

about places that I have no knowledge. In the desire of anthropologists to play in the exciting arenas of interdisciplinary social theory, are we at risk of losing the strengths of intense research engagement with the social and cultural processes involved in the organization and transformation of particular places? Do we still need doctoral research in anthropology to first encompass the relevant work done in the fieldwork site in the past before following the exciting traces of global scales and theoretical debates? If not, what will be anthropology's distinctive contributions to the swirl of what we might call recombinant social science?

References

- Carroll, John
2005 *Edge of Empires: Chinese Elites and British Colonials in Hong Kong*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Vickers Boyden, Stephen
1981 *The Ecology of a City and Its People: the Case of Hong Kong*. Canberra: Australian National University Press.

Colloredo-Mansfeld, Rudi, *Fighting Like a Community: Andean Civil Society in an Era of Indian Uprisings*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009, 233 pages.

Reviewer: Kim Clark
University of Western Ontario

This book explores complex questions of indigenous identities, livelihoods and mobilization, in a country known for having perhaps the strongest indigenous movement in the hemisphere. The product of more than a decade and a half of research in several highland regions in Ecuador, *Fighting Like a Community* works up from local contexts to examine what it means to be an indigenous person, and an indigenous community, in Ecuador in the early 21st century. Colloredo-Mansfeld concludes that it does not mean uniformity, shared experiences and consensus. Instead, the very differences of perspective and experience that must be continually negotiated at the heart of such communities have informed a broadly based indigenous movement that is also able to navigate successfully considerable internal differences. This study shows all the signs of being a second book, the result of mature reflection on Ecuadorian society undertaken over time and in more than one region: the countryside of Imbabura around Otavalo, rural Tigua in Cotopaxi, and the migrant and working-class neighbourhoods in the south end of Ecuador's capital city Quito. If Colloredo-Mansfeld's first book—*The Native Leisure Class: Consumption and Cultural Creativity in the Andes* (1999)—is very good indeed, his new book is even better.

An economic anthropologist whose work illuminates political processes, Colloredo-Mansfeld squarely confronts the multiple ways of being indigenous by beginning his book with accounts of three indigenous men's very different careers in the artisan economy. The first third of the book introduces us

to: the founder of Tigua painting, who uses his art to enable a life for himself and his family in the rural highlands of Cotopaxi; an Otavalo textile entrepreneur whose view of progress echoes some passages of Weber's *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism* (although the religion that sustains his vision is Mormonism); and a Tigua artist and community activist in Quito who has dedicated energy to organizing Tigua artists and resellers in the capital city, as well as channeling resources back to their communities of origin in Cotopaxi. The notions of the good life that each of these men pursues differ considerably, but it is significant that they all build their careers as people from particular places, particular indigenous communities, even when they work elsewhere.

Having presented a wide range of livelihoods and visions characterizing community members, Colloredo-Mansfeld turns to how indigenous communities nonetheless manage this diversity and the meaning of membership via processes of vernacular statecraft. In this area of the world where a number of elements of community structure were a product of the demands and pressures of colonizers and responses of the colonized in the 16th century (and before then, of shifting populations and identities under the expanding Inca empire), additional forms of legibility were promoted in the 1930s when the Ecuadorian government created the category of *comuna* in indigenous regions, with specific community offices and procedures. In the three situations of conflict and negotiation explored in the second third of the book, the author delves into such issues as the use of lists to record participation in community projects, how participants bring to life—make real and consequential—local jurisdictions, and how the structure of community offices and the symmetry between communities allows the negotiation of conflict that threaten to turn neighbours against each other. Throughout, Colloredo-Mansfeld reminds us time and again of how these processes take place where there are not only different careers and dreams, but also winners and losers in the new (and old) trajectories of indigeneity.

In the final third of the book, Colloredo-Mansfeld turns his gaze from internal community processes to negotiations with other groups that put additional pressures on the processes of vernacular statecraft and negotiation explored already. When Tigua artists in Quito are threatened with expulsion from their selling posts in a centrally-located park, they must negotiate with each other as they negotiate with municipal authorities and mestizo artisan associations. When community members have encounters with the legal system they must navigate not only court offices and legal procedures, but contradictory indigenous values. And when they block roads as part of a national uprising against a free trade agreement, they must negotiate internally (as community members may also suffer from a civic strike), as well as with regional and national actors, both inside and outside the state. In all cases, Colloredo-Mansfeld depicts the truces and temporary alignments that facilitate what are usually only partial successes. However, he emphasizes the larger significance of the processes followed

more than the results achieved: any consensus (or in some cases, simple consent) generated is not a product of community homogeneity but rather of working through differences, acknowledging divergences, and listening to contrary arguments. He concludes that the strong and politically significant indigenous movement in Ecuador has a complex relationship to local forms of indigenous organization, in which indeed the two levels or instances of mobilizing fulfil different functions, rather than simply building on each other. And again, given the diversity of Ecuadorian indigenous peoples in the Andes and the Amazon, in rural and urban areas, in trade associations and in local agricultural organizations, and the myriad shades of winners and losers when it comes to indigenous livelihoods, the ability to work through difference at the local level is probably central to how this larger movement itself has been built. Moreover, those methods, procedures, and negotiations are central to how indigeness is lived today, having broken through prior definitions that tied indigenous life to rural poverty, remoteness and marginalization.

The title *Fighting Like a Community* aptly captures Colloredo-Mansfeld's emphasis on the importance of community, but also on internal differentiation and the ongoing process of resolving differences (temporarily) as specific projects are pursued, at the same time as communities participate—fight—in much broader political processes as well as economic ones. No short review can do justice to the complexities of this fine book. I have used it successfully in an undergraduate course on Latin America, and have recommended it to graduate students and colleagues interested in indigenous mobilizing, globalization, relations between indigenous peoples and the state in Latin America and elsewhere, and political anthropology. It repays a close reading, and will be of interest to a broad audience.

References

- Colloredo-Mansfeld, Rudi
1999. *The Native Leisure Class: Consumption and Cultural Creativity in the Andes*. Chicago: Chicago University Press.
- Weber, Max
1958 *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*. Talcott Parsons, trans. New York: Scribner.

Menzies, Charles R., *Red Flags and Lace Coiffes: Identity and Survival in a Breton Village*. Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2011, 160 pages. (From the book series *Teaching Culture: UTP Ethnographies for the Classroom*.)

Reviewer: Victor Barac
University of Toronto

Red Flags and Lace Coiffes is an “historical ethnography” of Le Guilvinec, a coastal fishing village in the Bigouden region of Brittany, France. It draws on a variety of historical and scholarly sources in addition to the author's own extensive ethnographic fieldwork in the region since the mid-1990s. An intriguing element to this book is the author's biographical connection to fishing. He grew up in a fishing family in British Columbia and made his living as a commercial fisher before becoming a professional anthropologist. Such life experiences provided him with a well-defined comparative vantage point from which to study fishing in Brittany. It also gave him a valuable basis for bonding with his informants who tended to view themselves as social outsiders.

The substantive aim of Menzies's book is to provide an account of how and why the “artisanal fishery” of today came into being. On the level of social theory, Menzies's mission is to introduce the basic concepts of classical Marxism (without coming right out and saying it) mostly by way of lengthy asides or digressions within an otherwise engaging ethnographic narrative. Menzies employs the model of class struggle (mediated by gender and kinship) as the conceptual underpinning of his analysis, privileging “agency” over “structure.”

It is, however, in his analysis of the “structure” of fishing where Menzies is most compelling. He is at his best when weaving the complex tale of the transformation of production in Bigouden: how the development of new technology, the exploitation of new resources, and the transformation in the organization of labour created the conditions for a larger epochal shift that occurred in three well-defined historical phases.

The first, the pre-industrial, is characterized by a peasant, subsistence-based agrarian economy where fishing played, at best, a supplemental, seasonal role. During this period the region was only loosely integrated into the larger French nation-state and was more rooted in the locally based Celtic culture.

The second, industrial, phase, dubbed The Sardine Years (1864-1936), was dominated by large commercial interests which employed local men on fishing ships and local women in canneries in large numbers. The big companies benefitted from French protectionist policies and exercised strict labour discipline which led to militant labour unionism and various acts of resistance now remembered and mythologized in local social memory. Indeed it is this militant period to which the *Red Flags* of the book title refers. This period marked the transformation of the region from an agrarian to an industrial fishing economy and, to modernity.