

more than the results achieved: any consensus (or in some cases, simple consent) generated is not a product of community homogeneity but rather of working through differences, acknowledging divergences, and listening to contrary arguments. He concludes that the strong and politically significant indigenous movement in Ecuador has a complex relationship to local forms of indigenous organization, in which indeed the two levels or instances of mobilizing fulfil different functions, rather than simply building on each other. And again, given the diversity of Ecuadorian indigenous peoples in the Andes and the Amazon, in rural and urban areas, in trade associations and in local agricultural organizations, and the myriad shades of winners and losers when it comes to indigenous livelihoods, the ability to work through difference at the local level is probably central to how this larger movement itself has been built. Moreover, those methods, procedures, and negotiations are central to how indigeness is lived today, having broken through prior definitions that tied indigenous life to rural poverty, remoteness and marginalization.

The title *Fighting Like a Community* aptly captures Colloredo-Mansfeld's emphasis on the importance of community, but also on internal differentiation and the ongoing process of resolving differences (temporarily) as specific projects are pursued, at the same time as communities participate—fight—in much broader political processes as well as economic ones. No short review can do justice to the complexities of this fine book. I have used it successfully in an undergraduate course on Latin America, and have recommended it to graduate students and colleagues interested in indigenous mobilizing, globalization, relations between indigenous peoples and the state in Latin America and elsewhere, and political anthropology. It repays a close reading, and will be of interest to a broad audience.

References

- Colloredo-Mansfeld, Rudi
 1999. *The Native Leisure Class: Consumption and Cultural Creativity in the Andes*. Chicago: Chicago University Press.
- Weber, Max
 1958 *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*. Talcott Parsons, trans. New York: Scribner.

Menzies, Charles R., *Red Flags and Lace Coiffes: Identity and Survival in a Breton Village*. Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2011, 160 pages. (From the book series *Teaching Culture: UTP Ethnographies for the Classroom*.)

Reviewer: Victor Barac
 University of Toronto

Red Flags and Lace Coiffes is an "historical ethnography" of Le Guilvinec, a coastal fishing village in the Bigouden region of Brittany, France. It draws on a variety of historical and scholarly sources in addition to the author's own extensive ethnographic fieldwork in the region since the mid-1990s. An intriguing element to this book is the author's biographical connection to fishing. He grew up in a fishing family in British Columbia and made his living as a commercial fisher before becoming a professional anthropologist. Such life experiences provided him with a well-defined comparative vantage point from which to study fishing in Brittany. It also gave him a valuable basis for bonding with his informants who tended to view themselves as social outsiders.

The substantive aim of Menzies's book is to provide an account of how and why the "artisanal fishery" of today came into being. On the level of social theory, Menzies's mission is to introduce the basic concepts of classical Marxism (without coming right out and saying it) mostly by way of lengthy asides or digressions within an otherwise engaging ethnographic narrative. Menzies employs the model of class struggle (mediated by gender and kinship) as the conceptual underpinning of his analysis, privileging "agency" over "structure."

It is, however, in his analysis of the "structure" of fishing where Menzies is most compelling. He is at his best when weaving the complex tale of the transformation of production in Bigouden: how the development of new technology, the exploitation of new resources, and the transformation in the organization of labour created the conditions for a larger epochal shift that occurred in three well-defined historical phases.

The first, the pre-industrial, is characterized by a peasant, subsistence-based agrarian economy where fishing played, at best, a supplemental, seasonal role. During this period the region was only loosely integrated into the larger French nation-state and was more rooted in the locally based Celtic culture.

The second, industrial, phase, dubbed The Sardine Years (1864-1936), was dominated by large commercial interests which employed local men on fishing ships and local women in canneries in large numbers. The big companies benefitted from French protectionist policies and exercised strict labour discipline which led to militant labour unionism and various acts of resistance now remembered and mythologized in local social memory. Indeed it is this militant period to which the *Red Flags* of the book title refers. This period marked the transformation of the region from an agrarian to an industrial fishing economy and, to modernity.

The third phase, the present-day “artisanal fishery,” developed in the vacuum left behind by the protracted demise of the big fishing companies, who moved their operations elsewhere. The artisanal fishery consists of family-owned fishing vessels, usually skippered by their owners and worked by a combination of wage and family labour. New technology has allowed smaller fishing vessels to exploit a wider range of marine resources with much greater efficiency. In addition to technology, a key factor abetting the rise of the artisanal fishery was the enactment of French and European Union legislation that has rendered large-scale commercial fishing in the region no longer viable. The closing of the canneries has furthermore resulted in great changes for women, whose “multitasking” lives require them to run both their homes and the business end of the family fishing enterprise, in addition to having to work part-time to make ends meet. The artisanal fishery has exploited new opportunities provided by the expansion of tourism and the rise of local, fresh fish markets. In comparison to the big “capitalist” fishing enterprises, the artisanal fishery is judged by Menzies to be more ecologically and economically sustainable.

As a book intended for the undergraduate classroom, *Red Flags and Lace Coiffes* comes in at a relatively light 160 pages, including the glossary and index. Yet, much is packed into such a small format, including an attempt to capture the “messiness” of everyday life within an ordered, political economic analysis of the rise of the Bigouden fishery. Such a task requires a balancing act between microscopic description and macroscopic analysis not always successfully pulled off by Menzies. The frequent side trips into the byways of Marxist theory, while maybe of interest to advanced students, offer few enhancements to the more captivating, purely ethnographic passages of the narrative.

At various places Menzies tries to shoe-horn his observations into pre-defined theory. For example, in looking for the class conflict at the root of the contemporary artisanal fishery he is forced to admit that things have become more complicated by the advent of white collar jobs generated by the expansion of labour unions, the state, and “a private sector dominated by artisanal social relations in which explicit class-conflict models of struggle had become more memory than reality” (p. 44-45). In this case the theorized antagonistic relationship between skippers and crews is tempered, in the artisanal fishery, by an underlying egalitarian, family-like social ethos operative on fishing boats, as documented by Menzies.

Somewhat annoying also are the numerous references to “struggle,” “crisis,” “the violence of capital” and other such epithets peppering the narrative. A discernible pattern of over-use leads to the conclusion that “struggle” has been deployed more for its effectiveness as political rhetoric than as the analytical tool it was intended to be. The political rhetoric at times is taken to extremes, such as when an anti-government demonstration by boat owners together with their fishing crews becomes, in Menzies eyes, a demonstration against “late” capitalism, pure and simple (p. 42). Poetic, perhaps, but

this kind of social analysis can only lead to a reversal of the conventional meanings ascribed to emic and etic perspectives in anthropology.

Quibbles aside, *Red Flags and Lace Coiffes* delivers the goods when it comes to providing an in-depth account of the advent of the artisanal fishery from the perspective of production. It employs a variety of data sources to inquire into the roles of social class, gender and kinship in sustaining the fishery. In addition, the author’s work experience as a fisher allows him to succinctly identify key aspects of Bigouden marine ecology and the ever improving industrial foraging technologies that make fishing possible and economically viable in the region. Attuned to historical context Menzies has written a readable, plausible and convincing account of the interplay of local and supra-local factors in the rise and subsequent development of the Bigouden fishery of France.

Nelson-Martin Dawson, *Fourrures et forêts métissèrent les Montagnais. Regard sur les sang-mêlés au Royaume du Saguenay*, Québec : Septentrion, 2011, 314 pages.

Recenseur : Fabien Tremblay
Université de Montréal

Après avoir été professeur associé à l’Université de Sherbrooke pendant une dizaine d’années, Nelson-Martin Dawson se fait connaître des anthropologues s’intéressant aux questions autochtones, en 2002, par ses écrits sur la « disparition » des Atikamekw, des Ilnus et des Algonquins. Leur dévoilement dans les médias fait alors monter aux barricades nombre d’entre eux. Les travaux de l’historien sont à cette époque vivement critiqués, à la fois à cause de leur propos et du fait que ceux-ci, initialement rédigés pour le compte d’Hydro-Québec, ont pour but de fournir des arguments à la société d’État en cas de litige avec ces nations. Globalement, ces anthropologues spécialistes des questions autochtones reprochent à l’historien son manque de connaissances relatives à son sujet d’étude et l’incompréhension dont il fait preuve à l’égard de ceux qu’il étudie (Bouchard 2002, Charest 2002, Mailhot 2002, Savard 2002).

Il est fort à parier que le plus récent livre de Dawson, *Fourrures et forêts métissèrent les Montagnais...*, suscitera également plusieurs réactions, tant dans le monde académique que sur la scène politique autochtone. Dans ce dernier ouvrage, en plus de poursuivre sa réflexion sur le parcours historique des « Montagnais » (Ilnus) du Saguenay-Lac-Saint-Jean, Dawson prend position dans un débat d’actualité fort délicat sur la scène régionale : la reconnaissance historique d’une identité collective métisse. En effet, les Métis ne sont toujours pas reconnus au Québec et n’y ont donc aucun droit particulier. En 2003, la Cour suprême du Canada a néanmoins pavé la voie, en ce sens, aux « communautés historiques métisses » se situant en dehors de l’Ouest canadien¹. Le Saguenay-Lac-Saint-Jean