

Gammeltoft, Tine, *Haunting Images: A Cultural Account of Selective Reproduction in Vietnam*, Berkeley: University of California Press, 2014, 315 pages.

*Reviewer: Mounia El Kotni
State University of New York*

In this finely written ethnography, Tine Gammeltoft dives deep into the socio-moral factors guiding women's decisions to terminate their (desired) pregnancies in urban Vietnam. *Haunting Images: A Cultural Account of Selective Reproduction in Vietnam* follows 30 women in the multiple locations in which these decisions come to be: the 3D scanning room of Hanoi's Obstetric and Gynecologic Hospital where they are told that a fetal anomaly is detected, the antenatal care room where they are advised to terminate their pregnancy, and, finally, women's homes where their families and in-laws gather to narrate their own decision-making process. Gammeltoft reveals how, in each of these sites, the decisions are deeply entwined with mutual moral obligations and understandings of suffering.

Haunting Images is based on three years of fieldwork and a decade of work in Vietnam. It relies on ethnographic methods of participant observation and interviews, combined with mass media analysis. Gammeltoft's ethnography is rooted in a collaboration with several Vietnamese researchers. The author's transparent writing discloses methodological and ethical questions as Vietnamese women ask members of the interdisciplinary team for advice on their pregnancies. The ethical reflections that follow, and the open discussion of the ethnographer's uneasiness or disagreement at times, are an important contribution to the field of social science methodology.

Over the book's seven chapters, Gammeltoft disentangles the many networks in which pregnant patients are embedded and which lead them to terminate their pregnancies – sometimes in the second or third trimester. The research highlights how abortions are never women's decisions alone. Contrasting with the situation in Europe and the United States, where medical professionals present information for women and their partners to make informed decisions, the author shows how in Vietnam these same professionals are expected to guide their patients toward the right, or moral, choice. Women's choices are then positioned within webs of sociality and morality that include listening to medical advice and becoming full members of local and national communities by giving birth to non-disabled children. Daily interactions between patients, medical staff, families, and the researchers are haunted by images of Agent Orange children, widely shared on television programs, and memories of severely disabled children of neighbours, family members, or friends, who “[spend their] entire life lying in one place” (p. 171). Developing a framework for an anthropology of belonging, the author shows how undergoing an abortion is not a rejection of the disabled fetus, but a commitment to one form of belonging over another in a context shaped by local moral worlds, national history, and broader geopolitical forces. Gammeltoft's anthropology of belonging interweaves doctors' moral dilemmas as counsellors of their patients with pregnant women's narratives, providing readers with a humane understanding of their often painful decisions.

Vietnam's liberal abortion policy is reminiscent of other post-socialist contexts, like Cuba (Andaya 2014). In these two countries, the focus on family planning and on building a healthy citizen body was part of the revolution's goal. By providing strong historical background, Gammeltoft bridges women's intimate decisions with the state project of building a healthy modern nation. When women comply with medical advice, they become modern citizens and show their commitment to the state. Scenes at Hanoi's Obstetric and Gynecologic Hospital vividly portray the daily work of medical practitioners in overcrowded and underfunded hospitals. They embody the state beyond its bureaucratic characteristic, illustrating how it is an “open and affective structure of mutual belonging” (p. 102).

When a fetal anomaly is detected, parents and their families recurrently ask “why?” as they struggle to find answers and scrutinise their environment, their family's history during the “American war,” their collective fate, and their individual behaviours during pregnancy. Their crafted answers to the question “why?” rarely include an association with the spectre of Agent Orange, which, if admitted, might haunt the rest of their reproductive lives. A family's refusal to be associated with the potential for disability is understood in relation to Vietnamese's desire to achieve completeness, a non-disabled state. In a context of mutual belonging and attachment between citizens and the state, pregnant Vietnamese citizens who carry an unviable, or, at times, viable but undesirable, fetus feel that the state has abandoned them despite their family's longstanding commitment to the socialist state. Here, I wish the author had provided more information about the emerging topic of Agent Orange victims' visibility in Vietnamese society, as it is mentioned only briefly. Likewise, the author references orphanages that care for the newborns left at the hospital (when families cannot opt for an abortion), but readers might have benefited from more information on the existing networks of care for disabled citizens, as they provide an avenue for the analysis of state (non-)intervention and the lack of reciprocity in the socio-moral networks that tie families to the socialist state.

The analysis of technology, a symbol of modernity, and women's embodied responsibility is a key focus in the anthropology of reproduction (Andaya 2014; Rapp 2000). As in other contexts, frequent ultrasounds make Vietnamese women “modern mothers and good citizens” (p. 99). However, nuancing pregnant women's desire to become modern citizens at all costs, Gammeltoft shows how their decisions reveal deep connections to the past, to religion, and to morality. In Hanoi's hospital, prenatal screening becomes a way to maintain networks of care. In the Vietnamese context, choice does not equate to freedom but is made within obligations and attachment to various communities of belonging. The book highlights how women's bodies become spaces of collective decisions. Their wombs undergo multiple sonograms in a hospital room with no intimacy, and their choice of abortion is guided by family and medical pressure. Far from portraying women as blind followers, Gammeltoft's work adroitly highlights how they are active interpreters of family and medical advice. Indeed, future mothers welcome these interventions in their lives, which help them in their recovery from abortion as they hope that the little one will not haunt their future pregnancies and that the next scan will be perfect.

Gammeltoft's ethnography is not only an anthropology of belonging but also an anthropology of suffering and, as such, sits at the crossroads between disability studies, attachment, parenting, and reproduction. The author draws on Emmanuel Levinas (1998 [1982]) to analyse communities of belonging and attachment and positions suffering as the nexus of subjectivity. Rhetoric of suffering constitutes the main factor in pregnancy termination. In what the author calls the "disability-suffering" equation (p. 181), any type of fetal anomaly becomes a window through which the haunting images of Vietnam's severely disabled rush in and promise a life of suffering – individual suffering (of the future child) and collective suffering (of his or her family). The suffering of undergoing an abortion is then compared to the lifelong suffering of the future child. In a context where one's life's completeness relies on reciprocating care, disabled children are perceived as incomplete beings – and so are their parents. Couples longing to become complete beings – that is, fathers and mothers of "complete" children – thus make abortion decisions in the midst of the family's fear of the suffering the future disabled child will endure in their life. The birth of severely disabled or "incomplete" children places parents in the impossible situation of raising them to return the reciprocity of care, compromising their place in the family and the nation-state (p. 234).

Long after the closing of the book, Vietnamese women's narratives continue to haunt the reader. They echo women's difficult reproductive decisions in distant countries. This is one of the strengths of this captivating ethnography: it is deeply rooted in Vietnam's socio-historical context but yet draws on multiple similar stories in Asia as well as Europe and the United States and allows for cross-cultural comparison. The many case studies in *Haunting Images* make it a relevant reading for undergraduate and graduate students in cultural and medical anthropology, women and gender studies, and Asian studies, as well as to social workers and medical students who wish to gain a cross-cultural perspective on reproduction, parenting, and disability.

References

- Andaya, Elise
2014 *Conceiving Cuba: Reproduction, Women, and the State in the Post-Soviet Era*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.
- Levinas, Emmanuel
1998 [1982] *Useless Suffering*. In *Entre Nous: On Thinking-of-the-Other*. Michael B. Smith and Barbara Harshav, trans. Pp. 133–153. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Rapp, Rayna
2000 *Testing Women, Testing the Fetus: The Social Impact of Amniocentesis in America*. New York: Routledge.

Kirsch, Stuart, *Mining Capitalism: The Relationship between Corporations and Their Critics*, Oakland: University of California Press, 2014, 314 pages.

*Reviewer: Catherine Morin Boulais
Laval University*

According to many international observers, the social and environmental impacts of the Ok Tedi mine, in Papua New Guinea, constitute one of the last decades' worst mining disasters. Since the mid-1980s, this large-scale copper and gold mine has discharged more than 2 billion metric tons of tailings, waste rock, and overburden into the Ok Tedi and Fly Rivers, causing colossal environmental degradation downstream. Consequently, the 30,000 villagers living south of the mining site, who are highly dependent on access to natural resources, have been unable to pursue their traditional subsistence practices. At the turn of the 1990s, they initiated a long-running campaign against the operator of the mine (BHP Billiton for the most part), which was reduced in 2004 following an out-of-court settlement of their second lawsuit. Stuart Kirsch, professor of anthropology at the University of Michigan and a leading figure in the anthropology of mining, has done over two decades of extensive research and advocacy with the Yonggom people, the Indigenous communities affected by the Ok Tedi mine. In *Mining Capitalism*, he takes the Ok Tedi mine case as an ethnographic context to examine the protesters' strategies of resistance against corporations and the corporations' strategies to reassert their legitimacy. To broaden the scope of his analysis, Kirsch addresses other mining conflicts and compares the way mining, tobacco, and pharmaceutical industries manage their relationship to the public.

The book reveals that the Ok Tedi mine case was one of the first conflicts between a mining company and communities to gain international prominence and participated in setting other important milestones. A prime example is how the Ok Tedi campaigners sought to hold BHP Billiton accountable for its international operations in its country of incorporation (Australia). This novel strategy led to a successful landmark settlement in 1996, in which the company committed to stop discharging tailings in the Ok Tedi and Fly Rivers. It also set a precedent for transnational legal proceedings as it showed that subsistence rights claims were analogous to more familiar claims based on the economic damage of property. Weighing the pros and cons of international tort claims, Kirsch concludes that whether or not they result in successful judgments to the plaintiffs, they have proven a valuable resource for communities as they put corporations on the defensive and tarnish their public profile.

Kirsch introduces several concepts of his own to make sense of the relationship between corporations and their critics, the flagship being the "politics of space" and the "politics of time." Typical of 1990s environmental activism, the politics of space