

phrase of the “two minds” and the ambivalence in the practices and perceptions of psychiatry in the United States, in her final chapter, Behrouzan addresses the “many minds” of psychiatry evident in her own case, again highlighting the Iranian psychiatric discourse’s potential for providing an authoritative rationale for cultural critique that allows for the renegotiation of social moralities and personal responsibilities. An introduction as well as a conclusion bookend the chapters outlined here, while an extensive body of endnotes offers additional contributions to the discussions raised. Many of these notes indeed make for very instructive further reading, which might have warranted inclusion in the main body of the text.

A book review typically includes some mention of the shortcomings of the book in question, yet in this case, such an exercise would be forced. It seems much more constructive to acknowledge the book’s accomplishment in providing a theoretically nuanced and ethnographically dense account that brings out the ambiguities, convergences and departures between psychiatry as an allegedly uniform authoritative system of knowledge and psychiatry as a set of concepts, practices and modes that are subject to local evaluation, negotiation and re-contextualisation. Behrouzan’s subtle and sophisticated critique of the opposing trends within Iranian psychiatry redirects the discussion into the already existing channels of communication between neuropsychiatric, psychodynamic and anthropological approaches. Her book should prove very suitable reading for academic teaching across a wide range of university disciplines – not least of all social anthropology – and will make for fascinating and inspiring literature for any interested reader with a moderate degree of specialist knowledge in navigating the borderlands between psychiatry and social anthropology.

References

- Ehrenberg, Alain. 2010. *The Weariness of the Self: Diagnosing the History of Depression in the Contemporary Age*. Montreal: McGill-Queen’s University Press.
- Jenkins, Janis H. 2015. *Extraordinary Conditions: Culture and Experience in Mental Illness*. Oakland: University of California Press.
- Luhrmann, Tanya M. 2000. *Of Two Minds: An Anthropologist Looks at American Psychiatry*. New York: Vintage.

Ghannam, Farha, *Live and Die Like a Man: Gender Dynamics in Urban Egypt*, Palo Alto, CA: Stanford University Press, 2013, 240 pages.

Amal Haroun
Université de Montréal

Farha Ghannam’s *Live and Die Like a Man: Gender Dynamics in Urban Egypt* gives a nuanced analysis of the different phases of the constitution of masculinity (or *rugwula* in Arabic) in Al-Zawiya, a working-class neighbourhood of Cairo. The five chapters follow several men at different stages of their lives from 1993 to 2012. The book covers childhood, youth and adolescence before marriage; maturity through marriage and the founding of a family; retirement and old age; and death. The focus is on

masculinity in these contexts through mobility in public spaces, maintenance of hierarchies, forms of violence and gender relations in a broader and dynamic sense, as well as the male body in a labour market without social security.

The motivation for this book is to fill a gap: most studies on masculinity in the Middle East are not focused on gender but on relationships of domination. Ghannam notes that “hardly any studies tell us about how Middle Eastern men ... negotiate different social expectations that have to define their bodies and masculine selves” (11). The author criticises unidimensional and stigmatising aspects of previous studies on masculinity. Masculinity is not a static category but rather a process of being that is always in progress, framed, solicited and monitored by both men and women, always according to local culture, meanings and values. The book reads masculinity as a process and as a constant materialisation of important values, according to the system of informal meanings in specific contexts during the life course of a man. Theoretically, the book draws Williams James’s theory of meaning. At the same time, masculinity is always related to women, which thus underlines the complexity of masculinity (*rugwula*) in the Middle East. Ghannam argues that *rugwula* is a profoundly multi-dimensional, contextual and contingent process, rather than merely something linked to sexual performance.

The book draws a rich portrait of real people who grow up, evolve, deal with adversity, fall in love, get sick and die after having, somehow, achieved their masculinity. There is Ahmed, a child raised by his mother after the early death of his father in Saudi Arabia. Ahmed’s mother does everything to make him act and behave like a good boy – a boy who does not cry, who controls his whims and who does not let himself be dominated by others. Her goal is that Ahmed not receive the humiliating title of “raised by a woman.” Samer is a 40-year-old man who married later than his peers, and who is perceived as a “*gad’a*,” one who uses physical strength for a good cause. This is the typical model of a man who counts on his physical strength to earn a living, assert himself and realise his masculinity. Zaki is a young man of about 20 years of age, closely supervised by his mother, his sisters and his fiancée to attain an important stage in the achievement of masculinity: marriage and the founding of a family.

The book highlights a number of key themes under this system of masculinity, including violence and its modes of articulation, which Ghannam approaches in two distinct ways. The first aspect of violence is *gad’ana*, which is considered positive and is supposed to be performed to assert one’s masculine identity and establish hierarchies among peers and between women and men, as in between brothers and sisters or husbands and wives. The second aspect of masculinity is *baltaga*, which refers to gratuitous violence performed outside the structures of meaning and is perceived as useless. The author highlights the presence of both aspects of violence during the 2011 revolution in Egypt: the protection of women, neighbourhoods and relatives during the chaos caused by the absence of police (*gad’ana*) versus the harassment of women and the brutality of police (and others) against protesters (*baltaga*).

The last chapter deals with the perception of disease and death, and the making of memories of the deceased. Ghannam discusses death and its significance according to this system of local meanings by evoking two deaths in Al-Zawiy. The first is that of a young father who died in Saudi Arabia, whose death

was perceived as a good death, and whose memory was kept alive so that he could continue to survive among the living. The second death is that of an elderly man among his relatives, who was remembered through a family's memory of his illness and death.

One strength of the book is in its portrayal of the central detailed role of women in the construction of the masculinity of men – through their roles as mothers, sisters, wives and future wives, as well as in the role of women in the imagination of men. Women of the family are active; they push the male individual (child, adolescent, young man, mature man) to demonstrate what he must display (behaviours) and accomplish (marriage/responsibility) to materialise his masculinity. That said, women offer solidarity (financial and social) to their loved ones as they voice their criticisms and judgments concerning a lack of *ruguula*, or masculinity, when this is the case.

Another strength is the nuanced analysis of violence and physical force as a strategy for self-affirmation among peers, especially adolescents, and as a mechanism for establishing hierarchies between men and women. Violence is perceived, according to this system of meaning, as a strategy to be mobilised or avoided in specific contexts. Depending on the situation and invisible norms within the group, violence would be treated either as being *gad'ana* (e.g., for good cause) or *baltaga* (e.g., for the wrong cause). In general, the older the individual, the less violence he will resort to. Violence among young men is tolerated, and these men are even invited to prove their physical strength in order to establish hierarchies of power relations. However, mature men are encouraged to use violence as infrequently as possible. The role of violence, in this context, would be a measured strategy of affirmation and accomplishment, approved and encouraged by all, and not a mark of breaking during a social drama *à la Turner (1980)*. In fact, violence seems to be “rationalised” and “internalised” in social organisations as a mechanism of interaction, even as it is controlled.

A central insight of *Live and Die Like a Man* is that social organisation is the nucleus around which individualities must place themselves and materialise. This would perhaps explain the absence of gender and sexuality as themes relating to individuals. The analysis places them, rather, in social institutions and in structures of meaning, in the form of marriage and having children. This explains the care Ghannam takes to criticise the unidimensional, decontextualised aspect of studies on masculinity. In particular, Ghannam finds the limits in various frameworks, particularly Bourdieu's work on *habitus*, as well as the nuances of the multiple discourses that form the notion of self in comparison with a more authoritarian discourse developed by Saba Mahmood (2005, 56) in her *Politics of Piety*.

Nevertheless, Ghannam's book could be improved by addressing in greater depth the influence of Islamist groups on these structures of local meanings during her 20 years of fieldwork – especially since the Islamists, with their ideological and religious paradigms on gender and masculinity, have been active in the poor and marginalised neighbourhoods of Cairo since the 1980s. In addition, the author could better differentiate between two terms in Arabic referring to masculinity: *al-thozkora*, a name that describes the biological character and often the patriarchal aspect (*thokori*: adj., in a feminist discourse), and *al-ruguula*, which represents a set of behaviours that portray good masculinity. Similar nuance may also be applied to *al-gad'ana*, which implies an ethical aspect of the physical force

used to assert the good of the group, as it is a concept that was largely elaborated in El-Messiri's (1978) study of *Ibn El-Balad* (Son of the Country), which explores behaviours only “authentic” men and “genuine” Egyptians are able to display.

Live and Die Like a Man is an important study that weaves a vibrant narrative with serious analysis concerning structures of local meanings and that contributes toward a rethinking of the taken-for-granted paradigms that dominate research on the Middle East. Unlike some studies that have explored the imagination of male identity in the Middle East (e.g., Ghoussoub and Sinclair-Webb 2000), Ghannam offers rich long-term ethnography. Readers can see a deep knowledge of the terrain (the author was raised in an Arab country) and a full commitment to participant observation. The author gives clear and articulate voices to participants (women, men and children), with a touch of dynamism that demonstrates the complexity and multiplicity of the layers to be unravelled through fieldwork. Ghannam's work is a worthy achievement, especially after the revolts and conflicts prevalent to the region since 2011.

References

- El-Messiri, Sawsan. 1978. *Ibn Al-Balad: A Concept of Egyptian Identity*. Leiden: Brill.
- Ghoussoub, Mai, and Emma Sinclair-Webb. 2000. *Imagined Masculinities: Male Identity in the Modern Middle East*. London: Saqi.
- Mahmood, Saba. 2005. *Politics of Piety: The Islamic Revival and the Feminist Subject*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Turner, Victor. 1980. “Social Dramas and Stories about Them.” *Critical Inquiry* 7(1): 141–168. <https://doi.org/10.1086/448092>.

Moya, Ismaël, *De l'argent aux valeurs. Femmes, économie et société à Dakar*, Nanterre: Société d'Ethnologie, 2017, 351 pages.

Marie-Eve Paré
Université de Montréal

Cet ouvrage propose une analyse de l'interaction structurelle des cérémonies familiales et des réseaux financiers à Thiaroye-sur-Mer, quartier excentré de Dakar au Sénégal. Précisément, l'auteur vise à comprendre le rôle fondamental des cérémonies, des prestations et des relations de parenté, dans un contexte urbain où la parentalité ne semblerait plus être un agent d'ordonnance de la société contemporaine. À cette problématique centrale, s'ajoute un questionnement sur le rôle premier des femmes chez cette société musulmane dans les réseaux financiers et les cérémonies liées à la parenté. De manière plus générale, cet ouvrage s'interroge sur la définition de la notion de société dans un cadre urbain décrit comme « chaotique ».

Ces objectifs sont atteints malgré la complexité de l'interaction existante. Dans les deux premiers chapitres, Moya offre une reconstruction précise des réseaux financiers, notamment les tontines, et du rôle subordonné de l'économie au système cérémoniel, ici défini par les rituels musulmans et les cérémonies féminines du mariage et de la naissance. Les processus et