

describes Jivaroan Achuar co-wives' opposition to a violent husband as culminating in "...even a strike in the kitchen" (p. 100). This sort of comment implicitly degrades the extra-domestic roles of women/wives, and perhaps more so demonstrates an inappropriate application of the domestic/public dichotomy. It also implies an employer/labourer relationship between husband and co-wives which is quite thoroughly inappropriate.

Many of the articles (including Bonnemère, Hill and Biersack) focus on "male initiations" as "making men" (Papua New Guinea case studies) as opposed to "renewing the cosmos" (Amazonian examples). This difference is then related in interesting ways to differing ideas of the origins of the cosmos and of living species (Bonnemère, 41). Hill compares "marked" and "unmarked cults" across the two regions, and looks also at the parallels in childbirth rites. Biersack (rather unfairly) criticizes Turner and Van Gennep for not seeing the reproductive politics in male-focussed rituals. In her analysis of a ritual practiced by the Paiela of the Papua New Guinea Highlands in order to grow boys' hair and bodies, she makes an original point that the goal is to make them into not men, but husbands. One might reasonably ask, though, whether it is indeed making them into potential fathers instead, and whether that is an important distinction to draw.

Fisher, Conklin and Strathern all focus on definitions of personhood, variously taking into account bodily substances, age, age roles, and same-sex and cross-sex orientations. Jolly adds a consideration of sexuality, fertility and food in South Pentecost, Vanuatu. For a collection that uses the term "Melanesia" in its title, Jolly's is the only piece that is based on ethnographic research outside of Papua New Guinea. Brown also introduces some material little noticed in the literature: cases in which women or girls have taken prominent leadership roles in religious movements. As in Jolly's article, there is welcome attention paid by Brown to historical alterations in sexuality and gender.

With Hugh-Jones' article, the volume returns to "male cults" as fields of sociocultural conceptualization—of bodies, both male and female, and their substances, of the flow of life through reproduction. Roscoe interprets male cults as efforts to establish and maintain a masculine identity based on strength; Gregor and Tuzin show how difficult this is to accomplish. As they put it, they try to show how "...the cult reflects an effort, at times desperate, to hold together an all-too-fragile masculine self" (p. 309).

Gregor and Tuzin provide a short concluding chapter which puts it all into focus very nicely. I did have a good chuckle, however, at their assertion that in much of Melazonia, "Gender is still King" (p. 340). How ironic to use such a Western masculinist metaphor for non-hierarchical societies in which gender relations are a site of such contestation, as evidenced especially in their own article (chap. 13).

Overall *Gender in Amazonia and Melanesia* is a theoretically sophisticated, ethnographically rich resource. There is still some tendency, however, to prioritize men's rites, even though many of the authors do acknowledge the important

roles of women, even in those so-called "men's rites." As Jolly puts it, "...we still tend to naturalize and dehistoricize maternities, while we proliferate types of 'men' (big men, great men, men-men, clan-men) and culturalize and historicize paternities. The varieties of women, femaleness, and maternities are more rarely plotted and, if they are, are typically seen as derivative (cf. Strathern, 1988)" (p. 191). Nonetheless, this volume represents the anthropologist's anthropology, fascinating for those who crave ethnographic detail and the thrust and parry of contrary interpretations. It is a great text with which professionals can continue the debates and on which graduate students can cut their intellectual teeth.

One reservation remains, especially with students in mind. For my liking, too few of the articles come to grips with historical change in gender relations and with contemporary circumstances and cultural experiences, Jolly's and Brown's articles being notable exceptions. It might be argued that, given the book's purpose, this was not required; but it is certainly possible that where much change has occurred much light could be shed on that same purpose by looking at the nature of that change. Gregor and Tuzin themselves recognize this when they note that the gender inflections of the Ilahita Arapeh "...are extreme even by New Guinea standards, brought about by the latter's sudden increase in settlement size and social complexity" (p. 340).

---

**Andrew Strathern, Pamela J. Stewart, Laurence M. Carucci, Lin Poyer, Richard Feinberg and Cluny Macpherson, *Oceania: An Introduction to the Cultures and Identities of Pacific Islanders*, Durham, NC: Carolina Academic Press, 2002, 249 pages.**

Reviewer: *Ellen E. Facey*  
*University of Northern British Columbia*

The material is presented in three independent parts: "The South-West Pacific" by Strathern and Stewart (67 pp. of text), "The Eastern Pacific" by Feinberg and Macpherson (53 pp.), and "The West Central Pacific" by Carucci and Poyer (52 pp.).

In their very brief Introduction to the volume, Strathern and Stewart reject the common anthropological areal terms—Melanesia, Micronesia and Polynesia—in favour of compass directions, except where they use the older terms in quotation marks, to signify their dissatisfaction with them. Feinberg and Macpherson are of a different opinion, as indicated by the quotation marks they place on the phrase the "Eastern Pacific" in the title of part 2. Strathern and Stewart say that the sections ("parts") into which the book is divided "... correspond to geographical, historical, and cultural differences within the region as a whole, but we do not stress these broad divisions as such." Yet, having named the parts of the book for those divisions does indeed give stress or emphasis to them.

Stewart and Strathern provide the volume's aim: "... to provide an overview of ethnography, history, and contemporary changes in a broad range of societies across the Pacific region" (p. 3). They say that their intended audience is undergraduate college students; however, knowing that the average college/university student already finds Mela/Micro/Polynesia sufficiently hard to keep straight, I would rather that Strathern and Stewart had either used the traditional terms, or had taken the more sophisticated approach of avoiding this classificatory problem altogether. They state that "contemporary processes," "common ethnographic themes" and "dynamic differences" in Oceania as a whole are their primary interest (p. 4). Actually organizing the book around these concepts, rather than according to geographic areas (whatever one might call them), would have provided a unique treatment of Oceanic ethnography.

Additionally, in their Introduction, Stewart and Strathern note that they "... have written this book in the conviction that this Pacific world... is a world worth knowing, as much today as it was perceived to be by its earlier explorers, whether captains of ships or writers of books" (p. 3). While I agree with this, I also wonder why they feel they need to make this statement. The underlying issue is not how "worth knowing" Pacific cultures are, but the noxious habit of Westerners' judging other cultures as more or less interesting and therefore worth knowing in direct correlation with how "exotic" they appear to be. I wonder which audience Stewart and Strathern are trying to convince of the value of knowing contemporary Pacific cultures: students, their own colleagues, or the general public?

Part 1 of the book focusses on the South-West Pacific. The first section is overly detailed. For an undergraduate textbook, providing accurate content is essential, of course, but so is building a sense of place and context, visual clues and cues to aid students' memory and understanding, and that sense of "being there." What few pictures there are—nine—only appear at the end of the text of this section, preceding the References, very much like footnotes. None is in colour. Five are from Mt. Hagen, and not one is from outside Papua New Guinea.

The pictures seem like archival footage, frequently focussing on ritual moments—the *National Geographic* type of native (Lutz and Collins, Ch.5), strangely dressed, frightening or scowling, and more often than not, nameless: "a female mourner," "a male dancer," "a newly married bride," "a younger man."

Part 1 also contains 16 "Case Studies": two on Fiji; one each on New Caledonia and Vanuatu; three on the Solomons; and nine focussed on Papua New Guinea. These are all written by Strathern and Stewart, but each relies heavily on another author. As they summarize, Strathern and Stewart frequently refer back to their own ethnographic experiences—as in "... and here also we find a clear similarity with the Highlands of Papua New Guinea..." (35)—a strategy that at times detracts from the material in the case studies themselves. PNG is overrepresented in part 1 in relation to other parts of

the south-west Pacific. It does not also need to be treated as the reference point for comparison for all the other Melanesian case studies.

The rationale behind the choice of subjects for the case studies is not clear, but the main focus is on politics and political changes of the 20th century. Part 1 closes with "An Overview of Political Problems," followed by the photographs and collected References.

Part 2 concerns the "Eastern Pacific." Written by Richard Feinberg and Cluny Macpherson, it hangs together much better than part 1, without giving priority or centrality to one nation. As an overview I found it much more useful than part 1, especially the portions that are concise summaries of common themes: honor, *mana*, *tapu*, *aloha* and descent (although this last is surprisingly brief).

In lieu of many shorter case studies, the latter section of part 2 focusses on contemporary issues relating to the Maori of Aotearoa (New Zealand), Samoa, and Anuta, as three "variants of the Polynesian experience" (p. 130). Each of these is a solid and readable historical overview. Again, photographs and references follow the text rather than being incorporated into it. There are a few more photos than in part 1, and they are spread more evenly among the different nations and are linked to the different activities discussed in the section.

I would feel comfortable assigning part 2 to undergraduates. It provides a comprehensive, yet manageable, introduction to the commonalities and diversity of the cultures classed as the "Eastern Pacific," their prehistory, historic experiences and more contemporary processes and concerns. Feinberg and Macpherson have given us a valuable document, a scholarly overview which neither becomes mired in detail nor overemphasizes the authors' own ethnographic areas.

The West Central Pacific is treated in part 3 by Laurence Carucci and Lin Poyer. It is a stylistic halfway house between parts 1 and 2. There is considerable general information, and most parts of the sub-region are discussed, especially with reference to ecological variation, political systems and colonial histories. The focus is on the varied senses of identity which have evolved out of these situations.

As in the first two parts, case studies are presented to exemplify the processes involved. In the last major section of part 3 Carucci and Poyer concentrate on religious change—a dizzying array of Christian influences brought by Spanish, German, American, and even Japanese. The final major section is called the "Reification of Culture and the Politics of Tradition." The nine photographs that complete this part of the book are an interesting and appropriate mix of "traditional" and modern.

Of the three parts of this book, the most coherent and useful for teaching Pacific ethnography are parts 2 and 3, in that order. Ideally, it would have been wonderful to have a fully integrated consideration of Oceania as a whole, as the title seems to promise. However, the complexity of each of the book's three parts shows just how difficult that would be. Until someone manages that, this will be the closest thing we will have to

it. As such, it is an extremely valuable effort. But, if you plan to use it for undergraduates, they will need to be senior students. The book's length is deceptive; these are 249 pages of densely compacted material.

## References

Lutz, Catherine A. and Jane L. Collins  
1993 *Reading National Geographic*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

**Desjardins Michel**, *Le jardin d'ombres. La poétique et la politique de la rééducation sociale*. Préface de Gilles Bibeau, Collection Problèmes sociaux et interventions sociales, Presses de l'Université du Québec, 2002, 235 pages.

Recenseur : *Raymond Massé*  
*Université Laval*

Le Québec n'a pas échappé à la mouvance qui amena plusieurs sociétés occidentales à proposer une désinstitutionnalisation des personnes présentant des déficiences intellectuelles et à promouvoir leur réinsertion sociale. Ce mouvement qui a pris par exemple des allures parfois radicales, en Italie par exemple, fut officialisé au Québec en 1988 par son inscription dans les politiques explicites du Ministère de la santé et des services sociaux. Mais quels furent les résultats de cette entreprise, aux fondements idéologiques lourds, mais récupérée pour des motifs largement utilitaristes par l'État gestionnaire? Dans les termes de Michel Desjardins, tant les anthropologues que les sociologues, ont la responsabilité de questionner de quelles façons s'est effectué cette intégration des personnes? Leur intégration est-elle réelle ou symbolique? Bénéfique ou source alternative de marginalisation et de stigmatisation? Quel est leur mode de vie? La nature et l'adéquation de leur réseau social? Peut-on parler de réussite de cette politique à la lumière des moyens investis? C'est à des questions de ce type que répond l'auteur suivant une démarche ethnographique classique qui l'amena à étudier la vie quotidienne des bénéficiaires d'un Centre d'accueil montréalais, pionnier par ses programmes de «rééducation sociale» de déficients mentaux légers.

Sans nier les contributions des théories de l'étiquetage, du stigmatisme et du façonnement social des «modèles d'inconduites» qui ont marqué les études de la construction sociale des déviances, Michel Desjardins aura ici plutôt recours aux approches de la signification et de la sémiotique de la culture pour, non plus analyser la socialisation à l'incompétence des personnes déficientes intellectuelles mais pour s'intéresser au «rite de purification que notre société a élaboré afin d'éradiquer leur différence et de les intégrer au reste de la communauté» (p. 13). S'inspirant des quatre fonctions de la signification que D'Andrade définit comme étant la représentation, la construction, la direction et l'évocation, Desjardins s'attaque aux signes

et aux interprétations qui, dans le Centre d'accueil, «induit des manières de faire, de penser, de percevoir et d'éprouver spécifiques à ces personnes et à leur entourage» (p. 14). Il s'intéressera alors non pas à la construction sociale de la déficience, thème plus classiquement traité par l'anthropologie, mais à la construction des «catégories inédites» que deviennent les bénéficiaires, éducateurs, animateurs, ateliers de travail, appartements regroupés ou foyers de groupe.

L'ouvrage se caractérise d'abord par son souci du détail ethnographique et la parole donnée aux déficients et aux éducateurs. Le lecteur se trouve plongé dans une description minutieuse et sensible des rapports des bénéficiaires aux lieux physiques, des rapports sociaux de solidarité mais aussi des conflits de clans, des tensions interindividuelles et des mesquineries mais aussi des élans d'entraide entre déficients, de la déconstruction et la reconstruction des réseaux d'amitié suite aux départs des résidents du 5 445 (nom de la ressource résidentielle étudiée). Le lecteur pourra aussi suivre les déplacements des résidents qui partent chaque matin soit pour aller travailler dans le cadre de stage non rémunérés ou dans des ateliers supervisés, soit pour participer à diverses activités de formation et d'éducation. Nous pouvons les suivre dans l'intimité des rites de solidarité qui balisent leurs loisirs ou les fêtes, dans leur quête de normalité à travers l'idéal d'une vie conjugale, dans leurs rapports quotidiens avec les animateurs à la fois instructeurs et mauvais *boss*, confidents et fouineurs, protecteurs et *mères poules*. Mais surtout la deuxième partie de l'ouvrage nous introduit dans l'intimité de la forme et des contenus des programmes de «rééducation sociale». Desjardins analyse alors avec finesse et sensibilité de quelles façons, mais aussi avec quels résultats mitigés, les locataires du centre d'accueil Les Marronniers s'efforcent d'apprendre à maîtriser les techniques les plus basiques des soins corporels, de la tenue du foyer, des impératifs de ponctualité et de productivité qui règlent le marché du travail, le tout régi par des «plans de soins individualisés». Dans un souci du respect des besoins et des aspirations des bénéficiaires, l'auteur montre les limites de ces efforts de réinsertion et de rééducation sociale : même après plusieurs années de supervision et de stimulation, la grande majorité des locataires des Centre Marronniers n'acquerront pas les habiletés et les compétences permettant de vivre de façon autonome. Plus encore, la majorité d'entre eux, ralentiront plus ou moins consciemment le rythme d'apprentissage, effrayés par la perspective d'affronter une société extérieure dépourvue de la sécurité qu'offre le soutien quotidien des animateurs et le milieu protégé des résidences et des ateliers supervisés. Bien sûr, comme le montre Desjardins, ce milieu de vie n'a rien de «naturel». Ce milieu adapté représente en fait un «monde parallèle», un «simulacre» du monde normal reproduit ici en échelle réduite, «en miniature». Le monde des bénéficiaires «est ainsi une vaste reconstruction esthétique de notre monde [...] cette marge voilée à la fois si semblable et si différente du centre».

Tout en vivant dans une marginalité accueillante, les bénéficiaires ont toutefois l'impression illusoire de vivre dans le