profound inequality that the members of a newly insecure middle class find themselves moving to countries that are largely unknown to them. They do so to eliminate their vulnerability in meeting basic human needs: housing, health care and even human intimacy. That is to say, they are pursuing basic relationships of care that have been absent in their North American lives.

In Chapter 1, during a discussion of geoarbitrage, Hayes describes one Floridian couple that celebrates their ability to host dinner parties with a black-tie service staff, while at the same time referring to themselves as "economic refugees" from a place that no longer permits them to stop working if they wish maintain their existing housing, health care and modes of leisure in late life. The couple explicitly compares the costs of living in the United States with living in Cuenca but seems unable to consider the global structures within which such comparisons and translations of value are possible, and why it is that they are in the position to arbitrage while their service staff clearly are not. Part of this, Hayes argues, rests on racialised Euro-American assumptions of difference in which the radical inequality of experience between these two places is imagined to be the outcome of two unrelated natural processes.

Moving forward from his discussions of "gringo" subjectivity and their imaginations of Cuenca and Ecuadorian social life in the opening chapters, in Chapter 4, Hayes examines the relationship between what he calls "global gentrification" and the more specific local processes of gentrification in the historic Spanish colonial centre in Cuenca. This chapter provides insight into how global narratives of heritage circulate along similarly unequal latitudes shaped by histories of colonialism and disregard. Heritage preservation is based around the peculiar commoditisation of spaces generated by the concentrated material remains of prior colonisations. It relies on a romanticisation of colonial space, which seeks to appeal to the nostalgic impulses of both global tourism and migration markets. As such, heritage becomes a social and political project of powerful people that advances at the expense of Ecuadorian working people and traditional users of urban spaces (121).

In Chapter 5, Hayes shifts the reader's attention from urban Cuenca to lifestyle migrants who have settled in rural areas of highland Ecuador. He describes how these migrants inherit a landscape that is appealing for its seemingly natural beauty but is in fact the result of a specific history of private property–oriented land reforms that led to a loss of collective lands and the persistence of wealth and power inequality in the region. This privatised landscape thus becomes a space in which lifestyle migrants, often unwittingly, buy into "reproducing the economic interests of landholders" in the post-hacienda economy (152).

In the conclusion, Hayes takes on a critically nuanced and empathic tone. The lifestyle migrants he has described make their moves out of reasonable desires, he says, "to escape the cultural and economic excess of late capitalist life" (207). For these migrants, life in the United States and Canada was shaped by pressing insecurity and stress. But, he says, in moving along these latitudes of historically produced inequality to seek relief, "they can be the carriers of the very forces they seek to escape" (207). This is a powerful and apt phrasing, one that captures a much broader frustration with the perceived limits of agency in late capitalism. Hayes calls attention here to the extant impulses toward altruism and solidarity in the people he has met and worked with. It seems, as with so many of the "global" problems encountered in a world of ongoing coloniality, that the real political work begins at home. Modes of solidarity and decolonisation that continue the fight for living wages, for access to health care and for secure retirements seem the most immediate course toward less precarity in both Florida and Cuenca. The most troubling aspect of Hayes's ethnographic account, though, is his North American subjects' tendency to read the failures and vulnerabilities of political and economic life in the United States into the places where they have just arrived. Ineffective social support systems, economic precarity and persistent inequality are imagined as unique to Ecuador rather than being the very factors that pushed these migrants to flee the United States.

Gringolandia is a compelling ethnography of the mixed social life of a migrant enclave in Cuenca, but it is also a valuable critical reflection upon the strained social life of aging North Americans under late capitalism.

Heo, Angie. *The Political Lives of Saints: Christian-Muslim Mediation in Egypt*, Oakland: University of California Press, 2018, 294 pages.

Carolyn M. Ramzy
Carleton University

Angie Heo's book *The Political Lives of Saints* deftly threads scholarship across the anthropology of Christianity, Middle East Studies and media theory to highlight how Coptic Christian saints mediate the "interfaith industry of Christian-Muslim relations" in contemporary Egypt (23). In their otherworldly status as mediums between earthly and heavenly realms, Heo examines how Egypt's cult of the saints revolves around a central paradox: in their Orthodox material aesthetics, they can both foster and institute national interfaith unity among their pious believers and Muslim counterparts while simultaneously installing infrastructures of segregation, security and confines of minoritarian belonging for Orthodox Christians. This book is ethnographically grounded in 34 months of field research carried out over multiple trips in a dynamically changing Egypt.

Beginning in 2004, through to the 2011 Arab Uprising, and leading into the revolution's aftermath up to 2015, Heo's ethnography is rich. Her vignettes and interviews take place in various neighbourhoods as well as over denominational, religious and class strata across Cairo and the Delta, reaching also into parts of Sinai and Upper Egypt. Her experiences bring readers into the co-imbrications of Egyptian nationhood and the Coptic Church as they both grapple with territorial dispossession following the 1967 war, anticolonial sentiment beginning in the 1960s, and rising sectarianism beginning in the 1980s and continuing into the present. Her book argues that through the growing tactility of saints' relics, apparitions and icons, Copts have experienced a religious revival that coincides with political repressions and minoritarian regulations by the Orthodox Church and the military-backed Egyptian state. Astutely, Heo also highlights how believers navigate the limits of the church's tenuous entente with the state, paying attention to miracles, apparitions and other holy mediations shared across the porous peripheries of Christianity and Islam in popular religion. In the

end, she concludes that the micropolitics of divine mediations cannot be separated from the Coptic Orthodox Church as an organ of authoritarian rule (14).

The book is organised around three genres of saintly imagination: relics, apparitions and icons. Heo traces saint veneration, visual encounters with the sacred and holy intercessions to their long histories in antiquity as well as modern Egyptian history. How does interacting with the saints, further heightened by their holy and martyr status, create "new problems and possibilities for modern Christian-Muslim coexistence"? Relics, apparition and icons, Heo writes, "offer rich sites for exploring how Orthodox materialities and saint mediations shape the way Christians and Muslims imagine one another" (17).

Heo's conversation about "Relics" (Part 1) begins with the gut-wrenching initiation of "new" martyrs into the Orthodox Church: the funeral of the 24 Copts who died on New Year's Eve in 2011 when a car bomb tore through the Two Saints Church in the delta city of Alexandria. While some scholars tag this incident as one of the sparks that awakened Coptic participation in the 25 January uprising (Iskandar 2013, 5), Heo pays attention to the quotidian ways in which Coptic social imaginaries of martyrdom have long been the basis for Coptic communal belonging and agency. Such narratives normalise the church hierarchy's veneration of the bombing victims' "fleshy parts" as they reached the sixth floor of the church, "anointing the church with the blood of the martyrs" (34). Heo asks, how does the foundational institution of martyrs of the church, remembered and celebrated through the direct encounter with martyrs' bodies, lend power and agency within the internal dynamics of the Orthodox Church? She pays attention to both the communal potentials to limit papal and clerical authority while ushering its members into the church's body politic (43). In other words, Heo looks at power after death and situates a "resurrective agency" (75) from within a Coptic eschatological world view, in which Copts glean power from holy lives and holy deaths.

What happens, then, as these sacred sites exist in borderlands between Egypt's Coptic Christians and Muslims, as saintly mediations offer the dual potential of friendship and alienation (72)? In the next two chapters, Heo follows the makings of Egypt as Holy Land, as pilgrims touch, tour and migrate through Egypt's topography of holy sites and call upon saintly intercessions. Along these routes, Heo looks at a saint commonly shared by Egypt's Christians and Muslims – the Virgin Mary – one who she argues is the most important "national" saint, in drawing out questions around territorial occupation and dispossessions in Egypt's larger post-colonial contexts. Heo's argument is clear: The Egyptian nation-state critically relies on the experiences and imagination of Egypt as a Holy Land to cement a distinct Arab identity in the region following its independence from British rule. In turn, the church has complied, developing its own identity as a specifically Arab Egyptian church, a process that the Coptic Church had historically resisted but came to fully embrace beginning in the 1950s. Relics, then, draw the edges and borders of this imagined holy empire and distance the Orthodox Church from its suspected associations with a "Christian West."

Heo also uses her ethnography of pilgrimage to explore the importance of touch and holy tactilities among interlocutors. Specifically, she examines the movement of *baraka*, or saintly blessing, as it transfers from relics and travels without borders. *Baraka*, she argues, has long permeated religious boundaries and, in acts of friendship, has allowed Muslims access to saintly miraculous centres, holy assimilations, or even the hopes of illicit conversions (87). Beyond its critical role for pilgrims as they "visit" the saints, Heo pays attention to how pilgrims, both in and outside of Egypt, also "see" and experience the saints through televisual "visitations" as a vibrant Coptic satellite television and religious film industry expand notions of Egypt's sacred territoriality. Tactility, she argues, extends itself into mass-mediated sensoriums of holiness that allow for virtual pilgrimages, experiences of the miraculous and apparitions from as far away as Australia, making a Holy Egypt virtually accessible.

It is in "Apparitions" (Part 2) that Heo tackles the slippages of Egyptian sectarianism and nationalism, using her analysis of Egypt's most famous Marian apparitions. As the most widely celebrated national saint, the Virgin Mary has long emerged as an image of Christian-Muslim unity in the face of territorial dispossession. In 1968, one year following the devastating losses of the 1967 Arab-Israeli war, a Marian apparition in the upper-middle-class neighbourhood of Zaytun was seen by thousands, and the figure of light made headlines all over the Arab world. The apparition was widely interpreted as a sign of collective blessing and comfort to Egypt's Christians, Muslims and neighbouring Arab nations in the face of significant land losses for Egypt, Syria and Jordan. Besides the apparition's larger pan-Arab and Egyptian national implications, Heo zeros in on how the mass visuality of holiness, as concomitantly seen by the Muslim majority in the region (123), became a medium of interfaith unity and importantly legitimises Coptic experiences of apparitions that are largely relegated to private and communal spaces.

Heo captures the changed atmosphere of suspicion, sectarian competition and animosity in the country in 2009, following the occurrence of another Marian apparition in the working-class neighbourhood of Warraq. She asks, what accounts for these slippages 40 years later? And what do narratives around Marian apparitions tell us about the ways in which lines of belonging and exclusions are drawn, and how nationhood and sectarianism overlap? A vivid insight into the shifting moods of Coptic visual images of churches and apparitions illuminates how holy territories of national belonging can oscillate to feelings of minoritarian dispossession and sectarian competition. Heo here discusses another form of tactility: visuality and, how for Copts, "seeing" the saints –in this case, the Virgin – foregrounded on a dome of the Coptic Church, "sets into motion the sympathetic transmission of power" (122).

Turning to another kind of reordered appearance, Heo explores how the ontology of modern visual apparitions shapes Coptic navigations of contested spaces – in this case, around the contested and often difficult process of church building (and repair) in Egypt. Like miraculous relics, apparitions and icons, the very materialities of church buildings are believed to be another earthly link to a heavenly realm. But it is also these very materialities, in their potentials to allow for movements across the Christian-Muslim divide and to stake visible space in a majoritarian public sphere, that set up conditions for sectarian dissent.

The book's most valuable contribution is in "Icons" (Part 3): if Coptic churches are "icons of heaven" (117), what happens

as icons challenge public order, further transgress communal boundaries and even inspire conversions? In this final section, Heo investigates the collusion of the Orthodox Church and the state to insulate the Coptic community from its surrounding Muslim society by regulating and hiding miraculous icons and "their owners." As images of holy persons and mediums of ritual, icons mediate saintly power for the embedded saint and believers who identify with them.

In a powerful ethnographic vignette, and one in which she is most frank about the challenges and omissions of fieldwork, Heo follows the story of Samya and her miraculous encounter of Virgin Mary in the delta city of Port Said. When Samya's hands began to exude oil, the church quickly swept her to state security headquarters and then quarantined her behind monastery walls for five years as a consecrated deaconess. In confinement, Samya's hands stopped producing oil, conceding its miraculous power to a Marian icon in her cell, allowing her transfer to a convent closer to her family before her death in 2012. The tactics of hiding women behind the monastery in the name of Christian-Muslim unity is relatively routine, highlights Heo, as the church regularly subjugates the rights of Coptic women for larger communal orders. To this day, Samya's Marian icon continues to exude oil and is tightly regulated to Coptic communal spaces – adding yet another stop to Egypt's topography as Holy Land.

Through interviews, Heo explores the various narratives that released Samya as the "owner" of her own miracles, narratives that displaced her oil-exuding hand with an oil-exuding icon of the Virgin Mary. Heo nods to the various class forces at play around Samya but also pays attention to the historical suspicion and clerical control that have long surrounded female visionaries in the region; as a bishop recounted to Heo, Samya's miraculous hand and body posed a moral and spiritual threat to communal order (190). Heo follows the miracles' narrative making further as the church hierarchy worked to contain any speculations that both the Virgin Mary and Sayyida 'A'isha – Prophet Muhammad's wife – participated in the miracles. Samya even briefly reappeared to the public to affirm the exclusive and sole Christian ownership of the miraculous icon and to contain potential public disorder and confusion. While it is the Marian icon that remains in the public sphere, Samya was quickly forgotten after her death and, despite her story, has not been cast as a public saint.

In the final chapter, Heo brings her arguments full circle and explores the category of "the contemporary saint," the living presence of holiness in the modern era. How are contemporary saints publicly made and "published" into circulation? Importantly, how does the process create social spheres of inclusion and exclusion that revolve around maintaining a "mystical publicity" (212), an interplay between in/visibility, in/sanity and feigned holy foolery? Again, Heo curiously draws from antiquity; like the death masks that ensured the owners safe passage and place in the eternal realm, icons and publications are touchstones to eternally fixating these figures into saints. Saint making also hinges on the prolific publication – another visual tactility – to publicise the saints' previously secret miraculous acts. In the nebulous period between a saint's death and their official canonisation 50 years later, Heo follows the performance practice of secrecy, hidden visibility and shared silences around stories of the miraculous. Following the ethics of a mystical publicity, contemporary saintly canonisation requires a holy "perishing before publishing" (219).

In the anthropology of Christianity, Middle East studies, media studies and even the smaller circles of Coptic studies, *The Political Lives of Saints* offers an important intervention: it outlines the holy promises and perils of Coptic Orthodox saintly materialities in contemporary Egypt. Importantly, it traces the contemporary role of saintly mediations of Christian-Muslims relations leading up to and following the Egyptian uprisings. Its sensitive and thick ethnography makes it an obligatory read for students and scholars learning about the power of quotidian acts of faith and piety in the Middle East as it presses and passes through a pious sensorium. For Egypt's Coptic Christians, touching saintly relics, seeing holy icons, and witnessing miraculous encounters form tactical ontologies – to not only navigate not only the terrible atrocities that make it to the headlines but also the quieter ebb and flow of day-to-day living as Christian minorities in a Muslim majority nation.

Regulated to communal conclaves by both the church and state, the saints and their holy deaths are also critical to Coptic community formation and agency, as Heo follows what happens to the living in the wake of sectarian violence and death. Given the ocular centrality of tactility still structuring wider anthropological and media discourse, Heo's work will pair nicely with sound studies and scholarship of religious auditory tactilities: How does holiness also pass through the sensorium of the ear, complementing the rich material tactility of relics, apparitions and icons, as well as the sonic soundscapes of saints' shrines and holy sites? Importantly, Heo paves the path for further inquiry into the gendered processes of saint making and unmaking in Egypt, and in the region more broadly. Students and academics alike will find rich conversations here and a model ethnography that is candid in the challenges and omissions of capturing the ephemeral materialities of faith. And in the thoughtful inquiries that Heo prompts about faith, belonging and quotidian encounters of the saints, readers will bring their own discerning questions.

References

Iskandar, Adel. 2013. *Egypt in Flux: Essays on an Unfinished Revolution*. Cairo: American University in Egypt.

Selby, Jennifer, Amelie Barras and Lori G. Beaman. *Beyond Accommodation: Everyday Narratives of Muslim Canadians*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2018, 284 pages.

Samuel Victor
University of Cambridge

Beyond Accommodation: Everyday Narratives of Muslim Canadians shares insights from a multidisciplinary study of the quotidian experiences of Muslims in Montreal, Quebec, and St John's, Newfoundland. Rather than focusing primarily on Muslimness as a question of identity, the researchers explore the ways in which their interlocutors experience the mundane and unexceptional moments of daily life. By paying attention to "non-events" (5) such as attending a work party, buying