

Le Huguenot et le Sauvage

Frank Lestringuant

Paris, France: Aux Amateurs de Livres, 1990. 381 pp. N.p.

Reviewer: Claude Gandelman

Haifa University

This book deals with the beginnings of anthropological thinking after the discovery of the New World and the first explorations in North and South America at the end of the 16th century. At this time, most of the early French explorers—figures such as Roberval, Villegagnon, Laudonnière and Admiral Coligny (who became the leader of the Huguenot party and was eventually assassinated during the massacre of the Saint in Paris)—were Protestants.

The Protestants in the New World faced a double problem. On the one hand, they had to denounce the atrocities of the Spanish conquistadores and their hypocritical “Catholic” behaviour, which camouflaged the thirst for gold and conquest as a desire of salvation for the Indians—i.e., to free them from their false idols and convert them to the true religion. On the other hand, these Huguenot explorers were confronted by the absolute “otherness” of the Indians; in the name of Christianity, they had to condemn them as heretics. Yet, throughout the corpus of the Protestant explorers’ texts, a sort of pre-myth of the “Noble Savage” comes to the fore. A large section of the book is devoted to this pre-myth of the Noble Indian, largely as it is presented critically to a Catholic audience by Thevet, Léry, Chauveton and others. Among the early Protestant explorers of the New World, for example, the names of Léry and Chauveton are prominent. The first is clearly an exponent of Calvin’s anti-colonialistic ideas, whereas the other often dreams of a Protestant imperialism that will succeed that of the Catholic Spaniards (whom he sees as ephemeral conquerors of vast territories). According to Lestringuant, “The Léry-Chauveton collaboration largely contributed to the diffusion throughout Europe of the image of . . . *Le Bon Sauvage* . . . accompanied by the inverse image of his repulsive Other, the bad Christian . . . the cruel and treacherous Spaniard” (p. 129, my translation).

Of extreme interest also are the many illustrations reproduced from Thevet’s *Cosmographie Universelle*, Jacques Le Myne’s *Floridae Americae provinciae recens et exactissima descriptio* and other works. What is today called “Visual Anthropology” has its roots in these early phantasmagorical “documents.” Many of the Protestant explorers also “phantasized” that the New World was given them to re-write there a new *Genesis* and a new Biblical topography that reproduces the old one; thus, they rename one of the rivers, the Mississippi, “fleuve Jourdain” and some of them think of the Florida peninsula as a new Garden of Eden (p. 150). The Huguenot Laudonnière thinks he can create a Protestant Florida State that will be a sort of New Jerusalem. And yet, all this “re-writing” of the Biblical story fails and the Protestant colonists themselves cease to be “millenarists” and utopian thinkers and turn into exploiters of the Indians. Nevertheless, the failure of a Protestant Florida will stimulate English colonization of the New World. Whereas in France the pro-Spanish party (the *Ligue*) triumphs, it is the British, Hakluyt, then Walter Raleigh, who are the real heirs of the Protestant explorers and utopian colonists.

Although this book is not the first to deal with the issue of the interaction between self-image and the image of the Other, it is certainly the first to deal comprehensively

with the image of the "Protestant Other" within the global context of New World explorations and the situation in France. It is well written and original, an indispensable instrument for all those interested in the beginnings of "anthropological thinking."

Sweet Promises: A Reader on Indian-White Relations in Canada

J.R. Miller, ed.

Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991. xix + 468 pp. \$24.95 (paper)

Reviewer: R. Wesley Heber

Saskatchewan Indian Federated College

J.R. Miller's *Sweet Promises* is a compilation of readings on the history of Indian-White relations in Canada from early contact to the present. The articles address many key issues and events in Canadian history, including Indians in the fur trade, Indian-European military alliances, development of Canadian Indian policy and the growth of Native political organization. A central theme emerges from the readings of the gradual erosion of aboriginal rights, followed by the struggle for self-determination by Indian people in Canada. The selections, for the most part, are established articles that present the history of relations between Indian people and non-Indian authority from a Euro-Canadian perspective. Miller attempts to overcome this bias by including several articles from contemporary Indian scholars that highlight critical stages on the road to Indian self-determination. These include the Indian position in the 1885 uprising as laid out by Blair Stonechild and two articles on the emergence of Indian political organization in western Canada by Stan Cuthand and by Harold Cardinal. Other noteworthy contributions include Robin Fisher's article on Indian control of the maritime fur trade, Jim Miller's analysis of the conditions that led to 1885 and Sarah Carter's presentation of peasant farm policies in Indian agriculture during the late 19th century.

Detracting from the general high standard of the articles are several that express an ethnocentrism in use of language and through misrepresentations which do little to further Indian-White relations in a tense, post-Oka social environment. The most striking examples are Upton's portrayal of the Beothuck as architects of their own demise (p. 84), Rich's claim that the Indians were responsible for the near extermination of the buffalo and the beaver (p. 169) and Van Kirk's depiction of aboriginal women as drudges and beasts of burden (p. 181).

The book concludes with discussions of the Brundtland Report which is an attempt to reconcile aboriginal rights with economic development in a new world order. Brundtland's recommendation for universal education for economic development (pp. 447-449) is strikingly similar to the 19th-century policies of acculturation as presented in Usher's article (pp. 294-319), in which European models for Indian education were seen as the panacea for a perceived Indian problem. The inclusion of the Brundtland Report, with its Malthusian concerns of the Third World, represents a dramatic shift in the book's general appeal and supports the adage that history is doomed to repeat itself.

Despite some detracting features, *Sweet Promises* is a useful addition to readings in Canadian history and Indian/Native studies.