

tures sociohistoriques qui séparent Charlevoix en deux entités, qui s'observent mutuellement mais dont une seule est connectée au monde extérieur de capitaux et d'idées. D'une part, il y a le Charlevoix des villégiateurs qui aiment le contact avec un paysage et un peuple « sauvages » mais « purs ». Ce Charlevoix regroupe plusieurs écrivains, artistes et folkloristes qui représentent de cette façon les modes de vie sur le territoire. En contrepartie, le Charlevoix rural, pauvre et francophone se trouve édifié en objet d'étude folklorique.

Enfin, dans deux chapitres sur le rapport qu'entretient l'ethnologie avec l'histoire, l'auteur examine le « Charlevoix historique » dans lequel se situe le « Charlevoix folklorique ». En effet, si les premiers ethnologues ont découvert Charlevoix grâce à leurs hôtes villégiateurs, ils l'ont conceptualisé comme terrain d'enquête à partir des écrits historiques sur la région. Selon l'auteur, il existait déjà l'idée historique d'un Charlevoix limitrophe, « inhabitable et inquiétant » mais combien « pur ». Barbeau aurait reçu cette idée à travers les textes publiés au XIX^e siècle pendant l'éveil du nationalisme canadien français. Les frontières et le nom de Charlevoix remontent à cette époque de mouvance démographique et de balbutiement démocratique. Dès 1842, nombre de Charlevoisiens allèrent s'installer au « Royaume du Saguenay », dans la foulée de l'émigration qui affectait alors l'ensemble du terroir québécois. En 1855, on divisa le comté électoral de Saguenay en deux, et l'on renomma la portion ancestrale sur le Saint-Laurent en hommage au grand historien jésuite de la Nouvelle-France. Le nom de Charlevoix évoquait donc à la fois l'identité française et le renouveau démocratique, en même temps que la représentation de la région par les historiens de l'époque reposait sur son retard socioéconomique à titre de pays d'émigration et sur l'aspect « sauvage » des habitants et du paysage. Barbeau semble avoir été séduit par cette représentation historique de la région et l'a reproduite dans son travail ethnologique.

Toutefois, l'auteur montre que le rapport entre l'ethnologie et l'histoire était bien plus complexe. Parmi les ethnologues du XX^e siècle, Savard et Lacourcière mais aussi le cinéaste Pierre Perrault voyaient leur discipline comme le prolongement de l'histoire jusqu'au présent et comme la valorisation de la mémoire d'un « peuple » sous-représenté dans les registres d'archive. L'histoire, en tant que discipline était, rappelons-le, critiquée à l'époque pour sa tendance à légitimer le pouvoir et à faire taire la population. L'ethnologie était donc une façon de corriger les silences de l'histoire et d'avancer un projet politique. L'auteur montre comment les folkloristes, s'inscrivant dans une lignée intellectuelle remontant au siècle précédent, cherchaient à ramener la région limitrophe (mais « pure ») dans le giron de la nation territoriale et à intégrer son « peuple sans histoire » – ils ont bien saisi le potentiel de la célèbre formule de Durham – au projet de construction politique du Canada français et, ultimement, d'un Québec distinct. Ce décapage de la pensée des premiers folkloristes, à la lumière des courants intellectuels et politiques de leur époque, constitue un des apports les plus originaux du livre. Alors que Barbeau est

resté dans le carcan des rapports fracturés des deux Charlevoix, l'un ouvert au monde des idées et des capitaux, l'autre à l'écart de la modernité, Savard et Lacourcière ont su inscrire leur discipline dans la construction d'un peuple et d'un pays modernes et dans la pensée d'une époque qui a produit l'idée de l'État souverain du Québec.

Ce livre permet donc de comprendre l'histoire de Charlevoix autrement, de voir son identité dans un contexte historiographique complexe et, surtout, de mieux comprendre sa place dans l'histoire et l'ethnologie québécoises. En effet, pour quiconque aborde Charlevoix comme terrain d'enquête, il importe de comprendre le syncrétisme des figures du scientifique et du touriste qui existe dans la région depuis le temps de Marius Barbeau. Il importe aussi de comprendre le concept de région qui continue à faire son chemin, tant bien que mal, et dont Charlevoix fut érigé en archétype : unité géoculturelle spécifique et un peu hermétique, partie intégrante d'une nation territoriale, traditionnelle et donc le salut culturel de Montréal la moderne tout en restant à sa remorque. Sans doute, il n'a pas été facile pour l'auteur de toujours voir clair à travers ce dense sous-bois conceptuel qui s'élevait devant lui, ni d'ordonner la complexité de sa propre réflexion. Le livre conserve en effet quelques passages arides, vestiges de sa première incarnation comme thèse doctorale. L'organisation est parfois intuitive et une certaine pudeur, sinon une considération pour ses pairs charlevoisiens et scientifiques, semble avoir empêché l'auteur de pousser plus loin quelques-uns des thèmes percutants qu'il a appréhendés au cours de son travail. Il reste cependant que Serge Gauthier n'a pas refusé les difficultés du chercheur engagé et s'est donné les moyens scientifiques d'étayer sa passion pour Charlevoix. Son livre est une contribution significative à l'historiographie et à l'ethnologie du Québec « régional ».

Ruth Barnes, ed., *Textiles in Indian Ocean Societies*, Indian Ocean Series, London and New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2005, 162 pages.

Reviewer: *Tim Babcock*
Independent Scholar, Cape Breton

Textiles—sumptuous works of beauty or “ordinary” utilitarian articles with which we drape our bodies—have since the days of the early anthropologists provided a rich, fascinating and multivocal entry point into culture and society. Textile patterns are frequently loaded with key symbolism of cultures and textiles themselves may be powerful symbols of identity—gender, class, ethnicity or locality—or constituents and markers of particular life-cycle rituals. Textiles may be studied from the point of view of technology of production, or as products of globalization. Studies of production may reveal much about local economies—and whether globalization is an unmitigated evil that destroys local production and creativity or, conversely,

provides stimuli for the development of new forms. Studies of textiles can lead us to examining issues of “primitive” versus “modern,” and of the motivations, processes and impacts of collectors and collections in colonial times and in the present day.

Ruth Barnes, one of the foremost contemporary scholars of textiles of the Indonesian archipelago, has produced *Textiles in Indian Ocean Societies*, an edited collection of nine conference presentations and specially commissioned articles dating back to 1999. From Madagascar to easternmost Indonesia, with stops at the Red Sea coast of Egypt, Zanzibar, Persia, Sumatra and Java, the articles focus on one of the richest areas of artisanal textile production in the world—and one in which there have been many interconnections over centuries and even millennia. The book has a multidisciplinary flavour including perspectives from anthropology, archaeology and history, and art history.

The first short article, by John Peter Wild and Felicity Wild, reports on the identification of several hundred cloth fragments excavated at Berenike on the Red Sea coast of Egypt, dating to the late Roman period of rule. The fragments, some of which exhibit resist-dyed patterns, have been positively traced to India, indicating the antiquity and great span of trade routes of the time. The second article, by Himanshu Prabha Ray, puts the findings of the Wilds into a broader context, examining the historical record to uncover not only patterns of Indian transoceanic trade in textiles but also modes of production, producers’ and traders’ guilds and networks, and the importance of the textile trade to the state and religious institutions.

The third, short article, by Steven Cohen, limits itself to clearing up misconceptions about the so-called “Portuguese” carpets, once thought to be manufactured in the (former) Portuguese territory of Goa in India. Cohen demonstrates how these carpets, employing European motifs, were most likely made in northeast Persia—the motifs deriving from European prints and drawings brought to the region by traders, diplomats and missionaries.

With the fourth article, “Text as commodity, dress as text” by David Parkin, the book takes—from my point of view, at least—a much more interesting turn. Like most of the remaining articles, this one incorporates recent ethnography. Coastal (Muslim) Swahili-speaking women on the African shores of the Indian Ocean wear a type of cloth wrapper that is very clearly used as a means of social communication. These *kanga* or *leso* are imprinted with Swahili-language (once Arabic) messages that are assertive and often erotic and yet subtle and indirect. These messages are directed publicly at rival women and privately at husbands. In what is probably a unique case, the use of *kanga* cloths by women—who may be publicly voiceless—is a powerful means of commenting on the appropriateness, or otherwise, of particular social relationships. Like most other articles in the collection, this article highlights change over time—for example in the content of the messages.

The fifth article, by Zulfikar Hirji, turns to men in Zanzibari (also coastal, Muslim, Swahili-speaking) society and to

the making, wearing and interpreting of the many and changing meanings of one element of male dress, the *kofia* or embroidered head-dress. While the author does discuss the production and trade of the *kofia*, his more important contribution is his analysis of the contested implicit and explicit messages the *kofia* presents. Cross-cultural influences from around the Indian Ocean impinge upon this ever-evolving discourse. Is it, for example, an assertion of nationality, or of religion (Islam)? Is it also, worn a certain way, a veiled allusion to sexual prowess and intention?

The “anomalous” island of Madagascar—home to peoples whose Austronesian linguistic origins go back to Borneo but whose genetic and cultural origins are also African and Arab—is the setting of the sixth article, by Sarah Fee. The article first of all summarizes the various, and relatively unpublicized textile traditions of the island—traditions that more than any other perhaps exemplify pan-Indian Ocean interconnections. A major contribution of this article is a corrective to previous interpretations of Malagasy textiles and their uses based on foreign models. Fee’s ethnographic work among one Malagasy group, the Tandroy pastoralists, presents a nuanced analysis of the changing relations between gender and textile production and use, breaking a number of stereotypical views along the way.

The last three articles in the book jump to the opposite end of the Indian Ocean, to the Indonesian islands of Sumatra, Java and Lembata. Mary-Louise Totton’s article is a combination detective story and structural analysis, demonstrating that the huge carved stone panels in the “womb chambers” of a magnificent 9th-century Hindu temple in central Java are actually depictions of textiles. The symbolism of these “virtual textiles” is integral to the overall symbolism of the temple itself, and shows, once again, how imported cultural elements are reinterpreted in locally meaningful ways. Fiona Kerlogue reviews the rich history of textiles in the east coast Sumatran region of Jambi, today an Indonesian backwater with a recently revived and distinctive small-scale batik industry but once the location of an important Malay kingdom and cosmopolitan trading port. This article, as do several of the others, highlights a common theme: the high levels of prestige associated with imported, in particular Indian, textiles, and their influence on local production techniques, motifs and ritual. Finally, the book’s editor, Ruth Barnes, contributes her own case study of cloth in the textile-rich culture of a far-eastern Indonesian island, Lembata, where imported Indian double-ikat silk *patola* and block-printed cotton cloths have, since at least the 14th century, been highly valued heirloom goods. In Barnes’ first visit, in 1969, to the village of Kedang, the isolated mountain “old villages” not only produced no textiles but actually prohibited weaving, and cloths for ceremonial wear were imported from other islands. By the late 1990s, however, Barnes discovered that not only were complex bridewealth textiles being locally woven, and no longer imported, but a “traditional” man’s cloth had been “invented” and was being widely worn as an expression of Kedang culture. The role of

a particular woman, and her individual history, is highlighted in bringing about this development.

A major flaw of this publication is its outrageous list price of \$158.91, according to Amazon (though a discounted price of “only” \$99.54 is offered). For that price, a book on textiles surely merits a set of colour rather than black-and-white plates which this book does not have.

In sum, the book contains a number of useful, and occasionally innovative, case studies. I wish I were able to recommend this rather uneven collection as an introduction to the fascinating study of world-wide textile traditions. Unfortunately, the promise of the title is not fulfilled. There is little in the way of synthesis. Some common threads are identified in Barnes’ introduction: the mobility of textiles since ancient times, their huge importance in trade, the necessity of combining technical with sociological analyses, the dynamism and mutual influence (“fusion”) of textile traditions and their meanings and symbolism. But there is no far-ranging analysis that makes a definitive theoretical and factual statement on the subject. Readers whose appetite to delve into the study of textiles in their sociological, technical and historical contexts would be better served sampling such works as Forshee (2001), Niessen (1993) or Barnes’ own ethnography (1989)—all from Indonesia and all with beautiful colour as well as black-and-white illustrations.

References

- Barnes, Ruth
1989 *The Ikat Textiles of Lamalera: A Study of an Eastern Indonesian Weaving Tradition*. Leiden: EJ Brill.
- Forshee, Jill
2001 *Between the Folds: Stories of Cloth, Lives, and Travels from Sumba*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii.
- Niessen, Sandra
1993 *Batak Cloth and Clothing: A Dynamic Indonesian Tradition*. Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University Press.

Scott Simon, *Tanners of Taiwan: Life Strategies and National Culture*, Cambridge, Mass.: Westview Press, 2005, 172 pages.

Reviewer: *Eric Henry*
Cornell University

Scott Simon quotes one of his factory-owning informants in this ethnography of the Taiwanese leather tanning industry, as follows: “The Chinese have been making leather for thousands of years, but it has just been to cover their bodies. Taiwan has a modern tanning industry only because of foreign technology...Leather tanning has nothing to do with Chinese culture” (p. 60). It is statements like these that, for Simon, form the central problematic of his study: how is it that labour and business practices which are promoted by the government as distinctively Chinese (and linked to new forms of global Chinese

capital) are instead identified by their own practitioners as precisely the opposite, as non- or even anti-cultural? Simon conducted almost two years (with several subsequent field trips) of anthropological fieldwork in both small- and large-scale leather tanneries in southern Taiwan to answer this question. His ethnography uses the experiences of leather tannery owners and employees to explore questions of national identity and ideology in Taiwan, especially in light of recent political and social changes that have allowed previously marginalized populations to influence the course of the nation.

This book is much more than simply an ethnography of work. Most of the ethnography is not about the workplace itself but about how business owners and workers situate themselves within the imagined space of the nation: “In the workplace and at home, [Taiwanese tanners] craft identities at the same time that they craft leather” (p. 5). Simon includes a four page appendix that describes the technical steps of the leather tanning process, as well as some ethnographic detail of his own experience working in one such factory (pp. 93-96), but the bulk of the book concerns the contestation of national identity. Such an investigation is invaluable in its own right but, as Simon points out, is particularly compelling in the Taiwanese case. Taiwan was colonized by several successive waves of migration from the Chinese mainland, the final wave arriving after the Nationalist (KMT) defeat in the late 1940s. The more recent immigrants, backed by American influence and military power, were able to exclude other, mostly Holo-speaking, Taiwanese from positions of power and influence. At the same time the government embarked upon a series of ideological campaigns to emphasize Taiwan’s “Chinese” heritage. Mandarin Chinese became the only acceptable language in schools, while the teaching of history and geography had to conform to approved narratives. This historical context makes the appearance of a new identity politics which challenges the official government narratives that much more interesting.

The book is divided into nine chapters, the first three introduce the tanning industry, the historical context of Taiwan, and the relevant social, religious and kinship details of Taiwanese society. The next two outline two different types of tanneries: family-based and corporate firms. Family-based firms were encouraged by the government in the 1970s as means of strengthening the economy. While most firms are still owned by individual families the largest ones are now corporate entities. The family enterprises in Simon’s research tended to emphasize the benefits of kin-organized enterprises, arguing that employing family members helped reduce labour disputes, kept skilled labour from moving to other factories, and developed workers with years of experience in the industry. Corporate firms, on the other hand, emphasized their technological investments and rational business management.

Simon makes the argument that the narratives he recorded from both family and corporate firm owners represent an important counter-point to official discourses of Chinese-based identity. Instead of locating the success of their businesses in “Chinese” or “Confucian” business models, tan-