

fall of 1991, 8 years after Marshall was acquitted by the Nova Scotia Court of Appeal for the murder of Sandy Seale, and the meeting would precipitate a romantic relationship between McMillan and Marshall that continued for the next 13 years. Donald Marshall Jr passed away in 2009, and in a sense *Truth and Conviction* chronicles McMillan's own life with Marshall on the heels of the Royal Commission's sobering conclusions on discrimination in the administration of justice, as well as the violence of what McMillan calls the "failure of justice" that Marshall and his family experienced, which ultimately led to the community's assertion of Mi'kmaw treaty rights and the Mi'kmaw Nation's ongoing efforts to implement recommendations of the Marshall Inquiry toward self-determination.

Central to the narrative is an awareness of what McMillan calls the "rawness of discrimination" and the extent to which, in her words, "rage-infused racism" occurs in the Canadian justice system. McMillan describes both realisations in terms of her life with Marshall and his family, and her status as an "ally in the fight for Mi'kmaw rights" (p. 6). In retelling Marshall's journey and experiences, McMillan seeks to foster an awareness in Canadian society both of colonial forms of oppression and resistance and resilience to them, as well as the consequences of imposing a foreign system of justice. She asks: How can a pluralised legal system, one with different systems within a single geographic region, nation or population, counter five centuries of cultural genocide? Which traditional justice practices might address systemic discrimination against Indigenous peoples? Most fundamentally, who decides what is or isn't traditional? Each question draws attention to the intersection of power, knowledge and space, all also central to the challenges of colonial practices in higher education and academia.

McMillan is well positioned to speak to issues of power, privilege and knowledge-making in the academy and Canadian society more broadly. She is Associate Professor of Anthropology at St Francis Xavier University in Nova Scotia, and a former Canada Research Chair, which is a prestigious title (with accompanying ample research funds) awarded to professors to promote excellence in research. Given that the Canadian justice system recognises academics and often calls upon them as experts on Indigenous history and culture in support of the Crown's arguments (on this see von Gernet 2002; Daniels 2016), some readers might want to examine more deeply linkages between higher education and the legal system to better understand how particular social groups make and maintain knowledge and continue to occupy positions of power that impact Indigenous peoples in Canada.

McMillan acknowledges the centrality of the findings of the Royal Commission in the revitalisation of Mi'kmaw legal consciousness and the commission's role in shedding much-needed light on inequalities in the criminal justice system. She is critical, however, of the decision's oversight regarding the rights of Mi'kmaw persons who are "not ordinary citizens" (p. 48). As McMillan remarks, Mi'kmaws become "citizens with constitutionally recognized special rights under section 35 [of the *Constitution Act, 1982*]" (p. 48). On the one hand, McMillan is right about the commission's shortcomings, and yet she does not cast the same critical lens on constitutional recognition based on colonial policy. For example, one might question how "Indian status" is granted and by whom it is granted. One might question how status protects particular hunting rights, for example, while obscuring other rights, such as property

rights, in ways that are meant to disadvantage Indigenous peoples, particularly Indigenous women. One might consider the impact that decades and years of deliberate family disruption has had on social organisation as well as on knowledge-making and cultural heritage, including intangible traditional cultural practices of the Mi'kmaw Nation.

McMillan only briefly discusses the role of the Black United Front and the Union of Nova Scotia Indians alongside Mi'kmaw organisations in supporting public inquiries and pushing for greater scrutiny of racial bias in the criminal justice system and in Nova Scotia law (p. 48). Lived social realities of Mi'kmaw and Black persons and their experience of law are spurring interest in addressing systematic problems. Bringing change will require not only the support of organisations dedicated to legal reform, but also an awareness by all Canadians as well as their political will to see through such changes. *Truth and Conviction* offers a first step to anyone so inclined.

References

- Daniels v Canada (Indian Affairs and Northern Development)*, [2016] 1 SCR 99, 2016 SCC 12.
- Royal Commission on the Donald Marshall, Jr., Prosecution (NS), and T.A. Hickman. 1989. *Royal Commission on the Donald Marshall, Jr., Prosecution: Digest of Findings and Recommendations*. Halifax, NS: Lieutenant Governor in Council by the Royal Commission on the Donald Marshall, Jr., Prosecution.
- von Gernet, A. 2002. *The Early History of Lobster Harvesting among Natives and Newcomers in Atlantic Canada*, vol. 1. Ottawa: Department of Justice Canada.

Shulist, Sarah, *Transforming Indigeneity: Urbanization and Language Revitalization in the Brazilian Amazon*, Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2018, 241 pages.

Eric S. Henry
Saint Mary's University

Like its biodiversity, the linguistic diversity of the Amazon is under threat. In her ethnography of São Gabriel da Cachoeira, a place that calls itself "the most Indigenous city in Brazil" (p. 3), Sarah Shulist examines the strategies, politics and ideologies of language revitalisation practices. She skilfully weaves together descriptions of educational pedagogies, government language policies, community activism and the everyday experiences of families and individuals struggling to preserve their ethnolinguistic identities. One of the key features of her research setting – which sets it apart from other studies that are tightly focused on clearly defined and bounded social groups – is the highly diverse, multi-ethnic and multilingual population of the city. People have migrated to São Gabriel from across the northwest Amazon, spawning an urban population, 85 percent of which identifies as Indigenous, that speaks a range of different languages spread across five separate Indigenous language families. In 2002, three of the most widely spoken Indigenous languages in São Gabriel were granted official status at the municipal level, meaning that Tukano, Baniwa and Nheengatú have, in theory, equal status to

Portuguese in the provision of public services and education. Still, this policy of co-officialisation is widely perceived to have failed, a view that overshadows the entire discourse of revitalisation and Indigenous identity in the city.

Divided into six chapters and a conclusion, Shulist's ethnography provides a good overview of current issues in research on Indigeneity, language revitalisation and social change in the Amazon. At each turn, Shulist questions the assumptions, ideologies and disjunctures that accompany most anthropological work on these topics, and indeed, in a later chapter, the very groundwork of linguistic documentation. While Indigenous identity is most often recognised through ties to the land – residence in isolated rural settlements in the case of Amazonia – Shulist's informants are urban. While language revitalisation strategies typically presume a small, cohesive community of aspiring speakers, residents of São Gabriel may live in different neighbourhoods from other speakers of their language. While the household is usually presumed to be the main site for intervention when speakers are shifting from one language to another, Shulist highlights how linguistic exogamy, an Amazonian practice whereby people usually marry someone from a different linguistic background, creates tensions and complexities surrounding the question of which language(s) will be used in the home. All of this makes for a compelling narrative of the struggles Indigenous people in São Gabriel experience in their efforts to define themselves and claim their place in Brazilian society.

Chapters 1 and 2 outline the theoretical frameworks, regional histories and urban setting for *Transforming Indigeneity*. Chapter 3 discusses the history of co-officialisation and its impacts on the city. Although on its face the policy has utterly failed (the constantly rotating military, medical and colonial personnel from other parts of Brazil have no desire to speak the languages, the policy plays only a minor role in the education system, and even where texts in these languages are posted in public, most people are unable to read them), Shulist argues that the impacts of the policy go far beyond straightforward language maintenance. Rather, the policy, borne out of collective action by local Indigenous activists, has legitimised the public use of Indigenous languages and, by extension, opposed national narratives of Indigenous peoples as a stigmatised population. "Indigenous people," Shulist writes, "must confront the default assumption that the public space is non-Indigenous. A principal way in which the language policy is discursively invoked is as a counter to this image – that is to say, it offers speakers permission to use their languages outside the home by defining them as legally belonging to that space" (p. 69). This goal, which Shulist dubs "valorization," underlies a range of initiatives that are ostensibly aimed solely at language revitalisation.

Chapter 4 discusses how Indigenous languages have been incorporated into schooling, particularly Nheengatú, which, because it is not strongly associated with any one ethnic group, has emerged as an Indigenous lingua franca in the region. Despite the best efforts of educators and administrators, however, language education has had little impact on the speaking abilities of students. Children receive only one hour a week of language instruction in a handful of local schools, while teaching materials and pedagogical training are in short supply. Moreover, the goal of most administrators is not to produce a new generation of fluent speakers – Nheengatú, after all, isn't

even the most widespread Indigenous language in the city – but to valorise public symbols of Indigenous identity and vitality. This leads, in Chapter 5, to an exploration of the struggle by one group of non-official-language speakers, the Kotiria, to open their own school. The valorisation strategy, Shulist argues, encourages a pan-Indigenous identity in opposition to the colonial state, but at the same time marginalises speakers of smaller Indigenous languages that do not receive the same level of attention and support. In contrast, the Kotiria advance a discourse of their own unique cultural identity framed in terms of their language.

In the final and most important chapter, Shulist articulates a new vision of scholarly collaborations with Indigenous communities and language activists. This perspective is critical for any who wish to take the concept of decolonisation seriously because, as she points out, many research projects (including her own, initially) fail to account for the complex desires and motivations of the communities in which they are based. Academic linguists may take language documentation as their goal, with the desired outcome being a formal dictionary and grammar, but that goal automatically biases scholars toward rural, monolingual communities with stable linguistic repertoires. And while scholars may applaud regional language variation, Indigenous language speakers in São Gabriel require a standardised variety and orthography for language teaching in schools. Indeed, the chapter goes on to argue that language revitalisation practices need to be considered in light of social issues, including poverty, suicide, domestic and sexual violence, alcohol abuse and so on. Linguistic perspectives that focus solely on language and do not take account of the social context in which they are embedded are likely to fail.

As Shulist argues, language revitalisation in São Gabriel challenges many conventional ideologies and research practices. This forces scholars to grapple with seemingly basic questions like: What is a language? How do we define "the community" of its speakers? Who determines what the goals and methods of language revitalisation should be? It is only when we have answered such questions that we, as scholars, can collaborate with communities to advocate for their languages.

Aside from being an excellent ethnography of the politics of language and Indigeneity in Amazonia, it is this template for action that constitutes the real contribution of the book. Although one could wish for a slightly deeper dive into the literature on topics like education, Indigeneity and urbanisation, and at times the voices of individual informants are muted, *Transforming Indigeneity* is a landmark study of language revitalisation that breaks new ground by probing the links between Indigenous languages and identity.

Singh, Sagar, *The Anthropology of Love and Tourism*, Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2019, 223 pages.

Brittany Schaefer
University of Guelph, Guelph

The Anthropology of Love and Tourism is prepared for those who wish to navigate the field of tourism studies. The author presents snippets of his own research in India alongside meticulously compiled research from an array of disciplines in