sense" of other cultures, which was pursued by Rhoda Métraux and her peers in the middle decades of this century, or so it shall be argued.

Part 1: Writing and Experience

In *The Man With A Shattered World*, A.R. Luria describes the case of a Russian soldier by the name of Zasetsky whose world was literally shattered as a result of a head wound suffered during World War II. The injury deprived him of his middle- and long-term memory, the ability to organize sensory perceptions into meaningful wholes, and the capacity to grasp the relationship of words to their objects. Virtually all that he retained from his former life was the ability to write and an odd assortment of words. With the utmost effort, he managed to put these words into sentences. The sentences in turn "became his world, and writing his way of thinking" (Hall 1977:30).

In recent years, certain anthropologists have written themselves into a position or corner remarkably similar to Zasetsky's. For example, no post-modern anthropologist would dream of suggesting that the culture he or she studies be regarded as a meaningful perceptual whole, "collage" maybe (Taussig 1987). Nor would any post-modern anthropologist presume that words have a referential function. The stress is all on their "expressive" or "poetic" function—that is, words may "evoke" reality but they do not "represent" it (Tyler 1986).

It is with regard to the meaning to be found in the experience of fieldwork that the position of the post-modern anthropologist most closely approximates Zasetsky's. Witness the following remark of James Clifford (1988:110): "ethnographic comprehension [is] . . . better seen as a creation of ethnographic *writing* . . . than a consistent quality of ethnographic *experience*." In illustration of his point, Clifford cites the case of Bronislaw Malinowski. There is an irony involved here in that Malinowski was the originator of the method of participant-observation, and therefore attached far more importance to understanding through experience than through writing.

What Clifford highlights is the discrepancy between the professed goal of Malinowski's fieldwork, which was "to grasp the native's point of view, his relation to life, to realise *his* vision of *his* world" (Malinowski 1961:25) and the picture which emerges from his posthumously published diary. The latter reveals a soul perplexed by questions of identity, tortured by self-doubt and generally ambivalent in its attitude toward the native (i.e. not empathic at all). In Clifford's terms, what enabled Malinowski to "rescue a self" from the "disintegration and depression" which thus appears to have pervaded his experience in the Trobriand Islands was "the process of writing" *Argonauts of the Western Pacific* in the Canary Islands! The implication is that had it not been for the latter sojourn, where writing became his way of thinking, he would never have succeeded at "the fictional invention of the Trobrianders" or "the construction of a new public figure, the anthropologist as fieldworker" (Clifford 1988:110).

While post-modern anthropologists still do fieldwork, it is no longer referred to as such but rather as "the process of textualization." Furthermore, within this new episteme, writing figures as the means of experience instead of coming after it (as in Malinowski's situation). For example, while it was once permissible to assume that an ethnography is a record of an ethnographer's experience, according to Stephen Tyler (1986:138): "No, it is not a record of experience at all; it is the means of experience. That experience became experience only in the writing of the ethnography. Before that it was only a disconnected array of chance happenings. No experience preceded the ethnography. The experience was the ethnography."

The notion that there is no experience before or without writing, like Derrida's aphorism, "there is no linguistic sign before writing" (Derrida 1976:14), is a potential source of many creative insights. At the same time, one cannot help suspecting that Tyler, like Derrida, has got things backwards—a suspicion which is confirmed by the briefest glance at the frontispiece of *Writing Culture* (Clifford and Marcus 1986). The photograph, which bears the caption "Stephen Tyler in the field," shows Tyler with his back turned to his informants, writing.

It would be an exaggeration to say that whereas ethnographers used to face their informants and try to experience the world their way, now they turn their backs on them and write. But this claim is less exaggerated than one might hope, for what do anthropologists write most about nowadays? One would be hard pressed to find a single recent book on "the method of participant observation," but the number of books on "strategies of text construction" has skyrocketed (see, for example, Marcus and Fischer 1986; van Maanen 1988; Clifford 1988; Geertz 1988). What precipitated this dramatic shift in focus?

In what follows, I shall argue that the publication of *The Interpretation of Cultures* (Geertz 1973) was a major contributing factor, although the full effects of the epistemological rupture this book introduced would not become apparent until a decade later. Clifford Geertz was the first to take cognizance of the fact that the answer to the question, "What does the ethnographer do?" is that "—he writes" (Geertz 1973:19). This answer is so obvious that it does make it somewhat astonishing that throughout the previous history of anthropological inquiry ethnographers believed that "Man," not writing, was the *telos* of their discipline. Of course, they were justified in treating "man" as their end by the fact that both the term "anthropology" and the term "ethnography" refer to "man" or "nation" first, and to read them the other way—that is, Geertz's way, placing the accent on "the word" (*logos*) or "writing" (*graphe*)—would be to reverse their meaning. In any event, Geertz sensitized anthropologists to their calling as authors not only by what he said but also by how he said it—namely, with (superlative) style.

There is another reason the role of the ethnographer was not seen to be so bound up with writing prior to what could be called the "textual revolution" of the 1970s, which is that before this period ethnographers tended to regard other cultures as perceptual systems rather than as texts. Of course, the idea of treating other cultures "as texts" was also one of Geertz's: "The culture of a people is an ensemble of texts . . . which the anthropologist strains to read over the shoulders of those to whom they properly belong" (Geertz 1973:452). Now, there is a nice fit between defining cultures "as texts" and defining the ethnographic function as one of reading-writing. But what does such an approach occlude? Is it, for example, pertinent to the analysis of non-literate cultures? How is "non-verbal communication" to be comprehended within such a framework? What kind of sensory bias does the model of the text import?

Let us pursue the last question for a moment. Geertz wrote *Islam Observed*. Given that oral communication is so fundamental to Islamic civilization, and that "the Qur'an is not the Qur'an unless it is heard" (Nelson 1985:13), would it not have been more appropriate for him to approach Islam through the auditory (than the ocular) modality and to have called his book "Islam Overheard"?

This line of questioning is inspired by Marshall McLuhan (1962) and Walter Ong's (1967) work on how changes in the technology of communications affect the "ratio" or balance between the senses and cognitive processes generally. The same goes for changes in the metaphors for ethnography, as we shall see.

While some writers in the mainstream of textual (or if you prefer, interpretive) anthropology allude to Ong's work (e.g. Clifford 1986:11; Tyler

1986:131), it is those outside the mainstream who have pursued the McLuhan-Ong line of questioning the farthest both in their writing and in their fieldwork (e.g. Seeger 1975; Ohnuki-Tierney 1981; Stoller 1982; Feld 1983; Stoller and Olkes 1986). What is remarkable about the latter body of work is not so much the "experimental" form in which it is written (Marcus and Fischer 1986) as the experiment in perception on which the writing is based. By experimenting with their senses the way these authors do, not only do they link up with a venerable tradition in anthropology (as will be shown in the next part), they also display a degree of "reflexivity" which is greater than that of those who stress reflexivity but at the same time hold that "perception has nothing to do with [ethnography]" (Tyler 1986:137). This raises a puzzling point: while textual anthropologists are extremely conscious of their writing *style*, or "how to get themselves into print," their reflexivity does not seem to encompass the effects of print and other such extensions of the senses on consciousness itself. Various examples of this will be discussed in Part 3, "Creating Texts." But first let us explore how anthropology was practised before the textual revolution.

Part 2: Sensing Patterns

In the 1950s, the long-standing interest of anthropologists in the senses and perception (see e.g. Boas 1889) was given a new twist. Attention shifted from the problem of how people discriminate within a particular sensory modality to the question of what sorts of relationships obtain *between* the modalities. One thinks of the work of E. T. Hall (1969) and Edmund Carpenter (1973) and of Irving Hallowell's (1955) work on spatial orientation among the Ojibway, emphasizing that space is a construct which must be perceived through several modalities at once. One also thinks of Dorothy Lee's reflections on what her Wintu informant meant when he told her that *watca* means "to weep," "is he, like me, thinking of the whole kinesthetic activity with all its emotional implications, or is he merely concerned with the sound of keening, as I think he is?"—given the marked reluctance in Wintu society to "penetrate beyond external form" (Lee 1959:126). One thinks, above all, of Rhoda Métraux's (1953) essay, "Resonance in Imagery."

In this essay, Métraux both codified the analytic practices of her colleagues and sought to articulate a methodology for the study of culture "at a distance" (i.e., by means of literature, films, Rorschach protocols and above all, encounter sessions with emigré informants). She took the "image" as her point of entry, defined as "any unit in the perceptual system through which individuals are related to one another in a culture" (Métraux 1953:350). Thus, a gesture, a drum rhythm, a design on a jug, a scent, a

meal, a figure of speech—each communicate an image in a different modality, and the task of the research worker is to work out how one image "echoes and reinforces and counterpoints another" so as to arrive, ultimately, at "an accurate statement of the configuration of a given culture" (Métraux 1953:343). As Métraux says of this approach:

> To construct the unfamiliar pattern [or configuration] one is dependent on one's own sensibilities to sight and sound and movement, to figures of speech and tone of voice, to gesture and plastic representations, to proportional and colour relationships, to external configurations and to one's own proprioceptions for one's awareness of imagery and ability to transpose from one to another modality following the styles of the culture. Part of one's work consists in learning to modulate one's sensory perceptions and to alter the organization of these perceptions so that one can perhaps make finer discriminations between colours or, on the contrary, can group together colours which one is accustomed to distinguishing . . . And part of one's work consists in learning to perceive and so to build up new image clusters . . . congruent with one another but different in content and form from those one has hitherto known. (Métraux 1953:357-358)

Thus, whereas the research worker must rely on his or her own perceptual system (or sensibilities) to begin with, in time, she or he will have succeeded in constructing an internal model of the perceptual system used by his or her informants, and be able to compare the two intra-subjectively. According to Métraux (1953:357, 360), it is the development of such a "disciplined conscious awareness of the *two* systems within which one is working"—in short, *the capacity to be of two sensoria at once*—which ensures that the research worker's account is "not a generalized account of his own experience (which would be perhaps an *appreciation* of another culture [such as a creative writer might produce]) but rather an account of the way in which others experience the world, organized in a particular way, i.e., through the medium of his own disciplined consciousness."

Métraux goes on to describe how some of her fellows, each in their own way, disciplined their consciousnesses. One characterized the process as

> one in which he creates an "internal society" with "multiple voices" that carry on "multiple conversations" in his own mind. . . . [Another] seems in some way to ingest the culture so that, in effect, her own body becomes a living model of the culture on which she is working as well as the culture of which she is herself a member, and she continually tests out relationships in terms of her own bodily integration. And another describes the process as one of "receiving and sending kinesthetic sets, strengthened by auditory patterns—largely pitch, intonation and stress rather than words . . . I muscularly feel in rhythmic patterns the activity of others—singly or in groups—reading them as I read written material, in chunks, consciously registering

> only shifts of cadence or expectancy violations, internalizing the rest which is relatively easy to recall." (Métraux 1953:361)

One could never accuse these anthropologists of reifying the cultures on which they worked—they embodied them. As should also be apparent, it is not correct to accuse Métraux and her set of creating "worlds" that are "subjective, rather than dialogical or intersubjective" (Clifford 1988:37). The first anthropologist Métraux quotes appears eminently "dialogical" in the way he organized his perceptions, if not his writing style, while the other two seem eminently "intersubjective" given their internal awareness and use of "*multiple* systems" of perception (Métraux 1953:361). Rather than multiplying the voices that appear in their texts, what these anthropologists did was multiply their sensoria (or selves). Put another way, for them cultural analysis involved mastering all sorts of alien techniques of perception as opposed to interiorizing certain "genre conventions" (Marcus and Cushman 1982).

There are two points about the approach of Métraux and her contemporaries I wish to emphasize, the significance of which will become apparent in the next part when we turn to consider the rise of interpretive anthropology. One concerns their attitude to literature, something they never did interpret, but rather analyzed as "a source of data on man's use of his senses" (Hall 1969:100). This is because it was the "construction" of culture, not its "interpretation" that interested them. Thus, in a section on "literature as a key to perception" in *The Hidden Dimension*, Hall (1969:94) proposed that "instead of regarding [a British, American or Japanese] author's images as literary conventions, we examine them as . . . highly patterned systems which release memories."

The other point has to do with learning to transpose one's perceptions from one modality to another following the styles of a culture. Let me illustrate this by elaborating on Edmund Carpenter's (1973) discussion of how the graphic representations of certain non-literate societies are best seen as expressions of an oral consciousness very different from the visual consciousness of "typographic man" (McLuhan 1962).

Consider the following portrait of bear from a Tsimshian house-front: If we ask, "What is the point of view expressed in this representation?" we are forced to admit that it does not have one, but many, as many as there are sides to bear: the animal has been cut from back to front and flattened so that one sees both sides at once (as well as the back, which is indicated by the jagged outlines). Because *we* know that one cannot see an object from all sides at once, we conclude that the artist "lacked perspective." But this is too simple. What we ought to be asking ourselves is how the artist's hand

might have been guided by the ear rather than the eye, given that the culture to which he belonged was an oral one.

There are two facts about auditory consciousness which seem pertinent in this connection. One is that one can hear but not see around corners. The other is that sound surrounds, it "comes at you" from all directions at once. The Tsimshian representation of bear is consistent with both of these facts. Thus, the code in which this painting is expressed is auditory rather than visual. Put another way, the Tsimshian tend to transpose visual imagery into auditory imagery even in their plastic arts. Understanding that art involves "hearing with the eye" (Carpenter 1973:30).

To sum up, we have seen how some of the leading anthropologists of the 1950s and 1960s organized their experience of other cultures by *embodying* them in determinate ways, and how for them the world was the ensemble of references opened up by the interplay of the senses.

Part 3: Creating Texts

All of this was to change following Geertz's (1973) suggestion, in his celebrated article on the Balinese cockfight, that we regard cultures as "ensembles of texts" to be interpreted. The metaphor of the text provided anthropologists with a way of integrating their experience very different from having to use their bodies. It permitted them to fall back on a structure of perception—namely, that of "reading"—already familiar to them, being literate men and women, instead of having to adjust their perceptions so as to conform to the manner in which their informants perceive the world.

In what does the "interpretive method," or the method of "reading culture" consist? It consists, first of all, in assuming that events or actions have

the same sort of "propositional structure" as written texts (Ricoeur 1971: 538), that they "contain their own interpretations" (Geertz 1973: 453). The question then becomes one of how to gain access to these meanings. Geertz's solution, which is borrowed from the hermeneutics of Wilhelm Dilthey and Paul Ricoeur, is to let his imagination circle through the culture-as-text: "Hopping back and forth between the whole conceived through the parts that actualize it and the parts conceived through the whole that motivates them" (Geertz 1983:69). In this way, Geertz was able to arrive at a "reading" of the Balinese cockfight, a social event, as a commentary on the divisiveness of status in Balinese society.

There are a number of obvious objections to this way of proceeding. The first is that events do not possess the same stability as texts. To treat them as such, as "fixed expressions" (Ricoeur 1971:532; Clifford 1988:36) is to reify them. This point may be illustrated negatively by considering the closest thing to text production there is in an oral society such as that of the Australian Aborigines. We think of the wooden and stone churingas of the Arunta, as described by Spencer and Gillen. The most frequent design met with on the churingas is that of a series of concentric circles, which usually indicate some totemic creature or other. These devices might seem to function much like printed texts or business logos to us, because they are permanently inscribed. But as Spencer and Gillen (1968:145) found, "the same device will mean one thing to a native of one totem and quite another thing to a man who belongs to another totem, and as a man's knowledge is strictly confined to the designs of his own totem, it is quite unsafe to ask, say, an emu man to describe to you the markings on a wild cat churinga, or vice versa." Thus, the signifiers in question are contingent for their meaning on group membership, and the meanings are *not* repeatable.

This complete absence of standardization underlines the fact that for the Arunta the designs are "events" rather than "signs" (Ong 1982:76). As McLuhan (1962:37) would say, "they have no detached point of view," and as he further remarks, "No . . . nomadic people ever had writing any more than they ever developed architecture or 'enclosed space.' For writing is a visual enclosure of non-visual spaces and senses. It is, therefore, an abstraction of the visual from the ordinary sense interplay." Significant in this regard is the fact that the Arunta handle the churingas as much as they view them, butting them against their stomachs, and there is always singing when the churingas are revealed (Spencer and Gillen 1968:171-2, 188, 284-6)—i.e., *total* sensory involvement.

Our second objection to interpretive anthropology is that the hermeneutic method was evolved for the purpose of interpreting the written documents of Western culture. Given that this method was elaborated with the text as its object, how are we to know if it is capable of interpreting anything out-

side the text? Does it not follow that it will mark off for interpretation only those aspects of a form of life which are amenable to textualization and ignore the rest? This point is best illustrated by the manner in which Geertz (1973:450) represents the cockfight as enabling the Balinese "to see a dimension of his own subjectivity" the same way *Macbeth* or *King Lear* enable us to see ours. The analogy is with going to "see a play," as we say. It is only by way of a footnote that we learn that to use a visual idiom (or the analogy of a play) might not be altogether fitting in that "Balinese follow the progress of the fight as much (perhaps, as fighting cocks are actually rather hard to see except as blurs of motion, more) with their bodies as with their eyes, moving their limbs, heads and trunks in gestural mimicry of the cock's maneuvers, [so] that much of the individual's experience of the fight is kinesthetic rather than visual" (Geertz 1973:451 n. 40). It is telling that this sort of sense datum, which loomed so large in the accounts of other "worlds" written by earlier generations (see e.g. Bateson and Mead 1942), should be consigned to a footnote by Geertz.

The reason for this is simple. For the hermeneutician, "the world is the ensemble of references opened up by the texts" (Ricoeur 1971:535-6): literary allusions (e.g. to *Macbeth*) and the projection of one's own interpretations onto the actions of one's informants therefore come to take the place of trying to ascertain the configuration of their perceptual system and "catching the resonances of their imagery" (Métraux 1953:362). Of course, if one assumes that a meal, a ritual dance or a temple "may be the same sort of thing" as a linguistic text, and that "we can apply our ways of knowing about linguistic texts to these other sorts of symbolic constructions," as Alton Becker (1979:2) does, then it is hardly necessary to modulate one's sense perceptions as a Métraux would. Indeed, all one really needs is a "text-organ," which is how Becker suggests we regard symbolic systems. The fact that there is no anatomical basis for this suggestion does not seem to have worried Becker. But the postulation of such fictive organs does worry us because of what such fictions portend for the sense organs proper—complete atrophy.

The interpretive method may thus be said to compound the cultural biases of the ethnographer, rather than, as has been claimed, "offer a sophisticated alternative to the now apparently naive claims for experiential authority" advanced by Métraux and her contemporaries (Clifford 1988:38). For the interpretive ethnographer is not only a member of a literate (or text-producing) culture, he also uses the model of the text as a grid for the modulation of his perception-interpretation of *other* cultures. In short, what the adoption of a Geertzian approach imports is a double interiorization of reading-writing.

The effect of this double interiorization is apparent in the research agenda of those in the vanguard of contemporary "culture theory." What is foremost on that agenda is the study of other people's "minds, selves and emotions," to quote from the sub-title of *Culture Theory* (Shweder and LeVine 1984; see further Marcus and Fischer 1986:45). This inward turn, or shift in the direction of an anthropology of self and feeling, relates to writing in the following way. As Ong (1982:69) points out: "orality fosters personality structures that in certain ways are more communal and externalized, and less introspective, than those among literates. Oral communication unites people in groups. Writing and reading are solitary activities that throw the psyche back on itself."

Thus, literacy not only promotes a "reflexive" turn of mind, but also makes what is "inside" the person a matter for overt speculation and analytic discourse in ways that orality does not. In illustration of this point, consider the following excerpt from an account of the concept of the person among the Ommura of New Guinea. The account is written by a British social anthropologist whose mind has not been invaded by the text to the same extent as those who follow Geertz, and whose writing therefore permits us to "hear" as much as to "see" how the Ommura think:

> It was stressed that one cannot "see" the motives, thoughts, or intentions of another. They are "inside the ear." As elsewhere in Papua New Guinea, intellectual processes, knowledge and memory are asociated with the ear. The same verb "*iero*" is used to mean "to hear" (a sound) and "to know" or "to understand." It is taken for granted that people tend to keep their true . . . thoughts, motives and intentions "hidden," and my habit of asking questions such as "Why did he do that?" or "Does she like these?" was generally regarded as rather pointless. Such questions are not treated as matters for overt speculation or analytic discourse, and the typical retort was "Why ask me? I cannot see inside his ear."
>
> Similarly, a person's feelings, emotions and physical sensations are, for the most part "invisible" to others. . . . Most feeling and emotion remains "inside the belly" . . . so that no one else can "see" it. (Mayer 1982:246)

The implication of this account vis-à-vis the research agenda of the interpretive ethnographer is that the latter, having doubly interiorized writing, tends to ask questions from within a literate frame of reference for which there can be no answer from within an oral culture. This is not to belittle those questions. It is simply to emphasize the importance of understanding where they come from; namely, that they are thrown up by the invasion of consciousness by writing.

We have seen how the textual revolution has had the effect of narrowing both the ways in which anthropologists perceive the world and the sorts of issues they perceive as worthy of investigation. Its most pernicious effect,

however, has been the *prise de conscience* it sparked of the fact that what the ethnographer does is "write."

It was inevitable that the textual revolution should have precipitated increased self-consciousness about writing, given that "writing and reading are solitary activities that throw the psyche back on itself," as discussed above. Nevertheless, it was not until the beginning of the 1980s that this reflex rose to consciousness. At that point, a number of texts appeared with titles like "Ethnographies as Texts" (Marcus and Cushman 1982) and "On Ethnographic Authority" (Clifford [1983] 1988). While many anthropologists continued reading the classics for what they said (Malinowski as an authority *on* the Trobriand Islanders), the authors of these works started analyzing both the classics and certain recent works for the "rhetorical strategies" or "modes of authority" they deployed. Thus did anthropology pass into a stage of "secondary textuality" as distinct from but continuous with Geertz's "primary textuality" (see Ong 1982:136). That is, *the study of other cultures (as texts) became the study of other texts (as texts, or literary creations*). As Marcus and Cushman (1982:26) observe of this "emergent situation," "ethnographers read widely among new works for models, being interested as much, if not more, in styles of text construction as in their cultural analysis, both of which are difficult to separate in any case."

As may be inferred from this quotation, the new works conflate style and substance. A more accurate way of putting this would be that the new works are a product of a flight from theory to style. The reason for this is best expressed by John van Maanen (1988:x): "Put simply, many familiar ethnographic conceits have had their day and are no longer persuasive. To wit, the glacial clarity once attributed to, say, functional, structural, materialist, cognitive or linguistic theories, has withered." It is hardly surprising that the traditional conceits are not found persuasive by modern readerships: as we saw in Part 2, traditionally, anthropologists were more concerned with honing their senses than with developing catchy writing styles. (Recall Métraux's comments on the difference between a research worker and a creative writer.) It follows that Métraux and her contemporaries should be judged by what they were able to perceive, not how persuasively or creatively they wrote.

In any event, if one wants to write with authority in the "emergent situation," it is no longer possible to rely on the authority of any of the grand theories or "meta-narratives" of the past (Marcus and Fischer 1986:8), one simply *must* adopt one of the new styles—dialogical, polyphonic, confessional. Audience expectations have thus come to dictate factual presentations. The criteria for successful (which is to say persuasive as opposed to "realist") writing have been codified by Marcus and Cushman (1982), among others. While these authors claim that the genre they created is an

open-ended one, as is becoming increasingly apparent, one will not get a hearing unless 1) one is present in the text (an "I") instead of absent or omniscient, 2) one shares one's authority with one's informants instead of monologuing (i.e., their "voices" must be no less visible than one's own), and 3) one engages in or displays the requisite degree of "epistemological worrying" or "self-reflexiveness." Vincent Crapanzano's *Tuhami: Portrait of a Moroccan* is exemplary in all these respects, hence a post-modern classic.

Both the first and third aspects or criteria of the new styles are readily explicable in terms of the invasion of consciousness by writing. Writing automatically "throws the psyche back on itself" and so encourages both self-consciousness and reflexivity. The second aspect, stress on dialogue, is not so readily explicable in terms of the fall-out of the Geertzian textual revolution, and so requires further analysis.

It is, in fact, also to Crapanzano that we owe the most scathing critique, from a "dialogical" (read: secondary textualist) perspective, of the model ethnographic encounter as understood by Geertz: "There is never an I-you relationship, a dialogue, two people next to each other reading the same text and discussing it face-to-face, but only an I-they [or one looking over the shoulder of the other kind of] relationship" (Crapanzano 1986:74). It will be observed that while Crapanzano problematizes how people are positioned within the framework of Geertz' model ethnographic encounter, he fails to problematize Geertz's root metaphor—the idea of events as texts. This idea is accepted quite uncritically. Nevertheless, Crapanzano's critique is exemplary of the stylistic shift from description and interpretation to dialogue and negotiation, which is what distinguishes the secondary textualist position from the primary one. Clifford (1988:43) also stresses that "ethnography [is] located in a process of dialogue where interlocutors actively negotiate a shared vision of reality." It is curious in view of this assertion that no one, next perhaps to Geertz (1988) himself, has done more than Clifford to convince anthropologists of the centrality of writing to what they do "both in the field and thereafter" (Clifford 1986:2); "one must bear in mind the fact that ethnography is, from beginning to end, enmeshed in writing. This writing includes, minimally, a translation of experience into textual form" (Clifford 1988:25).

As implied above, it is somewhat paradoxical that Clifford extols the virtues of dialogue *and* insists upon the centrality of writing at once. As a second glance at the frontispiece of *Writing Culture* illustrates, the one excludes the other. Indeed, no photograph could give the lie to the so-called "principle of dialogical textual production" (Clifford 1986:14) better than that of "Stephen Tyler in the field." This raises the question of whether the

dialogue form might not be a transposition of a textual form into experience rather than a translation of experience into textual form.

It is interesting in this regard to note that what is distinctive about Marcus and Fischer's "experimental" writing is also characteristic of early writing. As Ong (1982:103) observes: "Early writing provides the reader with conspicuous helps for situating himself imaginatively. It presents philosophical material in dialogues, such as those of Plato's Socrates, which the reader can imagine himself overhearing." What this formal correspondence implies is that even the most dialogical of accounts continues to bear the (metaphorical) imprint of the text as model for experience, hence that the secondary textualists remain caught within the hermeneutic circle.

There are other things which disturb about the picture "Stephen Tyler in the field," at least when viewed from the perspective of what has gone before in anthropology. Métraux, for example, would be quick to point out that Tyler is not learning how to modulate his sense perceptions (Indeed, it is as if his senses had imploded, so absorbed is he in his writing.) And the early Geertz would probably note that Tyler's posture relative to his informants is the exact reverse of that required for "reading" culture (i.e., Tyler should be looking over *their* shoulders).

The conclusion I would draw from both these ante-post-modern reactions and what was said above about "early writing," is that the dialogical anthropology of the 1980s has not succeeded in liberating itself from the epistemological anaesthesia that characterized its predecesssor, the interpretive anthropology of the 1970s, but merely represents a continuation of that anaesthetized epistemology by other voices. Thus, for example, it is all very well for Clifford (1986:12) to write: "Once cultures are no longer prefigured visually—as objects, theatres, texts—it becomes possible to think of a cultural poetics that is an interplay of voices, of positioned utterances. In a discursive rather than a visual paradigm, the dominant metaphors for ethnography shift away from the observing eye toward expressive speech (and gesture)." Dialogical anthropologists *do* appear to have exchanged an ear for an eye. But this is only because of the demands of textualization which, "from beginning to end," remain their most abiding concern. For this reason, they have not been able to escape from the (metaphorical) prison-house of literacy, the foundations of which were laid by Geertz in the Balinese cockfight article. Indeed, that prison-house is more a pleasure-house for them, given the way the word "text" now seems to arouse all of the same excitement the word "sex" used to spark in the 1950s. But were the secondary textualists able to repress their textuality for just a moment, they would recognize that culture is not *created* out of an "interplay of voices" but *constructed* out of the interplay of all the senses.

They would also recognize how it is possible to "register" and "make sense" of a culture in other ways than through writing, as Michael Jackson (1983) has so eloquently demonstrated in "Thinking through the Body." The latter essay, which treats metaphors as extensions of bodily experience, would make immediate sense to that colleague of Métraux's who used to "muscularly feel in rhythmic patterns the activity of others—singly or in groups—reading them as I read written material, in chunks, consciously registering only shifts of cadence or expectancy violations, internalizing all the rest which is relatively easy to recall" (Métraux 1953:361). Of course, what would most stand out about this passage to anyone who has read *Writing Culture* is its textuality (the reference to reading) not its corporeality, but that is because the reader is not transposing his or her perceptions in a fitting sense.

The point of the preceding discussion is that no amount of experimenting with one's writing style is going to make up for the deficiency of failing to experiment with one's perceptions or "sensory ratio" first. To understand a culture is to "make sense" of it (Howes 1986 and 1987). Making sense involves more than a "rejection of "visualism"' (Clifford 1986:14; Tyler 1984), or exchanging an ear for an eye. Making sense involves, minimally, learning how to *be of two sensoria* at once and reflecting upon how the interplay of the senses in another culture's perceptual system both converges and diverges from their interplay in one's own (Howes 1991).

There exist a number of model studies in this respect, such as Anthony Seeger's (1975 and 1981) inquiries into the different degrees to which the five senses are "symbolically elaborated" among the Suya, or Ohnuki-Tierney's (1981) careful study of the use of multiple senses in the classification of illnesses among the Ainu. One also thinks of Steven Feld's *Sound and Sentiment*, which is more a sounding of Kaluli experience than a monograph, as befits a culture which attaches so much importance to auditory communication. One thinks, above all, of the "excursions into sensuality" embarked upon by Paul Stoller and Cheryl Olkes (1986 and 1987) in their work among the Songhay. What distinguishes this writing is the extent to which expositions on odours, sounds and tastes are treated as intrinsic to the ethnographic message rather than extraneous. To analyze these expositions as textual markers of having "been there" (Geertz 1988) would be to miss their point.

Anthropologists are thus faced with a choice. Either they may continue down the path of the text opened up by Clifford Geertz, which culminates in a book like *Tales of the Field*, in which John van Maanen contemplates his own texts, sorting them out into their appropriate genres (realist, confessional, etc.). Or, they may come (back) to their senses and learn to smell,

taste, touch, hear and see the world in alternative ways. To opt for the latter route would be to vindicate the approach of Métraux and her peers.

Where might this other route lead? Paradoxically, it will lead to a further refinement of anthropological writing because that writing will come to be based on a truly inter-cultural (albeit less literary) epistemology, again. The essays which follow, by Sylvain Pinard, Ian Ritchie, Kit Griffin and Constance Classen—all members of the Concordia Sensoria Research Group, funded by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council, the work of which has been exemplary in this regard. These essays take the "construction" (in Métraux's sense) of the sensory models or ratios of the cultures concerned—Hindu, Hausa, Moroccan and Andean—as their primary object and then seek to demonstrate how these models inform the discourse and practices of everyday life in the cultures under study. As I think the reader will find, these essays make for sensational reading, because they are addressed to all of the reader's senses, though not in quite the proportions he or she is accustomed to using them.[2]

Notes

1. Part of the research on which this essay is based was made possible by a grant from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (no. 410-88-0301). I also wish to thank the members of the Concordia Sensoria Research Group and two anonymous reviewers for their many helpful comments on earlier versions of this essay.

2. Another direction in which the "path of the senses" can lead involves the exploration of other modes for the presentation of ethnographic findings than the textual (or verbo-visual). Such "experiments" *beyond writing*, include having students prepare an ethnographic meal, or stage a ritual, as has been tried by an innovative group of professors at York University. Their example deserves to be followed.

References Cited

Bateson, Gregory, and Margaret Mead
1942 Balinese Character. New York: Publications of the New York Academy of Sciences, Vol. 2.

Becker, Alton
1979 Communicating Across Diversity. *In* The Imagination of Reality: Essays in Southeast Asian Coherence Systems, edited by Alton Becker and Aram Yengoyan, pp. 1-23. Norwood: Ablex.

Boas, Franz
1889 On Alternating Sounds. American Anthropologist 2:47-53.

Carpenter, Edmund
1973 Oh What a Blow that Phantom Gave Me! New York: Bantam Books.

Clifford, James
1986 Introduction: Partial Truths. *In* Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography, edited by James Clifford and George Marcus, pp.1-26. Berkeley: University of California Press.

1988 The Predicament of Culture: Twentieth Century Ethnography, Literature and Art. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Clifford, James, and George Marcus, eds.
1986 Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Crapanzano, Vincent
1980 Tuhami: Portrait of a Moroccan. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
1986 Hermes' Dilemma. *In* Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography, edited by James Clifford and George Marcus, pp. 51-76. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Derrida, Jacques
1976 Of Grammatology, translated by Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Feld, Steven
1983 Sound and Sentiment: Birds, Weeping, Poetics and Song in Kaluli Expression. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Geertz, Clifford
1968 Islam Observed: Religious Development in Morocco and Indonesia. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
1973 The Interpretation of Cultures: Selected Essays. New York: Basic Books.
1983 Local Knowledge: Further Essays in Interpretive Anthropology. New York: Basic Books.
1988 Works and Lives: The Anthropologist as Author. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Hall, E.T.
1969 The Hidden Dimension. Garden City, New York: Anchor Press/Doubleday.
1977 Beyond Culture. Garden City, New York: Anchor/Doubleday.

Hallowell, A. Irving
1955 Culture and Experience. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Howes, David
1986 Le sens sans parole. Anthropologie et Sociétés 10(3):29-46.
1987 Olfaction and Transition. The Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology 24(3):398-416.
1990 Les techniques des sens. Anthropologie et Sociétés 14(2):145-173.
1991 Introduction: To Summon all the Senses. *In* The Varieties of Sensory Experience: A Sourcebook in the Anthropology of the Senses. Toronto: University of Toronto Press (forthcoming).

Jackson, Michael
1983 Thinking Through the Body. Social Analysis 14:127-49.

Luria, A.R.
1972 The Man With a Shattered World: The History of a Brain Wound, translated by Lynn Solotaroff. New York: Basic Books.

Lee, Dorothy
1959 Freedom and Culture. New York: Spectrum.
McLuhan, Marshall
1962 The Gutenberg Galaxy: The Making of Typographic Man. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
Malinowski, Bronislaw
1969 Argonauts of the Western Pacific: An Account of Native Enterprise and Adventure in the Archipelagoes of Melanesian New Guinea. New York: Doubleday.
Marcus, George, and Dick Cushman
1982 Ethnographies as Texts. Annual Review of Anthropology 11:25-69.
Marcus, George, and Michael Fischer
1986 Anthropology as Cultural Critique: An Experimental Moment in the Human Sciences. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
Mayer, Jessica
1982 Body, Psyche and Society. Oceania 52:240-59.
Mead, Margaret, and Rhoda Métraux
1953 Introduction. *In* The Study of Culture at a Distance, edited by Margaret Mead and Rhoda Métraux, pp. 3-49. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
Métraux, Rhoda
1953 Resonance in Imagery. *In* The Study of Culture at a Distance, edited by Margaret Mead and Rhoda Métraux, pp. 343-364. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
Nelson, Katherine
1985 The Art of Reciting the Qur'an. Austin: University of Texas Press.
Ohnuki-Tierney, Emiko
1981 Illness and Healing among the Sakhalin Ainu. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
Ong, Walter
1967 The Presence of the Word: Some Prolegomena for Cultural and Religious History. New Haven: Yale University Press.
1982 Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word. New York: Methuen.
Ricoeur, Paul
1971 The Model of the Text: Meaningful Action Considered as a Text. Social Research 38(2):529-62.
Seeger, Anthony
1975 The Meaning of Body Ornaments. Ethnology 14(3):211-24.
1981 Nature and Society in Central Brazil: The Suya Indians of Mato Grosso. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
Shweder, Richard, and Robert Levine
1984 Culture Theory: Essays on Mind, Self and Emotion. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
Spencer, Baldwin, and F.J. Gillen
1968 The Native Tribes of Central Australia [1899]. New York: Dover.

Stoller, Paul
1984 Sound in Songhay Cultural Experience. American Ethnologist 11(3):599-610.
Stoller, Paul, and Cheryl Olkes
1986 Bad Sauce, Good Ethnography. Cultural Anthropology 1(3):336-352.
1987 In Sorcery's Shadow: A Memoir of Apprenticeship among the Songhay of Niger. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
Taussig, Michael
1987 Shamanism, Colonialism and the Wild Man: A Study in Terror and Healing. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
Tyler, Stephen
1984 The Vision Quest in the West, or What the Mind's Eye Sees. Journal of Anthropological Research 40:23-42.
1986 Post-modern Ethnography: From Document of the Occult to Occult Document. *In* Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography, edited by James Clifford and George Marcus, pp. 122-140. Berkeley: University of California Press.
Van Maanen, John
1988 Tales of the Field: On Writing Ethnography. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

L'ÉCONOMIE DES SENS EN INDE: EXPLORATION DES THÈSES DE WALTER ONG

Sylvain Pinard
Département de Philosophie
Université du Québec à Montréal

Résumé: Plusieurs spécialistes de l'Inde ont souligné la prépondérance du sens de la vue en Inde, et ils ont montré dans quelle mesure la vision informe une diversité de conceptions et de comportements sociaux. Cependant, à la lumière d'autres sources, il semble que le sens du goût, incluant tout ce qui gravite autour de l'échange de nourriture, occupe une place proéminente dans la culture, ce que nous ne pouvons ignorer—la gustation est le «mécanisme intégratif» paradigmatique des groupes sociaux. De plus, le rôle central joué par le toucher introduit un indéniable élément de proximité et de partage au sein de cette culture, contrastant avec l'accent mis sur la distance et l'individualisme dans les schèmes occidentaux de perceptions et de société. En s'appliquant à suivre les thèses de Walter Ong sur les sens en tant qu'informateurs et en tant que porteurs de la culture, l'auteur entreprend d'étudier l'activité de chacun des sens dans la société hindoue, d'une part dans le but de tester [et de nuancer] les thèses de Ong, d'autre part afin de mieux délimiter lequel est dominant dans le contexte culturel hindou.

Abstract: A number of Indologists have underlined the preponderance of the sense of sight in India, and shown how vision informs diverse notions and social behaviour. However, it is apparent in light of other sources that the sense of taste, including everything that surrounds the exchange of food, also occupies a prominent place in the culture, which we cannot ignore—gustation is the paradigmatic "integrative mechanism" of social groups. Moreover, the central role played by touch introduces an indeniable element of proximity in sharing into the culture, in contrast to the stress on distance and individualism in Western schemes of perceptions and society. Following up on Walter Ong's thesis concerning the senses as shapers and bearers of culture, the author undertakes to study the work of each of the senses in Hindu society, partly with the view to testing [and

Anthropologica XXXII (1990) 75-99

nuancing] Ong's thesis, and partly so as to better delimit which of the senses is dominant in the Hindu cultural context.

La société indienne hindoue est très complexe, d'une part parce que nous avons affaire non pas à une culture primitive mais à une organisation sociale ayant une très longue histoire, donc à une tradition écrite, ce qui élargit considérablement l'investigation. D'autre part, la plupart des anthropologues ont utilisé l'Inde comme terrain de combat pour éprouver leur théorie et/ou pour infirmer celles des autres, une situation qui fournit certes une multitude de rapports ethnographiques, mais qui complique la lecture vu les angles différents sous lesquels on a considéré l'Inde.

En confrontant certains de ces chercheurs, et bien que peu se soient intéressés spécifiquement à l'étude des *sens* dans l'hindouisme, tous d'une manière ou d'une autre ont eu à se soucier des sens, même si ce n'est qu'à cause de l'importance qu'ils revêtent dans le système des castes. Nous allons sauter dans l'arène et nous pencher sur la présence réelle et métaphorique de chaque sens dans la culture hindoue de l'Inde et les implications de cette présence. Nous confronterons les conceptions et pratiques hindoues qui ont trait aux sens avec les thèses de Walter Ong sur les sens afin de saisir jusqu'à quel point l'univers sensoriel indien ressemble ou diffère du nôtre, et pour saisir aussi ce que les sens révèlent sur cette société indienne.

Nous avons choisi Ong parce qu'il est un des pionniers de ce qui peut être appelé «l'anthropologie des sens». Comme il le souligne dans *The Presence of the Word*, «it is useful to think of cultures in terms of the organisation of the sensorium[:] . . . differences in cultures . . . can be thought of as differences in the sensorium, the organisation of which is in part determined by culture which at the same time it makes culture» (Ong 1967:6).[1]

La majeure partie de ses travaux s'est appliqué à déterminer l'impact des changements dans les médias de communication sur l'organisation du sensorium et sur la structure de la connaissance. Ong partage ce dernier domaine d'investigation avec Jack Goody (1977). Mais tandis que Goody y discerne une rupture absolue dans les modes de pensée entre les sociétés orales et lettrées, Ong appréhende la transition de l'oralité à la textualité («literacy») de manière plus graduelle. De plus, il démontre dans quelle mesure la rationalité occidentale est dépendante de la subordination de l'oreille, une thèse intéressante qui est absente dans les écrits de Goody.

Même si cet article contient une quantité appréciable d'informations qui semblent supporter les théories de Ong, nous nous situons dans la lignée de C.M. Brown qui défie les thèses de Ong. Les positions de Ong, apparemment universelles, s'en verront relativisées et élargies, car plutôt que de

nous concentrer sur la dichotomie visualité/oralité, nous nous pencherons tout autant sur les autres sens (v. Howes 1990). Nous affirmons ainsi que l'Inde hindoue peut non plus seulement être vue ou écoutée, mais qu'elle peut être humée, caressée, goûtée même, aussi surprenant que cela puisse paraître. Il ne s'agit donc pas ici de parvenir à *une* hiérarchie des sens en Inde. Ce travail vise plutôt à poser les prolégomènes de détermination d'une telle hiérarchie.

Pour ce faire, nous nous arrêterons à certains auteurs qui se sont penchés sur l'un ou l'autre des cinq sens dans l'hindouisme, en commençant avec l'ouïe (et la parole) à la section I, pour enchaîner à la section suivante avec les caractéristiques visuelles de la culture hindoue. Nous sortirons de la sempiternelle dichotomie culture orale/culture visuelle en considérant, en troisième lieu, le toucher; nous conclurons, à la section IV, en proposant une analyse du goût. Nous laisserons de côté, faute de données, le sens de l'odorat, en nous réservant l'éventualité de le traiter en un autre temps.

I

Indira Peterson (1982) a entrepris l'étude du culte dévotionnel exprimé dans les pèlerinages voués aux saints tamouls sivaïtes du moyen âge. Elle y met à jour la puissante fonction que les chants *Tevaram* y occupent. Ces chants permettent aux Tamouls sivaïtes de s'identifier à une communauté linguistiquement et géographiquement identique. Ce que Peterson relève sans insister, mais que je me permets ici de souligner, c'est la prépondérance de la performance chantée de ces chants sur leur transcription écrite et même sur la réalisation effective du pèlerinage. Pour vivre pleinement ces pèlerinages, il suffit d'entonner les chants comme les saints d'antan, «in the same, specific, concrete terms» (Peterson 1982:73).[2] Beaucoup plus que la simple lecture des hymnes, c'est leur actualisation effective dans l'expérience humaine qui prime. Cette présence absolument nécessaire et active qui caractérise l'expérience orale primaire confirme une des propositions qu'énonce Walter Ong sur l'oralité: «the names of persons and places occur as involved in doings» (Ong 1982:43).[3]

Ces chants nourrissent aussi la différentiation culturelle des Tamouls sivaïtes. Sans rejeter leur filiation aux textes traditionnels, ils se démarquent linguistiquement du sanskrit; du même coup, ils s'inscrivent en faux contre le sivaïsme traditionnel qu'ils régionalisent, et contre le bouddhisme et le jaïnisme qui dominèrent dans cette partie de l'Inde. Politiquement aussi, en parcourant oralement et/ou effectivement les lieux sacrés de cette région tamoule, ils délimitent géographiquement un pays qui se sépare des territoires environnants. Evidemment, cette différentiation extérieure va de pair avec l'identification empathique de la communauté qui participe à la même

expérience orale: les pèlerins forment un même ensemble, entre eux et avec l'esprit des saints sivaïtes qui composèrent ces stances. Ces chants vont même jusqu'à faire participer le dévot à l'essence, à l'amour non médiatisé de Śiva [Shiva], «*the Lord who dwells in Cemporpalli*» (Peterson 1982:74).[4]

Ce rapprochement dévotionnel par le chant permettra à Caitanya, le célèbre saint du moyen âge, de parler de «heard *bhakti*» (Gonda 1965:279).[5] Ce rapport direct de l'oralité à l'expérience humaine, aux situations vécues, explique pourquoi on en vient à oublier, ou du moins à relativiser, l'importance du pèlerinage physiquement réalisé. Il suffit de chanter pour vivre pleinement, pour actualiser l'expérience spirituelle d'un tel périple, comme si un des saints tamouls était à nos côtés. Le langage y est action et non seulement un pâle reflet de la pensée:

> to sing of the place is to sing of Śiva. Throughout the *Tevaram*, if there is any one activity that is praised over all others, it is this: «singing of Śiva/the place». By singing these songs the devotee makes a mental pilgrimage to the spot and reaps the same benefits as one who has actually made the pilgrimage; and the benefit is the experience of singing *as* pilgrimage[:] . . . singing surpassed all other acts. (Peterson 1982:81)[6]

Chanter un lieu sacré, c'est chanter Śiva lui-même en le rendant présent.

En ce cas, l'hégémonie de ces chants, et donc de l'oralité, sur les autres sens se reflète dans les sculptures sivaïtes qui attestent la subordination des créations artistiques à la parole d'abord audible: «the iconographical visualization of their God by the Tamil Saivites»,[7] comme le dit Peterson (1982:81-82), est déterminée par les images contenues dans les chants. Cette oralité se retrouve aussi au sein même des poèmes, par exemple lorsqu'ils exhortent les fidèles à les chanter constamment, ou encore lorsqu'ils évoquent un mythe de la création où, sur les eaux originelles, Śiva «and the goddess (his consort) [sail] in a boat made of the primal syllable ''OM''» (Peterson 1982:79).[8] Cette oralité est partagée par toutes les classes sociales, étant donné que les chants sont chantés «both by religious specialists . . . in temples in Tamil India and by Tamil Saivite devotees in private worship» (Peterson 1982:71).[9]

Ce n'est pas rendre justice à Peterson que d'évacuer complètement l'influence visuelle de ces chants. La textualité («literacy»: Ong 1982) a commencé à mettre en péril l'hégémonie des prêtres sur le corpus religieux en rendant possible une appropriation populaire des chants religieux, appropriation qui caractérise le mouvement bhaktique à tendance démocratique. Les chants eux-mêmes contiennent plusieurs références visuelles à Śiva, le «seigneur aux trois yeux«. Śiva par son seul regard détruit Kama, le dieu du plaisir, et il habite les lieux saints «there for all to see» (Peterson

1982:77).[10] Je reviendrai plus loin sur le regard indien. Ce qu'il convient de retenir ici, c'est la domination de l'oralité, la nécessité d'une performance audible pour rendre effectif un texte qui serait autrement vide de contenu. C'est là un point que Peterson effleure à peine mais qui est pourtant fondamental, d'un point de vue sensoriel, pour décoder adéquatement l'influence réelle de textes littéraires! Ce n'est pas un hasard si l'initiation sivaïte, après l'instruction orale de l'adepte, comporte la coupure («splitting»: Gonda 1965:434) des oreilles. Qui dit oreilles, dit écouter, et d'une façon plus générale et indienne, le port de la boucle d'oreille, au terme d'une cérémonie en bas âge, met l'accent sur l'attention à l'écoute: «to checking oneself from hearing evil things» (Sahay 1975:xvii).[11]

L'analyse de pèlerinages dans d'autres parties de l'Inde confirme les qualités de l'oralité que nous avons commencé à relever. Irawati Karve (1962), dans son article «On the road: A Maharashtrian pilgrimage», reconnaît que les musiciens et les chanteurs constituent, de concert avec le brahmane, le coeur des sous-groupes de pèlerins. L'auteure est impressionnée par l'oralité de l'expérience sonore qui homogénéise les langages vernaculaires divergents en une poésie unique: les groupes pèlerins, pourtant de dialectes différents, chantent tous dans une même langue. Elle regrette alors l'engagement qu'elle avait pris de ne pas prendre de notes: «There was great temptation to take down the songs, but I had started from home with the vow that I would not touch book, notebook, or pencil» (Karve 1962:23).[12] Cet univers sonore aspire et inspire tellement les dévots qu'ils en viennent à omettre les autres sens: on ne prête nullement attention au contact tactile de la pluie. Cette omniprésence de l'oralité dans les pèlerinages est telle que Valentine Daniel réussit, en participant à une sainte pérégrination tamoule, à échelonner cette expérience spirituelle en cinq étapes auditives (v. Daniel 1987:264-266).

L'oral joue aussi un rôle central dans d'autres sphères de la tradition hindoue. Nous n'avons qu'à nous rappeler que depuis l'époque védique, le brahmane est le dépositaire du savoir sacré qui lui permet, lorsqu'il le prononce, de garder l'univers en vie; s'il ne le récite pas, le brahmane est comparé à un nuage sans pluie (v. Gonda 1965:234). Une épithète se réfère à lui comme à «celui qui a entendu», «the one who has heard» (Gonda 1965:229), puisqu'il tire son pouvoir des Veda qui sont tenus pour être des mots éternels: «the Vedas are eternal, for they are the embodiment of language» (Staal 1979:11).[13]

David Tame, en analysant la musique indienne, montre que OM, le son cosmique qui soutient l'univers, est appelé *anahata* dans les Veda, c'est-à-dire un son inaudible par notre ouïe habituelle. Par contre, OM peut être perçu par des êtres aguerris qui ont développé leur oreille intérieure: «*anahata* can be heard — or experienced — by the advanced yogi sitting deep

in contemplation» (Tame 1984:171).[14] Ce OM constitue même la cause de toute activité, de tout phénomène qu'il modèle: «the OM is described as being the basic natural force inherent throughout all of the phenomena of Nature, and from which all other forces are derived» (Tame 1984:171).[15] Les Veda en sont la manifestation audible, tout comme la musique indienne qui s'incarne primordialement dans la voix du chanteur. En effet, le chanteur spiritualise la voix avec laquelle il est directement en contact, contrairement aux instruments de musique: «no other instrument can express so perfectly [as the voice] all the delicate subtleties of spiritual feeling that the musician seeks to give forth to others as sound» (v. Shankar 1969);[16] de plus, la voix humaine étant étroitement associée à la syllable OM qui est d'origine divine, elle se fait donc co-créatrice avec la voix divine: «through the use of his vocal cords in speech or in singing, man is thought to be a co-creator with God» (Tame 1984:174).[17] Pour cette raison, chanter est un art qui requiert une discipline spirituelle au même titre que la récitation des Veda: l'artiste devient un gourou (guide) aussi bien religieux qu'artistique. Etre à l'écoute nécessite qu'on laisse de côté notre réflexe analytique pour vraiment capter son essence: «the public *should be able to listen with the heart*» (Peter Hamel, cité par Tame 1984:178).[18]

Une autre facette révélatrice de la musique indienne se retrouve dans la musique classique, ou système *raga*, dont le musicien doit respecter l'inviolabilité des règles de production tout en ayant la latitude d'y investir ses émotions, c.-à-d. d'improviser: «the structure of the classical *raga* . . . is fixed. However, the time spent upon each section is left to the performers (Tame 1984:182).[19] Le musicien a tout le loisir, en suivant ses états d'âme, de créer et de recréer le *raga* dans toute sa fraîcheur; néanmoins, sa structure demeurera inchangée. Walter Ong dit la même chose des poètes qui, dans une culture orale, réutilisent les mêmes formules traditionnelles mais sont passés maîtres dans l'art de remodeler le matériel au gré des circonstances et de l'auditoire: «part of their skill is their ability to adjust to new audiences and new situations or simply to be coquettish» (Ong 1982:49).[20]

Pour revenir au rôle du brahmane, Frits Staal, se basant sur un passage du Rig Veda, énonce que toute langue naît quand le sens se fait son: «The main idea of the hymn is that language originated when hidden knowledge became manifest, i.e., when meaning was attached to sound» (Staal 1977:9).[21] Siège par excellence de la parole, astreint à une discipline orale de tous les instants, le brahmane connaît et parle le langage des dieux, «the speech of Gods» (Gonda 1965:202-204).[22] Il a accès au sommet de l'arbre cosmique hindou où *vac*, la voix céleste, la parole rituelle, révèle la volonté des dieux (v. Jevons 1892:334) ou amène le soma de la cérémonie des défunts à ces derniers (v. Knipe 1977:119-120). Ainsi, nous revenons à ce que nous disions plus haut, à savoir que le langage est actif, corroborant la dynamique

«magique» que Ong soutient pour l'oralité: «In India, language is not something with which you *name* something. It is in general something with which you *do* something» (Staal 1979:9).[23]

Wade Wheelock (1980), dans une brillante analyse taxonomique des mantras védiques comme «actes de langage» («speech acts»), fait bien ressortir cet aspect actif des récitations mantriques. Ces dernières sont l'essence des Veda, encore plus que les rituels qu'elles font justement vivre. Inscrits dans une performance effective, ces mantras prononcés «affirm the existence of a particular situation and create that situation» (Wheelock 1980:353).[24] Ces incantations possèdent des verbes majoritairement au temps présent qui réfèrent directement aux manipulations effectuées et qui isolent très rarement l'officiant de l'ensemble de la situation: «The speaker is most concerned to depict himself in active relation with the components of the sacrifice» (Wheelock 1980:356).[25] Cette activité d'identification va si loin que les parties du corps du prêtre deviennent celles de la déité invoquée, comme s'il avait «incorporé» en lui-même, par ex., «the arms of Indra», «the eye of Mitra» (Wheelock 1980:357).[26] Ong a détecté cette omniprésence de l'implication corporelle dans l'oralité: «Spoken words are always modifications of a total, existential situation, which always engages the body» (1982:67).[27] Ong révèle les qualités psychodynamiques du son qui tend à incorporer, à unir les participants: «the auditory ideal . . . is harmony, a putting together» (Ong 1982:72).[28] Cette union peut mener à l'expérience spirituelle de contact avec les êtres divins, car le son renseigne sur l'intérieur des choses, contrairement à la vue qui n'effleure que les surfaces. Le sacrifice védique, par ses mantras, crée des liens intimes entre humains, animaux et dieux puissants. Le prêtre réactualise les dieux en évoquant leur passé mythique, faisant fi des divisions temporelles pour ramener dans le présent l'énergie divine, «establishing his [divine] personality» (Wheelock 1980:361).[29]

Les mantras sont encore largement utilisés de nos jours, dans tous les rituels des étapes importantes de la vie (naissance, rite du cordon sacré, mariage, funérailles, etc.), dans le bain matinal, dans les inaugurations (par ex., de maisons) ou pour purifier d'un contact polluant. Ces données sur les mantras, ajoutées à celles qui précèdent concernant l'importance de l'oralité dans la culture indienne, nous inclinent fortement à considérer cette culture comme étant essentiellement orale. Pourtant, si on considère d'autres aspects de la culture hindoue comme, par ex., celui du système des castes lui-même éclaté en une myriade de sous-castes ou *jati*, où la discrimination et la division sont omniprésentes, nous éprouvons quelque peine à y détecter cette harmonie et ce «putting together» qui caractériseraient la culture orale.[30]

C. Mackenzie Brown (1986) nous donne les moyens de remettre en question la théorie de Ong. Dans son article sur les textes sacrés des Purṇa,

Brown développe une analyse du passage d'une tradition védique orale à une vision médiévale qui divinise le livre religieux. Effectivement, l'oralité est si implantée dans l'Inde védique qu'on considère les livres, même après la transcription manuscrite des hymnes sacrés par les hindous, comme hérétiques: «the written images of an alphabet . . . were regarded as defilements of the holy sounds» (Brown 1986:68-69).[31] Vidés de leur vibration originelle et éternelle, les mots étaient à l'origine considérés de moindre importance, ce qu'ils sont en quelque sorte car ils tendent à dénaturer les choses qu'ils dénotent, à les réduire à une simple forme visuelle: «writing . . . is a particularly pre-emptive and imperialist activity that tends to assimilate other things to itself», écrit Ong (1982:12).[32] Le texte serait ainsi un nouveau pouvoir qui minerait le pouvoir verbal exclusif des brahmanes et qui échapperait à leur contrôle. Ce n'est cependant pas le monopole de savoir lire que les prêtres redoutent de perdre, mais leurs valeurs traditionnelles et le mode habituel d'éducation où la présence du gourou est indispensable pour transmettre le savoir spirituel: «unlike a written text, the teacher can explain difficulties and reveal deeper, esoteric meanings . . . he may instruct the disciple in the proper modulation and accentuation of the holy words» (Brown 1986:73).[33] De plus, le brahmane procure un exemple moral pour son élève. Le contexte vécu, si central dans l'expérience orale, se voit privilégié ici; par-dessus tout, c'est la conservation du son lui-même, dans toute son authenticité, qui prend le pas sur la signification. Citant F. Staal, Brown dit des brahmanes qu'ils veulent «to preserve the sound for posterity, maintain it in its purity» (Brown 1986:73).[34] Cet attachement aux incantations mantriques s'explique, bien sûr, par ce que nous disions plus haut des mantras dont les vibrations provoquent les phénomènes de l'univers, ce qui procure une signication extrinsèque à leur récitation.

Avec les Purṇa, ces textes médiévaux qui apparaissent en même temps que les mouvements bhaktiques, c'est non plus seulement le son mais le sens du mantra qui devient important. Cette nouvelle synthèse constitue un pas décisif vers un changement de la tradition indienne: la reproduction des textes relève désormais non plus de la révélation, le *śruti*, mais de la tradition, le *smṛti*. Avec les épopées, elle ouvre le savoir à plus de gens, elle tend à une «democratization and privatization of culture» (Ong 1982:155),[35] privatisation car l'épopée peut maintenant mieux circuler. L'auteur d'un manuscrit devient même tatillon sur sa responsabilité de la copie qu'il rédige, ce qui est impensable dans une culture orale par celui qui chante un poème, par ex. (v. Brown 1986:84). Ce copiage de textes qui étaient ensuite distribués était encouragé plus même que de posséder chez soi un livre sacré qu'on adorerait pour acquérir prospérité et connaissance, fonctions qu'on réservait jadis aux sons sacrés: «far more frequent than this use of the

text as a talisman is the mention of the fruits of writing or copying the text itself and then giving it away in charity» (Brown 1986:77).[36] Le texte devient un mode de don individuel, une pratique religieuse, plutôt qu'exclusivement réceptive comme dans la culture orale où l'auditeur écoute attentivement les discours énoncés.

Brown détecte aussi une tendance à voir le livre comme une manifestation visuelle de la divinité, comme dans l'*Agni Purṇa* et le *Śiva Purṇa*, sans exclure la valeur sacrée des sons divinisés: «the visible, verbal image, in the form of the book, is none other than an incarnation of God» (Brown 1986:82).[37] Le polythéisme originel des Veda perd ici du terrain avec cette chosification nouvelle de l'essence divine, une manifestation qu'on peut maintenant voir là, à distance, comme une icône: «seeing the book is tantamount to seeing God» (Brown 1986:82).[38] Ce n'est pas sans rappeler la psychodynamique visuelle selon Ong: «sight situates the observer outside what he views, at a distance» (Ong 1982:72).[39] Jusqu'ici, les thèses de Ong semblent se vérifier.

Où Ong ca fouille, c'est avec son concept d'introspection religieuse, qu'il relie à la culture écrite, donc visuelle, alors que l'Inde passe bien mille ans au moins sans écriture mais avec une intériorité spirituelle enviable. Brown l'a vu: «Ong's argument, then, that writing makes possible the great introspective religions seems wholly unsupportable in the Hindu and early Buddhist cases» (Brown 1986:84-85).[40] Brown propose donc une nouvelle définition de l'introspection où l'écriture est liée à la réflexion spéculative, et l'oralité à un rapport moins intime aux mots écrits mais plus axé sur l'expérience immédiate. C'est encore insuffisant pourtant, car les *rsi* («rishi»), ces visionnaires («seers») de l'Inde antique, passent pour avoir vu plutôt qu'entendu l'essence des sons sacrés, comme le révèle Brown: «the Vedic mantras were originally ''seen'' by *rsis* (seers), rather than heard» (Brown 1986:82).[41] Existerait-il donc une culture visuelle primaire, à dominance intuitive, qui passerait pour l'ancêtre de la culture technologique visuelle que génère l'écriture? Si oui, l'Inde en serait peut-être le premier prototype. On peut supposer que des sons inaudibles, comme peut l'être OM, sont plus faciles à voir qu'à entendre.

Enfin, Brown regroupe les conceptions de Ong sur la vue opposée au son pour mettre en doute leur universalité et les attribuer plutôt à une déformation judéo-chrétienne. Pour ce faire, Brown invoque l'étude de Diana Eck sur le *darśana*, la vue bénéfique du divin incarné, où le concept de vision à sens unique, «a one-way operation» (Ong 1967; Brown 1986:86), s'évanouit.[42] Le dévot va au temple pour voir et *être vu* de la déité, pour vivre un échange intense qui peut s'avérer bénéfique ou dangereux. Puisque D. Eck soutient que le *darśana* est au coeur de la vie religieuse populaire, et que l'Inde est une culture basée sur la vue, «a visual and visionary culture»

(Eck 1985:7),[43] et puisque ces positions semblent défier celles de Ong, il convient de lui accorder quelqu'attention. Nous nous tournons donc vers le sens de la vue, en sachant bien que ce chapitre sur l'oralité n'a fait qu'effleurer toutes les implications qu'a l'oralité sur la culture indienne. On peut peut-être, pour l'instant, avancer le principe suivant: il est impossible de classer une culture sous la domination d'un sens donné sans avoir étudié tous les autres sens et leurs implications.

II

Diana Eck, dans sa petite plaquette (80 p.) sur le regard auspicieux qu'est le *darśana*, justifie les gestes de moult hindous qui partent fréquemment à la recherche de l'image vénérée, du lieu sacré ou de la personne sainte qui les gratifiera du regard bénéfique. Contrairement à la dynamique visuelle que Ong pose à sens unique, le *darśana* met en jeu un échange, une dynamique où, par ex., la déité offre sa vision mais aussi *voit* le fidèle: «the contact between devotee and deity is exchanged through the eyes» (Eck 1985:5).[44]

Cependant, si nous parlons d'échange spirituel, nous serions en droit de nous demander ce que signifie le toucher d'un humain à une divinité? Eck n'enquête pas plus loin sur ce point, pas plus qu'elle ne le fait sur la dynamique *tactile* de la vue, si centrale pourtant, qui réduirait ainsi la vue à un toucher, et l'Inde à une culture tactile. En effet, elle cite l'historienne de l'art Stella Kramrisch qui traite de la vue selon les conceptions hindoues, c'est-à-dire comme «a going forth of the sight toward the object. Sight touches it and acquires its form. Touch is the ultimate connection by which the visible yields to being grasped. While the eye touches the object, the vitality that pulsates in it is communicated» (S. Kramrisch, citée par Eck 1985:6).[45] Nous reviendrons plus loin au toucher.

Parlant des images saintes et des attitudes à entretenir face à elles, Eck en énumère deux qui font violence à la chosification qu'opérerait une culture visuelle (textuelle) telle que l'énonce Ong. Eck parle plutôt de méditation et de respect de la présence effective du divin dans l'image: «the image is primarily a focus for concentration, and . . . is the embodiment of the divine» (Eck 1985:34).[46] Elle renchérit en liant historiquement cette croyance en l'incarnation visible de la divinité à l'avènement des mouvements dévotionnels, ceux-là même qui générèrent le concept de livre-talisman (v. Brown, 1986). L'image «makes possible the deepest outpouring of emotions in worship» (Eck 1985:35).[47] Elle permet cet échange, cette participation situationnelle qui, tels qu'effleurés plus haut, caractérisaient justement la culture orale selon Ong. Que le temple soit un mandala, un lien entre le ciel et la terre, et que la ville indienne soit dessinée à l'image du cosmos (v. Eck, 1985) constituent des faits judicieux qui soulignent encore une délimitation

floue des structures que nous, Occidentaux, chosifions. L'intégration des *ṛṣi* et de leur vision yogique, qui posait problème, s'avère maintenant possible: la culture se fait à la fois visuelle et visionnaire.

Néanmoins, l'analyse de Ong n'est pas totalement invalidée par les thèses de Eck. Quand cette dernière parle de la prolifération d'icônes à partir de la période Gupta (IVe-VIe s.), nous sommes en pleine période bhaktique durant laquelle le texte se trouve sacralisé et socialisé, une appropriation populaire naissante digne des cultures textuelles. Les pèlerinages s'offrent à tous et suivent une géographie sacrée (v. Eck 1985:48) où certains saints, lieux, icônes ou personnes sont valorisés au détriment de d'autres, une individuation que Ong trouve typique de la vue: «la vue isoles», dit-il (Ong 1982:72). Les pèlerinages existaient depuis des temps immémoriaux, mais c'est leur nouveau mode vécu par une appropriation personnelle désormais possible qui altère leur caractère antérieur qui était principalement grégaire. L'icône, même si elle se démarque de la linéarité textuelle, possède en contexte hindou des connotations textuelles en réduisant la déité à un espace, apaisant le dévot comme seulement le texte peut le faire: «all script represents words as in some way things, quiescent objects, immobile marks for assimilation by vision» (Ong 1982:91).[48] Cette assimilation se confirme dans une des racines sémantiques du mot «icône», en sanscrit *vigraha*, qui signifie «to grasp, to catch hold of» (Eck 1985:28), une opération familière à la pensée analytique.[49] De plus, l'art iconographique et architectural doit suivre des canons qui annihilent toute démarche créatrice typique de la fixité visuelle, nonobstant la visualisation de l'oeuvre que doit réaliser l'artiste en méditation.

La plus grande critique que nous pouvons faire à Eck, toutefois, c'est d'évacuer plusieurs faits culturels indiens ou de les réduire au visuel. Le processus d'introspection qu'elle se propose de faire dans son livre, c.-à-d. «addressing the problem of how we understand and interpret what we see» (Eck 1985:10), ne semble pas être mené à terme.[50] Semblant projeter elle-même sa culture textuelle sur les phénomènes indiens, elle se permet de les appréhender comme un livre: «India has ''written'' prolifically in its images» (Eck 1985:12), un livre qu'il ne resterait qu'à lire.[51] Elle laisse de côté, tout en la nommant, la problématique du mauvais oeil que nous étudierons plus loin. Elle pousse ses projections visuelles jusqu'à mettre sur le même pied la visite de l'Inde et le visionnement d'un film (v. Eck 1985:12). Par le film, elle croit possible de faire saisir les rituels dont elle vient juste d'admirer la richesse sensorielle tant visuelle et sonore que *tactile*, *gustative* et *odorante* (v. Eck 1985:9).[52]

A plusieurs reprises, D. Eck relève l'importance du toucher en Inde sans jamais se situer face à ce sens, un geste qui s'imposait vu le palpable *darśana*: est-ce le même genre de toucher? Elle répète son erreur pour le

sens du goût qui figure dans les *puja* et les pèlerinages: elle ne se préoccupe que du *darśana*. Mais où, à notre avis, Eck pèche le plus par réductionnisme, c'est en situant l'oralité hindoue sous la domination du visuel. Ainsi, selon elle plus ou autant que l'ouverture rituelle des yeux d'une statue avec une aiguille d'or, c'est la récitation mantrique qui donne la vie en incarnant le souffle de vie: «the infusion of *praṇa* ordinarily takes the form of a *mantra* uttered» (Eck 1985:40).[53] A la lumière de ce que nous avons relevé plus haut sur l'oralité, parler de poésie védique visuelle devient aberrant: «the Vedic poets were image-makers . . . : they created vivid images of the gods in their poetry» (Eck 1985:24).[54] Ong faisait remarquer ce réflexe académique qu'ont les chercheurs à vider l'oralité de sa situation quand il parle de «such monstrous concepts as "oral literature"» (Ong 1982:11).[55] De plus, ayant en main l'article de Peterson sur les hymnes tamouls ci-haut étudié, Eck met davantage l'accent sur les lieux d'adoration, les «place-legends» du périple, que sur les hymnes chantés et leurs implications.[56]

Il s'avère évident que Eck, compte tenu de l'espace dont elle disposait dans son livre, se devait de faire des approximations. Elle aurait toutefois pu réduire, voire même prouver sa perspective en suggérant une typologie, en se situant face aux autres sens, et en respectant les faits sur lesquels elle étaye son analyse. Son livre demeure néamoins stimulant et est un «must» dans l'étude sensorielle indienne, même s'il a le dangereux handicap de perpétuer une vision analytique conditionnée par notre culture textuelle.

J'omets sciemment d'autres études importantes dans le domaine visuel en rapport avec l'Inde, comme celles de Jan Gonda, *Eye and Gaze in the Veda* (1969) et de Brenda Beck (1976) sur la symbolique de l'orientation spatiale des Tamouls. Ces textes représentent une véritable mine d'or d'informations sur la vue hindoue, mais s'arrêtent souvent à la description: ils seront discutés ailleurs.

Clarence Maloney (1976) a écrit un article bien fourni sur le mauvais oeil, qu'il propose de rebaptiser «oeil puissant» pour y réintégrer l'aspect bénéfique qu'est le *darśana*. Maloney traite du mauvais oeil sous l'angle des responsables, des remèdes, des préventions possibles pour les victimes que peuvent être les maisons, véhicules, récoltes, nourritures, bétail, corps et enfants. Il songe également au rôle de l'oeil chez les dieux, la mystique, les croyances marginales, ainsi qu'aux rapports aux structures sociales, à la sorcellerie, à la cosmologie. Sans entrer dans le détail, nous découvrons que le mauvais oeil ne fait pas l'unanimité quant à son origine (v. Maloney 1976:108-110). Sa caractéristique première en est l'envie, ce qui se vérifie linguistiquement: en tamil, «*kaṇ poda*, literally "to put the eye," means (1) to look with envy or desire, and (2) to fall in love» (Maloney 1976:127);[57] en sanscrit, «vue pécheresse» et «mauvais oeil» sont deux sens d'un même mot. L'auteur attribue l'origine de ce sens péjoratif de l'oeil à l'hindouisme

qui aurait absorbé la conception positive de l'oeil dans le concept mystique du troisième oeil: les yeux «transmit various emotions and functions of the mind: envy, malice, love, wisdom, and protection» (Maloney 1976:130).[58] Ce pouvoir oculaire n'est pas l'apanage de personne en particulier mais une possibilité pour tous: «*the evil eye belief is not a single belief, but a cluster whose only common factor is a conviction that a person's inner qualities and intentions can emanate from his eyes*» (Maloney 1976:134; emphase de Maloney).[59]

Cependant, quelqu'un qui a le mauvais oeil, ou plutôt par qui passe le mauvais oeil, ne sera pas incriminé bien qu'on puisse l'identifier, car la croyance au mauvais oeil se veut trop diffuse pour accuser directement l'envie ou le karma de l'individu. Cette croyance distribuée inégalement en Inde n'est d'ailleurs que l'une des cinq catégories définies par Maloney pour expliquer les phénomènes cachés: le mauvais oeil «is just one means among several of explaining events due to other people's presence without necessarily implicating them personally» (Maloney 1976:139).[60] Cette fuite de la controverse interpersonnelle et cette indétermination du mauvais oeil nous permettent de rapprocher ce dernier du *darśana* en tant qu'échange intuitif impalpable. Mary Douglas a proposé une division de l'actualisation des pouvoirs spirituels en deux classes, interne et externe, qui sied bien ici: «the first reside within the psyche of the agent—such as evil eye . . . The second are eternal symbols on which the agent must consciously work: spells, blessings, curses, charms and formulas and invocations» (Douglas 1966:98).[61] En liant la conscience à l'oralité, et l'inconscient à la vue, elle offre une inversion de la théorie de Ong. La vue n'individualise pas toujours en Inde, tandis que l'oralité mantrique provient de la bouche de l'élite religieuse de la société hindoue, à savoir les brahmanes.

Cette imprécision du concept de mauvais oeil trouve, enfin, des répercussions politiques. Maloney réussit à identifier une constante de cette croyance: elle se retrouve non pas chez les tribus nomades, mais dans les sociétés sédentaires: «the increasingly complex urban society began to require mechanisms to institutionalize envy and measures to counteract its effect» (Maloney 1976:145).[62] C'est une entreprise de récupération dont il s'agit ici, les gens pauvres et bafoués devenant asservis à une conception qui empêche l'opposition systématique aux autres et donc une prise en charge individuelle de la destinée. Nous ne voulons pas réduire la grande tolérance indienne des inégalités à ce caractère unique, mais la croyance au mauvais oeil et la conception de la vue militent en ce sens. Ce manque de contrôle individuel et ce fatalisme indien ressortent dans ce proverbe tamoul: «Even if you escape a thrown stone you still must escape the eye» (Maloney 1976:145).[63]

III

Il y aurait encore beaucoup à écrire sur le mauvais oeil (v. par ex. Pocock 1973), mais nous avons l'essentiel. Ouvrons de nouveaux horizons avec le sens du toucher, que Ong justement liait à l'espace et à la vision: «touch . . . is allied to vision in presenting extension and . . . visual perception itself perhaps never occurs without some admixture of the tactile imagination» (Ong 1969:635).[64] Il n'est bien sûr pas question du toucher concret qui chosifie et la chose touchée et celui qui touche, mais de toucher abstrait, d'imagination tactile. Nous sommes encore loin du toucher concret du regard indien. Ces deux pôles du toucher, concret et abstrait, ont fait l'objet de plusieurs études en Inde. Voyons d'abord le toucher littéral.

En maintes occasions, rituelles ou autres, les hindous tirent bénéfice du toucher, soit en se purifiant, soit en puisant à l'énergie divine. David Kinsley (1982), dans *Hinduism*, énumère ces contacts favorables. C'est une pratique courante que de se baigner pour se purifier de contacts illicites: «the bath consists of pouring water over one's head and letting it spill down over the body» (Kinsley 1982:135).[65] On va même jusqu'à user d'un tamis, en cas de grande pollution, pour accroître les points de contact de l'eau et ainsi mieux se purifier. Il existe toute une série de substances purificatrices, en commençant par les produits de la vache sacrée comme le lait, les excréments et l'urine.

L'individualité des dévots, laissée intacte dans le rite de purification, s'atténue dans la traditionnelle adoration des pieds du gourou. Les pieds des saints ou leurs sandales sont touchés pour exprimer d'abord le respect: «by touching another's feet, then touching one's own head, one demonstrates respect by showing that the person's feet are more pure than one's own head» (Kinsley 1982:136).[66] Karve (1962), dans le pèlerinage déjà cité, remarque aussi dans ce geste une volonté de recevoir les grâces, de puiser à la sainteté du gourou dans un échange qui rappelle le *darśana*.

Cette constance d'échange n'est pas fortuite car John Stanley (1977), dans ses observations d'un festival hindou, souligne un principe essentiel qui règle les rapports de proximité: «When any two things are joined . . . by copulation, bathing, eating, or any other penetrating intercourse, some of their substances . . . are loosened and transferred between them» (Stanley 1977:41).[67] C'est ce qui fera dire à Kinsley: «intermarriage involves the most intimate and therefore the most polluting contact» (Kinsley 1982:125);[68] les unions conjugales suivent donc un code très rigide. Encore une fois, Ong voit sa conception du toucher relativisée car, s'il y a partage de matière dans un contact tactile, l'objectivité de l'être rencontré et ma propre subjectivité deviennent des divisions moins distinctes que ne le suppose Ong (v. Ong 1969:637).

Cette fluidité des limites se vérifie quand les fidèles se battent pour toucher au palanquin portant le dieu Khandoba, ou quand ils sautent dans la rivière en même temps qu'y est plongée l'image divine, participant à distance à son pouvoir (v. Stanley 1977:36-37). Elle justifie la foule de prescriptions tactiles entourant les objets sacrés. Les intouchables, ces hors-castes qui ont bénéficié de la réforme gandhienne pour enfin avoir accès aux temples, ont en pratique été gardés à l'écart (v. Kinsley 1982:144). Avec eux, nous passons au second type de toucher concret, le toucher impur et polluant.

Louis Dumont (1980), dans *Homo Hierarchicus*, lui consacre une bonne partie de son livre; il étudie le contact viciant de la salive, des basses castes, de certains animaux, de la femme menstruée, etc., discutant même une graduation de l'intensité polluante. Richard Shweder (1985) s'attarde, lui, à la pollution menstruelle qui justifie l'exclusion de la femme de plusieurs rituels, des temples, des pèlerinages, de la cuisine. Le sang menstruel constitue un véritable poison; on dit d'une femme menstruée: «If the wife touches her husband on the first day of her period it is an offense equal to that of killing a guru» (Shweder 1985:203-204).[69]

Soulignons ici l'omniprésente anxiété qui entoure le toucher, obligeant l'hindou à se faire attentif à tous ses gestes, à toutes ses relations avec ses pairs. Cette anxiété contraste avec notre toucher occidental qui, souvent, connote un rapprochement des individus, un réconfort partagé. Shweder retrouve cette conception du toucher chez les enfants qui jouent à la «tag-pollution» (1985:206);[70] ces jeunes, par ailleurs, reviennent pollués de l'école où le mélange des sous-castes vicie.

A ce toucher concret, intime ou éloigné, s'ajoute le toucher abstrait. Nous qualifierons ce dernier de «métaphysique» dans ce cas étudié par David Miller (1988) où Viṣṇu [Vishnu] laisse son empreinte de pied à Old Gaya et imprime donc une présence éternelle des dieux: «the ''Viṣṇupada,'' the footprint of Viṣṇu» (*Ency. of Religion and Ethics* 6:183).[71] Mais la présence tactile abstraite en Inde s'incarne principalement dans les métaphores de température, que j'appellerais «méta-thermies» à cause de la scission fréquente entre les températures réelle et métaphorique. Un bon exemple serait la crème glacée qui, bien que froide, «is thought of as very hot» (Daniel 1987:185).[72]

Plus systématiquement, nous avons l'analyse de Brenda Beck (1969) sur les correspondances entre couleurs et chaleur. Elle y démontre l'intime rapport qui existe entre les couleurs et la température (chaud/froid) dans la majorité des rites religieux: divination, festival, étapes de la vie, bain sacré, yoga, marche sur le feu, et des éléments connexes comme le feu, la nourriture, la sexualité, la médecine, l'astrologie, les vêtements, les castes et la végétation. Nicholas Bradford (1983), dans son étude du culte de Yellamma

dans le sud de l'Inde, abonde dans le même sens: une grande partie de la culture indienne se classifie par oppositions méta-thermiques.

En général, un être en état de pollution est chaud, sans égard à sa chaleur physiologique: les femmes menstruées, ou même seulement en état de féconder, sont chaudes; une fille pré-pubertaire ou une femme ménopausée, non! La relation sexuelle rend chaud, alors que l'ascèse refroidit. La nourriture cuite ou la viande est généralement chaude, les fruits crus, non. Les démons et le rouge s'associent aux hautes températures; les dieux (souvent bleus; par exemple: Kṛṣṇa [Krishna]) et le blanc sont reliés à la sereine froideur.

Même si tous ces sens sont très importants dans différentes sphères de la société, c'est-à-dire dans les rituels, festivals, pèlerinages, castes et répartition du pouvoir, le sens du goût permet aussi d'appréhender, si ce n'est de mieux expliquer, la culture indienne d'un angle nouveau.

IV

Pour commencer selon la même approche qu'avec le toucher, nous aborderons le goût dans des situations concrètes. Nous pouvons prendre comme point de départ la position que soutient Arjun Appadurai (1981) dans son étude ''gastro-politique'' de l'Inde. Définissant son entreprise comme une analyse sémiotique de «conflict or competition over specific cultural or economic resources as it emerges in social transactions around food» (Appadurai 1981:495), il s'appuie ainsi sur le goût comme facteur de division sociale.[73]

Autour de la nourriture se cristallisent les hiérarchies familiales et sociales, comme l'illustre bien la vie des brahmanes dans les repas quotidiens, festivités de mariage et offrandes au temple. Appadurai parle de six principes qui règlent la manipulation de nourriture, rappelant la dose d'attention qu'investit l'Indien dans le toucher. Une femme signifiera son désaccord à ses pairs en changeant le goût des aliments; menstruée, elle se voit déchargée de son rôle culinaire: «when the woman is most removed from the role of genitrix and ''clean'' sexual partner, she also ceases to be cook» (Appadurai 1981:501).[74] Les dieux sont gourmands et ont des goûts spéciaux, les hommes aussi font preuve de discrimination gustative dans le cas où une caste brimée base ses dénonciations sur la disposition inadéquate de *prasad*, les restes rituels divins: ces derniers seraient traités «as if it was garbage or polluted leftovers, fit only for dogs and cattle» (Appadurai 1981:506).[75]

Ces faits et d'autres, comme la dichotomie végétarien/mangeur de viande, corroborent la théorie de Ong lorsqu'il associe le goût à un acte incessant de discrimination: «a yes-or-no sense, a take-it-or-don't-take-it sense,

letting us know what is good and what is bad for us in the most crucial physical way» (Ong 1967:5).[76] La menace de la maladie ou de la mort y joue sûrement pour beaucoup, à un point tel que Ong classe le goût comme le sens le plus discriminatoire. Cela se passe conséquent avec la disparité commensale des castes, avec cette séparation entre aliments purs, le *pakka*, et impurs, le *kacca*, avec le soin méticuleux que prennent les voyageurs quant à leur repas, en somme avec la dualité entre pur et impur qui fonde le système des castes selon L. Dumont.

Pourtant, plusieurs données semblent contredire ce modèle théorique. Appadurai relève qu'humains et dieux sont co-producteurs des récoltes, l'un par le travail, l'autre par la pluie, une coopération qui se scelle dans l'offrande aux dieux: «feeding the gods and eating their left-overs» (Appadurai 1981:496).[77] Les *jati* végétariens s'opposent aux non-végétariens et se regrouperont ensemble dans la même partie de la ville ou autour d'un même feu en pèlerinage (v. Karve 1962:18-19): le goût divise, certes, mais il unit aussi en commensalisme. Le paradoxe réside dans l'incorporation qui caractérise essentiellement le goût, l'«intussusception by one's own organism (food) or psyche (aesthetic taste)» (Ong 1969:637),[78] et qui, comme facteur d'union, vient après la discrimination. Ong ne valorise que cette dernière, bien qu'il parle d'ingurgitation.

Une manière d'élargir ce modèle théorique du goût comme jugement et assimilation est d'étendre cette dernière qualité au processus de préparation des aliments, en premier lieu la cuisson. «In India the cooking process is seen as the beginning of ingestion», dit M. Douglas (1966:126) en évoquant L. Dumont.[79] Certes, le cuisson prépare la nourriture à être ingérée par l'individu, mais elle effectue d'abord et avant tout une appropriation du goût par le groupe des hôtes: la caste qui reçoit imprime aux mets sa marque, sa «saveur». Les cuisiniers de la maison qui reçoit, en manipulant et en cuisant la nourriture, s'approprient cette dernière, lui communiquent le statut de leur *jati*. Ce faisant, ils opèrent aussi une coupure rituelle, une réorganisation spécifique des denrées alimentaires en vue de produire un certain goût, et ainsi les purifient de tous les contacts antérieurs avec les castes productrices ou commerciales. Par conséquent, la cuisson pré-digère collectivement la nourriture, elle sert à s'approprier socialement ce qu'ensuite le convive absorbera individuellement. Faire la cuisine en Inde, c'est opérer ce que le brahmane effectue rituellement quand il purifie les lieux sacrificiels et partage son expérience avec tous les participants. La cuisine fournit un véritable modèle d'interprétation pour les relations sociales: la distribution des goûts équivaut à la répartition des gens en groupes sociaux.

Charles Malamoud (1975), dans «Cuire le monde», abonde dans le même sens quand il pose le sacrifice comme le principe structurant de la pensée brahmanique: la cuisson en est le moment essentiel qui perfectionne la ma-

tière. Comme la nourriture cuite appartient *ipso facto* aux dieux, le repas que les Indiens se partagent n'est que «le reste d'un repas effectivement servi aux dieux» (Malamoud 1975:101). Cette offrande se répète quotidiennement dans les foyers hindous.

Par ailleurs, Malamoud continue en montrant que l'un des quatre devoirs du brahmane est «la cuisson du monde», parfaire le monde en cuisinant pour les autres: «la nourriture *pakka* est cuite par un brahmane de façon à permettre au plus grand nombre de consommer» (L. Dumont, cité par Malamoud 1975:92), mais aussi en se conduisant de façon exemplaire. L'exemple par excellence d'une telle «cuisson intérieure» est le renonçant qui a intériorisé le feu des Veda et qui se nomme «celui qui s'échauffe» (Malamoud 1975:113). A un niveau plus mystique, nous pouvons citer L. Babb qui évoque un processus intérieur, une «digestion» accomplie par un gourou:

> offerings made to the guru (that is, to the Supreme Being in the guru's person) are, in a sense, "digested" by him, with the transformed results then being made available — as flow — to the devotees. In the body, and in the universe at large (the body of the Supreme Being), there occurs a continuing process of discrimination, separation, retention, and downward discharge. The guru is the Supreme Being, and this means that he is the universal alimentary actor, the "eater of all" and the ultimate separator of fine from coarse and good from bad. He is, in other words, the most transformative of all beings. (Babb 1982-1983:306)[80]

Nous venons de passer ici à une conception métaphorique élargie du goût qui conserve son caractère ambivalent d'incorporation et de discrimination. Nous découvrons avec Valentine Daniel (1987) que les Tamouls considèrent les terres comme ayant chacune un des six goûts. Chaque terre avait purement, au début des temps, un de ces goûts, et chaque caste vivait sur sa terre: les prêtres sur le sommet des montagnes aux terres sucrées, les guerriers sur les terres astringentes, etc. La terre échangeait sa saveur avec sa caste correspondante, et vice versa. Mais à cause des déplacements de populations et des mariages exogamiques, les sols ont peu à peu accueilli des castes d'une saveur différente, ce qui explique qu'aujourd'hui nous sommes à une époque bouleversée où aucun sol n'est pur, et aucune caste non plus (v. Daniel 1987:84-86).

Francis Zimmermann (1982) étudie la médecine hindoue qui tourne, comme la société indienne peut-être, autour de la notion-clé de *rasa*. «Goût» se dit «*rasa*» en sanskrit, et le *rasa* est un concept passe-partout. *Rasa* signifie goût, langue, saveur, mais aussi sève, essence, nectar, fluide vital. La digestion, par ses sept étapes, concentre les *rasa*, ces essences en circulation, dans notre corps pour aboutir au sperme. Le soleil capte les *rasa*

de la terre, et la lune les restitue en envoyant une pluie de *rasa*, d'où la popularité de la pleine lune qui éclaire toute la planète (v. Zimmermann 1982:180). Cette essence peut être perçue (goûtée) tant par les sages spécialistes (v. Zimmermann 1982:21) que par les sages artistes, tel que Sudhir Kakar (1978) le met en relief. En effet, rappelons-nous l'entraînement religieux que doit suivre l'adepte de l'art. Selon Kakar, l'artiste doit s'appliquer à créer le *rasa* dans ses mouvements artistiques; il doit aussi éveiller une ou plusieurs des huit émotions dramatiques, appelées les *rasa*, chez son auditoire. L'union du *rasa* de son art et du *rasa* généré chez les spectateurs est une véritable expérience mystique: «a sojourn in the inner world . . . nearer to its perfect state of pure calm» (Kakar 1978:30-31).[81] Dans les Purṇa, *mokṣa*, la libération de ce monde, consiste en «eating of *brahman*» (Kakar 1978:16).[82] Cette structure gustative liant incorporation et discrimination se retrouve même dans la cosmologie: ne pourrait-on pas voir dans le dieu des cycles cosmiques et de la mort, Kala, avalant ou régurgitant les humains au gré de leurs réincarnations, une allusion au goût? En tout cas, Kala symbolise l'année, et les six saisons sont ses six bouches (v. Long 1977:85). Nous pourrions même avancer, à titre spéculatif, que le goût structure l'hindouisme car ce dernier assimile en bloc les religions étrangères comme le christianisme et l'islam, tel que l'observe Srinivas, tout en leur déterminant une position dans l'ensemble: «caste . . . absorbing autonomous groups everywhere, also provided the pattern for relations with non-Hindus groups» (Srinivas 1965:31).[83]

* * * * *

Nous arrivons ici au terme de notre incursion rapide au pays des merveilles sensorielles indiennes. Dans ce pays, tous les sens semblent en effervescence culturelle, même l'odorat sur lequel le manque de données nous a réduit au silence. L'aspect enveloppant de l'oralité s'y déploie; le *darśana* et le mauvais oeil fluides minent les limites que nous, Occidentaux, projetons sur cette culture; la dynamique tactile, perméable, entretient cette conception hindoue de l'individu comme union de pensée et de substances instables et hiérarchisables. C'est justement cette hiérarchisation persistante dans la culture hindoue qui nous incline à proposer le goût comme le sens prédominant et structurant dans une panoplie de contextes indiens. Par son caractère assimilateur, il se compare à l'oralité situationnelle à qui il permet de perdurer; surtout, il ne vient aucunement en contradiction avec la conception visuelle qui, elle aussi, incorpore. Enfin, par son aspect discriminatoire, le goût s'associe aisément au toucher, qui est une composante «sine qua non» du goûter, et à l'anxieuse attention qu'il requiert. Le goût est donc une riche métaphore dont la versatilité permet d'interpréter les sens de l'univers indien. Nonobstant le fait que nous pouvons parler de plusieurs

hiérarchies sensorielles selon les contextes, hiérarchies dont il reste à faire la typologie, nous affirmons, à la lumière de nos informations, que le goût mérite sinon la prédominance, du moins une plus grande attention pour définir l'infrastructure culturelle de l'Inde hindoue.

Remerciement

Cet article s'inscrit dans un projet de recherche plus large intitulé «The Varieties of Sensory Experiences» (sous direction de D. Howes et A. Synnott) subventionné par le Conseil de recherche en sciences humaines du Canada (subvention numéro 410-88-0301) en qui je suis reconnaissant. Je tiens aussi à remercier D. Howes, F. Mercier et D. Miller.

Notes

1. «il est utile de penser les cultures en terme d'organisation du sensorium[:] . . . les différences des cultures . . . peuvent être pensées en tant que différences du sensorium, dont l'organisation est en partie déterminée par la culture tout en produisant en même temps celle-ci» (N.B.: les traductions sont de l'auteur).
2. «dans les mêmes termes spécifiques et concrets».
3. «les noms de personnes et de lieux apparaissent impliqués dans des faits et gestes».
4. «le Seigneur qui demeure à Cemporpalli».
5. «bhakti entendu».
6. «chanter un endroit, c'est chanter Śiva». Tout au long des *Tevaram*, s'il se trouve une seule activité qui est plus vénérée que les autres, c'est celle-ci: "chanter Śiva/le lieu." En chantant ces chants, le dévot accomplit un pèlerinage mental jusqu'au lieu et recueille les mêmes mérites que celui qui accomplit réellement le pèlerinage; le mérite réside dans l'expérience du chant *comme* pèlerinage[:] . . . chanter surpasse tout autre action».
7. «la visualisation iconographique de leur Dieu par les sivaïtes tamouls».
8. «et la déesse (sa conjointe) [naviguent] dans un bateau formé de la syllabe "OM"».
9. «tant par les spécialistes religieux . . . dans les temples de l'Inde tamoule que par les dévots sivaïtes tamouls dans leur culte privé».
10. «là pour être vu de tous».
11. «pour prévenir quiconque d'entendre de mauvaises choses».
12. «Il y avait une grande tentation à écrire les chants, mais j'étais parti de chez-moi en prenant le voeu que je ne toucherais à aucun livre, calepin ou crayon».
13. «les Veda sont éternels, car ils sont l'incarnation du langage».
14. «*anahata* peut être entendu — ou expérimenté — par le yogi aguerri assis en contemplation».
15. «le OM est décrit comme étant la force naturelle fondamentale inhérente à tous les phénomènes de la Nature, et de laquelle tout autre force dérive».
16. «aucun autre instrument ne peut exprimer aussi parfaitement [que la voix] toutes les délicates subtilités du sentiment spirituel que le musicien recherche à communiquer aux autres par le son».
17. «par l'entremise de ses cordes vocales en parlant ou en chantant, l'homme est vu comme un co-créateur avec Dieu».
18. «Le public *devrait être capable d'écouter avec le coeur*».
19. «la structure du *raga* classique . . . est fixe. Néanmoins, le temps passé sur chacune des sections est laissé à la discrétion des interprètes».

20. «une partie de leurs habiletés consiste à pouvoir s'ajuster à de nouveaux auditoires ou situations, ou simplement à se faire coquet».
21. «L'idée principale de l'hymne est que le langage apparaît quand la connaissance cachée devient manifeste, ce qui revient à dire que la signification est liée au son.»
22. «la parole des Dieux».
23. «En Inde, le langage n'est pas quelque chose avec laquelle vous nommez quelque chose. C'est en général quelque chose avec laquelle vous faites quelque chose».
24. «affirment l'existence d'une situation particulière et créent cette situation».
25. «L'orateur s'applique principalement à se décrire en active relation avec les composantes du sacrifice».
26. «les bras d'Indra», «l'oeil de Mitra».
27. «Les mots prononcés sont toujours des modifications d'une situation existentielle, totale, qui engage toujours le corps».
28. «l'idéal de l'auditoire . . . est l'harmonie, une mise ensemble».
29. «établissant sa personnalité [divine]».
30. «cette "mise ensemble"».
31. «les images écrites d'un alphabet . . . étaient considérées comme des corruptions des saintes sonorités».
32. «l'écriture . . . est une activité particulièrement impérialiste et de préemption qui tend à assimiler les autres choses à elle-même».
33. «contrairement au texte écrit, le professeur peut expliquer les difficultés et révéler les significations ésotériques les plus profondes . . . il peut instruire le disciple sur la modulation et l'accentuation adéquates des mots sacrés».
34. «préserver le son pour la postérité, le maintenir dans sa pureté».
35. «démocratisation et à une privatisation de la culture».
36. «beaucoup plus fréquente que l'utilisation du texte comme talisman est la mention des fruits provenant de l'écriture ou de la copie du texte lui-même et de son don par charité».
37. «l'image verbale et visible, sous forme de livre, n'est autre que l'incarnation de Dieu».
38. «voir le livre équivaut à voir Dieu».
39. «la vue situe l'observateur hors de ce qu'il voit, à distance».
40. «Par conséquent, l'argument de Ong qui stipule que l'écriture rend possible les grandes religions introspectives semble totalement invalidé dans les cas de l'hindouisme et du bouddhisme ancien».
41. «les mantras védiques furent originellement "vus" par les rishis (visionnaires) plutôt qu'entendus».
42. «une opération à sens unique».
43. «une culture visuelle et visionnaire».
44. «le contact entre le dévot et la déité est échangé par les yeux».
45. «un mouvement de la vue vers l'objet. La vue le touche et adopte sa forme. Le toucher est le lien ultime par lequel le visible se laisse prendre. Quand l'oeil touche l'objet, la vitalité qui bat en lui est communiquée».
46. «l'image est premièrement un point de concentration, et . . . est l'incarnation du divin».
47. «rend possible les plus profondes effusions d'émotions dans l'office».
48. «toute écriture représente en quelque sorte les mots comme des choses, des objets passifs, des marques immobiles pour l'assimilation par la vision».
49. «saisir, empoigner».
50. «poser le problème de comment nous comprenons et interprétons ce que nous voyons».
51. «l'Inde á abondamment "écrit" dans ses images».
52. L.A. Babb (1981), en étudiant aussi le visuel dans l'Inde moderne, fait plus justice aux autres sens que la vue que Mme Eck. Il mentionne, par exemple, que les dévots *boivent*

le pouvoir divin du gourou, ou que le voyage mystique intérieur arbore des stimuli tant acoustiques que visuels. Mais il persiste à affirmer la suprématie du visuel.

53. «l'infusion de *praṇa* prend habituellement la forme d'un *mantra* prononcé».
54. «les poètes védiques étaient des faiseurs d'images . . . : ils créaient de vivantes images de leurs dieux dans leur poésie».
55. «ces monstrueux concepts comme celui de ''littérature orale''».
56. «lieux légendaires».
57. «*kaṇ poda*, littéralement 'mettre l'oeil', signifie (1) regarder avec envie ou désir, et (2) tomber en amour».
58. «transmettent diverses émotions et fonctions de l'esprit: envie, malice, amour, sagesse et protection».
59. «la croyance en le mauvais oeil n'est pas une croyance simple, mais un ensemble où le seul facteur commun est la conviction que les qualités et intentions intérieures de la personne peuvent émaner de ses yeux».
60. «n'est qu'un des multiples moyens d'expliquer les événements dus à la présence d'étrangers sans nécessairement impliquer personnellement ces derniers».
61. «le premier réside dans la psyché de l'agent – tel le mauvais oeil . . . Le second sont les symboles éternels sur lesquels l'agent doit consciemment travailler: sortilèges, bénédictions, sorts, charmes et formules et invocations».
62. «la société urbaine de plus en plus complexe commençait à requérir des mécanismes d'institutionalisation de l'envie et des mesures pour contrer ses effets».
63. «Même si vous évitez une pierre lancée, vous devez encore échapper à l'oeil».
64. «le toucher . . . est apparenté à la vision par l'extension qu'il offre et . . . la perception visuelle elle-même n'aurait peut-être jamais eu lieu sans quelqu'incorporation de l'imagination tactile».
65. «le bain consiste à verser de l'eau sur la tête et à la laisser couler le long du corps».
66. «en touchant les pieds d'autrui, puis en touchant sa propre tête, on démontre du respect en signifiant que les pieds de la personne sont plus purs que sa propre tête».
67. «Quand deux choses, peu importe lesquelles, sont unies . . . par copulation, baignade, absorption de nourriture ou par tout autre interaction pénétrante, un peu de leur substance . . . est perdu et échangé entre eux».
68. «le mariage croisé implique le plus intime et donc le plus polluant des contacts».
69. «Si l'épouse touche son mari au premier jour de ses règles, cela constitue une offense égale à celle du meurtre d'un gourou».
70. «pollution par le jeu du chat».
71. «le ''Viṣṇupada,'' l'empreinte du pied du Viṣṇu».
72. «est crue très bouillante»
73. «conflit ou de compétition à propos des ressources culturelles ou économiques spécifiques, tels qu'ils émergent dans les transactions sociales autour de la nourriture».
74. «lorsque la femme est le plus éloigné du rôle de génitrice et de partenaire sexuelle ''propre'', elle cesse aussi de cuisiner».
75. «comme si c'étaient des déchets ou des restes pollués, uniquement bons pour les chiens ou le bétail».
76. «un sens du oui-ou-non, un sens du prends-le-ou ne-le-prends-pas, nous laissant savoir ce qui est bon et ce qui ne l'est pas d'une façon des plus physiquement cruciales».

    Cette position implique, et nous sommes d'accord, une assimilation des actes de manger et d'incorporer des substances au sens du goût, la faculté qui domine alors, même si d'autres sens sont nécessairement en jeu, tel le toucher.
77. «nourrir les dieux et manger leurs restes».
78. «incorporation par son propre organisme (nourriture) ou par la psyché (goût esthétique)».

79. «En Inde, le processus de cuisson est vu comme le début de l'ingestion».
80. «les offrandes faites au gourou (à savoir, à l'Etre Suprême dans la personne du gourou) sont, en un sens, ''digérées'' par lui, rendant ainsi les résultats transformés disponibles—sous forme de flot—aux dévots. Dans le corps, et dans l'univers tout entier (le corps de l'Etre Suprême), il s'y produit un processus continuel de discrimination, de séparation, de rétention et de décharge vers le bas. Le gourou est l'Etre Suprême, ce qui signifie qu'il est l'acteur alimentaire universel, le ''mangeur de tout'' et l'ultime personne qui distingue le subtil du brut, le bon du mauvais. En d'autres mots, il est le plus transformateur de tous les êtres».
81. «un séjour dans le monde intérieur . . . plus près de l'état parfait de pur calme».
82. «à manger *brahman*».
83. «la caste . . . absorbant des groupes autonomes partout, procurent aussi le modèle de relations avec les groupes non hindous».

Bibliographie

Appadurai, A.,
1981 Gastro-Politics in Hindu South Asia. American Ethnologist 8:494-511.

Babb, L.A.,
1981 Glancing: Visual Interaction in Hinduism. Journal of Anthropological Research 37:387-401.
1982-83 The Physiology of Redemption. History of Religions 22:293-312.

Beck, B.E.F.,
1969 Colour and Heat in South Indian Ritual. Man 4(4):553-572.
1976 The Symbolic Merger of Body, Space, and Cosmos in Hindu Tamil Nadu. Contributions to Indian Sociology 10(2):213-243.

Bradford, N.J.,
1983 Transgenderism and the Cult of Yellamma: Heat, Sex, and Sickness in South Indian Ritual. Journal of Anthropological Research 39:307-322.

Brown, C.M.,
1986 Purana as Scripture: From Sound to Image of the Holy Word in the Hindu Tradition. History of Religions 26(1):68-86.

Daniel, E.V.,
1987 Fluid Signs: Being a Person the Tamil Way. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Douglas, M.,
1966 Purity and Danger: An Analysis of the Concepts of Pollution and Taboo. Boston: Ark.

Dumont, L.,
1980 Homo Hierarchicus: The Caste System and its Implications [1966], traduit par M. Sainsbury, L. Dumont et B. Gulati. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Eck, D.L.,
1985 Darsan—Seeing the Divine Image in India [1981]. Chambersburg: Anima Books.

Gonda, J.,
1965 Change and Continuity in Indian Religion. The Hague: Mouton.

1969 Eye and Gaze in the Veda. Amsterdam: North-Holland Publishing Company.

Goody, J.,
1977 The Domestication of the Savage Mind. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Howes, D.,
1990 Controlling Textuality: A Call for a Return to the Senses. Anthropologica 32(1).

Jevons, F.B.,
1892 The Testimony of Folk-lore to the European or Asiatic Origin of the Aryans. *Dans* The International Folk-lore Congress 1891, Papers and Transactions, édité par Joseph Jacobs et Alfred Nutt, pp. 322-347. London: David Nutt.

Kakar, S.,
1978 The Inner World: A Psychoanalysis Study of Childhood and Society in India. Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Karve, I.,
1962 On the Road: A Maharashtrian Pilgrimage. Journal of Asian Studies 22(4):13-29.

Kinsley, D.R.,
1982 Hinduism. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall.

Knipe, D.M.
1977 Sapindikarana: The Hindu Rite of Entry into Heaven. *Dans* Religious Encounters with Death, édité par Frank Reynolds et Earle Waugh, pp. 111-124. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press.

Long, J.B.,
1977 Death as a Necessity and a Gift in Hindu Mythology. *Dans* Religious Encounters with Death, édité par Frank Reynolds et Earle Waugh, pp.73-96. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press.

Malamoud, C.,
1975 Cuire le monde. Purushartha: recherche de sciences sociales sur l'Asie du sud 1:91-136.

Maloney, C.,
1976 Don't Say 'Pretty Baby' lest You Zap it with your Eye: The Evil Eye in South India. *Dans* The Evil Eye, édité par C. Maloney, pp.102-148. New York: Columbia University Press.

Miller, D.,
1988 Hindu Sacred Feet, Divine and Human. non publié, présenté au Département d'Études Religieuses de l'Université Concordia, Montréal.

Ong, W.,
1967 The Presence of the Word. New Haven: Yale University Press.
1969 World as View and World as Event. American Anthropologist 71:634-638.
1982 Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word. New York: Methuen.

1986 Hopkins, the Self and God. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Peterson, I.V.,
1982 Singing of a Place: Pilgrimage as Metaphor and Motif in the Tevaram Songs of the Tamil Saivite Saints. Journal of the American Oriental Society 102(1):69-90.

Pocock, D.F.,
1973 Mind, Body and Wealth: A Study of Belief and Practice in an Indian Village. Totowa, New Jersey: Rowman and Littlefield.

Sahay, S.,
1975 Indian Costume, Coiffure and Ornament. New Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal Publishers.

Shankar, R.,
1969 My Music, my Life. London: Jonathan Cape.

Shweder, R.A.,
1985 Menstrual Pollution, Soul Loss, and the Comparative Study of Emotions. *Dans* Culture and Depression, édité par Kleinman et Good, pp. 182-215. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Srinivas, M.N.,
1965 Religion and Society among the Coorgs of South India [1952]. London: Asia Publishing House.

Staal, F.,
1977 Rgveda 10.71 on the Origin of Language. *Dans* Revelation in Indian Thought, édité par Harold Coward et Krishna Sivaranam, pp. 3-14. Emeryville, California: Dharma Publishing.
1979 Oriental Ideas on the Origin of Language. Journal of the American Oriental Society 99(1):1-14.

Stanley, J.M.,
1977 Special Time, Special Power: The Fluidity of Power in a Popular Hindu Festival. Journal of Asian Studies 37(1):27-43.

Tame, D.,
1984 The Secret Power of Music. Wellingborough: Turnstone Press.

Wellesz, E., éd.
1957 Ancient and Oriental Music, The New Oxford History of Music, Vol. 1. London: Oxford University Press.

Wheelock, W.,
1980 A Taxonomy of the Mantras in the New- and Full-Moon Sacrifice. History of Religions 19:349-369.

Zimmermann, F.,
1982 La jungle et le fumet des viandes. Paris: Le Seuil.

AESTHETICS AND ASCETICISM IN INCA RELIGION

Constance Classen

Abstract: Among the Incas, sensory experience served as both a marker of status and a conduit to the supernatural. Ritual was preceded by a deprivation of sensation, especially taste, and followed by the consumption of highly flavoured food. Special sensory powers were ascribed to diviners and ceremonial virgins, with odours being especially associated with the latter role. Both intensive discipline and exquisite sensation were valued and formed part of the training and perquisites of the élite.

Résumé: Chez les Incas les expériences sensorielles ont servi et comme indicateur de status et comme moyen d'accéder au surnaturel. Les rites étaient précédés par une privation sensorielle — en particulier celle du goût — pour ensuite être suivie par la consommation de plats fortement assaisonnés. Des pouvoirs sensoriels étaient attribués aux divins et aux vierges cérémonieuses. Celles-ci étaient associées avec les odeurs. La discipline et le pouvoir sensoriel aigu étaient recherchés et faisaient partie de l'apprentissage et des bénéfices de l'élite.

Aesthetics and asceticism were important means by which the Incas distinguished themselves as civilized in contrast to non-Incas whom they deemed "savages." According to the Incas, "savages" were characterized both by their lack of sensory refinement, i.e. they didn't wear clothes, and by their lack of sensory control, i.e. they didn't regulate their sexuality through marriage (Garcilaso de la Vega 1945 1:40). The Incas, on the other hand, prided themselves on their ability to both cultivate the senses and control them.

When the Spanish arrived in the Inca Empire, they too were often perceived as "savages" by the Incas, due to their violent behaviour and sensory excesses (i.e. Garcilaso de la Vega 1945 1:86). The Spanish, however, considered *themselves* to be civilized and the *Incas* savages, a conception which they were particularly anxious to uphold in order to justify their conquest of the empire.[1] Nonetheless, despite centuries of being associated with

Anthropologica XXXII (1990) 101-106

savagery by the Spanish, present-day Andeans continue to regard themselves as "civilized" in contrast to the Indians of the lowlands (Bastien 1978:97).

Inca ideals of aesthetics and asceticism are best manifested in Inca religious practices and institutions. A short period of sensory deprivation, which in its most basic form consisted of abstaining from salt and pepper, was an essential prelude to all major Inca rituals. The rituals themselves were marked by their sensory richness, as manifested through pageantry, music, dance, the burning of incense and sacrifices, and feasting.

It is noteworthy that fasting for the Incas consisted not of abstaining from food but of abstaining from flavour. The deprivation of flavour before rituals was contrasted with the abundance of flavour present in the feasting which followed rituals. As in Inca mythology salt and pepper (*cache* and *uchu*) were the names given to two of the founders of the Inca dynasty, this pre-ritual fasting followed by post-ritual feasting was perhaps a symbolic reenactment of an original mythological transition from the pre-Inca world to the age of the Incas.

Inca priests were commonly required by their office to engage in long periods of fasting and abstention from sexual relations. In the case of a person in training for a religious office the ascetic requirements could be quite severe. According to one report:

> A person about to assume one of the [priestly] offices has to fast for a month, or, in some places a year, eating neither salt nor pepper nor sleeping with his wife, nor washing nor combing his hair. In some localities they are forbidden to touch the body with their hands. (Arriaga 1968:37)

This asceticism can be seen as a form of ritual exchange: one deprived oneself of certain things in order to receive other desired things—divine powers or a good harvest, for instance.

Significantly, the deprivation was principally one of sensory pleasure, with the senses particularly affected being those apparently considered the most productive of sensory pleasure—touch and taste. The deprivation of sensory pleasure practised before assuming a religious office or before undergoing a rite of passage would leave the body receptive to the sensory expressions of ritual and of the sacred.[2] It may also have served to protect those persons whose bodily boundaries would be abnormally weak due to their liminal position from being "disintegrated" by dangerously strong and intrusive physical sensations.[3]

There were some among the Incas for whom asceticism was a life-long practice. The *acllas* or chosen women, notably, remained virgins all their lives.[4] These women were selected at an early age as the most beautiful in the entire Inca empire. After a period of training some were taken or distri-

buted as wives by the Inca, and the rest were cloistered in special houses next to temples of the sun in order to serve the Inca deities. These *acllas* were told that if they lost their virginity their bodies would rot and, in fact, were punished by death if they had sexual relations. (Murúa 1946:387; Garcilaso de la Vega 1945 1:184-192).

Sex and marriage were understood to a certain extent by the Incas as the conquest and civilization of "savage" female bodies. [5] The Quechua word *purum* could mean an unconquered enemy, uncultivated land or a virgin woman. Sex and marriage, however, while on the one hand considered fundamental to civilization, on the other hand were seen as a corruption of an original pure state. Virginity in both women and men, therefore, although not generally prized by the Incas, could serve to represent purity and wholeness within a sacred context, as in the case of the *acllas*.

According to one colonial chronicler, the *acllas* abstained from food as well as from sex, surviving on odours alone.

> [The *acllas*] have no need of food, they live only on the odour of a certain wild fruit, and when they are travelling away from their house, they take some of this fruit with them in order to sustain themselves with its odour. If they were ever to smell a bad odour, it was considered certain that they would die without remedy. (Murúa 1946:262-263)

This myth was undoubtedly intended to emphasize the spirituality and exquisite sensitivity of the *acllas*. The "bad odours" which would be fatal to the *acllas*, may well have included the odours of sexual intercourse which many South American native peoples consider dangerous to one's health (i.e. Crocker 1985:159-160).[6]

Those Incas who engaged in the most extreme ascetic practices were the diviners who lived alone in the wilderness, wore no clothes, slept on the ground and ate roots (Murúa 1946:156). These diviners manifested many of the characteristics which the Incas associated with savagery—they didn't wear clothes, they didn't live in towns and they didn't practise agriculture—however, their purpose in this was not to participate in the chaos and sensuality of the earth but to detach themselves from it so as to be more attentive to the manifestations of the sacred.

The blunting of the senses of touch and taste practised by the diviners may have been intended to increase the sensitivity of sight and hearing, the primary media of divine revelation in Inca religion. The diviners who lived in the wilderness are said to have gained their knowledge by staring at the luminaries. Other diviners, who were in charge of the temples, went so far as to blind themselves in order to privilege their sense of hearing and attend

to the oral communications of the sacred statues in the temples (Murúa 1946:156, 257).

Such ascetic diviners were, like the cloistered *acllas*, outside the normal social order—the diviners did not conquer in the traditional male way and the *acllas* were not conquered in the traditional female way. Significantly, the odour the *acllas* were said to live on came from a *wild* fruit, associating the *acllas* with the unconquered earth and putting them again on a similar plane to the diviners who lived off the uncultivated products of the earth. Although the diviners and the *acllas* were outside the normal social order, however, by serving the Incas as conduits of sacred power, they helped to uphold the social order.

A significant difference between the *acllas* and the diviners is that the former were not only religious ascetics, but also guardians of Inca aesthetic values. The *acllas* were chosen for their exceptional beauty; they wove the finest cloth in the empire, prepared the finest food and drink, and had the finest singing voices. Most of the productions of the *acllas* were destined exclusively for the deities and the Inca ruling class. Only the Inca élite, for example, was permitted to wear the soft clothing which the *acllas* wove; their subjects were obliged to wear coarse clothes (Pizarro 1921:222-223).[7] Class distinctions within the Inca empire were thus established in part by aesthetic distinctions.

The aesthetic superiority with which the Incas invested themselves was matched by an ascetic superiority. The Inca male puberty rite was preceded by a rigorous training period during which Inca boys were required to fast, sleep on the ground, go barefoot, practise fighting techniques and manifest a general insensibility to pain. The Inca heir was expected to excel in these practices of austerity, as in all else, for the Incas held that a leader should be superior in all ways to his followers (Garcilaso de la Vega 1945 2:59).

Inca culture would seem on one level a combination of Rome and Sparta, of hedonistic excess, as marked by the orgies of revelry which followed rituals, and ascetic self-denial, as marked by the extreme self control which Incas were trained to possess.[8] Both these aesthetic and ascetic extremes, however, formed part of a religious system which considered sensory elaboration and control central to civilization and a fundamental means of establishing communion with the divine, and which required that a balance always be maintained between opposites for society and the cosmos to remain stable.

Acknowledgements

The research on which this research note is based was funded in part by a grant (no. 410-88-0301) from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research

Council of Canada and by a doctoral fellowship from the same organization. I wish to thank Gilles Bibeau for his helpful comments on this paper.

Notes

1. The Spanish executed the Inca ruler Atahualpa, for instance, on the basis of his alleged "barbarism."Atahualpa was charged by the Spanish with having committed, among other things, human sacrifice, polygamy and idolatry (Garcilaso de la Vega 1944:96-97).
2. In this regard it is interesting to note that the Desana Indians of the Colombian Amazon abstain from condiments and sex for several days before ritually ingesting hallucinogens in order to have bright and pleasant visions (Reichel-Dolmatoff 1978:11).
3. Among the Bororo of Central Brazil new parents (a very liminal position in Bororo culture) may not engage in sex, eat strong-tasting foods or scratch themselves, because all of these actions would have a debilitating or aging effect on them (Crocker 1985:56-59).
4. The *yanacona*, male servants of the Incas, who remained celibate during their youth, possibly formed to a certain extent the male counterpart of the *acllas*.
5. The role of women in the Inca is discussed by Irene Silverblatt in *Moon, Sun and Witches: Gender Ideologies and Class in Inca and Colonial Peru.*
6. For a comparison of highland and lowland South American sensory models see Classen (1990).
7. Of all the senses, touch was the one considered most able to traverse categories by the Incas, and therefore the one which had to be most rigorously controlled. Everything which the Inca touched, in particular his garments, for instance, was kept in chests and burned each year so that no one else could touch them and thereby transgress the barriers which separated the Inca from his subjects (Pizarro 1921:225).
8. Failure to manifest complete self control when so required had dire consequences. In the initial encounter of the Inca with the Spanish, for example, those Inca warriors who displayed fear of the horses of the Spanish were executed by the Inca.

References Cited

Arriaga, Pablo Joseph de.
1968 The Extirpation of Idolatry in Peru, [1621] translated and edited by L. Clark Keating. Lexington: University of Kentucky Press.

Bastien, Joseph
1978 Mountain of the Condor: Metaphor and Ritual in an Andean Ayllu. St. Paul, Minnesota: West Publishing.

Classen, Constance
1990 Sweet Colors, Fragrant Songs: Sensory Models of the Andes and the Amazon. American Ethnologist 17(4):722-735.

Crocker, Jon Christopher
1985 Vital Souls: Bororo Cosmology, Natural Symbolism and Shamanism. Tucson: University of Arizona Press.

Garcilaso de la Vega, "El Inca"
1944 Historia General del Peru, Vol. 1 [1617], edited by A. Rosenblat. Buenos Aires: Emece.
1945 Comentarios Reales de los Incas, 2 Vols. [1609], edited by A. Rosenblat. Buenos Aires: Emece.

Murúa, Martin de.
1946 Historia del origen y geneologia real de los reyes Incas del Peru [1590],
edited by C. Bayle. Madrid: Instituto Santo Toribio de Mogrovejo.

Pizarro, Pedro.
1921 Relation of the Discovery and Conquest of the Kingdoms of Peru. Vol. 1. [1571], translated and edited by P.A. Means. New York: Cortes Society.

Reichel-Dolmatoff, Gerardo.
1978 Beyond the Milky Way: Hallucinatory Imagery of the Tukano Indians. Los Angeles: University of California, Latin American Center.

Silverblatt, Irene
1987 Moon, Sun and Witches: Gender Ideologies and Class in Inca and Colonial Peru. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

NOTES ON THE MOROCCAN SENSORIUM

Kit Griffin
Concordia University

Abstract: This research note begins by setting out the received wisdom concerning the structure and content of knowledge in oral as opposed to literate societies. I then proceed to analyze some of the stereotypes which inform that wisdom from the perspective of Bourdieu's notion of the "habitus." The major part of the essay is devoted to showing how the notion of the "habitus" helps to explain the patterning of oral, visual and tactile knowledge and communication in Morocco.

Résumé: Ce travail commence par une description du savoir acquis concernant la structure et le contenu des connaissances dans des sociétés orales plutôt que littéraires. Ensuite, l'auteur fait l'analyse de quelques stéréotypes qui informent ce savoir du point de vue de la notion de l'«habitus» de Bourdieu. La plus grande partie de l'étude se propose de démontrer comment la notion de l'«habitus» aide à expliquer la «typification» des connaissances et de la communication orales, visuelles et tactiles au Maroc.

Communications scholars, following the example of Walter Ong (1967), typically divide world history and the world's cultures into four types or stages: oral (or speech-based), chirographic, typographic and electronic. Each of these kinds of media is said to "frame and facilitate the act of perceiving" differently, and thus contribute to the formation of a different "hierarchy of sensing" or "perceptual field" (Lowe 1982:1). In oral culture the emphasis is on the ear rather than the eye. In chirographic culture this emphasis tends to persist because manuscripts continue to be read aloud. It isn't until typographic culture that the sense of sight comes to dominate the sensorium, largely because the standardization of print makes visual knowledge more reliable than information communicated via any other channel.

In addition to relating perceivers to their environment in qualitatively different ways, media are credited with the power of shaping how people

Anthropologica XXXII (1990) 107-111

think. Thus, according to Lowe (1982:3), in oral culture "metric recitation of rhythmic formulas and commonplaces provides a communicational grid to determine knowledge." In order for any knowledge to be preserved it must fit this grid; otherwise it will be forgotten. With the invention of writing and then of print, there is a progressive separation of speech and memory.

Lowe's discussion of the "perceptual field" and its attendant "communicational grid" bears a certain resemblance to Bourdieu's notion of "habitus," which the latter defines as "a system of lasting, transposable dispositions which, integrating past experiences, functions at every moment as a matrix of perceptions, appreciations and actions and makes possible the achievement of infinitely diversified tasks" (Bourdieu 1977:83). But the resemblance is purely formal, for there is no room within Lowe's mechanistic schema for the analysis of human agency, or, what is equally important, the *context* of communication. By contrast, Bourdieu (1977:15) focusses on the *strategies* involved in the use of the "habitus." He also emphasizes that even in the most ritualized of exchanges, "the agents remain in command of the *interval* between the obligatory moments and can therefore act on their opponents by playing with the *tempo* of the exchange." The greater flexibility of Bourdieu's notion of the "habitus" lends itself well to the analysis of how knowledge is conceptualized and communicated in Morocco, as the remainder of this research note seeks to demonstrate.

In his discussion of traditional Islamic education in Morocco, Eickelman (1985) stresses the importance of "mnemonic possession." Still today, the *Qur'an* and other standard texts are wholly memorized—a feat which takes a minimum of six years for the *Qur'an* alone. Eickelman (1985:63) adds that "the discipline of Qur'anic memorization is an integral part of learning to be human and Muslim." These facts might seem to bear out Lowe's (1982:3) characterization of knowledge in oral and residually oral culture as "preservative and unspecialized, its content nonanalytical, . . . formulaic." However, this characterization fails to take account either of the cultural importance of the melodic voice, or of the indigenous concept of "understanding" (*Fahm*).

To take the second point first, Eickelman (1985:64) explains that in Morocco *understanding* "was not measured by any ability explicitly to "explain" particular verses. . . . Instead, the measure of understanding was implicit and consisted in the ability to use particular Qur'anic verses in appropriate contexts." It was only gradually that the student developed this ability to make appropriate practical reference to the memorized text, mostly by listening to how his father and other relatives did so at social gatherings.

As regards the voice, Nelson (1985) stresses that in Egypt as elsewhere in the Islamic world, the *Qur'an* is not the *Qur'an* unless it is heard. Indeed,

according to scholars and listeners alike, "the beauty and inimitability of the Qur'an lie not in the content and order of the message, on the one hand, and in the elegance of the language on the other [though both of these certainly matter], but in the use of the very sound of the language to convey specific meaning" (Nelson 1985:13). This interpenetration of sound and imagery amounts to what she calls "an almost onomatopoeic use of language." The manipulation of such things as choice of verse, nasality, pitch, phrasing, repetition and pause — not to mention melody — are intrinsic to the meaning, not mere stylistic flourishes, and not simply to facilitate memory. For example, one reciter was admired because he was able to demonstrate "the distance (referred to in a verse) with his voice" (Nelson 1985:65).

It might be surmised on the basis of the preceding discussion that the oral/aural modality is the most important medium of communication in the context of Moroccan culture. Such a conclusion would also find support in the well-known iconoclasm of Islamic art. What this iconoclasm implies is that visual communication is repressed in order to privilege oral communication. However, the tremendous power of Islamic art and architecture is testimony to a deep significance attached to visual know-how. In fact, a master craftsman in the visual arts is called "*ma'allem*," which means "he who knows." A *ma'allem* must work with exactly 357 different shapes of tiles, each with its own name and some so small that they must be put in place with tweezers, to create the mind-boggling puzzles of ceramic tiles that traditionally cover walls, floors and fountains (Paccard 1983:379-89).

Women's crafts involve an equal degree of visual intelligence. Flint (1980:57) describes how a woman learns the art of rugmaking:

> A little girl sits beside her mother at the loom and her eye learns to judge what can be done and what can't, what looks attractive and what doesn't. She becomes a master or mu'allima when she has absorbed all the elements (patterns and structures) so thoroughly that she is able to improvise on any given subject.

According to local conceptions, therefore, in the visual as in the verbal arts, knowledge *is* formulaic, and only through the thorough possession of the relevant formulas can creation take place. However, even though change may be slight, due to the highly structured nature of the vocabulary, creation does happen. Whether it be in the domain of oral communication or visual communication, then, the "disposition" (in Bourdieu's sense) is the same. Let us now examine how this analysis can be extended to the sense of touch.

It is a fairly common view that North African men tend to touch each other more often than North American men do. Greetings between men vary from a simple handshake to a full embrace. Moroccan men often walk

holding hands, or with one arm around another's shoulders. This does not, however, necessarily signify the degree of closeness or affection between them. Rather, the touch of greeting should be understood as a tool, or better, a barometer of where two people stand at a given time in a continual play of dominance and dependence.

Crapanzano (1980) explains that every man is born into the set of associations and obligations of his group. However, upon reaching adulthood he is free to develop his own network of associations. In fact it is from this personal network that he will derive his identity. Everyone is of potential benefit and therefore "must be bound into a relationship through an act—a gift, a favour, a gesture of hospitality, a greeting even" (Crapanzano 1980:77-78). There is no act without significance. The touch, however slight, is the sign of a relationship and every gesture requires reciprocation.

To maintain one's network of associates, or "clientele," involves a strong competitive element (Crapanzano 1980:80), for as Bourdieu (1977:9) observes, "even in cases in which the agents' habitus are perfectly harmonized and the interlocking of actions and reactions is totally predictable from the outside, uncertainty remains as to the outcome of the interaction as long as the sequence has not been completed." Thus in a given relationship, there exists much ambiguity as to who is dominated by whom at any given time. Indeed, in my own experience, one can often identify the dominant person in a given relationship by observing which person dotes and hangs on the other. It is as if the dominant person must continually throw affection on the subordinate one in a show of dependence, to mask his actual superiority. Flaunting one's superiority would effectively end an alliance.

This point is also stressed by Waterbury (1970). He notes that a person who amasses a significant degree of wealth and power becomes concerned with conserving it. He doesn't want to "rock the boat" by accumulating too much power, because he could lose it all, and this would cause disequilibrium—"a state that Moroccans generally seek to avoid" (Waterbury 1970:6). For this reason, intricate systems of alliance and counter-alliance are created and recreated according to the shape of events. In that way a balance of power is maintained.

Waterbury's discussion of this striving after equilibrium in interpersonal relations can be related to the interest in abstract patterns so characteristic of Islamic art. As McDonough (1984:9) explains:

> This interest has led to the elaboration of complex abstractions that indicate a perceived interrelatedness of all forms. Harmony and balance have been major characteristics of Islamic art. This awareness of equilibrium, suggested in the work of artists, has also shaped the thinking of jurists and others who have been concerned to design social forms.

We may surmise that in Morocco, whether a message is addressed to the eye, the ear or the touch, it is the context that counts, and the form of the message is subordinate to the social imperative, the maintenance of equilibrium.

Acknowledgment

I wish to thank fellow members of the Concordia Sensoria Research Group for their many helpful comments on earlier versions of this essay, as well as the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (grant no. 410-88-0301) for its support of our project.

References Cited

Bourdieu P.
1977 Outline of a Theory of Practice. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Crapanzano V.
1980 Tuhami, Portrait of a Moroccan. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Eickelman D.
1985 Knowledge and Power in Morocco: The Education of a Twentieth Century Notable. Princeton, N. J.: Princeton University Press.

Flint B.
1980 The Rugs of Settled and Nomadic Peoples: A Contrast in Expression. *In* From the Far West: Carpets and Textiles of Morocco, edited by Fiske, Pickering and Yohe, pp. 49-61. Washington: The Textile Museum.

Lowe D.
1982 History of Bourgeois Perception. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

McDonough S.
1984 Muslim Ethics and Modernity. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press.

Nelson K.
1985 The Art of Reciting the Qur'an. Austin: University of Texas Press.

Ong W.
1967 The Presence of the Word. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Paccard, André
1983 Le Maroc et l'artisanat traditionnel Islamique dans l'architecture. Annecy: Editions Atelier no. 74.

Waterbury J.
1970 The Commander of the Faithful. New York: Columbia University Press.

HAUSA SENSORY SYMBOLISM

Ian Ritchie
McGill University

Abstract: Hausa folk tales and proverbs suggest that Hausa culture traditionally placed a high value on non-visual modes of experiencing the world, especially those of taste and smell. Concomitantly, sight is de-emphasized in comparison to Western culture. Selected items of folk lore are examined and the relative roles of the different senses compared.

Résumé: Les contes folkloriques et les proverbes des Hausa suggèrent que la culture traditionelle Hausa attribua une grande importance aux modes non-visuels de l'expérience du monde et, plus particulièrement, à ceux de l'odeur et du goût. Ainsi on attribue moins d'importance à la vue que le fait la culture occidentale. Certains contes et traditions folkloriques sont étudiés et les rôles relatifs que jouent les sens différents sont comparés.

Introduction

This essay is a preliminary report on my research into Hausa sensory symbolism. The Hausa language is spoken by the peoples of the seven traditional Hausa city states in North-Central Nigeria, and seven additional city states called the "*banza bakwai.*" The term "Hausa" refers more to a language and culture than to a specific ethnic identity, though the ethnic component is also discernible.

The principal lines of evidence I shall be pursuing consist of the proverbial and folk tale literature. I begin with an examination of Pauline Ryan's (1976) study, "Colour Symbolism in Hausa Literature." Ryan makes a significant contribution to our knowledge of Hausa culture through her careful analysis of the symbolic values ascribed to white, black and red: the first denotes socially desirable qualities, the second their opposite, while red is ambiguous. However, my sense is that she has overstressed the visual dimension of the Hausa sensorium, and that other dimensions deserve equal, if not greater attention, if one is to abide by the sensory preferences of the Hausa themselves.

Anthropologica **XXXII (1990) 113-119**

For example, Ryan lists a number of colours, such as *kore-kore* (light green), *shudi-shudi* (light blue), *Ja mai bakin ruwa* (dark red) and *Rawaya* (yellow) (Ryan 1976:143) which virtually never occur in spoken Hausa. My Hausa instructor, Mallam Garba Adamu, (a "Katsina man") said that while colours other than *baki* (black), *fari* (white) and *ja* (red) do exist, most Hausa do not know these colours or refer to them. Ryan relies heavily on lexicons and this is perhaps the major weakness of her study, insofar as lexicographers, with typical collectors' zeal, often end up with a great collection of words which could be obtained only from one informant, or at best from a tiny élite within a society.

These words are atypical, and in some cases one may rightly question whether they should be included in the armature of a language at all. An example in this case would be Ryan's discussion of "*Algashi*" which she claims is an Arabic loan word for "green." Very few, if any, Hausas would know or use this word, though a few involved in industries such as the dyeing industry near Kano might use it because their profession requires finer colour specifications. She does admit that many of these terms are infrequently used (cf. regarding *kore* Ryan 1976:142), but she does not adequately emphasize this fact, with the result that she creates, perhaps inadvertently, a distorted perception of the Hausa life-world.

Ryan goes on to observe that in Whitting's (1940) entire collection of Hausa proverbs, amounting to well over 2000, there are only three proverbs which include *ja* (red) and that Abraham only lists one under this entry (Ryan 1976:149). This is telling! She proposes: "Perhaps a partial explanation for this dearth of proverbs containing *ja* may be that, as Turner suggests in his article on Ndembu color symbolism (Turner 1966) . . . , in certain contexts red becomes subsumed under black or white." (ibid.:149). I would suggest an additional explanation: it is because red, along with the entire visual spectrum, does not assume so prominent a role in the Hausa life-world as it does in Western culture, that one finds so little emphasis upon colour symbolism. Food symbolism, by contrast, is pervasive.

Taste

One notes in collections of Hausa folk tales and proverbs that the majority centre around food, tasting, eating or swallowing. Out of the 21 stories presented in the first volume of Rattray's (1913) *Hausa Folklore*, 15 give a very important role to eating something. The other six are the shortest six in the collection and do not have very developed plots. Similarly in Frank Edgar's collection of Hausa stories one finds that of the stories about Spider, virtually all of them revolve around Spider's insatiable appetite for meat, and the adventures he goes through to satisfy it (Skinner 1969).

More importantly, the eating of food usually seems to occur at a *pivotal* juncture in a story: it is not merely a decoration, nor an activity which happens in passing, in order to facilitate the developing relationships. It is *essential and integral* to what happens next in the story. After the eating of whatever is eaten, whether the item(s) had magical powers or not, the story moves off in an entirely new and unpredictable direction. For example, in Rattray's Story No. 5 a key actor is a magical spoon which comes to the rescue of a poor despised wife by providing her with an inexhaustible supply of food during a famine when she says the magic spoon's name: "Help me that I may taste" (Rattray 1913:80ff.). In Story No. 7 a dog has possession of magic implements which enable various visitors to cook whole pots of rice from a single grain, whole pots of meat from a single dry bone and perform other marvellous feats (ibid.:134ff.). This is crucial to the story's development.

In several of the folk tales, the story has barely gotten under way when already there is mention of eating something: in Number 9 and Number 19 eating takes place in the first eight lines of the story (Rattray 1913:186, 284). Often, tremendous powers of strength are attested to by the amount that a person can eat. Story Number 12 is about a man called "A man among men" whose strength is described by saying that "he eats twenty elephants, five of them for breakfast alone."(ibid.:226). This is in contrast to a lesser man who only ate 10 elephants (ibid.:218). In many of the stories plants or animals have prodigious eating capacities: in Number 21 a Gawo tree tries to swallow its nemesis the lizard, but each time the lizard comes out of the tree's body at a different place (ibid.:320).

A signal Hausa folk tale, the *Tale of Daudawar Batso*, is one in which all the actors of the drama are tastes! In this story Salt, Pepper, Nari (a savoury sauce made from peanut), Onion Leaves and Daudawar Batso (a special sauce with a strong smell) transform themselves into the forms of young maidens and go out to look for a certain young man who is not described visually, but is called "beautiful." They force Daudawar Batso to stay behind, however, because she has such a stench that she is not considered presentable. She remains behind but follows them at a distance. Salt, Pepper, Nari and Onion Leaves meet an old woman at a stream who asks them to rub her back, but they refuse and go along their way. When Daudawar Batso meets her, however, she agrees to rub the old woman's back, and as a reward the old woman tells her the name of the young man they are all searching for, (Daskandarini), who turns out to be her son. Eventually, Salt and Pepper and Onion Leaves reach the house where the young man is staying and greet him from outside. Each of them tries to gain admittance to the house, but the young man asks each in turn if they know his name. Of course they all fail to gain admittance because they don't know his name.

When at last Daudawar Batso arrives she tries her luck at the door, and she indeed knows the name of the young man for it is just as the old woman had said. She knows his name, he marries her, and Salt and Pepper and Onion Leaves end up being her servants. The story records the following moral: "if you see a man is poor don't despise him; you do not know but that some day he may be better than you." (Rattray 1913:272).

The idea of a story in which all the actors are *tastes* is one so foreign to westerners that they find it difficult to connect with. There is no visual imagery in the story, only tastes and smells. This is why it has a peculiar and alien ring to western ears. And the alterity of the idiom is compounded by the alterity of the medium (i.e. the oral-aural), as we shall see in the next part.

Hearing

Social skills are taught partly through example, but another important means of teaching correct behaviour is through proverbs and folk tales. This emphasis on the oral transmission of wisdom is expressed in the Hausa proverb *Kunne ya tsere wa kaka*, which means "The ear goes back beyond your grandfather" (Kirk-Greene 1966:14). Thus character is shaped *verbally* among the Hausa, and the models for that character are contained in oral literature, rather than being encountered in movies or other visual media (such as television cartoons or *People* Magazine), as would seem to be more often the case for westerners.

Kirk-Greene (1974) reports that good manners are of greater importance to the traditional Hausa man than good appearance, though appearance is also considered worth taking care about. He elaborates upon the concept *mutumin kirki* in Hausa: the "man of good character," which incorporates the notion of wisdom and upright conduct, good sense and human compassion. The concept "*kirki*" can be understood to suggest the superiority of the unseen to the seen (good manners over good looks) and that good character comes through internalizing what is *heard*, i.e. oral wisdom passed down from the ancestors.

Kirk-Greene's exegesis of the concept of *mutumin kirki* helps us to grasp the deeper meaning of the tale of Daudawar Batso, introduced in the last section. It is the knowledge of the *name* of the "beautiful young man" (Daskandarini) that is the key which unlocks the door to his house and to happiness. At the beginning of the story, the young girls know nothing about the young man except that he is "beautiful." Their attraction to him, therefore, is based entirely upon the visual realm. While the story teller does not explicitly condemn this dependence upon the visual, we can see that the *exclusive* reliance upon visual appearance as the basis of attraction is what

later ruins the fortunes of the girls. By contrast, Daudawar Batso, while she is also attracted by the visual, is not so controlled by it that she allows it to dominate her actions. When she meets the old woman, it is she alone who has the patience required to take the time to stop and rub the hag's back. The others, full of haste, had rushed on to find their "beautiful young man." Patience, *hakuri* in Hausa, is an essential component of *kirki* (Kirk-Greene 1974:7). It is therefore fitting that Daudawar Batso should be given the key to intimacy with the young man, which is his character-revealing *name*. As a result, she is enabled to connect with the inner *character* or *kirki* of the young man, for in Hausa, one's name reveals one's inner character.

Smell

In the tale of Daudawar Batso, the main character was rejected by the others because of her offensive smell. While this sort of reaction may be no more prominent in Hausa than in other cultures, nevertheless the moral of the story directs one to override the common reaction to this sense and give honour to the one who seemed worse than the others.

Smell also plays key roles in many of the other stories. One notes the role of smell in sniffing out enemies as in Rattray's Number 12 (Rattray 1913:218), reminding one of the "Fee fi fo fum" story in English. Furthermore, smell emanates from food, which plays a pivotal role in so many Hausa folk tales. In this role, smell has a tantalizing, and even a tempting function.

Smell has in common with sound the property of being able to travel around corners, and thus it has an especially revelatory role in Hausa culture, where the built environment occludes the sense of sight on account of its high walls, narrow crooked streets and cloistered courtyards. Extraordinary powers of olfactory discernment are frequently attributed to animals in Hausa folk tales, and this quality is connected with the quality of skill in living life, such as the skill which Spider demonstrates in the many clever ruses he employs to satisfy his seemingly insatiable appetite for meat (Skinner 1969).

Sight

In Whitting's collection of Hausa and Fulani proverbs there is some highly revealing information concerning the sense of sight. He reports the proverb *gani ya fi ji* or alternatively *gani ya kori ji* which he translates "seeing excels hearing" (Whitting 1940:53). The verb *kori* means literally "to chase away" or "drive out." While this proverb taken in isolation might seem to indicate the priority of sight, it is best understood in the context of its normal usage, which is limited to situations where hearsay must be proved

right or wrong through personally witnessing evidence of the rumoured event. Certainly sight in itself is not taken as ultimate in Hausa thought, as the following proverb attests: "*Ganin Dala ba shiga birni ba ne*—seeing Dala [a suburb of Kano] is not entering the city. [Kano], i.e. seeing your goal is not the same as reaching it." (ibid.:60). Another often heard proverb is *gani ba ci ba* which means "seeing is not eating" (Whitting 1940:52). In context, this phrase refers to the greater depth of knowledge gained through gustation and eating, as opposed to mere sight. It suggests that one can only become intimate with a person or thing and have true knowledge through the sense of taste.

Ample evidence indicates that making life pleasing to the eye is well worth the effort amongst the Hausa. Visual attraction is not condemned in itself: it is accepted as the normal human tendency, as we saw in the tale of Daudawar Batso. But sight as a *controlling* force, or the dependence upon sight as the *sole* means of determining character or the true (inner) nature of things is strongly discouraged in Hausa culture.

Conclusion

It would seem on the basis of the preceding analysis of Hausa proverbs and folk tales, cursory as it is, that the non-visual sense modalities play a more prominent role in Hausa culture than do they in western cultures. Certainly, when one finds entire folk tales constructed in the idiom of taste, and a tremendously rich and developed system of metaphors related to eating, then one begins to suspect that the gustatory and auditory senses exercise a wider and more developed role than they enjoy in western culture.

Acknowledgment

I am indebted to the SSHRC for its support of "The Varieties of Sensory Experience" research project (grant #410.88.0301). Thanks are also due to project co-ordinator David Howes who offered many helpful suggestions.

References Cited

Johnston, H.A.S.

1966 A Selection of Hausa Stories, translated and compiled by H.A.S. Johnston. Oxford: Clarendon.

Kirk-Greene, Anthony H.M.

1966 Hausa Ba Dabo Ba Ne: A Collection of 500 Proverbs, translated and annotated by A.H.M. Kirk-Greene. Ibadan: Oxford University Press.

1974 Mutumin Kirki: The Concept of the Good Man in Hausa. Bloomington: Indiana University African Studies Program.

Rattray, R. Sutherland
1913 Hausa Folk-Lore, Customs, Proverbs, Etc. 2 Vols. Oxford: Clarendon.
Ryan, Pauline M.
1976 Color Symbolism in Hausa Literature. Journal of Anthropological Research 32:141-160.
Skinner, Neil
1969 Hausa Tales and Traditions: An English translation of *Tatsuniyoyi Na Hausa*, compiled and edited by Frank Edgar. New York: Africana Publishing Corporation.
Turner, V.W.
1966 Colour Classification in Ndembu Ritual. *In* Anthropological Approaches to the Study of Religion, edited by M. Banton, pp. 47-84. London: Tavistock.
Whitting, C.E.J.
1967 Hausa and Fulani Proverbs. [1940] Lagos: Government Printer; Farnborough, Hants.: Gregg Press Ltd.

REVIEW ESSAY: THE CAPACITY FOR CULTURAL CRITIQUE WITHIN THE ROMANTIC MOTIVES OF CONTEMPORARY ANTHROPOLOGY

Paths Toward a Clearing: Radical Empiricism and Ethnographic Inquiry
Michael Jackson
Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press. 1985. 239 pp. $35.00 (cloth), $12.95 (paper)
Culture and Truth: The Remaking of Social Analysis.
Renato Rosaldo
Boston, Massachusetts: Beacon Press. 1989. 253 pp. $31.50 (cloth)
Romantic Motives: Essays on Anthropological Sensibility (History of Anthropology, Vol. 6).
George W. Stocking, Jr., editor
Madison, Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press. 1989. 286 pp. $25.00 (cloth)

Reviewer: George E. Marcus
Rice University

After assigning me the volumes by Jackson and Rosaldo, the review editor of this journal then asked me to include *Romantic Motives*, the latest in the distinguished annual series of collected papers in the history of anthropology, edited by George Stocking. This addition to the review was an inspired suggestion because it signalled both an interesting focus and an historical perspective by which to assess the other two works.

In his introduction, which tries to give thematic unity to his volume, Stocking distinguishes between two visions of knowledge production in anthropology: a major-key one, derived from the Enlightenment, that emphasizes scientific progress and the search for general laws, and a minor-key one, rooted intellectually in German romanticism and traditions of exploration and natural history, that emphasizes experience, subjectivity, reflexivity and holistic understanding. This minor-key vision has been realized through fieldwork, ethnography and the contemporary focus on interpretation, but, according to Stocking, the historiography of anthropology has not fully or explicitly acknowledged these "romantic motives" in the shaping of the discipline.

Stocking is not so much interested in exploring the methodological implications of the romanticist legacy in anthropology, but rather "what is at issue is a matter of "sensibility"" (p.5). It remains, however, unclear why the issue of sensibility is important for an historical understanding of the production of anthropological

Anthropologica XXXII (1990) 121-125

knowledge in the name of science. Or does raising the issue of sensibility call into question the scientific claims and enlightenment self-image that anthropologists have otherwise historically cultivated for themselves? This is the science-versus-humanism question that is so polemically discussed in contemporary anthropology and that badly needs historical and scholarly perspective. This volume, unfortunately, does little more than pose the question.

Stocking also avoids trying to define romanticism in anthropology in relation to the complex typological and conceptual debates among humanists about romanticism as an aesthetic and as a group of recurrent artistic movements in European history. Rather, the six papers of the volume diversely explore specific aspects of the relationship between anthropology and historical romanticism broadly or narrowly construed for the purposes of each paper. For me, most impressive is Thomas de Zengotita's long essay which brilliantly pairs Rousseau with Lévi-Strauss, and Herder with Sapir, and then appropriately ends with perhaps the most interesting commentary yet on the so-called postmodern move in contemporary anthropology. James Boon offers an irresistible and erudite contrapuntal duet for Lévi-Strauss and Wagner. Stocking's own piece explores the relationship between scientism and romanticism, as sensibilities in American anthropology, by surveying the salience of a romantic sensibility in 1920s anthropology and then focussing on the famous controversies that developed from the restudies of the work of Robert Redfield and Margaret Mead. The other papers in this volume are of the same superb quality. This volume, then, meets the high standards in scholarship, writing, and editing of its companions, making these among the most distinguished publications in anthropology, as well as in the history of social sciences.

It is among the most essential sources for contemporary debates in anthropology, too. Stocking himself has the persona of a careful, accomplished historian, keeping his distance professionally from current trends in the discipline on which he focusses. Yet, obliquely, from the margins and asides in his contributions to each volume, he very clearly indicates that he is shaping these annuals in the shadow of what seem to be the major turnings and internal critiques of American anthropology that have been occurring from the early 1880s to the present. Stocking notes, at the conclusion of his introduction to the present volume: "It is clear that this volume is itself the product of a particular (postmodern?) moment in the history of anthropology, in which a number of tendencies expressive of a romantic sensibility ("reflexive," "hermeneutic," "interpretive," "deconstructive," etc.) are quite strongly manifest" (p. 7).

The recent critical focus on the ethnography as a kind of writing, embodying a distinctive rhetoric and set of characteristics as discourse, has opened a rich discussion and meditation on all aspects of the production of anthropological knowledge at the end of the 20th century. It is this contemporary historical condition of a so-called crisis of representation in anthropology, and in the human sciences in general, that constitutes the major motives for the efflorescence of a romantic sensibility as Stocking has thematized it. A critical edge especially marks this sensibility at present. The value placed upon subjectivity—the writer's as well as the subject's—as a mode of knowing, on the senses and full-bodied experience, on narratives, and on the aesthetics of everyday existence is usually developed against, in particular, the once hegemonic post-World War II positivist sensibility of social science, marked by value neutrality. The question for me is this: to what kinds of

projects and commitments of knowledge production might such a keenly critical romantic sensibility attach itself, once released from the reductionism, objectifications and naïve faith in reason of much past social science?

The books by Rosaldo and Jackson are exemplary romanticist and critical works of the moment. They have much in common. Both are assemblages of essays that each scholar has produced, and in several cases previously published, over the past decade. Strong autobiographical threads run through each. In Rosaldo's case, it is the death of a spouse, bereavement, falling in love again, changes in the representation of Chicano identity, and the stakes involved in current academic debates over what is to count as knowledge. Jackson also writes of the loss of a spouse and also of his experience and struggles as a poet. But the central experience and fund of personal knowledge from which each writes evocatively, anecdotally and, on occasion, analytically is that of the career-defining activity of fieldwork—among the Ilongot of the Philippines for Rosaldo, and the Kuranko of West Africa for Jackson. The act of interpreting otherness in the fieldwork context is the framework that defines the *mise-en-scène* of most of the essays in both books. It also defines the limits of what each author might say critically about the epistemology he writes against and about the kind of knowing that might replace it. There is very little originality in these books' arguments or philosophical positions—each gladly acknowledges various sources of intellectual influence. Their power, rather, is in weaving these influences precisely into the expression of the sensibility that Stocking has labelled romantic—the sensibility that depends on a constant meditation upon feeling, acting and knowing within the scene of fieldwork. The question is how much intellectual weight can this kind of work be made to bear for readers familiar with a now decades-old genre of writing about "reflections on fieldwork in X."

Of the two works, I prefer Rosaldo's to Jackson's for his attempt to create a range of associations beyond the scene of fieldwork and for relating the basic and restrictive humanism of the lone, self-reflective anthropologist in the field to other frameworks, positionings and discourses about cultural difference. Jackson remains quite radically conservative (and romanticist) in his restatement of the creed from which many anthropologists slipped in the decades of post-World War II positivism. Jackson's key term is "radical empiricism," taken from William James, which emphasizes knowing through reflecting on the experience of intersubjectivity: "The importance of this view for anthropology is that it stresses the ethnographer's interactions with those he or she lives with and studies, while urging us to clarify the ways in which our knowledge is grounded in our practical, personal, and participatory experience in the field as much as our detached observations" (p. 3). The heralding of this position—which comes close to being the sole point of putting these mostly fine ethnographic essays together in a single volume—will hardly be news to an anthropology in 1990 which has seen, since the early 1980s, equally eloquent expressions of this same position.

In Jackson's essays there is a gifted ethnographer at work. Many interesting points are made through example and illustration about the body, personhood, poetics and the senses in the constitution of cultural phenomena. But the metadiscourse that this work develops is oddly out of touch with the important critiques of classic humanism that it, and most expressions of the romantic sensibility in anthropology, exemplifies. In such humanism, the virtue of an "other" is used to

state preferred *Western* value, in defining the subjectivity of the humanist writing. Correspondingly, Kuranko experience and Jackson's own define the position of radical empiricism as a preferred way of knowing. The very same emphases on the senses, poetics, and personhood have been used (e.g., by Stephen Tyler and James Clifford) in recent debates about ethnography to call into question the radical empiricism of the lone humanist voice that Jackson romanticizes. This would have been a much more interesting and useful volume had Jackson more openly and centrally engaged the ongoing debates, rather than assuming the identity of the essayist, the artist, rather alone, not only in the world of the Kuranko but also in his own academic culture.

Rosaldo makes somewhat different use of this sensibility of knowing through rich experiences among others. Most of his papers were originally talks delivered in public forms. They were not produced in the persona of a classic essayist for his own pleasure or for an implied reader, but rather were prepared for specific occasions and listeners. They imply a politics and a social activism that Jackson's do not. Beyond castigating bad epistemology, which is the point of a number of his papers, Rosaldo generally tries, in each paper, to expand the kinds of discourses to which ethnographically grounded discourse might be related. While speaking from ethnographic authority, he is certainly not chauvinist for it.

For Rosaldo, the key terms are, perhaps, "narratives" and "borders." The main use of ethnography is in relativizing itself among other, distinctly non-academic discourses for the purposes of cultural critique. Narratives, autobiographies and ethnohistories, gleaned in ethnographic work, cross the borders and blur the boundaries of genre, subject-object and disciplinary authority. Ultimately the identity of these latter must change in the academy, and in Rosaldo's epilogue ("The Raging Battle," about liberal education in contemporary American universities), the stakes are very high for knowledge/power in American culture: "In my view, the current battle about how best to prepare students for life in the twenty-first century revolves around questions of the degree and significance of human differences, whether change or stasis is the nature state of society, and to what extent struggle shapes the course of human events. . . . The choice of what we want to know is primarily political and ethical, hence the intensity of feelings brought to and aroused by the conflict" (p. 224).

In the way Rosaldo crafts his essays—around the romantic sensibility of fieldwork experience—his radically critical purposes are finally constricted. Still the lone knower of the Ilongot (despite the brilliant insights of his paper, "Imperialist Nostalgia"), Rosaldo can only approach the borderlands of the various discourses overlapping ethnography, evoking them without ever crossing over. Nonetheless, as talks, these papers, with their warmth, insight and ironies, have undoubtedly been very effective communications in the politics concerning what is to count as knowledge in the human sciences.

The romantic sensibility in contemporary anthropology, a discipline now full of debate about past purpose and present possibility, is thus double-edged. As in Rosaldo, it can begin to transform (deconstruct?) itself under pressure of other kinds of sensibilities into which it blurs, creating a different sort of knowledge space such as is now mapped by the human sciences. Or, as in Jackson, it can reinforce the humane knower, sustaining the unity and autonomy of his/her own experience among that of others, who remain his/her subjects. In this latter reaffirma-

tion of the romantic sensibility in anthropology, we have a sense of what seems good and true within a tradition of knowing, but we have no sense of how that tradition itself might be transformed. This is the question that Rosaldo's constituencies compel him to address.

BOOK REVIEWS / COMPTES RENDUS

Kinship and the Drum Dance in a Northern Dene Community
Michael Asch
The Boreal Institute for Northern Studies, 1988. xi + 113 pp. $12.95 (paper)

Reviewer: Robin Ridington
University of British Columbia

This book is a study of the Slavey Drum Dance at Pe Ts'eh Ki (Wrigley, NWT) in 1969-70. Much of the ethnographic information was previously available only in the author's Ph.D. thesis. The present book is more than a reissue of the thesis, however. While Asch bases the book on information he collected for his thesis, he asks questions relevant to changes in both his own thinking and that of the Dene in the intervening years. Unlike the thesis, which was organized in relation to the anthropological musicology of its time, this book discusses the meaning of a successful Drum Dance as defined by the community as it existed in the 1960s.

Asch relates his thesis material to his later interests in political process among the Dene by showing how the Drum Dance helped resolve dynamics of economic and social stress prior to the development of contemporary Dene political institutions. He also gives a critical review of the anthropological musicology available to him in 1972, the publication date of his thesis. Asch reflects that, like many another Ph.D. thesis, his own work may be more valuable for its ethnographic information than for its approach to a theoretical problem that it did not entirely resolve.

Asch begins his account of kinship and the Slavey Drum Dance with a story in the voice and highly contexted discourse of his Dene informants. This "Dene Account of How the World Was Created" is circular, like the Drum Dance itself, in that it describes the intersecting circles of a world in process. The book then goes on to provide detailed information about Pe Ts'eh Ki economic life in relation to the division of labour, ownership, knowledge, and household organization.

A chapter on social structure and organization describes kinship terminology and usage. Asch interprets Pe Ts'eh Ki kinship as a Dravidianate system of structural opposition between parallel and cross relatives. It organizes relations between members of nodal kindreds that are like bands within the community as a whole. The Drum Dance is related to kinship, Asch says, in that it helps overcome dynamic tensions that are endemic in current circumstance.

Finally, Asch describes and analyzes a corpus of 22 songs that illustrate the repertoire that were available to the Pe Ts'eh Ki in 1969-70. These songs enabled singers to bring about what Asch describes as an "ideal drum dance." Such a dance, he says, creates a "special world" in which personal disputes are laid aside in the interests of creating a "we rationale" of community solidarity. In a 1988 postscript, Asch admits that the theoretical perspective of his thesis led him to a more pessimistic view of the Drum Dance's efficacy than both the Pe Ts'eh Ki and Asch himself experienced at the time. Although the Drum Dance did bring about community solidarity, Asch argues that the Dene as a whole have been ultimately successful by confronting "the external forces of change" directly.

This book is an important addition to northern Athapaskan ethnography. It will be of value both to non-Native scholars and to the Dene themselves. It should be required reading for courses in anthropology and Native studies departments that deal with Native peoples in Canada or in subarctic cultures in general.

Who Shares: Co-operatives and Rural Development
D.W. Attwood and B.S. Baviskar, eds.
Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1988. x + 432 pp. $46.50 (cloth)

Reviewer: Marilyn Silverman
York University

In focussing on co-operatives, this volume "use[s] comparative case study analyses to . . . deepen our understanding of this field of development studies" (p. 1). To this end, the volume contains a very readable "Introduction" written by the two editors and 18 case studies which originally were presented at an 1983 symposium in Montreal.

The most striking feature of the volume, and both its strength and its weakness, lies in the sheer diversity of the cases presented. First, the articles cover a wide variety of locales and modes of livelihood. There are studies of co-operatives among pastoralists (in Baluchistan, Botswana, East Africa, Kenya) and among agriculturalists (in north-eastern Brazil, Kenya, Uganda, Egypt/Tunisia, Nigeria and the Philippines). Eight of the case studies are from India; four of these concern the dairy industry. Secondly, the kinds of co-operatives which receive attention vary considerably. The cases range over production, purchasing, processing, marketing, credit and savings co-operatives. Thirdly, the antecedent conditions out of which the co-operatives developed are extremely variable. For example, in some places the co-operatives were generated out of indigenous systems of land tenure, whereas in others they were located in colonial structures such as plantations. As a result, the class bases of the focal co-operatives are highly diverse. The various case studies deal, among other things, with wage labourers, pastoral nomads and small farmers. Fourthly, the co-operatives run the gamut of highly institutionalized organizations to "informal" ones based on prior local groups and networks. Fifthly, the levels of analyses differ. The articles range from those which focus on a single co-operative to one, for example, which assesses co-operative development for all of Africa. Finally, the different perspectives of the authors add a further dimension to this diversity. These range from anthropologists doing local-level political economy to sociologists collecting data by random sample and questionnaire.

In the light of this diversity, the editors are to be credited for achieving a degree of intellectual orderliness by organizing the contributions around three central questions. First, what is, and has been, the relationship between socioeconomic inequality and co-operatives? Secondly, how does the intervention of the state affect co-operatives? Thirdly, how does informal co-operation work and how does it affect the "fit" of more formal, "official," co-operatives?

In the "Introduction" the editors pose these questions and show how the particular case studies shed light on them. At the same time, a reading of the particular

cases shows that many are far more complex than these general questions allow. As such, the volume has the usual weaknesses and strengths of endeavours of this type. On the one hand, the volume necessarily lacks internal coherence, so readers who are interested in more theoretical and/or uniform approaches to development and co-operation will be somewhat disappointed. On the other hand, the diversity of case material and ethnography engenders a necessary respect for the complexity of real economic life and the problems of development. Moreover, several of the articles are excellent. It for these latter reasons that the volume is to be recommended. It will be useful for courses in agrarian systems and rural development and for those readers whose work and interests lie in co-operatives and rural development.

Beyond Anthropology: Society and the Other
Bernard McGrane
New York: Columbia University Press, 1989. xi + 150 pp. $32.50 (cloth)

Reviewer: Elvi Whittaker
University of British Columbia

The sparse collection of writing which addresses the gap between anthropology and philosophy is expanded by this work. The author examines the concept of the Other, the notion which, for more than a decade, anthropology has thrust forward as one of its central claims to existence. The evocation of the Other has tripped off so many anthropological tongues for so long that it has reached platitudinous proportions. McGrane's history-of-ideas analysis, however, lends it a scholarly seriousness. He traces the metaphoric history of the Other from the emergence of the Renaissance to the 20th century. Beginning with the 16th century, the reader is introduced to a cosmography where the Other is a heathen—sinful, diabolical and quintessentially non-Christian. From this period McGrane moves to the Enlightenment, when the concept was synonymous with ignorance in the face of rationality, a "savage" separated by the absence of religion from his moral opposite, the civilized, knowing European. To make his point the author evokes the classic confrontation of Crusoe with the Man Friday. In the 19th century, philosophy passed much of its intellectual mandate over to anthropology. At that time the Other resided in some mythic past, safely removed from contemporary civilized man by the ultimate segregation of all, evolutionary time. So anthropology and biology, McGrane suggests, serve as discourses that attempt to unify contemporary humanity with remnants from the innocent and savage past. In short they are "theories of kinship" (p. 78). Finally, in the 20th century where everything is culture-bound, the Other is accounted for by cultural relativity, where difference is "merely" or "only" difference and where, superficially at least, the Other is "not-inferior-but-different" (p. 129).

The giants from whose shoulders the author surveys the anthropological enterprise appear to be Foucault and, to a lesser extent, Wittgenstein, Kuhn and Nietzsche, on the one hand, and Fabian and Todorov, on the other. In the opening pages he declares his debt to Harold Garfinkel, Alan Blum, and to ethnomethodology in general. It is disappointing that their epistemological influence, provocative

as it is, is not more evident. His clearly constructivist view (for example, "anthropology, in short, does not simply describe its subject matter; it systematically constructs and produces it" [p. 4], or "this is an attempt not to understand the Other . . . but rather, historically, to understand our understanding of the Other" [p. 2]) suggest equally well ethnomethodology's predecessors, Schutz and Berger and Luckmann. He asks the question, as once proposed by Kuhn: to what conditions must the Other conform in order to become describable? This question seems to lie at the core of his undertaking.

What is surprising, however, is to have a reference such as "in the best of cases anthropology speaks well *of* the Other, but with very few exceptions, anthropology does not speak *to* the Other. . . . [It is] only by speaking *to* the Other . . . engaging in dialogue that I can acknowledge him as subject, comparable to what I am myself (p. 127)." In an anthropological universe abuzz with postmodernist questions and the high-profile presence of the recent thinkers some have come to call "Clifford and Co.," it is curious that McGrane seems innocent of their work. Nor does he seem aware of Clifford Geertz, an even earlier critic of the anthropological enterprise. Dialogic methodology, alternate genres, narrativity, and the recent emphasis on life history seem to have escaped his attention altogether. Furthermore, in an age of Derrida and the deconstructive onslaught, he is quite uncritical of essentialism and that old stand-by, reality. It is almost as if a whole decade were lost somewhere, and this volume belonged to the late 1970s instead of the late 1980s. It would be inappropriate, however, to finish with this particular criticism. Tribute should be paid to McGrane for his scholarly contribution in providing us with a historical portrait, dedicated to an anthropological mainstay.

Double Talk: Bilingualism and the Politics of Ethnicity in Catalonia
Kathryn A. Woolard
Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 1989. xiv + 183 pp. $29.50 (cloth)

Reviewer: Regna Darnell
University of Alberta

This is a case study of a period of intensive change in the language attitudes of Catalan and Castilian speaking citizens of Barcelona, Spain. The study is of intrinsic interest. Canadian readers, however, will appreciate its comparative importance in defining variables that contribute to maintaining stable bilingualism in a modern nation-state.

Historically, Catalan was spoken in the northeastern corner of what is now Spain. The financial prosperity of the region, based on mercantile activity, was considerably greater in medieval times than that of the area around Madrid, which eventually attained political supremacy. Moreover, Catalonia was tied to the high culture of Languedoc. As a result, Catalonians maintained the confidence to continue using their language in spite of its official and public repression.

After the death of Franco in 1975, Catalonia again began to develop local autonomy, with the Catalonian language as its primary symbol. Woolard's fieldwork was done in 1979-80 at a time when adherence in principle to national (i.e., Catalonian) language autonomy was accepted but Catalonians were still working out its impli-

cations for both public and private identities. Her informants tended to be relatively young progressives of the Catalan Communist Party.

The situation is complicated by the demographic composition of modern Barcelona. Many of its citizens are "immigrants" (the word in local use), largely from the less prosperous Castilian areas. Much of the book is devoted to exploring the identity of these non-Catalonians. Woolard sketches portraits of a number of individuals with different degrees of bilingualism (being explicit that Catalan and Castilian are distinct languages, not merely dialects) and of affection/disaffection for native Catalan culture. Other data come from statistical treatments and from classroom questionnaires evaluating spoken language with varying degrees of Catalan or Castilian accent. (Wallace Lambert and associates have evaluated this matched guise methodology in regard to French in Quebec.)

Many Catalonians live in industrial suburbs where they have minimal contact with the Catalan language. Others make a serious effort to become Catalan, in attitudes and social interactions, as well as in language choice (and thus social identity).

Native-born Catalan speakers, however, do not encourage the increasing identification of Castilian speakers with their language and culture. A Catalan speaker will, in the interests of politeness, always switch to Castilian in the presence of someone who is not a native speaker of Catalan. All Catalonians are, of course, bilingual, since Castilian is the official language of education and public life.

Prestige in the Barcelona area clearly accrues to Catalan speakers, who tend to greater socioeconomic achievement than the Castilian speaking immigrants. One might thus expect assimilation toward Catalan, yet there continues to be considerable ambivalence on the part of Castilian immigrants. Furthermore, Catalan cannot become the only language of the Barcelona area; Catalan and Castilian both remain official languages. So a high-prestige but beleaguered minority manages to maintain its language and its commitment to a national identity within a nation-state in spite of extensive need to use the official language of Spain.

Catalan speakers never seem to have felt themselves inferior. On economic grounds, of course, they are not; but the political ascendancy of Madrid and the official imposition of Castilian certainly suggest powerlessness. A similar ambiguity persists among Castilians, who resent their low socioeconomic status and feel that it is reinforced by their linguistic choices; moreover, they do not accept personal responsibility for the political dominance of Catalonia by their home region. Many are uncertain about whether or not Catalan nationalism and autonomy are intended to include them. Thus Woolard suggests that a reconsideration of the unitary nature of "prestige" in sociolinguistic models is long overdue. Certainly, the present situation, as she describes it, is something of an impasse.

The book does not attempt to bring the situation in Catalonia up to date, although the possibility of doing so would provide important evidence of the validity of Woolard's analysis. Her variables certainly have an implicit trajectory which would be expected to show up in further political and social developments. The potential for change in the system lies in the fact that language choice is the primary means of identifying an individual as Castilian or Catalonian. It is possible, therefore, for individuals to change their primary ethnic identity within a lifetime. The choices made by Castilian speakers to become Catalan—and the willingness

of Catalan speakers to accept them as such—are likely to define the long-term health of the national language movement in Catalonia.

Papers of the Nineteenth Algonquian Conference
William Cowan, ed.
Ottawa: Carleton University, 1988. v + 234. np (paper)

Reviewer: J.V. Powell
University of British Columbia

The 19th Algonquian Conference was hosted by the Smithsonian Institution at the Museum of Natural History in Washington, D.C., October 23-25, 1987. Of the 48 papers presented, 23 are included in this volume. William Cowan's introduction attributes much of the Conference's success to the conveners, Ives Goddard and Thomas Vennum, both of the Smithsonian. We are also told that the conference was "rich and varied in content." The papers remind me why it is that anthropological linguistics and ethnography are worth getting up every morning to go off and do. There is such a variety of topics and breadth of approach here that our trade can be seen in cross-section—from rigorously technical description and reconstruction to generalizations that make the recondite understandable and the commonplace fascinating.

The papers seem much more engaging than conference papers presented, one after another in a room full of folding chairs, ever seemed. (Would it be *all* bad if academic conferences were carried on as learned-society reunions with banquets and scholarly elbow rubbing, and a set of printed papers to digest later?) But it is the sharing of research, understandings and inspiration that one takes home from a conference, and one gets the same rush of energizing ideas from reading conference proceedings in a volume such as this.

The papers can best be discussed in groups though the book presents them alphabetically by author's name. Five papers involve textual analysis, though their results could hardly be more different. George Augin provides careful transcription, morphemic breakdown and translation (as he did with three other texts at the previous year's meeting) of Golden Lake Algonquin usage. Sarah Preston works with English narrative accounts to distinguish Cree groups on the basis of how the concept of "control" is expressed in them. (Those on the west coast of James Bay demonstrate control and avoid being controlled by expressing aggression; this contrasts with the East Cree concept of competence, which is expressed in non-interference, reticence and emotional control.) George Fulford compares three versions of the Menomini origin myth with descriptions of the ritual in which they were performed, attempting to capture the essence of the rituals from the insider's perspective. Richard Rhodes uses texts in Great Lakes Ojibwa to reveal matters of culture (concerning politeness) and social structure which lie behind the words of the texts. And Roger Spielman borrows Gail Jefferson's English conversational tactic of "laughing together" to discuss how laughter is used tactically to accomplish a variety of social activities such as topic closure and expressing appreciation in Winneway Algonquin texts.

As in the tradition at Algonquian conferences, many of the papers focus on linguistic data and description: Peter Bakker discusses the historical evidence for (and scant description of) a Basque-based pidgin used by the coastal Algonquian peoples from as early as the mid-16th century. Diane Daviault does an interesting analysis of the obviative (referring to a different third person than the topic, e.g., he likes his son) in 17th century Algonquin as seen in Fr. L. Nicolas' grammar. She compares that with the obviative in contemporary Ojibwa and Algonquin. Audrey Dawe-Sheppard discusses the Micmac verb and Micmac historical morphology with careful paradigmatic tables. Stephanie Inglis discusses the {ew}, a Micmac morpheme that appears to signal various types of change in grammatical status. Frank Siebert concisely examines tag-questions in Penobscot. Pierre Swiggers reviews theoretical implications of Uhlenbeck's Algonquian studies, all 26 of them.

There are also articles on semantic, cognitive and symbolic issues. Emmanuel Desveaux starts out maundering about the meaning of a native monster story and concludes that, contrary to Sperber's claims, monsters reflect what is symbolically unthinkable; they are like signals of the limits of symbolic animality. Janice Graham convincingly looks at Cree assumptions of the possibility of cognitive control with regard to death. Carlo Krieger compares native Penobscot and Western concepts of the yearly cycle using sources that allow him to reconstruct early native assumptions about the lunar calendar and time reckoning.

Ethnographic studies include David Ezzo's discussion of women in native Northeastern societies in which he suggests a model for understanding their role and the social institutions that maintained their status in these societies. David Gidmark discusses the birchbark canoe and its disappearance, and gives a narrative ethnography of the experience of watching Jim Jerome, a Rapid Lake artisan, make one.

A few articles are ethnohistorical. Tim Holzkamm discusses Ojibwa knowledge of minerals, using historical records extending back into the 18th century. Elizabeth Little, using archival evidence, discusses Nantucket whaling during the 18th century, including native involvement. Toby Morantz looks at the fur trade since 1700 and, focussing on the credit system, asks questions about the role of culture, ethos and personality in the eastern James Bay Cree's accommodation to the traders. Pauleena Seeber provides a readable discussion of the Maine Indian Guide in historical documents and current folklore. Nicholas Smith fills a lacuna in Passamaquoddy history by looking at the dissolution of the Caughnawaga Grand Council in the mid-19th century. John Strong shows how the Indian Biographies Project recently set up at the Southampton Campus of Long Island University has potential to provide ethnographic as well as historical insights.

I cannot help but compare published conference annals such as these to *Festschriften*, another type of compiled publication. I realize that the disparate nature of articles in collections discourages systematic reading. But the papers in conference annals like the *Papers of the Nineteenth Algonquian Conference* have a coherence that makes for readability and encourages browsing for fun and profit.

The Theory of Oral Composition: History and Methodology
John Miles Foley
Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1988. xv + 170pp.
$35.00 (cloth), $9.95 (paper)

Reviewer: Michael G. Kenny
Simon Fraser University

This book recounts the evolution of the theory of oral composition, as developed by Milman Parry and expanded by his student, Albert Lord, into an analytically powerful and broadly influential method for understanding oral literary forms. Having begun with armchair studies of Homeric epic, Parry came to realize that the analysis of still extant traditions of oral epic poetry could cast much light on early classical literature and, most particularly, on the vexing question of whether 'Homer' himself was a literate or oral poet. Accordingly Parry, and then Lord, undertook complex studies of South Slavic epic in Yugoslavia which – in addition to generating a collection of disc-recorded texts still available for use at Harvard – led to the conclusion, on comparative grounds, that Homer was indeed an oral bard and, further, that other early European literary traditions have similar roots.

The proposition which underwrites this hypothesis is that Homer contains many formulaic elements, such as the epithets associated with the various gods, which are easily transposable into differing poetical contexts according to the metrical requirements of the line. Parry supposed that this suited the requirements of the bard in spontaneously fashioning narratives according to the circumstances of the recitation. Parry and Lord found a supposition derived from the internal evidence of Homeric epic ethnographically confirmed in Yugoslavia, and hence the empirical persuasiveness of their theory. As Lord's thought developed he came to see that, in addition to these oral "formulae," there are also "themes" – stories within stories, as it were, "groupings of ideas rather than of words" (p. 42) – which can be inserted in the same way as phrases and epithets. Thus the Parry-Lord theory has grown in complexity and expanded in range of application, and Foley documents the scholarly debates which have arisen as it did so, about, among other things, whether the proper unit of analysis should be formula, theme or overall mythic structure.

According to the "Oral-Formulaic Theory," the oral bard creates his art within the constraints of traditional poetics, phraseology and theme. This is illustrated by Lord's assertion that, though such narratives seem to have historical content, in fact "their matrix is myth and not history; for when history does have an influence on the stories it is, at first at least, history that is changed, not the stories" (p. 47). However, though structure constrains, it does not determine; the oral artist remains an individual creative force, a player of extemporaneous variations.

Foley documents the emergence of the Parry-Lord hypothesis and its fullest expression in Lord's now classic work, *The Singer of Tales* (Harvard University Press, 1960); he then proceeds to show how subsequent work on oral tradition has been influenced by Parry and Lord and he discusses the general directions in which such work has tended and may go in the future. In doing so Foley shows the effects this view has had on contemporary understanding of European literatures and

those of the world in general. He concludes with a call for greater methodological refinement and analytical precision in the future, and he hopes that the journal *Oral Tradition*, recently founded under his editorship, will serve as an international forum for the exploration of such issues.

As an "introductory history," *The Theory of Oral Composition* accomplishes its purpose admirably. It has the capacity to arouse interest on the part of the uninitiated. Its discussion of theoretical issues is concise yet clear, and its bibliographical resources and notes easily allow one to follow these problems into what is by now a highly complex scholarly literature.

The Domestication of the Human Species
Peter J. Wilson
New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988. xvi + 201 pp. (cloth)

Reviewer: Michael Blake
University of British Columbia

Wilson's insightful and engaging volume poses the question: What are the social consequences of sedentary life? The trail of discussion down which this question leads him and down which he in turn leads the reader is both fascinating and productive. In the first section of the book he introduces us to some of the basic assumptions on which his argument relies. He convincingly elaborates a series of social distinctions from non-human primates to mobile hunter-gatherers to sedentary communities that set the stage for what follows. The essential distinction that he draws is that of "openness" vs. "domestication." These simple words do not convey the complexity of the interrelated ideas that he attaches to them and so their definitions must be expanded and clarified. Wilson sees *open* societies as those that have no permanent boundaries, physical, social, visual or ideological, among members of the group. This is not the simple egalitarian vs. non-egalitarian dichotomy that anthropologists usually make, since some egalitarian societies may be open while others may be domesticated. "Openness" is a basic characteristic of the social order that structures perceptions of morality, conservativism, innovation and all aspects of individual and group interactions. A key shift (if not *the* key shift) in the social evolution of humankind is, according to Wilson's argument, that *open* society gives way to the social closure of domesticated society.

At first I found the choice of *domestication* to be rather confusing, since, as an archaeologist I am usually confronted with its usage in the context of the transformation from hunting-gathering economies to the agricultural production of plant and animal foods. But after reading on (and, I must confess, after consulting my Oxford English Dictionary) it soon became clear that "domestication" provides exactly the right framework on which to interweave so many different implications of the closure of social relations. Wilson is not as concerned with how this domestication of humans comes about as he is with the ways in which the concept can be used in cross-cultural comparisons, and with its implications for understanding social structures. The central element in human domestication is the built environment, specifically, the home. The rise of sedentary society is equivalent to the rise of home-life and the shifts in social values, ideologies and economies that home-

life entails. In fact, as many anthropologists have pointed out, the word *economy* itself derives from the two Greek words *oikos* and *nomos* (house + to manage). Managing houses and households, as Wilson argues, has social, political, ideological, as well as productive implications.

One of the implications of the shift from mobile, open society to domesticated, sedentary society is the rapid multiplication of needs and opportunities engendered by the house. The house is the first and foremost element of the built environment and as such becomes the first truly impressive artifact of human manufacture. Wilson provides a number of ethnographic examples of the symbolic dimension of house construction, materials, layout, decoration and so forth, asserting that this dimension only becomes possible after the demise of open society. With permanent settlement comes group boundedness and closure that creates the possibility for the accumulation of material goods and the concept of ownership or possession. It also signals the beginnings of the notion of privacy/publicity, a distinction that is difficult to maintain in open society. The house stands for the idea of the group, or household, just as a group of houses may stand for the idea of community. Communities may exist without houses only if they are to remain impermanent and undomesticated, but groups need houses if they are to use the past (their own history) to exist in the present and influence the future.

In Chapter Five Wilson discusses the interaction between domesticated life and domesticated death. The elaboration of material symbols of power, especially monumental tombs and temples, becomes possible in domesticated society because the idea of the delimited and permanent group already exists. The relations of power within the group and between groups, particularly élites, rests to a certain extent on the maintenance of visible material as well as social symbols of that power. Some of these symbols reside in the house and some, such as palaces and tombs, are merely extensions of the concept of the house. One of the refreshing aspects of Wilson's discussion here is his ability to draw on ethnographic examples to convey the sometimes subtle contradictions between individual and group quests for power, and the resolution of those contradictions through, for example, witchcraft. Wilson's study is both concise and far-reaching and will provide an important new stimulus to anthropologists interested in the origins and evolution of houses and house-life and their implications for the understanding of human society.

T.T.T. An Introduction to Trance Dancing
Doug Morgan
Lantyville, British Columbia: Ship Cottage Press, 1984. pp. 132.

Reviewer: Christopher F.J. Ross
Wilfrid Laurier University

"T.T.T." stands for terpsichoretrancetherapy, Terpsichore being the Greek muse responsible for dance and music. The name is somewhat high-flown for a generally bright and unpretentious book about a form of nonverbal psychotherapy, which according to its enthusiastic psychotherapist-author derives from the phenomenon of trance-dancing that has been observed in a number of different cultures.

While the Whirling Dervishes of the Sufi tradition may be the most widely known, Morgan traces this particular Western psychologized form of trance-dancing back to the Umbanda spiritists of Brazil, whose kinetic trances attracted the attention of David Akstein, a psychiatrist living in Rio de Janeiro, who also trained the author and contributes a Foreword to the study.

The book works at a personal level to engage the "inner dancer" within the reader, but also presents a detailed and comprehensive description of a particular form of dance therapy. The two introductory chapters place trance-dance therapy in both a historical and anthropological context. The third chapter provides a detailed description of the experience of a sequence of trance-dancing sessions. The two concluding chapters show how the particular methods of dance therapy can be accommodated within prevailing psychological explanatory models, and integrated into other forms of psychotherapeutic interventions.

In the first chapter, entitled "Expression and Change," the author presents evidence of the traditional Western disdain of expressive physical movement; in 1507 30 women were burned for dancing in Catalonia, while in 1642 the entire convent of St. Elizabeth in Louviers was struck by "the dance." Morgan reminds us that in other cultural traditions dance is integrated into regular religious practices and esteemed as a means of reaching highly valued states of consciousness. He describes first a practice of the Salish people of the Western Coast of Canada, where, after alternating periods of under- and overstimulation, a selected initiate receives a vision of his guardian spirit. The initiate learns the song of this spirit, which is then imparted through the initiate's dance to the drummers in attendance, who are then equipped to re-invoke the song of the spirit through their drumming.

Morgan goes on to describe the Umbanda spiritists of Brazil. A synthesis of Catholic and Yoruba traditions Umbanda are held around an altar with a 20-piece drum band in attendance. The band's fast percussive rhythms are used as a vehicle for mediums to be possessed by one or more spirits. Morgan then highlights three critical elements of trance dancing: (1) belief in spirit possession; (2) the use of loud and continuous drumming and (3) the high status accorded certain mediums or shamans.

In the next chapter a session of trance-dance therapy as adapted by Akstein and Morgan is outlined in its four phases: trance induction; dance movement; relaxation and integration; and discussion. Typically the trance-dance therapy group consists of 16 persons and takes place in a school or community gym facility. The group divides into two groups: one group proceeds to go through all four phases while the second group acts as spotters to prevent injury to the entranced dancers.

In the trance induction phase the dancers are placed side by side, and with their eyes closed are asked to concentrate their attention for about a minute on one thing, such as what they would like to derive from the experience or what would constitute a cure for them. The dancers are then asked to increase their breathing rate. After a further minute of hyperventilation each person's head is then bent into a markedly forward position. Trance induction through disorientation becomes complete as each person is helped to make one or two complete counterclockwise body rotations. At this moment the quickpaced drumming music is turned to full volume, which signals the transition to the next phase.

In the dance-movement period of 45 minutes dancers are told to move their bodies in response to the loud, fast percussive music in any way they like. It is

emphasized that there is no "right" way to respond to the music. They are told that the time may seem longer or shorter than 40 minutes. Sometimes dancers feel that they are not in a trance. In the preliminary instructions it is suggested that they may like to spin a little as a way to reinduce the kinetic trance.

During the integration phase of 15 minutes the dancers are taken to a quiet area with mats on which to lie and relax. They are given water to drink and encouraged to rest, be quiet and listen to the music that has now become soft, slow and soothing. A brief snack break follows. After the spotters have had their turn a discussion phase ensues which permits individuals from both halves of the group to share their experience and allows time to return to their usual waking state. No effort is made by the T.T.T. workshop leader to interpret the experience or meaning of the phenomenon.

Morgan opines that T.T.T. is an appropriate treatment element for a number of psychological problems including dissociative states, acute stress syndromes, moderate and mild depression and even as a treatment component for borderline personality disorders. It is not recommended for obsessive-compulsive or phobic conditions. Morgan considers T.T.T. unlikely to be attractive or suitable for those who are emotionally very overcontrolled or have markedly low levels of trust. Psychiatrist Akstein writes in the Foreword that T.T.T. has had good effects on certain psychogenic somatic disorders, such as arterial hypertension. While these statements of clinical judgement should be attended to and case study material is included in the references, the absence of controlled studies prevents firm conclusions from being drawn about what the active ingredients are in the complexly orchestrated therapeutic sessions.

Morgan recommends a series of five or six sessions for both psychotherapeutic and personal growth purposes. These are usually scheduled one week apart and have the same format. The music played in the later sessions tends to be less purely percussive and more orchestral. The richer harmonic features facilitate the integration of the cathartic effects of the dance phase with the individual's ongoing psychological functioning. In the later sessions the intensity of emotional expression in the dance phase decreases as "pent up" or emotionally charged material is released and re-integrated.

In chapter five Morgan describes how T.T.T. may have some diagnostic value: for example (1) dissociative elements in the personality may find expression as sub-personalities in the active dancing phase; (2) the degree of amnesia in the initial sessions may indicate the strength of the dynamics of repression and denial within the individual personality; (3) the shortness of the phase needed for integration may suggest good ego-strength.

The question of how these results are obtained arises for clinician or social researcher alike. The chapter entitled "Frames of Reference" deals with this issue. The methods of T.T.T. are discussed in terms of their compatability with prevailing psychological theories as well as with contemporary practices associated with Asian spiritual traditions. The parallels suggested in these sections are interesting and insightful but require more elaboration. The author shows how the permissiveness of the dance phase, as reflected in the injunction to "Move your body as you wish in relation to the music!" corresponds to Freud's invitation to free association. Morgan additionally asserts that the expressive components of the dance phase bears a resem-

blance to the rhythmic gymnastics of Adlerian approaches to therapy, and to Carl Jung's techniques of active imagination and symbolic enactment.

The utilization of body rotation in the induction and active dance phases of T.T.T. are compared to Sufi Whirling Dervishes in the following passage: "The (Sufi) dancer turns, one hand up and one hand down, thus allowing the energies of the earth and sky to come together, mediated through the turns of the dancer" (p. 77). A connection is also made with the shaking and shivering techniques that may be used in Kundalini Yoga. The parallels drawn with Shintoist ancestral dances and the meditative slow-paced martial art of Taoist Tai Chi are less cogent. Moreover, the dominant explanatory thrust in this chapter appears neurophysiological and includes a strong nod toward the Russian physiologist, Pavlov – the encouragement of concentration during the induction phase is suggested as causing the overstimulation of a particular region of the cortex. This in turn facilitates the collapse of cortical control once the loud music starts. The fast rhythms are claimed to excite the sub-cortical structures of the limbic system that then occasion emotional release through uninhibited movement.

What is missing in this section is a discussion of these classical psychological theories in relation to some of the cultural and social themes featured in the anthropological and historical introduction to trance-dancing in the first chapter. A link between social and cultural levels of explanation could have been effected by a consideration of the literature in social psychology on attribution theory. The dynamics of how a person attributes causality – whether it be to spirits or behavioural wisdom – has been found to be linked to other aspects of someone's life adjustment. Discourse theory and the ethnomethodologists could also have a field day in analyzing the interaction at one of these trance-dance workshops! Comparisons could be made to the "original" drum-induced trance dances of the Umbanda in Brazil.

While this is not a book of or for a purist, it makes its mark in three important respects. First, it demonstrates the contribution of anthropology in sensitizing that most subtly imperialist of all Western sciences – psychology – to the socially integrating value of ritual practices among indigenous peoples. Secondly, it shows how ritual practices when appropriately contextualized and thoughtfully applied can have a distinctly healing effect on the overcontrolled yet inwardly fragmented consciousness that is reinforced in North American cities. Dance itself, of course, has its own rich tradition in contemporary North American culture, but has become split off from religion and other central meaning-bearing structures. Along with sexuality it has become bracketed from religion and allocated to secular night-time recreation. Thirdly, Morgan's book illustrates the liberating effect of creating a context for the free response of the human body to music. In so doing it returns dance to its pre-fragmented function where dance is seen to have both an intrinsically valuable recreational aspect, as well as a dynamic power to integrate the human personality. The effects may be longlasting, although follow-up studies are still required in order to establish this.

A return to the Umbanda of Brazil or the Northwest Pacific Coast Salish at the end of the book would have made for greater thematic symmetry and perhaps easier, wider social commentary, but then this book is the work of a culturally sensitive psychologist rather than someone trained in systemic social inquiry and analysis. It is a tribute to the clarity and freshness of the work that these social implications await the open reader's imagination.

CONTRIBUTORS/COLLABORATEURS

George J. S. Dei

George J. S. Dei was born in Koforidua, Ghana, and received his Ph.D. from the University of Toronto in 1986, and has taught at the University of Western Ontario and the University of Windsor. He has published a number of articles on agriculture and development in West Africa. He is currently a Research Associate and SSHRC Postdoctoral Fellow attached to the Department of Sociology and Anthropology at the University of Windsor, and is completing a research project on "Coping and Survival Strategies in Ghanaian Communities."

Tom Barker

Tom Barker received his Ph.D. from the University of Toronto in 1979. His thesis was entitled, "Barai Group Formation." He has done anthropological research in New Guinea, and has worked on development projects in Southern and Western Africa. Currently, he and his co-investigator, Marta Rohatynskij, are conducting further fieldwork among the Wawaga Barai in Papua, New Guinea.

Ian Ritchie

Ian Ritchie earned his B.A. degree in Religious Studies at Queen's University, Kingston in 1976, a Master of Christian Studies degree at Regent College, Vancouver in 1979 and an M.A. degree in Religious Studies at McGill University in 1987. He taught Religious Studies in the College of Education, Akwanga, Plateau State, Nigeria from 1981 to 1985. He is currently completing a Ph.D. at the Religious Studies Faculty, McGill University (a.b.d.) on the subject of African theology and its response to African Traditional Religion.

David Howes

David Howes teaches in the Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Concordia University. He holds a Master's degree in Social Anthropology from Oxford University and two degrees in law from McGill. His recent publications include 'We are the World' and Its Counterparts: Popular Song as Constitutional Discourse," *International Journal of Politics, Culture and Society* 3(3), and "Olfaction and transition." *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology* 24(3).

Sylvain Pinard

He is currently pursuing research toward a Ph.D. in the Département des Sciences de la Religion at the Université du Québec à Montréal. His research focusses on the play of sensory imagery in the discourse of certain Christian and Buddhist mystics of the Middle Ages.

Constance Classen

Constance Classen received her Master's degree from the Department of Religion, Concordia University in 1986, and has worked as a folklorist in the Andes. She is a recent graduate of the Faculty of Religious Studies, McGill University, where she submitted a thesis on "Inca Cosmology and the Human Body." Her publications include "Sweet Colors, Fragrant Songs: Sensory Models of the Andes and the Amazon," *American Ethnologist* 17(4):722-735.

Kit Griffin

Kit Griffin works in the Department of Sculpture, Ceramics and Fibre, Concordia University. A long-time student of Moroccan culture, with a particular interest in the position of women, her publications include "Making Sense in Morocco," *Journal of Religion and Culture* 4(2).

George Marcus

George Marcus is Professor and Chairperson of the Department of Anthropology at Rice University. He received his Ph.D. from Harvard University in 1975. He has conducted ethnographic research on aristocratic and commoner elites in Tonga as well as business elites in Galveston, Texas. He is co-auther with M. J. Fischer of *Anthropology as Cultural Critique* (University of Chicago Press, 1986) and co-editor with J. Clifford of *Writing Culture* (University of California Press, 1986).

INFORMATION FOR AUTHORS

Anthropologica accepts manuscripts in French or English and requires three copies of all articles for review purposes.

All manuscripts should be typed on one side only of standard 8-1/2 x 11-inch typing or computer paper, or A4 paper. Manuscripts must have adequate margins and should be double-spaced throughout, including quotations, notes, and bibliographic references. Articles must be accompanied by abstracts of not more than 100 words each in both English and French, if possible. In the case of articles accepted for publication, professionally drawn, camera-ready graphs, charts, and other illustrations are the responsibility of authors and will be returned upon publication. Only black and white versions of graphs, charts, and other illustrations can be printed. Authors of articles accepted for publication will be asked if they can submit copies of revised articles on computer disks (see below), or if they can transmit revised articles electronically via NETNORTH, or BITNET. If this technology is unavailable, then standard, typed manuscripts are completely acceptable. Computer disks will be returned, but all print copies of manuscripts will be destroyed upon publication unless authors make special arrangements. For security, authors should keep at least one printed and electronic copy of all manuscripts, including graphs, charts, and other illustrations.

Anthropologica currently uses an IBM PC computer with DOS 3.3, 5-1/4 or 3-1/2 inch double-sided, double-density diskettes, and "Word Perfect" Version 5.0 word processing. "ASCII" is also acceptable.

Articles accepted for publication must be revised to conform to the editorial standards of the journal, including details specified in *The Canadian Style: A Guide to Writing and Editing.* Footnotes are not normally used and should be incorporated into the text. If deemed absolutely necessary, footnotes must be placed at the end of the text in a section entitled Notes which appears before References Cited. Acknowledgements are placed at the beginning of Notes. All referencing must be meticulous. References in the text are placed in parentheses and include appropriate combinations of the author's last name, the year of publication, and page number(s); as for example: (Smith 1985), (cf. Lewis 1965), (Rouleau 1964:206), (e.g., Scheffler 1975:230), (Roy et al. 1980), or (Marshall, Simon, and Williams 1985:110-115). Plural references in the same year are distinguished by letters, while original dates of publication are distinguished by square brackets; as for example: (Trottier and LeVine 1977a, 1978b:110-115, 1979b:45,323-325) or Kroeber 1952[1909]). Multiple references are

separated by semicolons; as for example: (Desjardins 1975; Desforges 1980, 1985a; Roy 1895:42-44; see also Smith et al. 1980). If an author is mentioned in the text of an article, it is sufficient to cite the date of publication and page number(s); for example (1966) or (1985:249).

All references cited in the text are placed in a section titled References Cited at the end of an article. There, references are listed alphabetically and chronologically according to the following format:

References Cited

Lévi-Strauss, Claude

1962 La pensée sauvage. Paris: Plon.

1964 Le cru et le cuit. Paris: Plon.

1967 Les structures élémentaires de la parenté. Paris: Mouton. Publication originale en 1949.

Lévy-Bruhl, Lucien

1985 How Natives Think [1910], translated by Lillian A. Clare. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Paine, Robert, ed.

1977 The White Arctic: Anthropological Essays on Tutelage and Ethnicity. Newfoundland Social and Economic Papers Number Seven. St. John's, Newfoundland: Memorial University of Newfoundland Institute of Social and Economic Research.

Radcliffe-Brown, A.R.

1950 Introduction. *In* African Systems of Kinship and Marriage, edited by A.R. Radcliffe-Brown and D. Forde, pp. 1-85. London: Oxford University Press.

Salisbury, Richard F.

1966 Structuring Ignorance: The Genesis of a Myth in New Guinea. Anthropologica 8:315-328.

Soustelle, Jacques

1955 La vie quotidienne au temps des Aztèques. Paris: Hachette.
Turner, David H., and Gavin A. Smith, eds.

1979 Challenging Anthropology: A Critical Introduction to Social and Cultural Anthropology. Toronto, Ontario: McGraw-Hill Ryerson, Limited.

INFORMATION POUR LES AUTEURS

Anthropologica reçoit les manuscrits en français ou en anglais. Aux fins de recension, on demande trois copies de chaque article. Les manuscrits doivent être dactylographiés soit sur format standard (8 1/2 x 11 po.), soit sur ordinateur, soit sur papier A4. Il faut prévoir des marges suffisantes et une rédaction à double interligne (y compris dans les cas des citations, des notes et des références bibliographiques). Dans la mesure du possible, chaque article doit être accompagné d'un résumé d'un maximum de 100 mots, en anglais et en français. Dans le cas d'articles qu'on a acceptés de publier, l'auteur doit prendre la responsabilité d'obtenir les copies-photos (en noir et en blanc) de tout graphique, dessin et/ou illustration. Ces copies-photos lui seront retournées après publication.

Les auteurs des articles acceptés, s'ils en sont en mesure, pourront soumettre leurs copies d'articles révisés soit sur disquettes (voir infra), soit via les systèmes de communication NETNORTH ou BITNET. Si ces procédés s'avèrent impossible, le manuscrit dactylographié suffira. Les disquettes seront retournées et, à moins d'avis contraire de la part des auteurs, les manuscrits seront détruits après publication. Par mesure de sécurité, il convient que les auteurs conservent une copie (imprimée ou reproduite électroniquement) de leurs manuscrits, y compris les graphiques, les dessins et/ou les autres illustrations.

Anthropologica utilise actuellement l'ordinateur personnel de marque IBM (PC), le système d'exploitation sur disque DOS 3.3, et les disquettes à double côté et double densité de 5-1/4 ou 3-1/2 pouces. Le logiciel de traitement de texte utilisé est le "Word Perfect," version 5.0; "ASCII" est tout de même acceptable.

Les articles acceptés doivent être révisés de façon conforme au style de rédaction de la revue *Anthropologica* et des instructions données dans *Guide du rédacteur*. Le système des notes infra-paginales n'est pas utilisé, ces dernières doivent être incorporer au texte. S'il est indispensable d'ajouter des notes, il faut alors les reporter à la fin du texte, dans une section précédée du titre Notes, avant les References. Les *remerciements* adressés aux collaborateurs s'insèrent en début de Notes. Il faut apporter un soin méticuleux à la rédaction des références, les placer entre parenthèses et inclure le nom de famille de l'auteur, l'année de publication, et la pagination; par exemple: (Smith 1985), (cf. Lewis 1965), (Rouleau 1964:206), (e.g., Scheffler 1975:230), (Roy et al. 1980) ou (Marshall, Simon, et Williams 1985:110-115). On distingue la pluralité des références, pour une même année, par des lettres, alors que les dates originales de publication

figurent entre crochets; par exemple: (Trottier et LeVine 1977a, 1978b:110-115, 1979b:45, 323-325) ou (Kroeber 1952[1909]). Les références multiples sont séparées par des points-virgules; par exemple: (Desjardins 1975; Desforges 1980, 1985a; Roy 1895;42-44; voir aussi Smith et al. 1980). Si le nom d'un auteur paraît dans le corps de l'article, il suffit d'indiquer la date de publication et la pagination; par exemple: (1966) ou (1895:249).

Les références citées dans le texte seront reportées par ordre alphabétique et chronologique à la fin de l'article, dans la section References.

References Cited

Lévi-Strauss, Claude
1962 La pensée sauvage. Paris: Plon.
1964 Le cru et le cuit. Paris: Plon.
1967 Les structures élémentaires de la parenté. Paris: Mouton. Publication originale en 1949.

Lévy-Bruhl, Lucien
1985 How Natives Think [1910], translated by Lillian A. Clare. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Paine, Robert, ed.
1977 The White Arctic: Anthropological Essays on Tutelage and Ethnicity. Newfoundland Social and Economic Papers Number Seven. St. John's, Newfoundland: Memorial University of Newfoundland Institute of Social and Economic Research.

Radcliffe-Brown, A.R.
1950 Introduction. *In* African Systems of Kinship and Marriage, edited by A.R. Radcliffe-Brown and D. Forde, pp. 1-85. London: Oxford University Press.

Salisbury, Richard F.
1966 Structuring Ignorance: The Genesis of a Myth in New Guinea. Anthropologica 8:315-328.

Soustelle, Jacques
1955 La vie quotidienne au temps des Aztèques. Paris: Hachette.

Turner, David H., and Gavin A. Smith, eds.
1979 Challenging Anthropology: A Critical Introduction to Social and Cultural Anthropology. Toronto, Ontario: McGraw-Hill Ryerson, Limited.

ANTHROPOLOGICA

SUBSCRIPTIONS

1989: Individual subscriptions:
One year (two issues): $35.00
Institutional subscriptions:
$35.00 plus $3.00 for foreign postage

Subscriptions and address changes should be sent to WLU Press, Wilfrid Laurier University, Waterloo, Ontario N2L 3C5.

Cheques in payment of subscriptions should be made out to Wilfrid Laurier University Press.

ABONNEMENTS

1989 : Abonnement personnel : 35,00 $
Abonnement institutionnel : 35,00 $
Supplément pour envois à l'étranger : 3,00 $

Les abonnements et changements d'adresse doivent être envoyés à WLU Press, Wilfrid Laurier University, Waterloo, Ontario N2L 3C5.

Tout chèque pour frais d'abonnement doit être fait à l'ordre de Wilfrid Laurier University Press.

BACK ISSUES / ANCIENS NUMEROS

In-print back issues can be obtained from *Anthropologica* at the above address. Please write for a list.

Certains anciens numéros de la revue sont encore disponibles. Veuillez vous adresser à *Anthropologica* pour obtenir la liste des numéros disponibles.

Out-of-print back issues can be obtained from: / Les numéros épuisés sont disponibles chez :
Swets and Zeitlinger, P.O. Box 830, 2160 SZ, Lisse, Holland

LEGAL DEPOSIT / DEPOT LEGAL

National Library of Canada / Bibliothèque nationale du Canada

INDEXING / REPERTOIRES

Indexed and/or abstracted in: / Répertoriée dans :

Abstracts in Anthropology
America: History and Life (ABC-Clio Press)
Anthropological Literature: An Index to Periodical Articles and Essays
Biological Abstracts
International Bibliography of Periodical Literature
Psychological Abstracts
Point de Repère (formerly *Radar*)
Sociological Abstracts