

Au cours du processus d'édition, les sections de la thèse originale correspondant au contexte méthodologique, de même que certains passages décrivant les courants théoriques dans lesquels se situe l'ouvrage, ont été éliminés. Ces modifications ont pour effet de séparer les résultats de la recherche du processus par lequel ils ont été obtenus. Elles font en sorte qu'il n'est plus possible d'analyser les conclusions en fonction des catégories d'analyse dans lesquelles elles ont été produites, ce qui compromet leur évaluation critique par le lecteur. Toutefois, dans le cas présent, les modifications introduites ont un impact au-delà d'une perte de transparence et affectent la clarté et l'accessibilité de l'œuvre et ce, sur deux plans :

Tout d'abord, à la lecture de *Territoire, transmission et culture sourde*, les lecteurs qui ne sont pas familiers avec les courants postmoderniste et constructiviste auxquels appartiennent les questionnements de l'auteure risquent d'être déstabilisés par la manière dont est abordé l'objet de recherche. En effet, en n'introduisant pas les thèmes explorés dans le cadre théorique dans lequel ils s'inscrivent, ceux-ci ont perdu tout leur sens. La notion de frontière identitaire, de même que les thèmes de construction, production et diffusion, auraient mérité d'être définis dans le chapitre d'introduction.

Le deuxième plan concerne la structure générale de l'ouvrage. Le fait d'éliminer les références au processus itératif caractéristique de l'approche qualitative dans laquelle cette recherche a été effectuée a pour effet de rendre invisible les liens logiques qui relient les différentes sections de l'ouvrage. Cette situation n'a pas été corrigée par l'ajout de matériel permettant au lecteur de comprendre l'organisation des différentes sections et de les situer par rapport aux questionnements qui ont guidé l'auteure.

En conclusion, les choix effectués au cours du processus d'édition font en sorte que *Territoire, transmission et culture sourde* est, somme toute, une œuvre largement moins accessible que la thèse originale. Ainsi, considérant que l'ouvrage ne contient pas de matériel nouveau, à l'exception de photos d'archives et d'un index biographique, les chercheurs en sciences sociales, de même que le public en général, auront avantage à se référer à la thèse originale. *Territoire, transmission et culture sourde*, loin de rendre justice au travail de recherche dont il est tiré, ne présente pas de valeur ajoutée par rapport à la thèse dont il est extrait, peu importe la perspective dans laquelle on l'évalue.

Référence

Lachance, Nathalie

- 2002 Analyse du discours sur la culture sourde au Québec. Fondements historiques et réalité contemporaine. Thèse présentée en vue de l'obtention du grade de Ph.D., Département d'anthropologie, Université de Montréal.

João Biehl (photographs by Torben Eskerod), *Will to Live: AIDS Therapies and the Politics of Survival*, Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2007, 466 pages.

Reviewer: Margaret MacDonald
York University

Will to Live is the work of João Biehl, Assistant Professor of Anthropology at Princeton University. In a sea of recent scholarly work on HIV/AIDS this book is a unique and significant contribution to critical medical anthropology and interdisciplinary studies of the topic. Brazil's marginalized underclass—who suffer disproportionately from HIV/AIDS—is the main focus of the book, and it is they especially to which the tension of the title refers.

This book is worthy of praise for the depth and breadth of the author's ethnographic method. Although focusing on the poorest of the poor in northeastern Brazil, Biehl traces the work and life trajectories of influential AIDS activists and organizations, and Brazilian politicians and international health policy makers. He documents the means and ways of the massive ARV rollout across the country and wades through the complexities of epidemiological data collection and representation. Finally, he mines the press for portrayals of Brazil's radical AIDS policy on the global stage. Although Biehl describes AIDS policy and practice in Brazil as more imaginative than most, his work complicates this apparent success story by illuminating the gaps *within* and *between* these sites: the hospital without enough beds and the clinic without enough drugs; the impoverished patients who never return for their HIV test results or never present themselves at all; the health care resources spent on middle class patients who return again and again to be tested, suffering from "AIDS anxiety" at greater rates than the infection itself; and the persistence of major donor policies of prevention rather than treatment. In a country lauded for its defiant stand against the limitations of international health policy and global market forces to curb infection rates and treat those suffering from HIV/AIDS, *Will to Live* describes a more complex reality.

Biehl is an elegant writer and thinker. This book, however, has the potential to wear the reader out, perhaps just as the author intended. Stories of individual and collective suffering are recounted relentlessly. "Welcome to the end of the world" Rose says to welcome the anthropologist and photographer to her shack where she recounts her story of abandonment, prostitution and drug addiction. She weeps again over the death of her teenage son the previous year and prays everyday for her infant daughter's sero-positive status to reverse. She is thankful for the antiretroviral treatment she receives and relieved to no longer to be out among "the people [who] are still dying of AIDS in the streets" (p. 28). A group of poor and homeless AIDS sufferers are harassed by police as they search for a quiet place to sit and eat the lunch prepared for them every Wednesday by nurse Dona Conceicao. She says, "many die, many new ones ask for help. Everyday

I get to know three or four more poor people with AIDS and I am only one" (p. 146). On a return visit to an AIDS home—Caasah—the anthropologist and photographer ask after several residents and are told, "Nerivaldo went back to the street and died soon after you left. He and Maria Madalena were last seen at Mae Preta's shelter [for the homeless]. Jorge Leal died in the old Caasah, all of a sudden. Lazaro and Marilda too. Medication did no good for them. Nobody from their families showed up to their funerals, that's the reality" (p. 340).

One is riveted by these stories of suffering, but not in a "nameless masses" sort of way. Nor are the individuals cast in the light of heroism. Rather, one is riveted, just as Beihl was, by the stories of individuals "who, like everyone, have a will to live." His work gives the reader the opportunity to understand the subtleties of such will in the most brutal of circumstances. The effect is not just emotional, but intellectual because of the author's rich engagement of this Brazilian data with the "global assemblages" of power. Beihl shows the convergence of state policy-making, international funding, NGO activism, multinational pharmaceutical companies, and international trade treaties in the story of bringing treatment to the front lines of the AIDS crisis in Brazil. But there are no easy answers, and the paradoxes abound. For example, even as Beihl observes and critically analyses the "pharmaceuticalization of public health" in Brazil, he concludes that it is not just a necessary evil, but a human right.

An important feature of this book is the series of evocative black and white portraits of many of the people Biehl got to know, over the course of his multiple fieldwork trips to Brazil taken by Danish photographer Torben Eskerod. Sontag wrote that "to photograph is to appropriate the thing photographed. It means putting oneself into a certain relation to the world that feels like knowledge—and, therefore, like power." Eskerod's portrait work here is not an appropriation and packaging of "the pain of others" in an uncritical way for the Western viewer, in part because of the rich ethnographic and analytical context that Beihl provides (cf. Sontag 1977 and 2003). The visual and textual in combination work to "unpack" the idea of HIV/AIDS and poverty in Brazil as a place of pure suffering and violence. At the same time they unpack the simple "success" story of Brazil's AIDS policy.

The absence of portraits in some sections of the book, however, leaves a few lingering questions. There are no photographs of the middle class AIDS sufferers, or AIDS anxiety sufferers or their health care providers—not to mention the politicians, policy makers, and NGO executives Beihl also writes about. The names of high level politicians and activists are used, but the pseudonyms (like "Eyeglasses" and "Dog") employed for middle class individuals intensify the uneasy contrast with the first names and faces of the poor and the full names and titles of the elites. These aspects of his study are not footnotes; Biehl spends entire chapters on them. I cannot imagine the author was unaware of the effect. Towards the end of the book the author writes, "the ethnographer upholds the rights of micro-analysis and thus brings into view the

immanent fields people invent to live in and by" (p. 378). *Will to Live* does this beautifully and profoundly well. The unevenness of Beihl's representational strategy—intentional or not—and the uneasy feeling it inspires is nevertheless important to mention because it is part and parcel of the anthropologist's (and his reader's) lot. We grapple with the persistent paradox of the anthropologist's disproportionate access to the private lives (and images) of the poor, which sits uneasily with the tension between the power of knowledge and the potential for vulnerability in telling and showing the stories of others.

References

- Sontag, Susan.
1977 On Photography. New York: Dell.
2003 Regarding the Pain of Others. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.

Mark Padilla, *Caribbean Pleasure Industry: Tourism, Sexuality and AIDS in the Dominican Republic*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007, 294 pages.

Reviewer: *David A.B. Murray*
York University

In their introduction to the ground-breaking volume *The Gender/Sexuality Reader* (1997), editors Roger Lancaster and Micaela di Leonardo argued for the importance of the "political economy of sexuality," an approach which, simply put, examines how sexual desires, practices, and identities are shaped by political and economic processes. Ten years later, Mark Padilla has produced one of the best examples of this approach in his research on male sex workers who have sex with foreign gay tourists in the Dominican Republic. Padilla's examination of a group of men who work in what he calls "the pleasure industry" (the diverse informal sector of the Dominican economy devoted to providing myriad pleasure-related services to more than two million foreign guests who visit annually) succeeds where many other political economy analyses fail: whereas I often find that the complexity and richness of individual lives are lost in lengthy descriptions of macro-structural trends and transformations that work to privilege a few and marginalize many, Padilla works very hard to illustrate the linkages between global processes and local cultural contexts and how a particular group of marginalized men negotiate the pressures and opportunities created through these multi-scalar processes. The goal of foregrounding these linkages requires a constant shifting of analytical lenses from individual narratives to economic and political transformations at local, national and global levels, and there are times in this ethnography when this continuous movement runs the risk of repeating certain themes or curtailing in-depth analysis or thick description in order to foreground connectivity. Nevertheless, *Caribbean Pleasure Industry* makes significant