

de rapports à l'alimentation. L'argumentaire se développe ainsi de façon discrète en privilégiant l'analyse des transformations, observées et discutées à partir de données organisées autour de thèmes choisis, plus souvent qu'autrement, en fonction des référents traditionnels. Des qualités de la nourriture aux principes de commensalité à l'organisation hiérarchique, différents aspects des rapports à l'alimentation sont étudiés dans chacune des entreprises afin de mettre en lumière les différentes mutations qu'ils connaissent.

Les mutations en question se trouvent être les moments forts de l'ouvrage, c'est-à-dire les épisodes où l'auteur prend de front les confrontations entre l'orthopraxie hindoue et les exigences professionnelles des milieux. Par exemple, la question des menstruations traitée à partir des discussions et observations à ce sujet permet une compréhension des plus saillantes de la séparation des sphères professionnelle et domestique. Si les menstruations sont considérées comme étant impures et que cuisiner durant cette période risque de polluer la nourriture, comment cette situation est-elle gérée dans le milieu de travail? La réponse à cette question donne lieu à une élaboration de distinctions toutes nouvelles que je laisse au lecteur de découvrir.

Bien que les pratiques et conceptions traditionnelles soient au cœur de l'ouvrage, le choix des entreprises reflète davantage un intérêt pour la diversité, ce qui ne manque pas d'alimenter l'intérêt ethnographique mais atténue quelque peu la force des conclusions. Par exemple, une entreprise aux orientations aussi particulières que le Centre Kamala Krishnan fournit notamment un regard unique sur le végétarisme occidental en concurrence avec le végétarisme attaché à l'idéal brahmanique. Son projet éducatif, visant la propagation de ses conceptions de la personne saine et de l'alimentation, trace de nouveaux contours au champ des prescriptions alimentaires. Par contre, et comme l'auteur le souligne, cette organisation constitue un phénomène isolé dans le domaine de l'alimentation en Inde. De plus, au sein même de l'entreprise, une seule personne, soit la secrétaire et comptable, suit à la lettre le régime en question. Les autres employées, les dirigeantes et les clients sont dits être en processus de transition. Ce phénomène illustre bien la singularité du milieu et son aspect inusité, rendant le lecteur attentif aux limites et possibles que son étude soulève.

À cheval entre les sphères domestique et professionnelle, ces entreprises de restauration collective donnent un accès privilégié à l'intimité des rapports à l'alimentation en contexte public et organisé que forme l'entreprise. Cet ouvrage détient tous les avantages d'une étude micro-qualitative, soit le traitement des rapports sociaux dans la totalité de ses dimensions données par un contexte, une compréhension du sujet par la complétude de ses données et une approche du particulier qui rend les milieux vivants et ses informateurs—et dans ce cas, les informatrices—familiers. Le revers d'une telle approche pourrait bien être la difficulté à saisir l'ampleur des phénomènes étudiés au sortir de leur contexte. Somme toute, une problématique passionnante, un contexte éclairant et une étude

avertie et bien menée qui ne manquera pas de plaire à tout lecteur gourmand et intéressé à l'Inde contemporaine et aux rebondissements qu'elle connaît.

---

**Arnd Schneider**, *Appropriation as Practice: Art and Identity in Argentina*, New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006, 256 pages.

Reviewer: *Lindsay DuBois*  
*Dalhousie University*

What does it mean when Argentines of European descent take pottery classes in which they aim to reproduce pre-Columbian artefacts? Does fashion photography employing white Argentine models dressed as indigenous people help create a space for indigenous Argentines in the national imagined community? What about fine art incorporating elements of indigenous cultures? In *Appropriation as Practice*, Arnd Schneider considers these and similar questions about how Argentine artists of European descent appropriate indigenism, arguing that artists are at the forefront of "a process of cultural conversion and identity construction" (p. 5). To make these arguments, the book gathers together case studies drawn from a variety of commercial and fine arts, located mostly in Buenos Aires. Three introductory chapters, about Argentine identity, appropriation, and the Argentine art world respectively, are followed by four chapters addressing a variety of types of artistic appropriation and engagement with the indigenous in several media: pottery, graphic and textile design (ch. 4), photography (ch. 5), commercial film (ch. 6) and multimedia fine art (chs. 7 and 8).

Coming to this topic from previous work on immigrant and national identities in urban Argentina, Schneider considers the impact of the appropriation of the indigenous within this larger context. Argentina is a country in which the indigenous has been almost invisible to those at its administrative, economic and symbolic centre in Buenos Aires. (If readers doubt such claims, I can attest from personal experience that some *porteños* assert that Argentina "has no Indians.") In this sense, Argentina provides an interesting comparative case both for those working in other settler societies—like Canada, Australia and New Zealand—and for Latin Americanists more familiar with national contexts where the indigenous figures more prominently, albeit from a position of marginalization. In this respect, Schneider's discussion of the different significances of *criollo* (ch. 1) is helpful and informative. One of the most striking aspects of the Argentine version of *mestizaje*, is that it is not predicated on notions of biological or genetic relatedness; it is about cultural inheritance. Argentines have often seen themselves, and been seen, as the most European of Latin Americans. However, in the context of the steady growth of poverty in Argentina, taking up indigenous themes, symbols, images, or inspiration is understood as part of a process of latinamericanization. When artists reimagine their identities

as tied to aboriginal peoples, they are turning away from the European towards something which they characterize as autochthonous (“*lo nuestro*”), a process Schneider interestingly refers to as “rooting.”

While the book’s subtitle, “Art and Identity in Argentina,” signals Schneider’s interest in how art is involved in producing certain ideas of the nation, the book also addresses the ethnography of art more broadly. He contends that anthropologists have, with some notable exceptions, paid too little attention to the creative processes and practices in which artists engage. Ethnographers, he asserts, have tended more to the observation side of the participant-observation pair. Consequently, they have not concerned themselves with artistic practice and process as fully as they might. The varied case studies he describes demonstrate differing degrees and types of possible participation: from actually making objects, to helping cast indigenous extras for a film or accompanying artists on their exploratory field trips. (There is an appendix on methodology with respect to artistic practices.) As a reader who knows more about Argentina than the anthropology of art, I find this argument convincing. It seems to extend a critique anthropologists often level at cultural studies: that too many authors examine cultural products as if we can read from our own experience what others will make of them. Here Schneider suggests that it is not enough to broaden our consideration of cultural products to a careful study of their reception. We need to also ethnographically examine the creative process, which is, one might note, not just an intellectual process, but also an embodied and a social one.

A third theme Schneider pursues is the analogy between ethnography and art-making on indigenous topics. He notes that both share the problem of communicating about the other. As anthropologists well understand, this is a project which is fraught. He asks where artists get their understandings of the indigenous, examining their research processes. The varied case studies reveal a range of research strategies on the part of the commercial and fine artists he follows: from copying designs from photographs of indigenous pottery, to consultation with indigenous artists and craftspeople, collaborations with anthropologists and field trips quite anthropological in nature.

As for the book’s shortcomings, they are few and minor. Although the book is readable, it would have been nice if the press had engaged a copy editor. Some chapters appear to be adapted from articles originally published in other languages with translations varying in degree of elegance. I was also put off by the treatment of excerpts of fieldnotes (which were formatted like direct quotations) as if they had the status of direct evidence. Schneider’s analysis of appropriation as one of the ways in which cultures connect is suggestive, but I am not entirely convinced by his attempt to link his work to the current (excessive?) academic interest in globalization. Despite a discussion of the relationship of the Argentine art market to international art markets, the study pays too little attention to the political and economic aspects of globalization to be con-

vincing here. On the other hand, I rather like the way Schneider discusses appropriation as a rethinking of the older and outmoded notion of culture contact.

In sum, and as the foregoing suggests, Schneider gives us a lot to think about. I expect the book will be particularly interesting to scholars of appropriation on one hand, and to those engaged in the anthropology of art on the other. As Schneider ably demonstrates, Argentina provides a rich comparative case which scholars better acquainted with other contexts will no doubt find good to think with and against.

---

**Yannick Fer**, *Pentecôtisme en Polynésie française: L'Évangile relationnel*, Geneva : Labor et Fides, 2005, 498 pages.

Reviewer: *Deirdre Meintel*  
*Université de Montréal*

The length of Yannick Fer’s study of Pentecostalism in French Polynesia may put off readers whose mother tongue is not French. However, that would be unfortunate, because the book holds much that will interest not only specialists of Polynesia but also students of contemporary religious movements. Fer’s study offers an unusually nuanced understanding of charismatic Protestantism in this part of the world. As the author explains, day-to-day proximity with his research subjects over two years of field work allowed him to get beyond the conventions of research on this type of religion, notably the conversion narrative, whose contours are (from the researcher’s point of view) all-too-familiar, given that they are an essential part of religious rhetoric in Pentecostal congregations. The three sections of the book can be read almost independently from each other, such that different readerships may focus on one or another section of the book.

In the first section, Fer traces the development of Pentecostalism from the charismatic Protestantism introduced by Hakka Chinese immigrants (many of them former Buddhists) in the 1960s. Here he shows the interesting dynamic between ethnic identity and religious identity as Hakka Protestantism saw the emergence of ruptures, divisions and eventually, the rise of the ethnically plural Assemblies of God of French Polynesia, to which many Hakka and their descendants now belong. This part of the book is probably of greatest interest to specialists of Pentecostalism.

Sociologists and anthropologists of religion will find the second section of the book interesting insofar as it details the institutional aspects of the Assemblies of God of French Polynesia, showing an interesting division of religious labour between different spiritual functions (prophecy, healing, teaching etc.), the most fundamental distinction being that between “pastors” and “evangelists” (who may, in fact, be one and the same person at different points in time or in different contexts) (pp. 202-203). Here the classical issues of charisma versus institutionalization and religious communalization are