

that has been modified within the traditions and conventions of northwest coast potlatch economics. This rich ethnography describes the way in which the northwest coast artware industry has been transformed over more than one hundred years into “an Indigenous-led effort to harness capitalist means of production, distribution, and consumption for the purposes of cultural and economic sovereignty” (17).

Roth’s is an original view of the northwest art market in Vancouver, British Columbia, which draws on fieldwork in Vancouver between 2006 and 2013. It is a contemporary, urban and business ethnography that revisits and reinvestigates topics found in earlier ethnographic work on potlatching and rank. With fieldwork that consisted of visiting with artists and business owners and attending exhibition openings and artist talks, Roth has produced a nuanced understanding of the interplay between artware production and distribution. In writing and researching as Roth does, Vancouver emerges as a hub for northwest coast artware.

The book depends on two highly elaborated and carefully deployed terms: *artware* and *culturally modified capitalism*. Artware is a catch-all term for a wide range of products that could be left blank but are, in this case, adorned with northwest coast motifs (9). These items are found in tourist shops and galleries, and are different but not entirely separate from art. Culturally modified capitalism refers to “the encounter between a capitalist market and the desire to protect culturally specific values and practices [that] results in an economic system that remains recognizably capitalist and yet bears the marks of transformation by local worldviews” (5). Roth points to parallels with culturally modified trees, an iconic marker of Indigenous presence and identity in many parts of the northwest coast. Just as a tree is modified by Indigenous Peoples through the harvesting and use of its wood and bark, the northwest coast artware market is modified by northwest coast economic and cultural practices; in both cases, changes perpetuate “Indigenous cultural heritage and ways of life” (173) As Roth shows, the economic tensions of production and protection, as well as consumption and preservation are epitomised by the artware market. Taken together, a strategic approach to cultural and economic continuity is illustrated.

Incorporating Culture has five chapters framed by an introduction and conclusion. Each chapter engages with a pair of ideas that points to the larger interplay of the local and global as well as the subtleties of capitalism in its conventional and modified forms. Chapter 1 tells of the participants in the artware industry, investigating topics including trust, racism, networked relationships and, drawing on the work of Anna Tsing, frictions within the industry.

Chapter 2 offers a fascinating presentation of the history of the artware market, describing the expansion of artware production in context of the history of twentieth-century colonialism in Canada and the efforts of the state to make Indigenous Peoples into better capitalists. The shift over time toward a greater inclusion of the interests of Indigenous stakeholders is an important observation.

Chapter 3 pairs the global and local and observes that the artware market indexes place and identity for Indigenous and non-Indigenous peoples alike. Chapter 4 delves into the mechanics of the artware market to discuss notions of property and contracts, and stewardship and relationships, all of which

point, once again, to competing and complementary interests stemming from Indigenous modifications of capitalist activities.

Chapter 5 is notable for its lengthy discussion of accumulation and redistribution as markers of potlatch economics and the implications of those processes for understanding the pressures on artists and business to “give back” and to “make one’s name good” within their communities. Indeed, through the book, central concepts within northwest coast economic practices are explained and shared. These include reciprocity, redistribution, witnessing and potlatching. The intellectual context draws on the substantial use of northwest coast scholarship and contemporary theorising around terms like *refusal*, *friction* and *ethnicity*.

Roth’s book complicates our understanding of cultural appropriation. The author draws helpful parallels and comparisons: for example, she observes that the artware business, and its history of appropriation of artistic styles and ideas, is similar to current extractions and appropriations within natural resource industries. The book tells a history of northwest coast art to be sure, but it is also a business ethnography of buying and selling, accumulation and distribution. It describes the components of an industry that would likely be unexpected by the consumers of the artware.

This is a fine ethnography told in a personal tone. Roth is present throughout the book, guiding readers through the ideas and the networks that shape the artware industry. The work is a provocative take on classic anthropological themes, and it makes me think differently about the northwest coast-branded items I have in my office and home. This work is researched and written in the spirit and tradition of northwest coast ethnography, and regional specialists will undoubtedly appreciate it. Art-oriented and economic anthropologists will as well.

Incorporating Culture provides a model for thinking about similar issues more widely within Canada. It will resonate with those interested in the confluence of Indigenous artware and tourist souvenir markets throughout the world. And Roth’s discussion of culturally modified capitalism would fit well in a lecture for an introductory course in anthropology. The book provides, for example, a new appreciation for the way in which potlatch and redistribution principles have been refashioned. All readers will benefit from time spent with this well-told story of cultural adaptation and change, particularly because it refutes notions of Indigenous erasure and, instead, emphasises Indigenous resiliency.

Gagné, Karine. *Caring for Glaciers: Land, Animals, and Humanity in the Himalayas*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2019, 231 pages.

Deepti Chatti
Humboldt State University

Karine Gagné’s *Caring for Glaciers* is an eloquent ethnographic exploration of how ethics and morality are cultivated through the everyday practices of living in the high desert of Ladakh in the Indian Himalayas. Emphasising the ongoing cultivation of ethical selfhood against the backdrop of two dramatic threads of change in Ladakh – post-colonial state formation and climate

change – Gagné argues that the seemingly mundane activities of farming, herding and living on the fraught border between India and China are the foundations for a Ladakhi sense of ethical self. Based on arduous fieldwork conducted through the freezing winter in the high Himalayas, Gagné explores how people in Ladakh make sense of the vast biophysical, cultural, economic and political changes that they have experienced in the past few decades and argues that multiple and simultaneous forces of change have transformed the moral order of Ladakhi life. She traces these changes over time by foregrounding the voices of the elderly population in Ladakh whose agrarian and pastoralist way of life has been transformed by the increasing militarisation of Ladakh by the post-colonial nation-state of India as a mountain fortress against China. In the span of one or two generations, Ladakhis are discursively and materially transformed from passive and submissive colonial subjects of the British empire to “sentinel citizens” (72), ideal citizen-subjects for guarding the nation-state in the newly created border zone between India and China, in the harsh terrain of Ladakh.

The geopolitical transformation of Ladakh into a militarised border zone accompanies an economic transformation of everyday life from an agrarian and pastoralist economy to one where younger generations migrate to other parts of India, seeking different kinds of education and employment, which means they have less time for and interest in taking care of the family’s herds and fields. This seasonal migration is made possible by the increase in connectivity between Ladakh and the rest of India because of state-led infrastructure development and is driven by the younger generations’ understandably growing economic aspirations and the increasingly difficult subsistence conditions in Ladakh’s high-desert villages. But this increase in connectivity for younger generations also leads Ladakh’s elderly population to experience long, lonely and difficult winters and results in the rapid transformation of Ladakh’s intergenerational family structures. Many of Gagné’s elderly interlocutors report feeling isolated, burdensome and trivial in the new way of life. In parallel, a stark consequence of the changing way of life is the lack of knowledge that the younger generations of Ladakhis have about the mountain landscape, as well as a lack of familiarity with Ladakh’s glaciers, which have hitherto been integral to routine Ladakhi life.

Glaciers, for Gagné’s elderly interlocutors, are not simply a beautiful backdrop to their lives, nor are they seen solely as natural reservoirs of water, integral to the lives and economic well-being of their downstream brethren in the plains of India. They are sites of sociality and places marking happy memories of one’s youth. Glaciers are intimately known through years of herding in the high mountains. They are protected by the proximity to and interaction with their humans, who know them well and care for them by cultivating a sense of moral selfhood in relation to them. Climbing a glacier requires enskilment in the mountains, which involves social relations and requires both physical and mental strength. One of the most memorable sections of the book (and there are many) is the author’s attempt at climbing Shali Kangri, a glacier at high altitude, accessible only through a long and difficult hike. When the author returns to her host’s home after having failed to complete the ascent, she shows an assorted intergenerational crowd of residents the photographs she took on her journey. Gagné realises that except for the older people in the group, few know the glacier with any familiarity, and most do not know the place names or

narratives associated with the trek to the glacier. As Gagné puts it, knowledge of this landscape has become disembodied, transformed within a single generation as the younger people no longer traverse the high mountains in search of pastureland for their herds. According to Gagné’s elderly interlocutors, the affective experience of caring for their livestock in the high desert of Ladakh generated in them an intimate knowledge of their glaciers and resulted in their cultivating a moral sense of self, which caused them to care for their fellow humans, animals and landscapes. Glaciers disappearing is thus a product of a disintegrating way of life that results in people not caring for each other and, consequently, not knowing or caring for their environment. Environmental degradation closely follows a breakdown of a moral order in which people care for each other (the “other” including the non-human).

Caring for Glaciers is Gagné’s first book, but it makes multiple contributions to several bodies of scholarship. First, as an ethnographic analysis of people’s perceptions of environmental change, Gagné’s work joins a growing and important body of scholarship providing another lens into understanding climate change, as an enhancement to understanding climate change through top-down environmental research. Although other forms of climate change research such as global circulation models or economic analyses of impacts are crucial for us to understand how environmental change unfurls at a large scale across space and time, deep ethnographic research, exemplified by Gagné’s work, allow us to understand what a changing climate means to people’s everyday lives and how environmental change affects their changing sense of self. This kind of climate change research allows us to understand what a changing climate actually means to people experiencing it. This book explores people’s relationship to and knowledge of their environments through everyday practices and provides a lens into how climate change is made sense of and explained by people who viscerally experience it through dramatic changes to their familiar landscape – which in this case is surrounded by glaciers.

Second, in foregrounding everyday practices rather than doctrinal teachings, Gagné’s work makes an important contribution to the anthropology of ethics and to scholarship in the Buddhist Himalayas. Gagné argues eloquently that morality is not solely doctrinal; in Ladakh, it is nurtured through relationships with one’s human and non-human family, and through an embodied and sensorial knowledge of one’s landscape. The ethical dispositions of Gagné’s interlocutors are informed by Buddhist doctrinal teachings but are forged most strongly in the practice of everyday life. Gagné’s research centres affect: the affective nature of care for livestock, the affective labour involved in guarding the nation-state in a militarised border zone, and the affective experience of climbing the high mountains.

Third, Gagné’s work shines a brilliant light on the importance of human-landscape relationships in fostering a sense of care for one’s environment. Thus, her work adds a glacial dimension to the posthuman literature that has grown in recent anthropological enquiry.

Divided into six body chapters and bookended by an introduction and conclusion, Gagné’s prose is a delight to read as she weaves careful ethnographic detail into the fabric of vastly different timelines of glaciers melting, the post-colonial state forming, families aging and agrarian seasons changing. By

conducting sustained fieldwork through Ladakh's difficult weather and terrain, Gagné's work enhances the anthropological understanding of South Asia and draws attention to emic understandings of climate change in the Himalayas. For Gagné's interlocutors in Ladakh, climate change is not an external imposition caused by the accumulation of carbon dioxide molecules in the atmosphere. Climate change is caused

by a breakdown of the interpersonal relationships between humans, other humans and non-humans in their world. In highlighting this aspect of her research, Gagné reminds us that care for the environment and care for other humans are inextricably linked.
