

from agriculture toward domestically related activities. Part of its legacy, however, was to provide accumulated experience on which Allpachiqueños could draw when seeking a future under their own control (p. 92).

In chapter 6, "Developing People: Gender and the Turn to Individuals as Foci of Development," Vincent shifts her focus from projects to individuals. She explores the effects of gendered development on Allpachiqueños women and the subsequent reordering of local relations along gender lines. Using the experience of local recipients such as Tomasa, a woman involved in several local projects, the author argues that projects aimed at women tend to emphasize female domesticity at the expense of other important women's roles, including farming (pp. 99–102). Programs focusing on female leadership and organized through women's collectives may not provide more power to women. The author argues that although these projects help women to acquire political mobilization skills, their managerial bent often ends up being interpreted by women in clientelistic ways (p. 107), which makes Andean women vulnerable to outside manipulation.

Chapter 7, "NGOs, Infrastructure Projects, and Commodification," centres on the labour demands large-scale infrastructural projects put on local residents. To illustrate this point, the author uses the cases of an early electrical project and a more recent water project that took place in the 2000s. Both of these initiatives were based on a neoliberal model of development, which promoted self-help through collective mobilization to reduce costs for the state. After presenting diverse local viewpoints, Vincent comes to the conclusion that these projects have generated internal class-like divisions (p. 131) and conflicting understanding on the value of labour power (p. 132). Because the contribution of the residents is usually not acknowledged as cost, infrastructural projects tend to burden residents with heavy demands and lead to increased labour commodification. Such projects also encourage abuse of unpaid forms of collective labour mobilization, such as the Andean communal faenas, a traditional form of labour organization.

In chapter 8, "Participatory Budgeting: Accounting, Accountability, and Politics," the author discusses the role of the state as a major source of development funds through municipal participatory budgeting. Participatory budgeting is a form of top-down decentralization, which outlines the responsibilities of citizens while limiting their role (p. 139). For Vincent, the rigidity of formal dictates subverts public input into resource spending; it generates local frustrations and also promotes uneven and contradictory integration into capitalism (p. 154).

Chapter 9, "Conclusion: Immanent Development in Capitalism," deals with how people's experience of past projects becomes their accumulated knowledge to change their circumstances, seen by the author as the product of historical struggle. The particularities of responses, Vincent argues, are framed by the priorities and limits dictated by the state and outside agencies, and shaped by knowledge people have acquired through past experience of struggles.

*Dimensions of Development* is both scholarly and stimulating. Tightly organized, very carefully drafted, it is a fine piece of work that provides a lucid analysis of some very complex issues generated by capitalism and international development. Allpachiqueños are portrayed as individuals trying to strategize their efforts within constraining circumstances, and their capacity to navigate through these challenges offers a valuable

lesson in perseverance. Its contribution is significant to anthropological study in the Andean region and will prove useful and provocative to those concerned with development anywhere.

---

**Rudnyckyj, Daromir**, *Spiritual Economies: Islam, Globalization and the Afterlife of Development*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2010, 289 pp.

Reviewer: Janice Newberry  
Lethbridge University

The relationship between Islam and globalization, although not a new one, has inspired some excellent ethnographic and theoretical work recently, perhaps especially in Southeast Asia, which is often overlooked in current political debate in North America and Europe. Daromir Rudnyckyj's *Spiritual Economies* adds to this growing canon with a fieldwork-based analysis of a popular human resources program known as Emotional and Spiritual Quotient (ESQ) and its use at Krakatau Steel, a state-owned factory in the province of Banten located at the western tip of the island of Java. Rudnyckyj's focus is how this spiritual training exemplifies the workings of neoliberal rationality in the post-Suharto era. By considering how this popular program is used by Krakatau to deal with the changing market position of the company, he is able to contrast the bright post-independence promise of state-led industrialization with the changed circumstances of a newly democratic and decentralized Indonesia post-1997. He contrasts the Suharto-era faith in development to a more recent post-9/11 desire to develop faith. In this respect, Rudnyckyj considers both the local context of Banten's special role as an industrial zone and as a province with a rather particular Islamic and trading history. His analysis includes the larger context of shifting trading and manufacturing regimes in the current phase of globalization affecting Indonesia. The attention to Banten's role and its pre-colonial, colonial and post-independence roles is fascinating and an important addition to the ethnographic scholarship on Indonesia.

Rudnyckyj firmly situates his analysis in the governmentality literature and the production of particular subjectivities. He draws inspiration from classics such as Weber's Protestant work ethic and Hirschmann's attention to self-interest and its reconciliation with collective interest. Yet, his emphasis is clearly on recent theoretical treatments of regulation, accountability, audit culture and the production of selves through particular global practices as he describes it. His attention to the growth in human resources management in Indonesia is especially good, highlighting the importance of these programs as Indonesia has shifted toward more flexible forms of production and governance. Rudnyckyj's ethnography is notably strong when he takes the reader to an ESQ session where the intensely choreographed performance produces a moment of conversion and collective effervescence. The voices of those transformed in these sessions, where they are asked to confront their own death, provide an excellent window onto current Indonesian tensions and coherencies. He follows this thread through attention to emotion and affect and its governance through these evangelistic seminars aimed at self-improvement.

Rudnyckyj makes an argument that ESQ is an example of spiritual reform undertaken to solve several dilemmas in post-Suharto Indonesia, including the failures of a “blind faith” in development and the corruption of those middle-class workers who benefitted most from Krakatau and New Order state-led industrialization. ESQ provides a way to reconcile an invigorated Muslim identity post-9/11 with Islamic science and with technical progress. As such, Rudnyckyj’s work is directly aimed at a middle class whose initial success has stalled and is seeking in some sense to mend its identity in a post-development world. His attention to the developer of ESQ, Ary Ginanjar, is another interesting window on current Indonesia. For many familiar with Indonesia, Ginanjar may appear as a manifestation of a general pattern of Indonesian hucksterism, but Rudnyckyj uses the felicitous emergence of ESQ to identify the convergence of desires to reinterpret Islam in the current age, the reinvention of industry in a neoliberal era and the appeal of self-help in Indonesia at the present moment. It is this entry point that allows him to explore how affect and neoliberal forms of governmentality produce new subjects.

Rudnyckyj’s work also adds to the growing list of scholars who consider the Islamic counter to neoclassical economics in the Western tradition. The dictates of Islamic banking, for example, have been used to consider the banking crisis in the West as well as how an Islamic ecumene is reforming finance in parts of the world (Maurer 2005). Rudnyckyj’s work provokes questions not only about how Islam is being constituted in Indonesia among middle-class factory employees but also about what kind of an economy is produced or, more to the point, what we mean by economy.

Beginning with his treatment of Islam in Indonesia, Rudnyckyj’s insights into some of the specifics of how it has become a powerfully renewed force for identity in post-New Order Indonesia are significant, not only for illustrating how Islam functions as an anti-Western machine but also for the intricacies of its invocation through class, geography and history. One thread in the book is the idea that individual achievement and responsibility, as promoted by ESQ, can be promoted by conceptualizing labour as appropriate religious practice. The sections devoted to how the ESQ program combines a universalist, humanitarian Islam with science, physics and math are particularly instructive. Calculating selves are produced as ESQ followers identify mathematical equations to demonstrate Allah’s perfection and the Qur’an’s depiction of the big bang. As Rudnyckyj says, “I argue that in contemporary Indonesia, Islam is invoked to elicit subjects complicit with norms of efficiency, productivity, and transparency. In diagramming this spiritual economy, I show how Islam serves as a medium through which subjects of spiritual reform are made accountable to themselves, their families, their work, and the nation at large” (p. 139).

Even so, Rudnyckyj’s treatment of Islam is not especially comprehensive, nor does it explore the varieties of Islam in Indonesia. The lack of attention to other sources of individualism such as Sufi Islam is a bit perplexing given his focus on how individualization of responsibility through religion is commensurate with neoliberalism. Beginning with Weber perhaps has kept him from foregrounding Islamic approaches to the individual. More telling for anthropologists of religion, Rudnyckyj spends little time analyzing the ritual of conversion, which surely is at the core of the ESQ experience when partic-

ipants are put to physical and emotional stress to produce a specific and significant experience of unity and identification. ESQ is immediately reminiscent of Erhard Seminars Training (EST); after all, these California seminars of the 1970s intended to produce the same kind of breakthrough by breakdown. It seems a tendency to focus narrowly keeps Rudnyckyj from looking laterally in ways that might have been productive. For example, in terms of the mediation of scientific progress through religion, Chatterjee’s (1989) older work on this issue in India would have been a fruitful addition.

Perhaps Rudnyckyj missed this reference because it has been widely used to consider gender differences in colonial and post-colonial settings. While Rudnyckyj’s attention to the middle class and its recalibration in post-Suharto Indonesia adds important ethnographic detail, one wonders at the near exclusive and unremarked focus on males. As someone who has worked on the role of Javanese women’s informal sector labour in national development, both before and after Suharto, I was especially interested to read this distaff analysis. Yet, Rudnyckyj does not share this interest in the substantive and relational aspects of Indonesia’s economy. In fact, he does not cite one of the key texts on factory labour in Indonesia, Wolf’s (1992) *Factory Daughters*, a rather stunning oversight—one that is likely explained as much by his approach to economy as to gender.

Rudnyckyj follows current fashion in approaching the economy as a political rationality, which Foucault called governmentality. That is, the economy is a “technology for eliciting certain types of subjects and practices” (p. 138). Governmentality has proven to be a robust approach to understanding governance and globalization in anthropology. Yet, Rudnyckyj’s lack of attention to the literature on community and family in Indonesia has produced more than one blind spot in his ethnography. Other equally robust approaches to economy would have made this neglect more difficult. Considering, for example, how labour is produced as a social formation or the role of reciprocity in exchange would have made it harder to narrow economy to subjectivity alone. Governmentality tends to swallow all other analysis, which can lead us to neglect some of the most powerful and influential work in anthropology.

Even so, Rudnyckyj’s ethnography is an important contribution to the work on Indonesia, Southeast Asia and globalization. His attention to ethnographic textures that surround these emergent practices of self-improvement and self-management in post-Suharto Indonesia identifies both continuities and changes in development and faith in the most recent era of globalization. Rudnyckyj’s ethnography is accessible and would be useful in upper division undergraduate and graduate courses.

## References

- Chatterjee, Partha  
1989 Colonialism, Nationalism, and Colonised Women: The Context in India. *American Ethnologist* 16(4):622–633. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1525/ae.1989.16.4.02a00020>.
- Maurer, Bill  
2005 Implementing Empirical Knowledge in Anthropology and Islamic Accountancy. In *Global Assemblages: Technology, Politics, and Ethics as Anthropological Problems*. Aihwa Ong and Stephen J. Collier, eds. Pp. 214–232. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing.

Wolf, Diane

1992 *Factory Daughters: Gender, Household Dynamics, and Rural Industrialization in Java*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

---

**Linda Scarangella McNenly**, *Native Performers in Wild West Shows: From Buffalo Bill to Euro Disney*, Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2012, 254 pages.

*Reviewer: Lynda Mannik  
Memorial University*

*Native Performers in Wild West Shows* moves past a litany of excellent histories concerning the global influence of Wild West shows to create a “revisionist history” that begins in the late 19th century and ends in 2005. It also looks at various types of Wild West performances that took place around the world, including contemporary examples in Paris at Euro Disney and mock Wild West shows called Buffalo Bill Days in Sheridan, Wyoming. Anthropologist Linda Scarangella McNenly focuses on Native performer’s experiences and perspectives that are suggested in archival materials and articulated in contemporary interviews with the intention of explaining how Canadian and American Native participants interacted with dominant society through this venue to produce subjective social meanings. Her revisionist history is intended to provide an examination and a re-examination of cultural, social and political expressions of Native identity and agency. Considering the span of both time and place, this is a challenging undertaking.

Scarangella McNenly adopts Mary Pratt’s well-used concept of “contact zone” as a space that allows for negotiations of power within a colonial context. The idea of the contact zone has been employed by anthropologists and historians frequently in discussions of North American fairs, powwows and rodeo competitions as a way of understanding how indigenous peoples have negotiated social identities and acted as political agents. Most recently, Mary Ellen Kelm (2011) used this concept to weave together a holistic view of rodeo in Canada as a space where new identities and new relationships between indigenous and settler communities were crafted, contested and negotiated. Scarangella McNenly’s adds Ortner’s emphasis on “practice theory” to allow for an examination of such processes through discourses and representations, and to clarify how free will and intentions are part of webs of power structures and relationships. Multi-sited research is employed as a way to facilitate her “research pathway,” which is based on “an experience” that cuts across places, ethnicities, archival records (including print media), oral narratives and personal accounts. This book is organized as a series of case studies and is intended to “examine processes, encounters, and relationships through time and space.”

Chapters 1 through 4 focus on Wild West performances and productions in the late 19th century and the early 20th century, ending with a brief overview of the Miller Brothers’ 101 Ranch, last produced in 1932. Chapter 1 provides a fleeting introduction into the basics of American Wild West shows as an international sensation, where the performance of imperialism disseminated ideas about race, progress and indigenous peoples alongside world’s fairs, museums displays and dime

store novels. Chapter 2 and the remaining chapters follow a similar pattern: the first section of each uses archival sources and popular media to explain the context of Native participation, and the closing section brings “forward Native performers’ perspectives and experiences to explore how they engaged with and negotiated these encounters.” Chapter 2 looks at American Wild West shows as employers and Native performers as employees. Scarangella McNenly realizes her intention of providing Native perspectives on historic experiences through archived letters, show programs and personal memoirs to outline the reasons why Native performers wanted to work in Wild West shows, including work for work’s sake, monetary advantage and travel. Chapter 3 explores Wild West shows as performances of identity juxtaposing stereotypical representations of exotic cowboys and Indians in various forms of Western print media with “warrior identity” created by Native participants. The bulk of this chapter emphasizes how agency is expressed through dance, song and clothing. Here, Native perspective is evidenced primarily through previous scholarly literature, memoirs and a brief photographic analysis. Chapter 4 adds Native voices to this historic record through oral narratives that Scarangella McNenly collected in 2004. This case study features members of three Mohawk families who performed in a variety of venues; most interesting is the Deer Family Wild West show, which performed internationally in the early 20th century. This chapter, in particular, would have benefited from a clearer explanation of visual anthropological methods due to its reliance on the relationship between photography and memory.

The last two chapters, which I would argue are the most thought-provoking, move ahead to fieldwork research that took place in 2005. Chapter 5 highlights the perpetuation of stereotypes at Buffalo Bill’s Wild West show at Euro Disney in Paris. After a brief overview of the contemporary Disneyfication of activities—such as buffalo hunting, rodeo and stagecoach racing—that spectacularize noble savage stereotypes, it moves into an interesting conversation about the challenges experienced by Native performers from Canada and the United States in this venue. For them, agency is not defined as “resistance to dominant power, but as the pursuit of one’s own goals and intentions.” Conflicts between representation and identity are central to this conversation. Chapter 6 considers the construction of contemporary “Nativity” at one of many Wild West show re-creations that are continually being performed across the United States. Conversations with performers at Buffalo Bill Days in Sheridan, Wyoming, not only spotlight agency but, moreover, control over performances and, consequently, expressions of identity. Dancing, music and regalia provide educational entertainment that does not conform to Western ideals but emphasizes cultural continuity, survival, skills and knowledge.

Scarangella McNenly concludes by providing an overview of the threads that link this series of case studies, such as similarities in the ways Native identity is expressed through dance, song and dress. This book’s integrity would have benefited from a more determined stress on these links throughout. Even though Scarangella McNenly clearly explains her views on pan-Indianness—that these expressions are suitable for touristic cultural performances and do not “replace tribal identities”—a clearer differentiation between Canadian and American experiences in chapters 4 and 5 would have added to her investigations into the Canadian Native experience