

---

# In the Wake of the Quiet Revolution: From Secularization to Religious Cosmopolitanism

Deirdre Meintel *Université de Montréal*

Géraldine Mossière *Université de Montréal*

---

**Abstract:** Montréal's current religious landscape reflects certain historical and social factors that contributed to the development of a somewhat unique "religious cosmopolitanism" in the city. We explore the notion of religious cosmopolitanism and how it manifests in the Montréal context, drawing on the results of team research involving the ethnographic study of 100 religious groups in the metropolitan area. In so doing, we present an image of religious openness on the part of the Québécois, at least on the part of those who frequent religious or spiritual groups, which contrast with the secularism being promoted by the Parti Québécois and with media images of Québec as closed to religious diversity.

**Keywords:** religion, pluralism, spirituality, cosmopolitanism, Montréal, Québec

**Résumé :** À certains égards, le paysage religieux actuel de Montréal reflète des tendances communes à d'autres villes canadiennes et américaines. Pourtant, nous soutenons que certains facteurs historiques et sociaux ont contribué à créer dans la ville une forme de « cosmopolitisme religieux » quelque peu unique. Nous explorons la notion de cosmopolitisme religieux et la façon dont celui-ci se manifeste dans le contexte montréalais en nous appuyant sur les résultats d'une recherche d'équipe impliquant l'étude ethnographique de 100 groupes religieux dans l'espace métropolitain. Nous présentons ainsi une image d'ouverture religieuse de la part des Québécois, du moins de la part de ceux qui fréquentent des groupes religieux ou spirituels, qui contraste avec le sécularisme qui est promu par le Parti Québécois et avec les représentations véhiculées par les médias au Québec en ce qui a trait à la diversité religieuse.

**Mots-clés :** religion, pluralisme, spiritualité, cosmopolitisme, Montréal, Québec

## Introduction<sup>1</sup>

The research on which the present analysis is based shows that religious diversity in Montréal is shaped to a large degree by trends evident in other North American cities, such as the decline in Catholic and mainstream Protestant religious attendance over recent decades, the proliferation of evangelical Protestant and nondenominational congregations and the increased presence of Islam. Along with this, we note the development of newer, more marginal spiritual currents, including many centred on nature (Druidry, Wicca, Neoshamanism), others of exogenous origin (yogic spiritualities, Buddhism), and hybrid religiosities developed *in situ*.

Similar tendencies have been observed elsewhere in Canada and the U.S.; for example Williamson (2010) describes three Hindu-inspired movements—Siddha Yoga, the Self-Realization Fellowship and Transcendental Meditation—that have attracted a number of non-Hindu Americans. Not only these three but many other movements originating in the Indian subcontinent are active in or near Montréal. Several of these have been studied in depth by our team, including the Sai Baba Organization and the Sivananda ashram in nearby Val-Morin, which has a meditation centre in Montréal. The importance of Evangelical (including Pentecostal) Protestant groups that we found among Montréal immigrants, including Latin Americans from various countries, Tamils from Sri Lanka, Ghanaians, Nigerians, Ethiopians and many other groups, is true of other Canadian cities (James 2011, Guenther 2008, Wilkinson 2006), as well as in the U.S. (Warner 1998; Menjivar 2003; Wuthnow 2007). The earth-centred spiritualities (Neoshamanism, Wicca, Paganism, Druidry) that we have observed in Montréal find their counterparts in the U.S. (Lewis 1996; Magliocco 2004) and elsewhere in Canada (Rabinovitch 1996). Our research finds that many individuals define themselves as "spiritual but not religious," bringing to mind the title of Fuller's (2001) study of "unchurched" Americans; that is, those

who claim no religious affiliation and have no religious attendance of any sort. Once again, our findings would seem to echo trends observed in the U.S., where the “nones” are a growing category (Putnam and Campbell 2010). However, the phrase is used in a somewhat different sense in Quebec than in the U.S., as we shall see.

In what follows, we will first explain what we mean by the term “cosmopolitanism” and look briefly at the ways cosmopolitanism and religious cosmopolitanism in particular have been approached by other researchers. This will be followed by a presentation of our study and its methodology, as well as a brief discussion of the Quebec religious context. We will argue that though Montréal has much in common with other major North American cities insofar as contemporary religious diversity is concerned, various historical and social factors have given rise to a considerable—though difficult to measure—degree of religious cosmopolitanism in the city. This last we consider to be an empirically observable aspect of social pluralism, albeit one that is unequally distributed. Here again, Montréal is not *entirely* unique; other researchers have observed various forms of religious cosmopolitanism in the U.S. and in Europe. Yet it appears to be more widespread and polymorphous in Montréal than in these other contexts. In fact, we find evidence of cosmopolitanism within religious congregations as well as among individuals in our study. We also find that there are religiously cosmopolitan spaces in Montréal. In what follows, we present religious openness in Montréal in quite a different light than many media reports on the Bouchard-Taylor in 2005 and, more recently, the “secularist charter” (*Charte de la laïcité*) proposed by the Parti Québécois, whereby, among other things, religious symbols would be banned from public and parapublic institutions.

## Religion and Cosmopolitanism

The very words “religious cosmopolitanism” might seem like an oxymoron to many. After all, modernism and enlightenment, the necessary conditions of the “cosmopolitan peace” (Alexander 2006) envisioned by Euro-American elites of the decades around the turn of the 20th century, were long associated with the expected decline of religion in classical social science. As we know, the expectation of such decline on the part of thinkers such as Comte, Durkheim and Weber and other thinkers well into the 1960s has been disproven by events of recent decades; rather it is the vision of Simmel (1997[1911]), who foresaw great change in religious institutions but an increased importance of spirituality in the face of modernization and urbanization, that has been borne out by time. But how, then, can cosmopolitanism and religion coexist?

Cosmopolitanism has preoccupied scholars in a number of disciplines, including philosophy (e.g., Appiah 2005, 2006) and sociology (e.g., Beck, Roudometof, Vertovec) as well as anthropology (e.g., Hannerz, Werbner, Glick Schiller et al.). While definitions of the term vary, most focus, as Glick Schiller and her colleagues (2011) note, on “openness to difference”—but not necessarily the celebration of difference. The distinction is an important one, because otherwise, how to reconcile, for example, ethnic, national or religious affiliation with cosmopolitanism? Beck (2006), for example, pits nationalism, both methodological and political, against cosmopolitanism. Appiah opens the way out of this impasse with his notion of “rooted cosmopolitanism,” arguing that various circles “narrower than the human horizon” (2005:246)—for example, family, religion, nation, local community, ethnic group—are sources of identities and represent “appropriate spheres of moral concern” along with the universalism associated with cosmopolitanism. Indeed, such rootedness should allow for a universalism that is “sensitive to the ways in which historical context may shape the significance of a practice” (Appiah 2005:256).

Some, including Beck (2006), and Schweder (2000:170, quoted by Hannerz 2007:69), see cosmopolitanism as a matter for the elite, or even the effete (Fridman and Ollivier 2004). The association of cosmopolitanism with mobile elites probably goes back to the “Grand Tour” that replaced religious pilgrimage as a *rite de passage* among the moneyed classes in the 18th and 19th centuries (Tomasi 1998, 2002). However, Appiah’s approach allows for a more socially inclusive, less elitist, quotidian cosmopolitanism, one that corresponds to the ethnographic observations of several anthropologists, such as Werbner’s study of working-class Pakistani Sufis (2007; 1999), or Notar’s (2008) work on ethnic minority café owners in Yunan, China. In the face of cases like these, Hannerz (2007:79) suggests that it might be useful to distinguish between cosmopolitanism from the top, at the macrolevel, versus microlevel approaches founded in personal or group experience. Hannerz (2007:80) describes the first as “global governance” in the broad sense, including not only inter-governmental relationships but also non-governmental organizations (NGOs), citizens’ movements, multi-national corporations, and the global capital market, all interacting through global communications media. For most anthropologists, though, it is the second that is of primary research interest. Pnina Werbner writes of “vernacular cosmopolitanism,” tracing “discrepant” cosmopolitanisms, and situates it within:

a family of concepts, all of which combine in similar fashion apparently contradictory opposites: cosmopolitan patriotism, rooted cosmopolitanism, cosmopolitan ethnicity, working-class cosmopolitanism, discrepant cosmopolitanism. [2006:496]

Werbner presents the case of a Pakistani Sufi, Hajji Suleiman, “a simple man from a poor background and with little formal education” (1999:24), whose labour migration has led him to become competent in many foreign cultures, making him familiar with Hindus, Japanese, Bangladeshis, Arabs, and Iraqis. He is blasé about learning Dutch and the possibility of moving to the Netherlands; however, this possibility is framed mainly by his commitment to establish a branch of his Sufi order there, if indeed he does migrate there. Moreover, locals as well as migrants may be cosmopolitan, as Mau et al. show in their study (2008) of Germans with prior transborder experience.

This is not to say that transnational experience is a guarantee of cosmopolitan “willingness to engage with the Other” (Hannerz 1996:103) and recognition of the Other’s “value and integrity as human beings” (Mau et al. 2008:5). On the contrary, transnational experience may be conducive to cosmopolitanism, but is not necessarily so (Roudometof 2005). Therefore, numerous examples disprove any causal link between mobility and cosmopolitanism. For example, the Chinese transnational élites studied by Aihwa Ong (Werbner 2006:4) seem lacking in cultural openness. On the other hand, Meintel encountered Cape Verdeans in the city of Sao Vicente in the early 70s who had hardly left their native island but who manifested what Vertovec (2009:6) calls “xenophilia,” an eagerness to know diversity; some had learned foreign languages on their own, through contact with sojourners from abroad. Thus, we do not assume that geographical mobility per se gives rise to cosmopolitanism; moreover, we argue as have a number of others (e.g., Roudometof 2005), that it is not a condition for cosmopolitanism. In fact, there appear to be various levels of cosmopolitanism: competences and abilities, aesthetics, politics, affect and values all come into play (Vertovec 2009; Hannerz 2007), with varying degrees of reflexivity (Werbner 2006:497).

Religious cosmopolitanism is only beginning to attract anthropological attention. A recent journal issue on “cosmopolitan sociability” (Glick Schiller et al. 2011), a dynamic where ethnic or religious rootedness coexists with openness to others on the level of everyday non-utilitarian social interactions, is particularly relevant to our concerns here. Appiah’s work (2006) on ethics and everyday cosmopolitanism—“as likely to be found in a

shantytown as at the Sorbonne” (p. xvii) is also salient. Here cosmopolitanism is explicitly linked with recognition, or the validation of the Other, similar to the *anerkennung* form of recognition in Fabian’s analysis (2001:159); the author uses the model of a “conversation,” a dynamic of coexistence and exchange where one is open to learning something from as well as about the Other—without necessarily converting to his/her point of view.<sup>2</sup>

As Werbner (2006:497) remarks, there are “many, different, cosmopolitan practices co-existing in late modernity, with their own historicities and distinctive worldviews.” We will try to show in a later section that, similarly, *religious* cosmopolitanism is highly varied, taking many different forms and lived out in greatly diversified practices in the Montréal context. Finally, Germain and Radice (2006) raise the issue of cosmopolitan *spaces*—be they social or physical spaces, a question to which we return at a later point. As the authors point out in regard to Montréal, cosmopolitanism is sometimes a form of “branding,” something we have had occasion to observe in regard to certain religions in Montréal.

## The Research

Our ongoing research program,<sup>3</sup> done in collaboration with five other researchers, aims to document the new religious diversity that has appeared in Quebec in the aftermath of the Quiet Revolution (since the 1960s), as well as the meaning of religion in the everyday lives of the Québécois today. Although our research concerns the whole of the province, here we are concerned mainly with the results of the first phase of the project (2006-2010), which focused on the Montréal metropolitan area. Ethnographic observations have been made of religious groups that represent (1) religions established in Quebec since the 1960s (e.g., Baha’i; Neo-shamanism, including Druidism and Wicca); (2) new forms of religious practice in long-established religions (as seen in some Jewish and Catholic congregations); (3) religions imported by immigrants (including Islam, Hinduism, certain forms of Buddhism); (4) congregations of long-established religions that include a substantial proportion of immigrants among their members. Thus far, observations have been completed on a total of 100 groups in Montréal (with another 37 cases still ongoing). Of the Montréal groups, 38 have been studied in-depth through extended participant observation and interviews with members and leaders. The second phase of the study (2010-2014) is extending the research to the regions of Quebec outside Montréal, where several dozen more groups are under study, and is also taking a closer look at new developments in Catholicism (for example, the rising importance of lay groups

composed of and led by individuals who are not members of the clergy).

Research assistants observe religious rituals and other religious activities, such as neighbourhood prayer groups, as well as social activities involving members of the group, like communal meals and picnics, fundraising events, and training courses that are sponsored by the group. Generally, assistants frequent the group's ritual activities assiduously for at least three months and usually for much longer. They also observe at least one (but usually several) non-ritual religious activity and at least one social, nonreligious activity involving members of the group. In-depth interviews are carried out with at least three members (usually more) and one leader. The members interviewed vary by gender, age, profession, matrimonial status, and level of commitment to the group. The interviews last at least an hour and a half, and cover individuals' personal and religious trajectories, the role of the religious group in their everyday lives, the level of their economic, social, and ideological commitment to the religious community, and when relevant, religious activities pursued outside the group's purview.

Each assistant produces a report that covers a long list of themes presented in an analytical grid common to the project; these include: governance and structure of the group, its dogmas, doctrines, norms and beliefs, its relation with other religious groups of the same or different denomination, the place of worship, rituals regularly held there, altered states of consciousness, embodied practices, use of the media, religious activities such as retreats or pilgrimages, healing practices, social activities, social differentiation within the group by ethnicity, gender, class, worldview (health, food, education, family relations, money, death, etc.), non-religious activities sponsored by the group (e.g., language classes), religious socialization of children, converts or new members, relations with the wider society (sectarian tendencies, integration) and with the public sphere, evolution of the group over time. A section of the grid concerns individual members: their religious identity/identities and trajectory, personal religious practices, conversion or change of affiliation. In addition, each assistant chooses a theme to research individually and presents their findings in their report. In order to do such an in-depth analysis, many observations are required and often, many informal interviews. Reports<sup>4</sup> vary in length from 60 to 120 pages or more. At present the team is conducting further research on music, this with the help of a musicologist, and on youth and matrimonial practices in some of the groups.

Meintel and Mossière devised the tools for the team study on the basis of their own long-term, in-depth fieldwork, in a Spiritualist church for Meintel and in an

African Pentecostal congregation for Mossière. Their research has been integrated into the project. The methodology of the present study is strongly influenced by approaches termed variously as "experiential," "phenomenological," or "experience-near."<sup>5</sup> Our research tools give an important place to the voice of the actors, their subjectivity and embodied experience. At the same time, possible biases of such an approach are, we believe, mitigated by the use of standardized research tools adjusted as needed to each group, a common analytical grid for research reports and careful supervision of the assistants' work by a number of more senior researchers. The observations and interviews necessary to complete the final reports require repeated attendance at religious rituals and many informal contacts with members; this usually takes at least five to six months of fieldwork, often longer. (Duration depends partly on the frequency of religious activities as well as the availability of interviewees.) Training and supervision of assistants, who are graduate students in anthropology, religious studies and other fields, follows a field school model. All field notes are read and commented upon by several researchers and regular meetings allow assistants to discuss issues that arise in the course of the fieldwork.

Discussions about fieldwork are particularly important for neophyte researchers when the subject under study is religious experience. In order to do participant observation in religious groups in one's own society, reflexivity usually becomes integral to the research process (Meintel 2011; Meintel and Mossière 2012). When apprehending religious phenomena, researchers are inevitably confronted with their own belief system and must situate themselves in relation to the beliefs of their subjects, which in turn, is likely to influence research methods and strategies. Typically, fieldworkers must decide "how far to go" in participating in the religious activities they are studying. Generally, assistants and researchers have not been asked by members of the religious groups to make their personal beliefs explicit as a condition of doing research; however, in Meintel's experience at least, academic colleagues and students are far more likely to raise such questions. The vast majority of the groups contacted welcomed the researchers and in some cases, seemed to consider the presence of a researcher as a form of validation. This was particularly the case for smaller congregations made up mostly of immigrants, who are sometimes subject to negative media coverage.

Before examining the question of religious cosmopolitanism we propose an overview of the contemporary religious landscape in Montréal and more generally in Quebec.

## Religion in Montréal Today

Our team research has focused on religions that took root in Quebec following the “Quiet Revolution” (*la Révolution tranquille*) of 1960–66, a time of dramatic social change in the province (Linteau et al. 1989). During this period of rapid secularization, the state took over the social welfare, educational and health systems that had long been the fief of the Catholic Church, and the ranks of the clergy and other religious orders were depleted. Meanwhile, religious practice in the form of weekly Mass attendance among Catholics was declining rapidly (Linteau et al.:336; Bibby 1990) and continued to diminish in the 1980s (Bibby 1988:39) and on into the early 2000s (Bibby 2008). Linteau et al. (1989) find that the decline in religious attendance in Montréal goes back to the 1940s, when some 30 to 50 per cent of Catholics in the city had ceased weekly attendance at Mass. While Quebec society was becoming secularized and more open to religious diversity, changes in Canadian immigration policy in 1968 opened the door to new source countries. As Helly (1997:158–159) has noted, new immigrant groups were bringing their own religious plurality with them; the Vietnamese were variously Catholic, Buddhist or Caodaists; Haitians might be Catholic, Baptist, Adventist or Lutheran, and so on.

Globalization has contributed greatly to the growth of religious diversity in Quebec as elsewhere, especially in regard to the increased mobility of the population and access to the Internet. Increased travel and international contact, new mass media, and diversified migration patterns have all led to increased religious diversity. New religions (such as Osho, the International Movement for Krishna Consciousness, Eckankar) arrive in the city by various means, whether via migrants, missionaries or Québécois converts. At the same time, long-established religions in the city are affected by new currents coming from elsewhere (e.g., Reconstructionist Judaism, the Charismatic Renewal in Catholicism). Thus, even as traditional religious observance has declined in the province, there has been an effervescent multiplication of spiritual groups and networks, along with the conversion of a number of Catholics to other religions (e.g., Evangelical Protestantism, Islam).

Bibby (2004, 2008) notes a certain “renaissance” of religion in Canada in recent years, a tendency that he finds both within and outside of established religious groups. In Quebec, Lemieux and Montmigny (1992) have remarked on the vitality of Catholicism in the province, mentioning the socially engaged activities of the Catholic clergy and religious (shelters for the homeless, soup kitchens and so on) as well the growth of the Charismatic Catholic movement. Also, immigration has brought more

Catholics than adherents of any other religion to Quebec and there are still more Catholics than immigrants of any other religion arriving in Canada (Castel 2003:275), even though Islam is the fastest growing faith in the country (Statistics Canada 2003). In Quebec, the majority (55 per cent) of visible minority individuals are Catholic, according to Castel (2007:135). Catholic immigrants, like immigrants in general, tend to be more religiously active than their native-born counterparts (Lacombe et al. 2002:322–323). Moreover, immigrant youth give greater importance to spirituality than their peers born in Quebec (ibid.:328).

Recent years have seen an ever-increasing number of places of worship in the province, especially in cities; Germain and Gagnon (2003:295) found some 800 in the Montréal area in their 2003 study. In part, this is due to immigration. The relative demographic weight of immigrants in the population has been growing steadily: in 1996 immigrants accounted for 9.4 per cent of the province’s population whereas in 1951, they represented only 5.6 per cent of the province’s population (Ministère de l’Immigration et Communautés Culturelles Quebec 2004). By 2001, according to census figures, this figure had risen to almost 10 per cent. The number of Muslims grew 140 per cent over the 1990s (MICC, 2002), mostly due to immigration from Lebanon, Morocco and Algeria as well as West Africa and Pakistan. Concerns about the integration of this culturally diverse religious group have recently stirred debate over the adjustments to be made by the receiving society to new religious groups. The hearings of the Bouchard-Taylor Commission<sup>6</sup> on “reasonable accommodation” focused to a great degree on the visible religiosity of certain immigrant groups, particularly Muslims (as exemplified by women’s *hijab*—veils and headscarves) and whether such practices represented a threat to Québécois identity.

While public debates around religious diversity and pluralism focus mainly on a few religious symbols, such as the *hijab*, the *kirpan* (a ceremonial dagger carried by observant Sikh males) and the Catholic crucifix in the Quebec National Assembly,<sup>7</sup> much of the actual religious diversity in Quebec goes unnoticed. Indeed, our study finds that much religiosity is relatively invisible both physically and socially; furthermore, our findings contradict a widespread stereotype whereby locals are imagined as non-religious, immigrants as religious. Apart from the fact that, much immigrant religiosity is nearly invisible (small, mobile, materially poor congregations); Muslims who do not frequent mosques or wear distinctive signs of religious belonging; and so on), that of non-immigrants is even more so. The Quiet Revolution seems to have made religion something of a social

taboo; even practicing Catholics are unlikely to advertise the fact. The word “religion,” in fact, is widely resisted, connoting “clerical authority” to many. Those who say they “have no religion” often consider themselves “spiritual”; moreover, those who are active in an open religious group such as the Spiritualist congregation Meintel studies—including those who work as healers and mediums at church services—will often say something like, “Well, I was brought up Catholic” if asked their religion. All this makes for a little-known religious diversity that involves non-immigrants and immigrants alike. Researchers in our team<sup>8</sup> have encountered a number of religious Muslims, mostly immigrants from the Maghreb region or from West Africa, who do not frequent mosques. Catholic lay groups (quite numerous in the outlying regions of Quebec) frequently meet in private homes, as do Muslim prayer groups. Evangelical congregations, especially those composed mostly of immigrants, often occupy rented spaces and sometimes share them with other religious groups. In general, small religious congregations have difficulty finding affordable spaces in which to worship and this is especially true of congregations composed mainly of new immigrants, who are likely to move often before finding a stable location (see also Germain and Gagnon 2003: note 21). Nature-centred spiritualities (Neoshamanism, Wicca and so on) often meet in public green spaces, but discreetly, and at times, may synchronize individual activities online.<sup>9</sup>

Further contributing to the invisibility of much religiosity in the province, is the widespread reticence of many native-born Québécois to discuss their religious practices and participation in religious or spiritual groups with friends and colleagues. Many say they fear being ridiculed for their beliefs, while those who practice the liberal professions worry that their clients would be “scandalized” to know of their religious activities, in the phrase of one follower of a guru born in the Gatineau region who is leader of an ashram in Montréal (Geoffrion 2011). Many non-immigrants who frequent the groups in our study profess themselves to be “spiritual” rather than religious. Apart from those who have converted to Islam, Buddhism or Evangelical religions, many born Catholics have discovered forms of spirituality that have either developed *in situ* from various sources (these are typically hybrid spiritualities combining New Age, Oriental, neoshamanic and/or other influences, where one key individual is the centre of a small network) or have been imported to Quebec by returned travellers. Still others are attracted to currents that are presented as contemporary versions of ancient traditions such as Druidism, Native-inspired shamanism, Wicca and so on. Note that none of these

require conversion, such that those brought up Catholic sometimes retain certain elements of Catholic identity and religious observance. As is the case in the spiritualist church that Meintel (2003, 2007, 2011) has studied, many of these spiritual currents involve beliefs in spirits and spirit contact. Thus it is that the province of Canada with the lowest level of conventional religious practice, that is, attending a weekly religious service (Bibby 2007-2008:167)—Quebec—is the one with the highest number of people—a full 57 per cent of those contacted in Bibby’s survey research (2004:149-150)—who believe they have had a personal encounter with God. The relation between these two facts lies, we believe, in the fact that the Quiet Revolution did not so much do away with religion as create a religious vacuum, that is, it led to felt needs for what Meintel (2011) has termed “tools for transcendence.” And this is exactly what many of those who have participated in our study seem to have found through their participation in groups that they prefer to describe as “spiritual” rather than religious. (Some, of course, feel the need for a new system of religious meanings, symbols and practices, including many converts to Islam [Mossière 2007, 2012]).

To sum up the main findings of our study to date that are relevant for the question of religious cosmopolitanism, we note the following:

- (1) There is high religious mobility among immigrants and non-immigrants: many immigrants have converted to another religion than that of their primary socialization before or after arriving in Canada (Mossière 2007). Though this is not usually true of Muslims, they may change their practice or move to a different current of Islam (from say, Shiite to Sufi) over time. As for native-born Francophones and Anglophones, a few convert to other religions, but many more circulate among the spiritual currents that have taken root in Quebec without any formal conversion.
- (2) Local religious institutions, especially Catholic ones, have adapted to new clienteles, though there are sometimes difficulties, as we note in a later section;
- (3) New forms of religious sociality are proliferating, some of them supported by the Internet (Meintel 2010, 2012);
- (4) New religious hybridities in religious practices and beliefs are emerging, on both the individual and the collective levels;
- (5) Healing occupies an important place in most contemporary religious currents, along with the utilisation of multiple healing resources, often from different religious sources, by individuals seeking increased well-being (Meintel and Mossière, 2011);

- (6) Religious congregations are significant sites of inter-ethnic relations. Virtually none of the groups we have encountered is made up of individuals from a single national or ethnic origin; most include individuals from a number of national backgrounds (Mossière 2010).

### Forms of Religious Cosmopolitanism

Glick Schiller et al. present cosmopolitanism as a dynamic where rootedness and openness coexist at the level of sociability—that is, in everyday non-utilitarian social interactions by actors who may have definite ethnic, national or religious commitments. The authors examine the cosmopolitanism that can emerge in “relationships of experiential commonalities despite differences” (2011:402); in terms of competence, it refers to the ability to find such commonalities across differences. Though Glick Schiller and her colleagues focus on actors defined by their geographical mobility (transnational migrants, pilgrims), we try to show that the cosmopolitan sociability they describe can also be found among individuals who are not themselves physically mobile, but in close contact with those who are, much like the café owners described by Notar (2008). We also find cosmopolitan actors who are socially, rather than geographically mobile; in the case of religion, this means encounters with and openness to other religions, beliefs, practices and styles.

Furthermore, while most studies of cosmopolitanism tend to focus on individuals, beginning with Hannerz’s earlier (1990) distinction between (mobile) “cosmopolitans” and (place-bound) “locals,” we suggest that it can also be observed on the collective and institutional level, in urban spaces (this, following Germain and Radice 2006), and even in certain theological concepts. In Montréal, it manifests within religious groups as well as between them, in religious activities such as pilgrimage and sweat lodges, in certain forms of religious mobility and hybridity and in personal spiritual practices. It also appears as a form of self-representation, of religious branding, so to speak. We have observed several religiously cosmopolitan spaces and cosmopolitan relations of *voisinage* (neighbour-like relations) in the city; in these cases, proximity that happens to be physical is also made relational and symbolic; that is, they are relations of “neighbourhood” in a social sense, as Appadurai uses the term (1996:184). Finally, we propose several theological concepts that hold a certain cosmopolitan potential, a likelihood of generating contexts where cultural or religious others are recognized and validated.

### Cosmopolitan Collectivities, Cosmopolitan Actors

One of the clearest examples of cosmopolitanism in religious contexts is found in a number of Pentecostal groups. Glick Schiller and her colleagues speak of the “solidarity of belief” (2011:204) that prevails over cultural differences within the same broad tradition. Such solidarity may be ephemeral: in the same journal issue, Kristine Krause (2011) describes the New Mission churches in West Africa she has studied in terms of “cosmopolitan moments” that may turn out to be part of the process of developing an “ultimately exclusivist” institution.

In Montréal, Pentecostal groups often cast the net very wide; among different Protestant branches, all the same newcomers of other origins are generally welcomed as fellow believers. At the beginning of each celebration in the Congolese church studied by Mossière (2007), the leader of the service asks new visitors to stand and introduce themselves to the community, after which they are officially welcomed by the pastor. Later, certain members are charged with meeting them informally and putting them at ease, in the hope that they will return. This ritual is not new in Evangelical churches but in the Montréal context they contrasted with the Catholic services that some describe as “cold.” Mossière found many cases of individuals of Catholic background and of various ethnic origins who decide to become members of Evangelical churches because of their warm relationships with other members.

In the Congolese congregation, initiatives (such as workshops) are taken by the pastor to help immigrant members adapt their economic and political behaviour to the dominant ideology of the surrounding society so as to make them, in his own words, “good citizens.” Nevertheless, the congregation’s norms regarding family relationships are more conservative than the Québécois patterns where single parents, cohabitation without marriage and children born out of wedlock are common. On one hand, the pastor urges the faithful to uphold the Christian family model and may temporarily exclude the members who don’t; on the other, he nuances his preaching so as not to judge Québécois family behaviour but rather to distinguish it from the “Christian” model in a respectful way. At the same time, members who do not strictly conform to these models are not expelled from the congregation. When one young woman became pregnant out of wedlock, she was asked to suspend her membership for a few months but later the baby and the mother were reintegrated in the church without prejudice. The church’s doors are always open to any visitor as a potential new

member and at present, the congregation is composed of Congolese and Haitians as well as a few native born Québécois. Beyond their ethnic affiliations, the members of this church consider themselves sisters and brothers in Christ.

Other African churches Mossière (under review) has observed in Montréal show another dimension of religious cosmopolitanism that is based on the collective effect of periodic religious gatherings. The sense of *communitas* that is commonly experienced in the framework of joyful, expressive rituals is often facilitated by the transnational actors who circulate throughout networks that extend across French-speaking Africa and European countries to Quebec. Be they prophets, apostles, evangelists, or pastors, they visit each other's congregations; they also give moving sermons and preside over ritual activities in the framework of public talks or so-called conventions that attract members of various churches in the region. Besides the multilingualism, cultural fluency and technological competence that enable them to easily traverse national and cultural boundaries, these new cosmopolitan actors are distinguished by their charismatic skills. These allow them to generate a powerful, ritualized sense of communion with the Holy Spirit, as well as with other "sisters" and "brothers," and to perform what those present see as healing miracles.

As in Pentecostal churches, the acceptance of cultural differences has marked Catholic institutions as well. As mentioned above, immigration still brings more Catholics than adherents of any other religion to Canada; of these, many come to Quebec (Castel 2003), and especially to Montréal. The new arrivals bring their own styles of Catholic worship, requiring accommodation from existing parishes (services in the language of the new group, for example) and the archdiocese as a whole, which has established various "missions" to accommodate groups such as the Tamils. Hispanic Catholics have given new vitality to the Charismatic Renewal in Quebec, which had lost momentum during the 1990s. (According to a Peruvian immigrant in Montréal, wherever there are Latinos, Catholic worship becomes charismatic.) Services in a Catholic church in a Francophone neighbourhood observed by Meintel often include readings in Lingala as a gesture of welcome to the numerous Congolese assisting at Mass. However, openness to the cultural "Other" on the part of local Catholics is uneven; in a case reported by Mélissa Bouchard (2009), when Tamil Catholics tried to buy a Catholic church that was for sale because parishioners could not afford to maintain it, they were rebuffed.

Furthermore, when we look at the majority, non-immigrant population of Quebec whose religious options were

transformed by the Quiet Revolution, our research shows a great deal of religious cosmopolitanism on the part of individuals who move *across* traditions. The long period when the Church was experienced as a kind of "total social fact" in the lives of the faithful ended with the Quiet Revolution. Rapid secularization on the institutional level and generalized anticlericalism on the ideological level occurred just as the influence of globalization was beginning to be felt. So, just at the moment when a religious void was created in the lives of the Catholic-born majority, the religious resources available in Quebec were multiplying. The currents that most attract native born Québécois are typically described by participants as "spiritual" rather than "religious;" usually they do not require conversion—as in the case of Buddhism or Spiritualism—and often, they do not present themselves as a religious denomination, for instance, neoshamanic groups that promote what they call "Native" (Amerindian) spirituality. While some tens of thousands of Francophone Catholics have converted to other religions since the 1960s, such as Evangelical Protestantism and Islam, converts are but the tip of the iceberg when it comes to circulation across religious boundaries. The fact that there is no "conversion" to religions such as Spiritualism, Neoshamanism or Wicca allows participants to retain a Catholic identity, as most we have met do, while developing new kinds of religious subjectivities. Though these Québécois follow behaviour patterns that are widespread in the U.S. (Pew Research Center 2008) in that their religious practices and frequentations are different from those of their youth, they are not detached from organized religion.<sup>10</sup> They are not "unchurched" in any simple way (see Fuller 2001 for a discussion of the different meanings of the term as it applies to Americans); rather, they identify on some level with the denomination of their birth, Catholicism. For these actors, participating in other types of spiritual/religious groups and adopting practices discovered therein is not seen as conversion or as adopting a new religious identity but rather as enhancing their spirituality, their intuition and/or their personal development.

In such cases, cosmopolitan openness to the Other takes specifically religious forms, that is, it involves *religious* "Others" and their beliefs and practices. It often involves openness to other cultures as well; for example, those who frequent groups promoting "Native" (Amerindian) spirituality or the various groups promoting Hindu-inspired meditation techniques and other spiritual practices along with various forms of yoga (Sivananda, Vipassana, Kundalini yoga). Typically, individuals in these groups create personal, hybrid spiritualities; they may participate in one type of group more intensely than



others, but individual practices and group participation tend to evolve and change over time.

A number of the groups that attract Catholic-born Québécois present themselves as cosmopolitan by definition; for example, the Baha'i emphasize their openness and inclusiveness as regards ethnic and national origins. They also promote an ideology of tolerance toward all religions, allowing those of other religious backgrounds to participate in their activities, though actual membership in the Baha'i faith is exclusive. In their gatherings, members of diverse ethnic and national origins are encouraged to share the cuisine, poetry or music of their cultural background. All this represents the celebration of diversity mentioned earlier and forms part of the "branding" of the Baha'i religion as a cosmopolitan faith.

The Spiritualists whom Deirdre Meintel has followed for over a decade allow membership to anyone who wishes, as this is seen simply as a way of contributing material support for the church. Baptism exists in the Spiritualist tradition but is not practiced in the half-dozen congregations found in Montréal; rather, members are typically of Catholic background and often retain many elements of Catholic belief and practice. Many have their children baptized and a few regularly attend Mass along with their participation in Spiritualist activities, which involve clairvoyant mediumship and healing. Furthermore, some also frequent sweat lodges and other "Native" rituals, and this with the blessing of the pastor. Numerous elements of Amerindian spirituality have been incorporated into the rituals, beliefs and discourse of this group (Meintel 2003, 2007).

Another example of such openness to other traditions involves a group that is part of our more recent work in the regions outside Montréal. In Sherbrooke, we find an "interfaith" church whose activities are centred on meditation, prayers of healing and shared reflections on matters of the spirit (Delisle 2011). Members tend to be Catholic by socialization; one of the most active is, in fact, an Oblate nun. The leader and founder of the congregation was brought up Catholic, explored other traditions in India and the Philippines, and was married a few years ago in the Catholic church by a local pastor.

Somewhat similar is the Church of the Nouveau Penser ("new thinking") in Montréal, which sees itself as promoting a "philosophy of life"<sup>11</sup> rather than denominational belonging, though it also offers the services of its ministers for performing life-stage rituals (such as baptism, marriage, and funerals). Its website mentions that these are available to those of different cultures or faiths, divorced people and gays, and presents the Church as nondenominational, open, universal and spiritual.<sup>12</sup> A

small, relatively poor congregation of Messianic Jews studied by Altmine (2011) in our project makes regular accommodation in its rituals and other activities to the cultural and religious backgrounds of participants, some of whom were born into the Jewish religion, and others into Catholic or other religious backgrounds. In these cases, cosmopolitanism is something of a "brand," a positively valued representation of the group, and one that apparently holds considerable attraction in the spiritual "marketplace" of Quebec (Gauthier et al. 2011).

This does not mean that the groups concerned are themselves diverse; except for the Baha'is, they tend to be mainly composed of native-born Francophone or Anglophone Québécois. For their part, the Baha'is studied by Gabrielle Désilets (2012) in our project include many immigrants, mostly well-educated, with many from Iran, and others come from Mexico, Mali, other African countries, Rumania and elsewhere. Moreover, the diverse provenance of members is seen by Baha'is as representing the religion's cosmopolitan openness to various cultures. Thus, in religious activities, several languages are likely to be used: on one occasion, a meeting for devotional prayer, "An Iranian woman sang in Farsi; a Malian woman prayed in French. A Mexican woman prayed in Spanish. The others prayed in English." (Field notes, Oc. 14, 2007). One of Désilet's informants, a middle-aged woman from Iran, explains:

You know as Baha'is, we are encouraged to have friends from all cultures. ... Baha'u'llah [the religion's founder] says mix, because if you want to have unity, you cannot bring it by just staying in your own community. That even transcends in our activities, we always try to invite friends and neighbours because we want to open up. [Désilets 2009:99]

While such groups and networks are mostly middle or upper middle class in composition, this is not always the case, notably for the Spiritualists studied by Meintel, who tend to be of working class background. Michel, the pastor, often affirms that "We are not a cult, we are not a sect; we are open to all traditions and to all sacred texts." On one hand, the flavour of the "Spiritual Church of Healing" (pseudonym) is strongly Christian, and to some degree, Catholic. A large Bible (King James version) is prominently displayed in the front of the church. The Catholic origins of most who frequent the church are evident in the clairvoyant "messages" addressed by mediums to individuals in the congregation, which often include Catholic references (Meintel 2012), always presented favourably "I see the blue of the Virgin Mary around you; you are very devoted to her". Or, "I see the Oratory (a reference to

St. Joseph's Oratory), you should go there." Saint Brother André is often mentioned in such messages. Representations of Catholic saints, Jesus, Natives, as well as New Age-style paintings of angels and other spirit entities adorn the walls, along with a Star of David. A large "welcome stick," with a line of feathers hanging from it that was given to Michel by a Native friend adorns the top of the main doorway.

Further examples are emerging from our current fieldwork in the Laurentians, an area near Montréal: a Sivananda ashram attracts hundreds of devotees who also frequent sweat lodges and other Amerindian-inspired rituals held nearby;<sup>13</sup> an ecumenical charismatic Catholic group welcomes Evangelical participants.

### Cosmopolitan Religious Spaces

Mount Royal Park, a large green space conceptualized by Frederick Law Olmsted, is one site of what Germain and Radice (2006) term "cosmopolitanism by default;" that is, it is frequented by people of diverse origins in unplanned, but peaceful cohabitation. The "Mountain" as it is called, with a bit of exaggeration perhaps, is also the site of *de facto* religious cosmopolitanism. Numerous small groups hold rituals there regularly, including various currents of Nature-centred spiritualities (Wicca, Neoshamanism) along with others, such as yoga groups, who occasionally use the park as a ritual site. An annual blessing of pets also is often held there, with an Anglican priest officiating. (Pet blessings by Catholic priests are held in other parts of the city.) We also find spaces characterized by a more intentional religious cosmopolitanism; notably St. Joseph's Oratory (l'Oratoire Saint-Joseph), constructed due to the efforts of Brother André, who was canonized in 2010. Built atop a natural promontory, the Oratory attracts believers of various faiths, in groups and individually, on a daily basis. Moreover, the clergy and other personnel of the basilica have adopted a remarkably inclusive, non-proselytizing approach to visitors; as well as welcoming a broad variety of Catholic practices from many parts of the world. The Oratory is open to a great diversity of religious groups (including Jews, Hindus—who consider the Oratory a temple—Buddhists and various Christian groups) and allows them space to organize their activities, as long as they respect the Catholic identity of the place and do not disturb others; it has been the site of events celebrating religious diversity as well as the cultural diversity within Catholicism (Boutin 2005:129-141). A priest who works there reports that while some of his colleagues refuse communion to those who are clearly not Catholic, others choose to give them the sacred host. This stands in contrast, we should add, to the chilly reception given to Tamil Catholics who went in their hundreds

to make pilgrimage at a smaller Catholic shrine outside of Montréal, bringing their Hindu friends and picnicking on the grounds (Bouchard 2009).

Other cases of religious cohabitation have been observed including the collaborative relations between the multiethnic Messianic Jewish congregation (Altminc 2011) and their Evangelical Protestant neighbours in the same building, who share resources; the group's rabbi has participated in its services and that of another Evangelical group close by. In Parc-Extension, a neighbourhood of Montréal that is home to immigrants of diverse national origins, a former office building is now occupied by many different religious groups, with Hindus and African Pentecostals sharing the same elevator and in some cases the same floor; the latter joke: "It's easier to evangelize them this way!" though in fact, no such efforts are made. In another part of the city, part of the first floor of a commercial building is rented for spiritual or personal development activities by various groups including Sufis and yoga groups along with travelling spiritual leaders who hold activities there (such as a chakra crystal music event observed by Mossière). In Saint-Jérôme, a community centre was founded (1990) by a devoutly Catholic woman who believed that religion in the broad sense helps immigrants integrate socially. It is used by immigrant religious groups including Hindus, Bhutanese Pentecostals and African Evangelicals; Mennonites who celebrate the Sabbath on Sunday rent their building to Adventists who do so on Saturday.<sup>14</sup>

Certain Muslim groups also make efforts to open lines of communication with non-Muslims; besides "open door" days held by certain mosques, some Sufi centres hold prayer and meditation groups that attract many non-Muslims. The Bel-Agir group, mainly composed of educated Moroccans, encourages its members to establish collaborative relationships with their physical neighbours in the city (Maynard 2009). Some Pentecostal groups also organize charitable activities aimed at Christians and non-Christians such as soup kitchens and blood donation campaigns (as do some Hindu congregations).

Finally, although it is somewhat beyond the purview of this article, it seems relevant to mention certain theological concepts we have encountered in the course of the fieldwork that carry a certain cosmopolitan potential. Catholic notions of "inculturation," or adaptation to local cultures, are sometimes invoked to allow for ethnically diverse religious styles. Khadiyatoullah Fall (2007), co-investigator in our project, has written about the Muslim concept of *arrouhsatou*, whereby Muslim religious practice can and should be modified in contexts where this is necessary to accommodate others.

## Religious Cosmopolitanism in Montréal: Image versus Reality

Now let us return to the question we raised at the beginning. How can we explain the openness to the religiosity of others we found in Montréal, along with the lack of animosity, given the image of the province that emerged from the Bouchard-Taylor hearings and more recently from the secularist charter proposed by Pauline Marois of the Parti Québécois, who became premier when her party won the elections of 2012. It should be noted that prejudiced views expressed at the public hearings of the Commission and at times in journalistic representations of the hearings were frequently criticized in the Quebec media, not to mention by Quebecois academics (see, for example, Côté 2008; Potvin 2010). The *Charte de la laïcité* provoked consternation among scholars (Milot 2012) and in the local media, and even among some sovereignists (Dorion 2012).

As we have seen, many born in Quebec who frequent religious groups regularly do not see their activities as “religious” (which to them connotes traditional Catholicism and clerical authority) but rather as “spiritual.” The social invisibility of the religiosity (spirituality) of many Quebecois, especially those born in Quebec, helps nourish a stereotype of native-born Québécois as hostile to all forms of religion, as contrasted with immigrants, who are imagined to be religiously observant (often not true, we have found). Moreover, events such as the Shafia trial or the arrest of a “home-grown” group of terrorists in the Toronto area have been the occasion of thinly veiled negative stereotypes of Muslims in Quebec as elsewhere in Canada. In this context, the fact that none of the hundreds of native-born Québécois encountered in the course of our research have expressed negative views about other religions, or the visible signs of such religions (temples, mosques, veils, kirpans and so on) is remarkable, though such views are often evident in Quebec’s mass media. Our informants, it should be emphasized, are all individuals who engage in some type of religious (spiritual) activity, at least occasionally. It is as though by the fact of activating their own spiritual lives, they do not feel threatened by the religiosity of others. Furthermore, many we have met engage in less conventional forms of religiosity, for instance, Spiritualists, whose religious activities include channelling, clairvoyance and healing by the laying on of hands. Many others frequent marginal groups, such as Druids and Wiccans. It is likely that, feeling vulnerable to stigmatization themselves, they sympathize with those who endure negative stereotypes and discrimination because of their religion.

## Conclusion

We have tried to show how religious rootedness is by no means in contradiction to cosmopolitanism; in fact, the opposite would seem to be true in Quebec. We have sought to give an account of the many forms that religious cosmopolitanism takes in Montréal and more widely, in Quebec. As we have seen, the recognition of others and the willingness to adapt to their presence that cosmopolitanism implies concerns not only individuals but groups, institutions and urban spaces. Cosmopolitanism as an elitist set of tastes and distinctions (Fridman and Ollivier 2004) is certainly present in the city, but this does not detract from the “vernacular” (Werbner 2006) varieties that we have noted. While making an argument for the presence of cosmopolitanism among religious groups, actors and places, we have tried to show that its presence is contextual and unequal.

The religious cosmopolitanism we see in Montréal and its environs is not entirely surprising; the city has the highest level of trilingualism in Canada and, thus, in North America (Lamarre and Lamarre 2009). Annick Germain and Martha Radice (2006) have described the “cosmopolitan sociability” that defines public social encounters in several multiethnic areas of the city. It might be argued, then, that religious cosmopolitanism is simply part of a larger picture; however, religion has been a particularly thorny issue in debates around Québécois identity in recent years. It is clear that many old-stock Québécois feel threatened by the visible religiosity of others, however virtual their own Catholic religious belonging. Given the apparent “contradiction” between religious rootedness and cosmopolitanism that we mentioned in the introduction, it is all the more interesting to note that among the hundreds of those involved in religion (or spirituality) who have been interviewed for our research in Montréal, none expressed negative reactions about religious minorities and their practices, and this, despite being questioned about their relations with other religions. We do not always find the same openness among Québécois who have no personal spiritual practice or regular religious attendance. In other words, it seems as if the religiosity (or spirituality)—the personal, lived religious “rootedness”—of our informants, as well as the mobility between religions that so many have experienced, allows them to be at ease with the religious belonging and practices of others.

*Deirdre Meintel, Département d'anthropologie, Université de Montréal, C.P. 6128, Succ. Centre-ville, Montréal, Québec, H3C 3J7, Canada. E-mail: deirdre.meintel@uMontreal.ca.*

## Notes

- 1 A note of thanks to Martha Radice, Naomi McPherson and an anonymous reviewer for their constructive criticism of earlier versions of this article. Thanks also to Marie-Noëlle Doublet-Petropavlovsky for the reference to Lise McKean's work.
- 2 The issue of recognition is particularly relevant for inter-group relations in Quebec; indeed, Taylor's classic essay on the subject centres on the example of Quebec and its relations with the rest of Canada (1994).
- 3 Our co-investigators are Khadiyatoulah Fall, François Gauthier, Claude Gélinas, Marie-Nathalie Le Blanc and Josiane Le Gall. Géraldine Mossière is coordinator of the project. Deirdre Meintel is principal investigator. The work is supported by a team grant from the Fonds de recherche sur la société et la culture (Québec) and by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada.
- 4 Abridged digital versions of published reports from the project are available at <http://www.grdu.umontreal.ca/fr/publications-workingpapers.html>. See also Mossière and Meintel (2010) and Meintel (2010).
- 5 The term is taken from Wikan 1991. This broad current includes many authors. See for example: Csordas 2001; Csoradas 2002, Desjarlais 1992; Dubisch 2005; Goulet 1998; Goulet 1993; McGuire 2008; Turner 1994; Turner 1996.
- 6 The formal name of the commission was "Consultation Commission on Accommodation Practices Related to Cultural Differences." It was presided by Gérard Bouchard and Charles Taylor. The final report of the Commission is available at: <http://www.scribd.com/doc/3053017/rapport-de-la-commission-BouchardTaylor-version-integrale>.
- 7 The Bouchard-Taylor Commission recommended the removal of the crucifix but this was rejected in a unanimous vote by the Quebec Assemblée nationale on May 22, 2008.
- 8 Khadiyatoulah Fall, co-researcher in the project, and Yannick Boucher, coordinator of the project for the Saguenay region (personal communications).
- 9 Roberts (2011), an assistant for our research project, gives the example of simultaneous prayers among Pagans after the Gulf oil spill in 2010. Their prayers were synchronized using a listserv and followed by many Internet exchanges between participants.
- 10 It is worth noting in this context that Bibby (2002) finds a modest comeback in recent years for traditional religious organizations in Canada as a whole.
- 11 In an effort to build bridges with the host society, some Hindu leaders Anne-Laure Betbeder (2009) met in Montréal describe Hinduism more as an encompassing philosophy of life than a religion.
- 12 <http://lenouveaupenser.com>.
- 13 This makes an interesting contrast with the same group in India, where it has been associated with Hinduist fundamentalism (McKean 1996).

- 14 From the field notes of Guillaume Boucher, coordinator of the project in the St. Jérôme area. Boucher learned of an incident at the Centre where the member of an African Evangelical congregation took umbrage at seeing the pictures of Hindu deities "in his church." He was reprimanded by a male staff member who cited a passage from the Bible about respecting others. The man calmed down and after that the pictures remained on the wall, but covered with a cloth except during Hindu gatherings.

## References

- Alexander, Jeffrey C.  
2006 Global Civil Society. *Theory, Culture & Society* 23(2-3):521-524.
- Altminc, Ruth  
2011 Juif-chrétien, Juif-messianique ou Simplement Chrétien: Une Congrégation Messianique à Montréal. Document de travail/Working Paper, Groupe de recherche Diversité urbaine, Université de Montréal. Online version: <http://www.grdu.umontreal.ca/fr/publications-workingpapers.html>, accessed March 13, 2013.
- Appadurai, Arjun  
1996 The Production of Locality. *In* *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. Pp. 178-204. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Appiah, Anthony Kwame  
2005 *The Ethics of Identity*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.  
2006 *Cosmopolitanism: Ethics in a World of Strangers*. New York: W.W. Norton.
- Beck, Ulrich  
2006 *The Cosmopolitan Vision*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Bibby, Reginald  
2008 La religion à la carte au Québec: Un problème d'offre, de demande ou des deux? *Globe* 11(1):151-179.  
2004 Restless Gods: The Renaissance of Religion in Canada. Toronto: Novalis.  
1990 La religion à la Carte au Québec: Une Analyse de Tendances. *Sociologie et sociétés* 22(2):133-144.  
1988 La religion à la carte: pauvreté et potentiel de la religion au Canada. Montréal: Fides.
- Bouchard, Melissa  
2009 La Mission catholique tamoule: présentation ethnographique et enquête sur la dévotion mariale. Document de Travail du Groupe de Recherche Diversité Urbaine. Montréal. Online version: <http://www.grdu.umontreal.ca/fr/publications-workingpapers.html>, accessed January 19, 2013.
- Boutin, Suzanne  
2005 Modernité avancée et quêtes de mieux-être sur trois lieux de pèlerinage québécois: Sainte-Anne-de-Beaupré, Notre-Dame-du-Cap et l'Oratoire Saint-Joseph. Ph.D. thesis, Dép. d'anthropologie, Université Laval.
- Bramadat, Paul, and David Seljak  
2008 *Christianity and Ethnicity in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Castel Frédéric  
2003 Progrès du catholicisme, influence de l'immigration: les grandes tendances de l'affiliation religieuse

- depuis la Seconde Guerre mondiale. *In* L'Annuaire du Québec 2004. M. Venne, ed. Pp. 274-275. Saint-Laurent, Québec: Fides.
- 2007 Envahissement des minorités religieuses au Québec?. *In* L'Annuaire du Québec 2008. M. Venne and M. Fahmy, eds. Pp. 133-140. Saint-Laurent, Québec: Fides.
- Côté, Pauline
- 2008 Quebec and Reasonable Accommodation: Uses and Misuses of Public Consultation. *In* Religion and Diversity in Canada. L. Beaman and P. Beyer, eds. Pp. 41-65. Leiden and Boston: Brill.
- Csordas, Thomas
- 2001 Language, Charisma, and Creativity: Ritual Life in the Catholic Charismatic Renewal. New York: Palgrave.
- 2002 Body/Meaning/Healing. New York: Palgrave.
- Delisle, Sara
- 2011 L'Église Spirituelle Inter-foi. Document de travail (Working Paper). Groupe de recherche Diversité urbaine, Université de Montréal. The online version will be available in 2013 at <http://www.grdu.umontréal.ca/fr/publications-workingpapers.html>.
- Désilets, Gabrielle
- 2010 Le cosmopolitisme de la communauté baha'ie de Montréal: étude ethnographique. Document de travail/Working Paper. Groupe de recherche Diversité urbaine, Université de Montréal. Online version: <http://www.grdu.umontréal.ca/fr/publications-workingpapers.html>, accessed January 19, 2013.
- Desjarlais, Robert
- 1992 Body and Emotion: The Aesthetics of Illness and Healing in the Nepal Himalayas. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Diouf, Mamadou
- 2002 The Senegalese Mourid Trade Diaspora and the Making of a Vernacular Cosmopolitanism. *In* Cosmopolitanism. C. A. Breckenridge, S. Pollack, H. Bhabha and D. Chakrabarty, eds. Pp. 111-137. Durham, NC: Duke University.
- Dorion, Jean
- 2012 Charte de la laïcité: quand un séparatiste se sépare. Montréal: Le Devoir. September 22. Online: <http://www.ledevoir.com/politique/quebec/359768/quand-un-separatiste-se-separe>, accessed Dec. 4, 2012.
- Dubisch, Jill
- 2008 Challenging the Boundaries of Experience, Performance, and Consciousness: Edith Turner's Contributions to the Turnerian Project. *In* Victor Turner and Contemporary Cultural Performance. G. St. John, ed. Pp. 324-335. New York: Berghahn Books.
- Fabian, Johannes
- 2001 Remembering the Other: Knowledge and Recognition. *In* Anthropology with an Attitude: Critical Essays. Pp. 158-178. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Fall, Khadiyatoula
- 2007 Pour un Islam du Québec. Montréal: Le Devoir, September 19. [www.ledevoir.com/2007/09/19/157463.html](http://www.ledevoir.com/2007/09/19/157463.html), accessed February 17, 2011.
- Fridman, Viviana, and Michèle Ollivier
- 2004 Ouverture ostentatoire à la diversité et cosmopolitisme: vers une nouvelle configuration discursive? *Sociologie et sociétés* 36(1):105-126.
- Fuller, Robert C.
- 2001 Spiritual but not Religious. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Gauthier, François, Tuomas Martikainen and Linda Woodhead
- 2011 Religion in Consumer Society: Acknowledging a Global Shift. *Social Compass* 58(3):280-301.
- Geoffrion, Karine
- 2011 Le Disciple et sa Quête Spirituelle : Le Rôle Du Gourou dans un Ashram Montréalais. Document de travail/Working Paper, Groupe de recherche Diversité urbaine, Université de Montréal. Online version: <http://www.grdu.umontréal.ca/fr/publications-workingpapers.html>, accessed January 19, 2013.
- Germain, Annick, Julie Elizabeth Gagnon and Anne-Lise Polo
- 2003 Laménagement des lieux de culte des minorités ethniques: enjeux et dynamiques locales. Montréal: Institut national de la recherche scientifique—Urbanisation, Culture et Société.
- Germain, Annick, and Martha Radice
- 2006 Cosmopolitanism by Default. *In* Cosmopolitan Urbanism. J. Binnie, J. Holloway, S. Millington and C. Young, eds. Pp. 112-129. London and New York: Routledge.
- Glick Schiller, Nina, Tsypylma Darieva and Sandra Gruner-Domic
- 2011 Defining Cosmopolitan Sociability in a Transnational age: An Introduction, *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 34(3):399-418.
- Goulet, Jean-Guy
- 1993 Dreams and Visions in Indigenous Lifeworlds: An Experiential Approach. *Canadian Journal of Native Studies* 13(2):171-198.
- 1998 Ways of Knowing: Experience, Knowledge, and Power among the Dene Tha. Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Guenther, Bruce L.
- 2008 Ethnicity and Evangelical Protestants in Canada. *In* Christianity and Ethnicity in Canada. P. Bramadat and D. Seljak, eds. Pp. 365-414. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Hannerz, Ulf
- 2007 Cosmopolitanism. *In* A Companion to the Anthropology of Politics. D. Nugent and J. Vincent, eds. Pp. 69-85. Malden, MA: Blackwell.
- 1996 Transnational Connections. London and New York, Routledge.
- 1990 Cosmopolitans and Locals in World Culture. *In* Global Culture. M. Featherstone, ed. Pp. 237-251. London: Sage.
- Helly, Denise
- 1997 Structuration Communautaire et Institutions Ethniques. *In* Revue des études ethniques au Québec. Report prepared for Citizenship and Immigration Canada and the Metropolis project. Available online at [http://Canada.metropolis.net/research-policy/litreviews/hel\\_rv/hel\\_rv01a.html](http://Canada.metropolis.net/research-policy/litreviews/hel_rv/hel_rv01a.html), accessed July 14, 2012.

- James, William Closson  
2011 *God's Plenty: Religious Diversity in Kingston*. Montréal: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Lacombe, Hébert, Lucille Pica and May Clarkson  
2002 *Spiritualité, religion et santé chez des immigrants récents: une approche exploratoire*. In *Santé et bien-être, immigrants récents au Québec: une adaptation réciproque: étude auprès des communautés culturelles, 1998-1999*. Version révisé. Institut de la Statistique, gouvernement du Québec, en collaboration avec le ministère de la santé et des services sociaux. Pp. 320-332. Québec: Gouvernement du Québec.
- Lamarre, Patricia, and Stéphanie Lamarre  
2009 Montréal "on the move": Pour une approche ethnographique non-statistique des pratiques langagières des jeunes multilingues. In *Formes & normes sociolinguistiques. Ségrégations et discriminations urbaines*. T. Bulot, ed. Pp.105-134. Paris: LHarmattan.
- Lewis, James R., ed.  
1996 *Magical Religion and Modern Witchcraft*. Albany: State University of New York.
- Raymond Lemieux, and Jean-Paul Montminy  
1992 *La vitalité paradoxale du catholicisme québécois*. In *Le Québec en jeu. Comprendre les grands défis*. G. Daigle and G. Rocher, eds. Pp. 575-606. Montréal: Presses de l'Université de Montréal.
- Linteau, Paul-André, René Durocher, Jean-Claude Robert and François Ricard  
1989 *Histoire du Québec contemporain, Tome II : Le Québec depuis 1930*. Montréal: Éditions Boréal.
- Magliocco, Sabina  
2004 *Witching Culture: Folklore and Neo-Paganism in America*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Mau, Steffen, Jan Mewes and Ann Zimmermann  
2008 *Cosmopolitan Attitudes through Transnational Social Practices*. *Global Networks* 8(1):1-24.
- Maynard, Serge  
2009 *Vivre au Québec selon l'islam: Étude de cas d'une association musulmane montréalaise*, Document de Travail/Working Paper, Groupe de Recherche Diversité Urbaine, Montréal. The online version will be available in 2013 at <http://www.grdu.umontréal.ca/fr/publications-workingpapers.html>, accessed March 13, 2013.
- McGuire, Meredith B.  
2002 *New Old Directions in the Social Scientific Study of religion: Ethnography, Phenomenology and the Human Body*. In *Personal Knowledge and Beyond: Reshaping the Ethnography of Religion*. J.V. Spickard, S. Landres and M. McGuire, eds. Pp 195-211. New York: New York University Press.  
2008 *Lived Religion: Faith and Practice in Everyday Life*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- McKean, Lise  
1996 *Divine Enterprise: Gurus and the Hindu Nationalist Movement*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Meintel, Deirdre  
2012 *Catholicism as Living Memory in a Spiritualist Congregation*. *Quebec Studies*, 52(Fall/Winter):69-86.
- 2011 *Apprendre et désapprendre: quand la médiumnité croise l'anthropologie*. *Anthropologie et sociétés*, 35(3):89-106.
- 2010 *Nouvelles formes de convivialité religieuse au Québec*. In *Dieu Change en Ville*. S. Fath, S. Mathieu and L. Endelstein, eds. Pp. 37-54. Paris: Harmattan.
- 2007 *When There Is No Conversion: Spiritualists and Personal Religious Change*. *Anthropologica* 49(1):149-162.
- 2003 *La stabilité dans le flou: parcours religieux et identités de spiritualistes*. *Anthropologie et sociétés* 27(1):35-64.
- Meintel, Deirdre, and Géraldine Mossière  
2012 *Going through the back door: Studying ethnicity via religion*. In *Where is the field? Exploring migration through the lenses of fieldwork*. H. Snellman and L. Hirvi, eds. Pp. 135-161. Helsinki: Finnish Literature Society.
- 2011 *Reflections on Healing Rituals, Practices and Discourse in Contemporary Religious Groups*. *Éthnologiques* 33(1):19-32.
- Menjivar, Cecilia  
2003 *Religion and Immigration in Comparative Perspective: Catholic and Evangelical Salvadorans in San Francisco, Washington, DC, and Phoenix*. *Sociology of Religion* 64(1):21-45.
- Ministère de l'Immigration et Communautés Culturelles Québec  
2004 *Population immigrée recensée au Québec et dans les régions en 2001: caractéristiques générales*. Québec: Gouvernement du Québec.  
2002 *Tableaux sur l'immigration au 2002. Québec 1997-2001*. Québec: Gouvernement du Québec.
- Mossière, Géraldine  
(Under review) *Réseaux pentecôtistes, activités d'évangélisation, et émotions partagées: un cosmopolitisme de charisme?*  
2012 *Modesty and Style in Islamic Attire: Refashioning Muslim Garments in a Western Context*. *Contemporary Islam* 6(2):115-34.  
2010 *Mobility and Belonging among Transnational Congolese Pentecostal Congregations: Modernity and the Emergence of Socioeconomic Differences*. In *Religion Crossing Boundaries: Transnational Dynamics in African and the New African Diasporic Religions*. A. Adogame and J.V. Spickard, eds. Pp.63-86. Leiden and Boston: E.J. Brill.  
2007 *Emotional Dimensions of Conversion: An African Evangelical Congregation in Montréal*. *Anthropologica* 49(1):113-24.
- Notar, Beth E.  
2008 *Producing Cosmopolitanism at the Borderlands: Lonely Planetiers and "Local" Cosmopolitans in Southwest China*. *Anthropological Quarterly* 81(3):615-650.
- Ossman, Susan  
2006 *Beck's Cosmopolitan Vision or Plays on Nation*. *Ethnos* 71(4):559-568.
- Pew Research Center  
2008 *U.S. Religious Landscape Survey*. Washington, DC: Pew Research Center.

- Putnam, Robert D. and David E. Campbell  
 2010 *American Grace: How Religion Divides and Unites Us*. New York: Simon and Schuster.
- Rabinovitch, Shelley TSivia  
 1996 *Spells of Transformation*. In *Magical Religion and Modern Witchcraft*. J.R. Lewis, ed. Pp. 75-92. Albany : State University of New York.
- Roberts, Rosemary  
 2011 *Healing My Body, Healing the Land: Healing as Sociopolitical Activism in Reclaiming Witchcraft*. *Ethnologies* 33(1):239-256.
- Roudometof, Victor  
 2005 *Transnationalism, Cosmopolitanism and Glocalization*. *Current Sociology* 53(1):113-135.
- Schweder, Richard A.  
 2000 *Moral Maps, First World Conceits, and the New Evangelists*. In *Culture Matters*, L.F. Harrison and S.P. Huntingdon, eds. Pp.158-176. New York: Basic Books.
- Statistics Canada  
 2003 *Growth in Islam, Hinduism, Sikhism and Buddhism*, In *2001 Census: Analysis Series. Religions in Canada*. Catalogue no. 96F0030XIE2001015. Minister of Industry, May. P.8. Online: <http://www12.statcan.ca/english/census01/Products/Analytic/companion/rel/canada.cfm#growth>, accessed July 15, 2012.
- Simmel, Georg  
 1997 *The Problem of Religion Today*. In *Essays on Religion*. H.J. Helle, ed., in collaboration with L. Nieder. Pp. 7-19. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Taylor, Charles  
 1994 *The Politics of Recognition*. In *Multiculturalism: Examining the Politics of Recognition*. A. Gutman, ed. Pp. 25-73. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Tomasi, Luigi  
 2002 *Homo Viator: From Pilgrimage to Religious Tourism Via the Journey*. In *From Medieval Pilgrimage to Religious Tourism: The Social and Cultural Economics of Piety*. William H. Swatos, Jr., and Luigi Tomasi, eds. Pp. 1-24. Westport, CT: Praeger.
- 1998 *Pilgrimage/Tourism*. In *Encyclopedia of Religion and Society*. W.H. Swatos and P. Kvisto, eds. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press. Available online at <http://hrr.hartsem.edu/ency/Pilgrimage.htm>, accessed March 13, 2013.
- Turner, Edith  
 1994 *A visible Spirit Form in Zambia*. In *Being Changed by Cross-cultural Encounters; the Anthropology of Extraordinary Experience*. J.-G. Goulet and D. Young, eds. Pp. 71-95. Peterborough: Broadview Press.
- 1996 *The Hands Feel It: Healing and Spirit Presence among a Northern Alaskan People*. DeKalb, IL: Northern Illinois University Press.
- Vertovec, Steven  
 2009 *Cosmopolitanism in Attitude, Practice and Competence*. MMG Working Papers, Göttingen, Germany: Max Planck Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnic Diversity.
- Warner, R. Stephen, and Judith G. Wittner  
 1998 *Gatherings in Diaspora: Religious Communities and the New Immigration*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Werbner, Pnina  
 2007 *Intimate Disciples in the Modern World: The Creation of Translocal Amity among South Asian Sufis in Britain*. In *Sufism and the "Modern" in Islam*. M. Van Bruinessen and J.D. Howell, eds. Pp. 195-216. London: I.B. Taurius and Co.
- 2006 *Vernacular Cosmopolitanism. Theory, Culture and Society*, 23(2-3):496-498.
- 1999 *Global Pathways: Working Class Cosmopolitans and the Creation of Transnational Ethnic Worlds*. *Social Anthropology* 7(1):17-35.
- Wikan, Unni  
 1991 *Toward an Experience-Near Anthropology*. *Cultural Anthropology* 6(3):285-305.
- Wilkinson, Michael  
 2006 *The Spirit Said Go: Pentecostal Immigrants in Canada*. New York: Peter Lang.
- Williamson, Lola  
 2010 *Transcendent in America. Hindu-inspired Meditation Movements as New Religion*. New York: New York University Press.
- Wuthnow, Robert  
 2007 *America and the Challenges of Religious Diversity*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.