

VICTOR WITTER TURNER: A BIBLIOGRAPHY (1952-1975)

Henry G. Barnard, compiler
Library School, National Library of New Zealand

INTRODUCTION

This bibliography was originally developed for students of the anthropological study of religion at Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand and at Auckland, Massey, and Otago Universities.

Although all of Victor Turner's major publications and many of his minor ones between 1952 and 1975 have been included in this bibliography, it is possible that some of his shorter reviews have been overlooked. The principal method of compilation was bibliographic coupling; that is, working from the references in one source to those in another. Sources consulted included *The Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Sociological Abstracts*, the *Social Sciences and Humanities Index*, *Abstracts in Anthropology*, *Current Anthropology*, and the *Book Review Index* (for reviews by and about Victor Turner). In addition, the indexes of a number of journals in anthropology and the comparative study of religion were examined.

Whenever possible, reviews of Turner's major works by other authors have been included. This list of reviews is by no means comprehensive, and is meant only as a guide. Abstracts of articles and references to reprinted works have been included whenever possible, although these are likewise not necessarily comprehensive.

The arrangement of the main section of the bibliography is chronological by date of publication. Although this format is meant to show the development of Turner's ideas and the changing nature of his interests, it must be treated with caution since delays in publication, reprinting, and other factors have resulted in an imperfect chronological framework.

A BRIEF INTRODUCTION TO VICTOR TURNER'S WORK

The work of Victor Turner is now recognized as among the best arising from the discipline of anthropology in recent decades. Although Turner's influence has been principally in the study of religion, his works on political anthropology have also been the basis of wide discussion.

Victor Witter Turner was born in 1919 in Glasgow, Scotland. In 1949, he completed an honors undergraduate degree in anthro-

pology at the University of London under Professors Daryll Forde and Meyer Fortes. Between 1950 and 1954, he was a Research Officer at the Rhodes-Livingstone Institute in Rhodesia (now Zambia). During that period, he conducted fieldwork among the Lunda-Ndembu people in northern Rhodesia. In 1955, he received his Ph.D. from the University of Manchester, and in 1957, his thesis was published as a book titled *Schism and Continuity in an African Society: A Study of Ndembu Village Life*. From 1954 to 1960, Turner worked at the University of Manchester, first as a Senior Fellow and later as Senior Lecturer. During that period, Professor Max Gluckman, a former Director of the Rhodes-Livingstone Institute whose theories influenced Turner, especially in the initial stages of his work, was head of the Department of Anthropology at Manchester. Around Gluckman grew up what came to be known as the "Manchester school" of British social anthropology. Members of this school included John Barnes, A. L. Epstein, Clyde Mitchell, and Dorothy Emmet as the school's "mascot" philosopher. Turner was first identified with this school, and his later interests and ideas continued to be linked to the school's influence.

In 1961, Turner was appointed a Fellow of the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences in Stanford, California. This opportunity was used to write *The Drums of Affliction: A Study of Religious Processes Among the Ndembu of Zambia*, published in 1968. Although Turner returned to the University of Manchester a year later, he remained deeply attracted to the free-wheeling, multi-disciplinary atmosphere of American academic life. In 1964 he accepted a position as Professor of Anthropology at Cornell University in Ithaca, New York and remained in this post for four years, conducting three months of fieldwork among the Gisu of Uganda (July-September, 1966).

In 1969, Turner joined the six-member Committee on Social Thought at the University of Chicago. Colleagues on the committee included the novelist Saul Bellow, the philosopher Hannah Arendt, and the art critic Harold Rosenberg. In 1977, Turner was appointed William R. Kenan Professor of Anthropology at the University of Virginia, a post which he held until his death in December 1983. During the 1970s, Turner also conducted fieldwork on pilgrimage in Mexico and Ireland. His latter years were devoted to studying the interplay between ritual and contemporary drama theory.

This brief sketch of Victor Turner's academic and professional career is meant as an introduction to the major themes which developed in his work. The origins of these themes were multifarious, and were as much related to his personal history as to the influence of his background. First, there is the theme of "society" as an evolutionary mechanism which exists to combat humankind's "innate and universal drives whose complete gratification would result in a breakdown of (social) control" (*The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* 1967:37). Turner also

spoke of the "forces of disorder that . . . inhere in man's mammalian constitution" (*The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-Structure* 1969:93). This Hobbesian view of *bellum omnes contra omnes* is a theme which pervades his work and is more often than not implicit. This is not to say that Turner consistently thought through the consequences of this idea. Indeed, since the consequences of the idea were taken for granted, they evaded his scientific scrutiny. The result is that at times, he seems to suggest that "self-interest" is a significant factor in understanding capitalist societies, and that at other times it is significant for all societies. But he also sometimes suggests that it is society itself that is disruptive. In this vein, he speaks of the "failure . . . of the secular mechanisms to redress and absorb conflicts that arise in and between local and kinship groups" (*Schism and Continuity in an African Society: A Study of Ndembu Village Life* 1957:289), and of "the social forces working in the opposite direction" from that of societal unity (*ibid.*:295). This idea culminates in his statement that "structural differentiation, both vertical and horizontal is the foundation of strife and factionalism" (*The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-Structure* 1969:179).

The second theme that runs through Turner's work is related to the first. Turner saw ritual as one of the principal mechanisms that society has evolved for maintaining the social order. He stated that "in the course of a ritual, symbols and verbal behavior are manipulated so as to discharge tensions in the social system" (*Schism and Continuity in an African Society: A Study of Ndembu Village Life* 1957:316), and that "ritual is situated near the apex of a whole hierarchy of redressive and regulative institutions that correct deflections and deviations from customary prescribed behavior" (*The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* 1967:45). To discover how ritual fulfills its function, Turner explored various methods of analyzing rituals and ritual symbols. This exploration suggested a number of other themes.

Victor Turner stressed not only the need to analyze rituals and ritual symbols by looking at their external forms, observable characteristics, and sociological contexts, but also the need to take into account the interpretations offered by native specialists and laymen—that is, native exegesis. By using all of these data, Turner discovered three properties of ritual symbols: (1) *condensation*—the ability of ritual symbols to "stand for" or "represent" many things and actions in a single formation; (2) *unification of disparate significata*—or the idea that very different categories and actions are often held together in one symbol by the common possession of analogous properties; and (3) *polarization of meaning*—how the various "meanings" of a symbol can be spread out on a spectrum or fan from a *normative pole* to a sensory or *orectic pole*. The meanings of a given symbol at its normative pole are seen as usually connected with principles of

social behavior, while the meanings of symbols at their sensory poles are usually seen as physiological characters.

It is this last property of ritual symbols which provides Turner with another of the major themes in his work, namely, the ability of ritual symbols to unite intimately the moral and the material by conflating the normative with the sensory. Thus "an exchange of qualities may take place in the psyches of the participants under the stimulating circumstances of the ritual performance, between orectic and normative poles; the former, through its association with the latter, becomes purged of its infantile and regressive character, while the normative pole becomes charged" with the power of the grossly physiological (*The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* 1967:54-55).

Turner was interested in analyzing both the semantic and sociological dimensions of rituals and ritual symbolism. Since he saw ritual as a phase in social process, he developed a "dramatic" mode of analysis which stressed the "processual" nature of social life. This analysis was an especially strong theme in *Schism and Continuity in an African Society: A Study of Ndembu Village Life* (1957), where he attempted to extract the formal properties of ritual processes, including breaches of norms, crisis resolution or dissolution, and other such categories.

Turner's emphasis on "process" also led him to examine the "processual" nature of rituals themselves, leaning heavily at the start on Van Gennep's "rites of passage." Following Van Gennep, Turner discerned three phases in rituals: separation, margin (or limen), and aggregation. Concentrating on the liminal phase of rituals, Turner described and evaluated the common symbolic features of rituals. His concern with the properties of "liminal" phenomena provided the major theme for such works as *The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-Structure* (1969), and *Dramas, Fields, and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society* (1974). Eventually, Turner moved from an analysis of the symbolism of the liminal phase of "primitive" rituals to the analysis of liminal phases in such broader social processes as millenarian movements and pilgrimage processes. Here, he discerned similar structural and anti-structural characteristics and was led to the development of the concept of *communitas*, or society seen as a relatively unstructured, undifferentiated *communitas*, community, or even communion of equal individuals.

Since the themes which occupied the focal point of Turner's interests were "liminal" and "communitas" phenomena on a worldwide scale, he eventually sought these themes not only in social processes, but also in art and literature.

AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY OF VICTOR TURNER (1952-1975)

N.B.: Unless otherwise noted, the following works were authored by Victor Turner.

- 1952 The Lozi Peoples of North-Western Rhodesia. Ethnographic Survey of Africa, West Central Africa, Part Three. London: International African Institute Press.

Reviews:

Trouwborst, A. A.

1954 *Man* 54:61.

Wylie, T.

1954 *The Rhodes-Livingstone Journal* 17:58.

- 1953 Lunda Rites and Ceremonies. Rhodes-Livingstone Museum Occasional Papers Number Ten. Livingstone, Northern Rhodesia (Zambia): The Rhodes-Livingstone Museum.

- 1954 A Revival in the Study of African Ritual: Review of *Rituals of Rebellion in South-East Africa* by Max Gluckman and of *African Worlds* by Daryll Forde. *The Rhodes-Livingstone Journal* 17:51-56.

- 1955 A Lunda Love Story and its Consequences: Selected Texts from Traditions Collected by Henrique Dias de Carvalho at the Court of Mwatianvwa in 1887. *The Rhodes-Livingstone Journal* 19:1-26.

Abstract:

1956 *African Abstracts* 7:120.

- 1955 The Spatial Separation of Adjacent Generations in Ndembu Village Structure. *Africa* 25:121-137.

A discussion of the separation of two halves of a roughly circular village into adjacent generations, including the relation of this principle of social organization to virilocal marriage, succession to chieftainship, and the relationship between the sexes and the kinds of work they do. Adjacent generations treat each other with respect, whereas alternate generations treat each other with familiarity and good humor.

Abstract:

1956 *African Abstracts* 7:128.

and E. L. Turner

- 1955 Money Economy Among the Mwinilunga Ndembu: A Study of Some Individual Cash Budgets. *The Rhodes-Livingstone Journal* 18:19-37.

Abstract:

1956 *African Abstracts* 7:40.

- 1957 Schism and Continuity in an African Society: A Study of Ndembu Village Life. Manchester, England: Manchester University Press for the Rhodes-Livingstone Institute, University of Zambia. A new edition of this book published in 1968 includes a new preface.

A detailed analysis of the social organization of the Ndembu of Zambia. There are chapters on the history of the tribe, the ecology of the environment, and demography. The main principles of Ndembu social organization (matrilineality, virilocal marriage, the spatial separation of adjacent generations, and succession to headmanship) are first discussed in brief, and then in greater detail using a new type of analysis which concentrates on showing how the major principles of Ndembu social organization—as well as psychological, ecological, and economic factors—interact, conflict, and support each other through a series of social dramas. These social dramas are concerned with the activities of both individuals and groups in one particular village, and how they try to exploit various principles and values to their own ends. The pervasive theme of the book is conflict and the resolution of conflict, and there is a chapter on the politically integrative functions of ritual.

Reviews:

Richards, A. L.

1959 Africa 29:88-90.

Stanner, W. E.

1958 Continuity and Schism in an African Society: A Review. Oceania 29:208-217.

Tuden, Arthur

1958 American Anthropologist 60:1222-1224.

Wilson, Monica

1959 Man 59:55-56.

See also:

Carlston, Kenneth S.

1968 Social Theory and African Tribal Organization: The Development of Sociological Theory, pp. 425-434. Urbana, Illinois: University of Illinois Press.

Chock, Phyllis P.

1967 Kinship and Culture: Some Problems in Ndembu Kinship. Southwestern Journal of Anthropology 23:74-89.

- 1960 Muchona the Hornet: Interpreter of Religion. In In the Company of Man: Twenty Portraits by Anthropologists. Joseph B. Casagrande, ed. pp. 333-355. New York: Harper and Brothers. Reprinted in 1967 in *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* by Victor Turner, pp. 131-150. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

In Muchona, an elderly Ndembu diviner, Turner found a kindred spirit with whom he could converse on a professional level about the ritual structure of the Ndembu. Muchona was Turner's best informant on these matters, and Muchona's descriptions were enhanced by his obvious delight in speculating about his own religious world and the meanings of its symbols. Muchona's wit found a ready response in Turner, who spent eight months in exhilarating, quick-fire talk with Muchona and an Ndembu school-teacher named Windson. In this article, Turner also describes Muchona's social and psychological background as a marginal man and tries to explain why Muchona became a diviner.

Review (of Casagrande, ed.):

Keesing, Felix M.

1961 *American Anthropologist* 63:138-141.

- 1961 *Ndembu Divination: Its Symbolism and Techniques*. Rhodes-Livingstone Papers Number 31. Manchester, England: Manchester University Press for the Rhodes-Livingstone Institute. Reprinted in 1969 by Manchester University Press for the Institute for Social Research, University of Zambia. Reprinted again in 1975 with a new Introduction in *Revelation and Divination in Ndembu Ritual* by Victor Turner, pp. 205-342. Symbol, Myth, and Ritual Series, Victor Turner, ed. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

For Ndembu diviners, the items of their divining apparatus are more like signs than symbols, and the diviners' knowledge of the meanings of the items are more esoteric and conscious than those of ordinary laypersons. In this case, a sign is an analogous or abbreviated expression of a *known* thing, whereas a symbol is the best possible expression of a relatively *unknown* fact which is nevertheless recognized or postulated as existing. The Ndembu diviner discloses what has already happened and does not foretell future events. He is a member of society who is called upon in moments of crisis to isolate the physical and social causes of misfortunes. As an agent of redress and social adjustment, he locates tensions in the contemporary social structure. By exonerating and accusing individuals, he brings moral norms to the surface and re-states them, and also prescribes actions which will dissipate tensions that have accumulated in the social structure. Turner exemplifies these ideas with detailed case studies of divinations which he observed.

- 1961 *Ritual Symbolism, Morality and Social Structure Among the Ndembu*. The Rhodes-Livingstone Journal 30:1-10. Reprinted in 1965 in *African Systems of Thought: Studies Presented and Discussed at the Third International African Seminar in Salisbury, December 1960*. Preface by Meyer Fortes and

G. Dieterlen. Meyer Fortes and G. Dieterlen, eds. pp. 79-95 (résumé en français). London and New York: Oxford University Press for the International African Institute (see also "Ritual and Symbolism: Introduction to the Section on Symbolism" 1965). Reprinted again in 1967 in *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* by Victor Turner, pp. 48-58. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

Symbols make beliefs, ideas, values, sentiments, and psychological dispositions that cannot be directly perceived visible, audible, and tangible. Symbols are also multivocal, standing for many things at the same time. The meanings of symbols can be spread out on a continuum or fan from the orectic (biological and emotional) pole to the cognitive pole. Turner considers this polarity to be a universal feature of ritual symbols of any semantic complexity. Through this polarity, an exchange of qualities takes place between the two poles of a symbol: (1) the orectic pole is purged of its anti-social elements through its association with the cognitive and normative; and (2) the normative pole is charged with the biological and emotional effects of the orectic. In brief, a single symbol represents both the obligatory and the desirable, a union of the moral and the biological.

Abstract:

1963 African Abstracts 14:83-84.

1962 Chihamba, the White Spirit: A Ritual Drama of the Ndembu. Rhodes-Livingstone Papers Number 33. Manchester, England: Manchester University Press for the Rhodes-Livingstone Institute. Reprinted in 1975 with a new introduction in *Revelation and Divination in Ndembu Ritual* by Victor Turner, pp. 1-204. Symbol, Myth, and Ritual Series, Victor Turner, ed. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

The main features of this ritual have already been outlined in Turner's *Schism and Continuity in an African Society: A Study of Ndembu Village Life* (1957). Here, in concentrating on the various performers, the objects used, and explanations which the performers give for both their actions and the objects they use, Turner gives a step-by-step account of the ritual. Unlike his other analyses, he does not go into the social setting of the ritual, but instead concentrates on the content of its meaning. He isolates Kavula, one of the male nature-spirits, for special attention and explores the meaning and function of Kavula in his ritual setting. Then, through a cross-cultural comparison with other isolates from different cultures, such as Jesus and Moby Dick, he attempts to give a theological explanation of the ritual. He also criticizes his previous analyses of ritual, maintaining that they obliterated the qualitative distinction between religious and secular cus-

tom and behavior. This work represents one of Turner's key statements on the essential irreducibility of religion.

Review:

Horton, Robin

1964 *Ritual Man in Africa*. *Africa* 34:85-104.

1962 Review of *Lugbara Religion: Ritual and Authority among an East African People* by John Middleton. *Man* 62:43-44.

1962 Review of *The Social Organization of the Gwembe Tonga* by Elizabeth Colson. *American Anthropologist* 64:868.

1962 Themes in the Symbolism of Ndembu Hunting Ritual. *Anthropological Quarterly* 35(2):37-57. Reprinted in 1967 in *Mythology and Symbolism*. John Middleton, ed., pp. 249-269. Garden City, New York: The Natural History Press. Reprinted again in 1967 in *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* by Victor Turner, pp. 280-298. Ithaca: New York, Cornell University Press.

For the Ndembu, hunting is a religious activity in addition to a search for food which is given an importance far beyond the physical needs which it fulfills. Turner analyzes various ritual symbols, especially the *chishinga*, and reveals the multivocal nature of these symbols from three levels of interpretation: (1) the exegetical; (2) the operational; and (3) the positional. These symbols act as unitary powers which conflate all the powers that are inherent in the activities, objects, relationships, and ideas which they represent.

Abstracts:

1963 *African Abstracts* 14:133.

1964 *Sociological Abstracts* 12:747.

1962 Three Symbols of *Passage* in Ndembu Circumcision Ritual: An Interpretation. In *Essays on the Ritual of Social Relations* by Daryll Forde, Meyer Fortes, and Victor W. Turner. Introduction by Max Gluckman. Max Gluckman, ed. pp. 124-173. Manchester, England: Manchester University Press (distributed in North America by the Humanities Press, New York).

An exposition of the author's method of analyzing ritual symbols with particular reference to three symbols, all of which are trees and all of which occur in *Mukanda*, the circumcision rite of the Ndembu. This article stresses a structural analysis as well as the tools used to extract the meanings of symbols at the exegetical, operational, and positional levels. Turner concludes with a brief comparison of circumcision with sacraments in the Western religious systems. He states that "There are religious

depths here that cannot be fathomed by the analysis of observational data."

Reviews (of Gluckman, ed.):

Douglas, Mary

1963 *Africa* 33:271-272.

Firth, Raymond

1965 *Man* 65:88-89.

Mandelbaum, David G.

1964 *American Anthropologist* 66:1182-1184.

1963 Review of *The Plateau Tonga of Northern Rhodesia: Social and Religious Studies* by Elizabeth Colson. *Africa* 33:276.

1963 Review of *Shona Religion* by Michael Gelfand. *Man* 63:136.

1964 *Betwixt and Between: The Liminal Period in Rites de Passage*. In *Symposium on New Approaches to the Study of Religion: Proceedings of the 1964 Annual Spring Meeting of the American Ethnological Society*. June Helm, ed. pp. 4-20. Seattle, Washington: University of Washington Press for the American Ethnological Society. Reprinted in 1967 in *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* by Victor Turner, pp. 93-111. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press. Reprinted again in 1972 in *Reader in Comparative Religion: An Anthropological Approach*. Third Edition. William Lessa and Evon Z. Vogt, eds. pp. 338-347. New York: Harper and Row. Reprinted again in 1979 in *Reader in Comparative Religion: An Anthropological Approach*. Fourth Edition. William Lessa and Evon Z. Vogt, eds. pp. 234-243. New York: Harper and Row.

"In his seminal essay *The Rites of Passage*, Arnold Van Gennep characterized a class of rituals with three successive and distinct moments in ritual time: separation, margin, and aggregation. Working within Van Gennep's framework, Turner concentrates on the properties of the hitherto neglected, and supposedly amorphous, period in rites of passage, the marginal or liminal period. Initiation rites have particularly well-marked liminal periods, where neophytes typically are removed, secluded, darkened, hidden, without rank or insignia; in terms of social structure, neophytes are invisible. In effect, the initiate is 'betwixt and between,' neither here nor there, no longer a child and not yet an adult. During this period of transition between states symbolic themes characteristically concern death and decomposition, or gestation and parturition, referring to the culturally defined person the initiate has been and will become. Because of the economy of symbolic reference, the opposed states—the having been and the becoming—may be represented by a single object, act, or phrase. Turner's originality lies in uncovering the potential richness and cultural significance of what

all too often is dismissed as a residual category, an interstructural phase which does not bear much study" (Lessa and Vogt 1972:338).

- 1964 Lunda Medicine and the Treatment of Disease. Rhodes-Livingstone Museum Occasional Papers Number Fifteen. Livingstone, Northern Rhodesia (Zambia): The Rhodes-Livingstone Museum. Reprinted in 1967 in *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* by Victor Turner, pp. 299-358. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

The Ndembu conceive of disease as a species of misfortune caused by mystical forces which are directed by conscious agents. To counter these forces, diviners are employed to diagnose and recommend curative rituals. Misfortune is considered to be a black state, and the rituals which are used to restore a normal state of affairs are full of the symbolism of color. This article includes an inventory of diseases and their treatments for everything from bilharziasis and leprosy to backache and abscesses. An analysis of the symbolism of these rituals shows how they are influenced by ultimate and axiomatic values of Ndembu religion and ethics. A major point of the paper is how their beliefs about diseases and cures give the Ndembu a false sense of confidence about their ability to cope with disease.

- 1964 An Ndembu Doctor in Practice. In *Magic, Faith, and Healing: Studies in Primitive Psychiatry Today*. Foreword by Jerome D. Frank. Ari Kiev, ed. pp. 230-263. Glencoe, Illinois: The Free Press of Glencoe (Macmillan). Reprinted in 1967 in *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* by Victor Turner, pp. 359-393. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

This is a description of the activities, character, and social role of an Ndembu ritual specialist or doctor, with a detailed description of the sociological context of the performances of the rituals in which the doctor was a specialist. There is also a detailed description of the rituals themselves. Turner states: "Emotion is roused and then stripped of its illicit and antisocial quality, but nothing of its intensity, its quantitative aspect, has been lost in the transformation. Ndembu social norms and values, expressed in symbolic objects and actions, are saturated with this generalised emotion, which itself becomes ennobled through contact with these norms and values. The sick individual, exposed to this process, is re-integrated into his group as, step by step, its members are reconciled with one another in emotionally charged circumstances."

Review (of Kiev, ed.):

Stainbrook, Edward

1968 *American Anthropologist* 70:173-174.

- 1964 Symbols in Ndembu Ritual. In *Closed Systems and Open Minds: The Limits of Naivety in Social Anthropology*. Max Gluckman, ed. pp. 20-51. Chicago, Illinois: Aldine Publishing Company (also published in 1964 by Oliver and Boyd, Edinburgh and London). Reprinted in 1967 in *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* by Victor Turner, pp. 19-47. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press. Reprinted again in 1970 in *Sociological Theory and Philosophical Analysis*. Dorothy Emmet and Alasdair MacIntyre, eds. pp. 150-182. London: Macmillan.

This is one of Turner's major statements on the study of ritual symbolism. Ritual is prescribed, formal behavior for occasions not given over to technological routine, and it refers to beliefs in mystical beings or powers. Symbols are things which the general consensus regards as naturally typifying, representing, or recalling something either by possession of analogous qualities, or by association in fact or thought. Ritual symbols can be analyzed from the standpoint of three classes of data: (1) the external form; (2) the native interpretation; and (3) significant contexts worked out by the anthropologist. These symbols can be further classified by their properties: (a) condensation or multivocality; (b) unification of disparate significata; and (c) polarization of meaning. Rituals adapt and periodically readapt the biophysical individual to the basic conditions and axiomatic values of human social life. Because of their properties, ritual symbols make the obligatory desirable. Since rituals are part of broad social processes, they should be studied as forces in a field of social action, and not merely as part of an abstract unitary system. Turner eschews psychological interpretations of ritual symbolism not because they are irrelevant, but because he thinks that an anthropologist cannot pass judgment "in a field of inquiry in which he has neither received systematic training nor obtained thorough practical experience."

Abstract:1971 *Sociological Abstracts* 19:710.**Reviews** (of Gluckman, ed.):

Beattie, J. H. M.

1965 *Man* 65:158-159.

Middleton, John

1967 *American Anthropologist* 69:386-388.

- 1964 Witchcraft and Sorcery: Taxonomy Versus Dynamics. *Africa* 34:314-324. Reprinted in 1967 in *The Forest of Symbols:*

Aspects of Ndembu Ritual by Victor Turner, pp. 112-127. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

In this review of "Witchcraft and Sorcery in East Africa" by Middleton and Winter (1963), Victor Turner criticizes the contributors for not employing more sociological methods of analysis in their study of witchcraft beliefs and for their overemphasis on the cognitive and cultural aspects of these beliefs. In so doing, he reveals his own predilection for analyses that accommodate "biotic, ecological, and intergroup as well as intra-group developments."

- 1965 Ritual and Symbolism: Introduction to the Section on Symbolism. *In African Systems of Thought: Studies Presented and Discussed at the Third International African Seminar in Salisbury, December 1960.* Preface by Meyer Fortes and G. Dieterlen. Meyer Fortes and G. Dieterlen, eds. pp. 9-15. London and New York: Oxford University Press for the International African Institute (see also "Ritual Symbolism, Morality and Social Structure Among the Ndembu" 1961).

A summary of the discussions on ritual and symbolism at the Third International African Seminar held in Salisbury (Harare), Southern Rhodesia (Zimbabwe) in 1960. The divergent perspectives of British and French anthropologists are pointed out; the former stress the sociological aspects of religious behavior and belief, while the latter stress the semantic, cognitive, and systematic aspects of this same behavior and belief.

Reviews (of Fortes and Dieterlen, eds.):

Douglas, Mary

1967 *Africa* 37:352-353.

Maquet, Jacques

1966 *American Anthropologist* 68:246-248.

- 1965 Some Current Trends in the Study of Ritual in Africa. *Anthropological Quarterly* 38(3):155-166.

Literature on the study of ritual in Africa can be broadly classified into purely descriptive studies and analytic or interpretive studies. The latter type of studies can be further subdivided into those which focus on traditional, cyclical, and repetitive systems, and those which focus on radically changing systems. Two types of analysis are applied to both systems, one concentrating on the ideological structure of religions, and the other on social situations where religious beliefs and practices significantly affect behavior. Turner suggests that these extremes can be brought together by seeing society as "a process with some systematic characteristics." He advo-

cates urgently-needed research in traditional cultures which are little affected by modernization, with particular reference to the collection of exegetical texts.

Abstracts:

1966 African Abstracts 17:153.

1968 Sociological Abstracts 16:419.

- 1966 Anthropological Epilogue. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London, Series B, Biological Sciences* 251(772):521-522.

A very brief summary of the main problems raised by the dialogue between ethologists and anthropologists with regard to the study of ritual in animals and man. Both ethology and anthropology are characterized as "behavioral" sciences.

- 1966 Colour Classification in Ndembu Ritual: A Problem in Primitive Classification. In *Anthropological Approaches to the Study of Religion*. Association of Social Anthropologists of the Commonwealth Monograph Number Three. Michael Banton, ed. pp. 47-84. London: Tavistock Publications. Reprinted in 1967 in *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* by Victor Turner, pp. 59-92. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

This paper was first delivered as a contribution to a conference on "New Approaches in Social Anthropology," sponsored by the Association of Social Anthropologists in 1963. The revival of interest in primitive forms of classification is pointed out. Turner found that among the Ndembu of Zambia, every form of dualism was contained in a wider, tripartite mode of classification relating to the colors white, red, and black. He describes the use of these colors in rituals among the Ndembu, Ngone, and other African societies, and extracts the meanings of these colors in those societies. Turning to comparative materials from Africa, Malaya, Australia, North America, and India, as well as to data from archaeological literature, he points out the universality of the meanings of these colors. He also attempts to link the cultural meanings of these three colors with their "natural" symbolism in a socio-physiological hypothesis. "By representing forces or strands of life by colour symbols in a ritual context, men have felt that they could domesticate or control these forces for social ends, but the forces and the symbols for them are biologically, psychologically, and logically prior to social classification by moieties, clans, sex totems and all the rest."

Review (of Banton, ed.):

Rivière, P. G.

1966 *Man* N.S. 1:406-407.

- 1966 Political Anthropology. Marc J. Swartz, Victor W. Turner, and Arthur Tuden, eds. Chicago, Illinois: Aldine Publishing Company.

The introduction to this book (pp. 1-41) discusses the concepts of politics, force and coercion, legitimacy, power, and other related terms. The value of processual forms of analysis, such as those found in Turner's *Schism and Continuity in an African Society: A Study of Ndembu Village Life* (1957), are emphasized.

Reviews:

- Jayawardena, Chandra
1968 American Anthropologist 70:764-766.
La Fontaine, J.
1967 Man N.S. 2:644.
- 1966 Review of *Sacrifice: Its Nature and Function* by Henri Hubert and Marcel Mauss. Translated by W. D. Halls. Man N.S. 1:116-117.
- 1966 Review of *Theories of Primitive Religion* by E. E. Evans-Pritchard. Man N.S. 1:256-258.
- 1966 Ritual Aspects of Conflict Control in African Micropolitics. In *Political Anthropology*. Marc J. Swartz, Victor W. Turner, and Arthur Tuden, eds. pp. 239-246. Chicago, Illinois: Aldine Publishing Company.

Society is a process with some systematic characteristics rather than a closely integrated system. Disputes in society have a life cycle, successive situations of this cycle being characterized as "political," "ritual," or "economic," depending on the routines, procedures, and symbols used in the situation. A social situation is a critical point or complication in the history of a group, and intervening situations leave their imprint on subsequent patterns of behavior. Turner demonstrates these ideas by describing the struggle between two factions of a vicinage to fill the role of senior circumciser at a performance of the Mukunda circumcision ritual. He shows how when the situation was defined politically, it was the modernist group that seemed to have the upper hand, whereas when the dispute entered its ritual phase, the traditionalists became paramount.

- 1966 Sorcery in Its Social Setting: A Review Article. African Social Research 2:159-164.

In this review of M. G. Marwick's *Sorcery in its Social Setting: A Study of the Northern Rhodesian Cewa* (Manchester University Press 1965), Turner commends the author for the use of detailed case histories, for his detailed ac-

count of Cewa social structure, and, in general, for his sociological approach to the study of sorcery. However, Marwick is criticized for his tendency to use the case method as "apt illustration" rather than to probe the properties of spatio-temporal continua. Marwick has failed to provide an in-depth study of the vicissitudes of life in one community over an extended period of time. Nevertheless, this work marks the culmination of a passing epoch in anthropological research.

- 1966 The Syntax of Symbolism in an African Ritual. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London, Series B, Biological Sciences 251(772):295-303. Reprinted in 1971 (with the last two paragraphs omitted) in *Structural Analysis of Oral Tradition*. Publications in Folklore and Folklife Number Three. Pierre Maranda and Elli Köngäs, eds. pp. 125-133. Philadelphia, Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press.

This article was delivered as a contribution to a symposium titled "A discussion on ritualization of behavior in animals and man." Here, Turner once again describes the analytical tools he has developed for the study of religion, the various dimensions of significance (exegetic, operational, and positional), and the way the meaning of symbol is built up in the exegetic dimension (on the nominal, artifactual, and substantial basis). He demonstrates the use of these concepts in an analysis of the mukula tree, which exudes a dusky red gum from cracks in its bark. Using this analysis, he demonstrates the complex relationship between innate human propensities and cultural mechanisms.

Review (of Maranda and Köngäs, eds.):

Gossen, Gary H.

1972 *American Anthropologist* 74:1446-1449.

- 1967 Aspects of Saora Ritual and Shamanism: An Approach to the Data of Ritual. In *The Craft of Social Anthropology*. Arnold L. Epstein, ed. pp. 181-204. London: Tavistock Publications (distributed in North America by Barnes and Noble, New York).

Verrier Elwin's book, *The Religion of an Indian Tribe*, is criticized for its lack of a sociological dimension in its analysis of Saora ritual. Elwin sees Saora religion "as an attempt to make the mystery and horror of the unseen more bearable." Turner states that this explanation might be adequate for the theologian or the psychologist, but not for the anthropologist. Using Elwin's data, he tries to extract the social elements of Saora religion, but is hampered most of the way by the lack of relevant material in Elwin's work. Only after the sociological and

psychological factors influencing religion have been closely examined can one reflect on the "numinous" element in religion.

Reviews (of Epstein, ed.):

Parkin, David

1968 *Africa* 38:478-479.

Reining, Conrad C.

1968 *American Anthropologist* 70:770-771.

- 1967 *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual*. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

With one exception (see below), all of the essays in this book have been published before. The book's introduction contains a very general description of the social and ritual organization of the Ndembu of Zambia.

Contents:

"Muchona the Hornet: Interpreter of Religion" (1960).

"Ritual Symbolism, Morality and Social Structure Among the Ndembu" (1961).

"Themes in the Symbolism of Ndembu Hunting Ritual" (1962).

"Witchcraft and Sorcery: Taxonomy Versus Dynamics" (1964).

"Betwixt and Between: The Liminal Period in *Rites de Passage*" (1964).

"An Ndembu Doctor in Practice" (1964).

"Symbols in Ndembu Ritual" (1964).

"Lunda Medicine and the Treatment of Disease" (1964).

"Colour Classification in Ndembu Ritual: A Problem in Primitive Classification" (1966).

"Mukanda: The Rite of Circumcision" (1967; see below).

Reviews:

Beidelman, T. O.

1968 *Africa* 38:483-484.

Peacock, James

1968 *American Anthropologist* 70:984-985.

- 1967 *Law, Primitive*. *New Catholic Encyclopedia* 8:560-564. New York: McGraw-Hill.

In this article, "primitive" means technologically simple. Radcliffe-Brown and others argued that where there is no state, there is no law, implying that various stateless societies such as the Nuer and Cheyenne would have no law. On the other hand, Malinowski states that law is that branch of custom which enforces rules of conduct. Nadel defines the presence or absence of law in terms of force. Turner recommends studying law as a part of social process, where certain phases of this process are called legal because of the kinds of activities they involve, including the settlement of disputes, etc.

- 1967 Mukanda: The Rite of Circumcision. In *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* by Victor W. Turner, pp. 151-279. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

This article is the only new piece in Turner's collection of essays titled *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* (see above). It is another detailed, step-by-step account of one particular ritual—in this case a life-crisis ritual, which is to be distinguished from rituals of affliction. Unlike Turner's analysis of Chihamba ritual (see *Chihamba, the White Spirit: A Ritual Drama of the Ndembu* 1962, above), he returns to a sociological explanation of ritual behavior and symbols. The social background of the ritual performance and detailed genealogical and spatial studies are provided. In this essay, Turner is concerned with "the power relations between the real groups in the field, and the shifting balances between groups and between individuals."

- 1967 Religion (in primitive culture). *New Catholic Encyclopedia* 12:247-250. New York: McGraw-Hill.

This article is a brief review of main trends in the development of theories about religion, from evolutionist hypotheses (Tylor, Frazer, Freud, and Durkheim) to functionalist and current hypotheses. The "meaning of religion" is stressed, and there is a brief discussion of some of the principal religious ideas and practices in primitive societies, including cults of the dead, the High God, and polytheism. Attention is given to the development of Judaism as a unique religion and as a precursor of Christianity.

- 1968 *The Drums of Affliction: A Study of Religious Processes Among the Ndembu of Zambia*. Oxford, England: Clarendon Press and the International African Institute.

This work begins with a discussion of ritual in the broad terms of its symbolic structure, its aims, and its implications for social relationships. Some background information about Ndembu cosmology, social structure, and the dynamics of social cohesion and conflict is provided. This is followed by an extended description of the basic concepts of Ndembu divination (for more detail, see *Ndembu Divination: Its Symbolism and Techniques* 1961) by which the Ndembu determine the various causes of misfortune, and hence the kind of ritual to be used in removing this.

The main body of the book is divided into two sections. The first section describes a set of rituals of affliction in the context of an extended case history of those involved. This is then compared to other sets of Ndembu rit-

ual with the same afflictive character. The second section describes a set of life-crisis rituals involving female initiation. A brief conclusion summarizes the theoretical implications of both lengthy accounts.

Reviews:

Beidelman, T. O.

1969 *Africa* 39:91-93.

Janzen, John M.

1969 *American Anthropologist* 71:525-527.

White, C. M. N.

1969 *African Social Research* 8:615-619.

- 1968 *Mukanda: The Politics of a Non-Political Ritual. In Local-Level Politics: Social and Cultural Perspectives.* Marc J. Swartz, ed. pp. 135-150. Chicago, Illinois, Aldine Publishing Company (also published in 1969 by University Press, London, England).

This article is a word-for-word repetition of the last section of Turner's article on "Mukanda: The Rite of Circumcision" (1967; see above) with one and a half additional paragraphs relating the analysis to the work of Karl Deutsch.

Reviews (of Swartz, ed.):

Cohen, Ronald

1970 *American Anthropologist* 72:112-115.

MacGaffey, Wyatt

1969 *Man* N.S. 4:663.

- 1968 *Myth and Symbol. International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences* 10:576-582. David L. Sills, ed. New York: Macmillan.

The liminal aspect of myths has two dimensions: (1) they are often narrated and are most effectively known in liminal situations of rites of passage; and (2) they themselves refer to passages, of "how things came to be what they are." They are not merely charters of the social order in positive or negative ways; rather they are "deep mysteries which put the initiand temporarily into close rapport with the primacy or primordial generative powers of the cosmos." Turner points out that many authors, including Malinowski, Jung, and Eliade, have each stressed the reality of myths in their own way.

- 1968 *Religious Specialists: Anthropological Study. International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences* 13:437-444. David L. Sills, ed. New York: Macmillan.

A religious specialist is one who devotes himself to a particular branch of religion or of a religious system. Various categories have been devised and contrasted, in-

cluding the priest and the prophet (Weber), the priest and the shaman (Lessa and Vogt), the shaman and the medium (Firth), the diviner, the doctor, and others. In most societies, religious specialization is also intimately linked with political specialization.

- 1968 Review of *Ethnologie et language: la parole chez les Dogon* by G. Calame-Griaule. *Social Science Information* 7(6):55-61. Reprinted in 1974 as "The Word of the Dogon" in *Dramas, Fields and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society* by Victor Turner, pp. 156-165. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

In the Dogon mythico-cosmological system, every element is interwoven with every other in a fine tapestry of symbols and ideas. This tapestry is the result of a set of correspondences between "the human form divine" and the rest of the universe. As Calame-Griaule says, "Man seeks his reflection in all mirrors of an anthropomorphic universe." Calame-Griaule's work stresses the order to be found in process and structure. Turner says that the social order he sought and found through his own fieldwork was seen as the result of social action rather than of knowledge, the latter varying with social situations. He confesses that he might have been extreme in his stress on the systematizing effect of social processes and admits that he has now found more order and consistency in Ndembu expressive culture. However, he suggests that Calame-Griaule has gone to the opposite extreme, and by stressing the cognitive or intellectual level of Dogon culture, has neglected the study of the social processes which make "day-to-day social adjustments possible."

- 1968 Review of *Thresholds of Initiation* by Joseph L. Henderson. *American Anthropologist* 70:1193-1194.

- 1968 *The Waters of Life: A Study of Zionist Water Symbolism. In Religions in Antiquity: Essays in Memory of Erwin Ramsdell Goodenough. Studies in the History of Religions, Supplements to Numen: International Review for the History of Religions, Number Fourteen.* Jacob Neusner, ed. pp. 506-520. Leiden, The Netherlands: E. J. Brill.

In this article, Turner returns to themes raised in previous articles, principally his work on color symbolism and liminality. First, from a comparison between symbols used by a traditional Zulu diviner in a ritual performed on one side of a river with those employed by a Zulu Zionist prophet in a ritual at the same time on the other side of the river, Turner abstracts the common properties and meanings of the symbolism of the color white and of water. He then compares these to similar symbols in ancient reli-

gions. This comparison points out a remarkable constancy in basic values ascribed to the symbolism. Three questions are raised, discussed, and tentatively answered: (1) Why does whiteness, which represents, *interalia*, purity, and purification, also have connections with sexual and bodily fluids such as semen and maternal waters? (2) What connection, if any, does symbolism maintain with social structure? and (3) What is the relationship between clusters of symbols used in traditional religious systems in stable societies and in similar clusters of symbols in new religious movements where societies are undergoing rapid change?

- 1969 Forms of Symbolic Action: Introduction. *In* Forms of Symbolic Action: Proceedings of the 1969 Annual Spring Meeting of the American Ethnological Society. Robert F. Spencer, ed. pp. 3-25. Seattle, Washington and London, England: University of Washington Press for the American Ethnological Society.

This introduction to a symposium on symbolic action is one of Turner's most complete statements on his theoretical position regarding the analysis of ritual symbols. His method of analysis in previous articles is once again presented here. Society is seen as existing to counter the forces of disorder that are inherent in the mammalian constitution of humans—Hobbes' *bellum omnes contra omnes*. Rituals put these very forces of disorder at the service of order, uniting the normative and the orectic through key symbols. There is also a discussion of the various papers presented at the symposium.

Review (of Spencer, ed.):

Leach, Edmund

1971 *American Anthropologist* 73:824-827.

- 1969 The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-Structure. The 1966 Lewis Henry Morgan Lectures at the University of Rochester. Chicago, Illinois: Aldine Publishing Company (also published in 1969 by Routledge and Kegan Paul, London).

Moving from detailed analyses of rituals among the Ndembu of Zambia to a discussion of millenarian movements, marginality, rituals of reversal, communes, and much more, Turner introduces and expands the themes of liminality and "communitas"; that is, society when it manifests itself as a relatively unstructured, undifferentiated comitatus, community, or even communion of equal individuals. These are themes which Turner briefly touched on in previous works, and which occupied the central position in the development of his ideas from the moment they were published here. This book is full of briefly-stated theories about the symbolism, dialectics, and meaning of the concepts of

liminality and *communitas*. The book has a "seminal" character of which Turner was probably conscious. His hopes that students and colleagues would develop (and exemplify) aspects of the theory have been largely fulfilled.

Reviews:

Gardener, Peter M.

1971 *Journal of American Folklore* 84(334):450-451.

Leslie, Charles

1970 *Symbolic Behavior*. Review of *The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-Structure* by Victor Turner. *Science* 168(3932):702-704.

Lewis, I. M.

1971 *Man* N.S. 6:306-307.

Schwartz, Theodore

1972 *American Anthropologist* 74:904-908.

Willis, R. G.

1971 *Africa* 41:70-71.

- 1969 Symbolization and Patterning in the Circumcision Rites of Two Bantu-Speaking Societies. In *Man in Africa*. Mary Douglas and Phyllis M. Kaberry, eds. pp. 229-244. London: Tavistock Publications (distributed in North America by Barnes and Noble, New York).

A comparison of key symbolic features of the rites surrounding male circumcision in two widely-separated Bantu-speaking societies, the Gisu of Uganda and the Ndembu of Zambia. Turner uses data from his own fieldwork among the Ndembu and from Dr. Jean La Fontaine's studies of the Gisu. He compares the ritual employment of "two symbol triads": finger millet yeast, chyme, and mud by the Gisu; and three species of trees, with their typical excretions, by the Ndembu. As is the case elsewhere in Turner's work, the meaning of these symbols must be found by "considering them in their operational social settings," and as indices and agents of social change. Turner carefully analyzes the circumcision rites of the two societies and the symbols they use in the context of contrasting social tensions. He concludes that Gisu circumcision rites serve to assimilate all other principles, including principles of consanguinity, affinity, and territoriality, to the central Gisu principle of patrilineality. At the same time, these rites liberate the novice from specific paternal authority. Among the matrilineal but virilocal Ndembu, circumcision rites sharply separate bonds between men from bonds between men and women. Ndembu circumcision rites stress paternity of a "maternal" rather than an authoritarian kind as a mediating link between local family ties (such as a matrilineage) as well as between the broader unities of vicinage and tribe.

Reviews (of Douglas and Kaberry, eds.):

Argyle, W. J.

1970 *Man* N.S. 5:146.

- Beattie, John
 1970 *Africa* 40:172-175.
 Ottenberg, Simon
 1970 *American Anthropologist* 72:1114-1116.

- 1971 *An Anthropological Approach to the Icelandic Saga. In The Translation of Culture: Essays to E. E. Evans-Pritchard. T. O. Beidelman, ed. pp. 349-374. London: Tavistock Publications (distributed in North America by Barnes and Noble, New York).*

In this essay, early Icelandic society is discussed in sociological terms using Icelandic literature of the saga period as a source, and with the aid of other historical studies of the period which make use of philology, archaeology, and other such tools. Turner's own study of the Ndembu of Zambia is used comparatively to describe and explain conflicts that arise from tensions within the social structure of Icelandic society.

Reviews (of Beidelman, ed.):

- Davis, J.
 1974 *Man N.S.* 9:638-640.
 Epstein, David G.
 1973 *American Anthropologist* 75:399-400.

- 1971 *Themes and Symbols in an Ndembu Hunter's Burial. In Themes in Culture: Essays in Honor of Morris E. Opler. Mario D. Zamora, J. M. Mahar, and Henry Orenstein, eds. Quezon City, The Philippines: Kayumangii Publishers.*

The relationship between cultural themes and ritual symbols is discussed with particular reference to an Ndembu hunter's burial ritual. Once again, the characteristics of ritual symbols and ways of analyzing them are presented. It is shown that as well as being significant of other symbols, cultural themes are significant of ritual symbols and are expressed in ritual symbols. Themes are energized through their embodiment in symbols which combine a physiological or orectic pole of sensory referents with many normative or evaluative significant in the structure of a system of semantic reference.

, ed.

- 1971 *Profiles of Change: African Society and Colonial Rule. In Colonialism in Africa, 1870-1960, Volume Three. Edited and with an introduction by Victor Turner. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.*

A collection of essays by anthropologists on the colonial situation in Africa.

- 1972 Foreword. *In Function, Purpose and Powers: Some Concepts in the Study of Individuals and Societies*. Second Edition. Dorothy Emmet, ed. pp. vii-xi. Philadelphia, Pennsylvania: Temple University Press.

Dorothy Emmet is a philosopher who was very involved with the seminars of the anthropology department at Manchester University in the 1950s while Turner was there. Turner was influenced by her, and relied on her for philosophical justification of his own excursions from the mainstream of anthropological theory. Her formulation: "A society is a process with some systematic characteristics, rather than a closely integrated system like an organism or a machine," was particularly congenial to Turner's own thought, since he had rebelled against contemporary structural-functionalist approaches to the study of society.

- 1972 *Passages, Margins, and Poverty: Religious Symbols of Communitas*. *Worship* 46(7):390-412 and 46(8):482-494. Reprinted in 1974 in *Dramas, Fields and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society* by Victor Turner, pp. 231-271. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

A theoretical discussion of the terms "communitas," "structure," "liminality," "outsiderhood," "marginality," and "structural inferiority," including the relationships between all of these. There is also a discussion of the symbols that typify these social states, with examples drawn from a wide field ranging from rock music and messianic movements to characters from Shakespearean and Chekhovian literature.

- 1973 *The Center Out There: Pilgrim's Goal*. *History of Religions* 12(3):191-230. Reprinted as "Pilgrimages as Social Processes" in *Dramas, Fields and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society* by Victor Turner, pp. 166-230. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

While focusing on pilgrimage systems in the major historical religions, this article examines the specific types of ritual symbols associated with religious pilgrimages and introduces the comparative study of pilgrimage processes. Although the article mainly deals with Christian pilgrimages (Mexico) and Hindu pilgrimages (Pandhar-pur), several others are mentioned. The work continues Turner's examination of social phenomena which are characterized by their liminality and the "communitas" in their social relations.

- 1973 Reply to "Analysis of Ritual: Metaphoric Correspondences as the Elementary Forms" by James Fernandez (Fernandez's

- comments on Turner's "Symbols in African Ritual"; see below). *Science* 182 (4119):1366-1367.
- 1973 Symbols in African Ritual. *Science* 179(4078):1100-1105. Reprinted in *Symbolic Anthropology: A Reader in the Study of Symbols and Meanings*. Janet L. Dolgin, David S. Kemnitzer, and David M. Schneider, eds. pp. 183-194. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Review** (of Dolgin, Kemnitzer, and Schneider, eds.): Parry, Keith
1979 *American Anthropologist* 81:955-966.

This article can be regarded as the ultimate synthesis in abbreviated form of Turner's work on African rituals. Rituals are pervasive in Africa and can be classified as: (1) seasonal or (2) contingent, including (a) life crisis and (b) rituals of affliction. Each African society has its own finite number of rituals drawn variously from these categories. Symbols in the rituals have the following attributes: (1) multiple meanings; (2) unification of apparently disparate significata; (3) condensation, where many things are represented simultaneously; and (4) polarization of significata, where the meanings are on a continuum from a normative or ideological pole to an orrectic or sensory pole. These symbols may represent a number of themes. Symbols that are extremely multivocal and central to a ritual are called dominant symbols, and tend to recur from ritual to ritual. Whichever of the many meanings of a symbol is the theme of a particular ritual depends on its relation to other symbols in the whole situation. Actors in a given ritual experience symbols as powers and meanings. These symbols have three dimensions: (1) the exegetic; (2) the operational; and (3) the positional. They also vary in the degree to which they correspond with each other from culture to culture. Among West African cultures such as the Dogon, everything is a symbol of everything else. However, social action in response to material pressures is always the systematic and systematizing factor. These ritual symbols are still efficacious in contemporary culture, as is witnessed by the imagery to be found in the writings of modern African novelists and in the rhetoric of politicians.

- 1973- Symbol, Myth, and Ritual Series. Victor Turner, ed.
on Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.
- Volumes in the Series:**
- Eliade, Mircea
1973 *Australian Religions: An Introduction*. Foreword by Victor Turner.
- Firth, Raymond
1973 *Symbols: Public and Private*. Foreword by Victor Turner.

- Manning, Frank E.
1973 *Black Clubs in Bermuda: Ethnography of a Play World*. Foreword by Victor Turner.
- Munn, Nancy D.
1973 *Walbiri Iconography: Graphic Representation and Cultural Symbolism in a Central Australian Society*. Foreword by Victor Turner.
- Deshin, Shlomo, and Moshe Shakeid
1974 *The Predicament of Homecoming: Cultural and Social Life of North African Immigrants in Israel*. Foreword by Victor Turner.
- Errington, Frederick K.
1974 *Karvar: Masks and Power in a Melanesian Ritual*. Foreword by Victor Turner.
- Myerhoff, Barbara G.
1974 *Peyote Hunt: The Sacred Journey of the Huichol Indians*. Foreword by Victor Turner.
- Turner, Victor
1974 *Dramas, Fields and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society* (see 1968, 1972, 1973 above; 1974 below).
Review:
Hanchett, Suzanne
1978 *American Anthropologist* 80:613-621.
- Falk Moore, Sally, and Barbara G. Myerhoff, eds.
1975 *Symbol and Politics in Communal Ideology: Cases and Questions*. Foreword by Victor Turner.
- Jules-Rossette, Vannetta
1975 *African Apostles: Ritual and Conversion in the Church of John Maronke*. Foreword by Victor Turner.
- Turner, Victor
1975 *Revelation and Divination in Ndembu Ritual*. Reprint of *Ndembu Divination: Its Symbolism and Techniques* (1961) and *Chihamba, the White Spirit: A Ritual Drama of the Ndembu* (1962), with a new introduction.
Reviews:
Hahn, Robert A.
1978 *American Anthropologist* 80:149-150.
Mair, Lucy
1977 *Man* N.S. 12:207-208.
- Grimes, Ronald
1976 *Symbol and Conquest: Public Ritual and Drama in Santa Fe, New Mexico*. Foreword by Victor Turner.
- Hiltebeidel, Alf
1976 *The Ritual of Battle: Krishna and the Mahabharata*. Foreword by Victor Turner.
- Babcock, Barbara A., ed.
1978 *The Reversible World: Symbolic Inversion in Art and Society*. Foreword and Comments and Conclusions by Victor Turner.

- 1974 Liminal to Liminoid, in Play, Flow, and Ritual: An Essay in Comparative Symbology. *Rice University Studies* 60(3): 53-92.
- 1974 Metaphors of Anti-Structure in Religious Culture. In *Changing Perspectives in the Scientific Study of Religion*. Allan W. Eister, ed. pp. 63-84. New York: Wiley. Reprinted in 1974 in *Dramas, Fields and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society* by Victor Turner, pp. 272-299. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press (see above).
Review (of Eister, ed.):
Buchdahl, David A.
1977 *American Anthropologist* 79:397-413.
- 1974 Pilgrimage and Communitas. *Studia Missionalia* 23:305-327.
- 1974 Ritual Paradigms and Political Action: Thomas Becket at the Council of Northampton. In *Dramas, Fields and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society* by Victor Turner, pp. 60-97. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.
- 1974 Symbols and Social Experience in Religious Ritual. *Studia Missionalia* 23:1-21.
- 1975 Ritual as Communication and Potency: An Ndembu Case Study. In *Symbols and Society: Essays on Belief Systems in Action*. Southern Anthropological Society Proceedings, Number Nine. Carole E. Hill, ed. pp. 58-81. Athens, Georgia: Southern Anthropological Society (distributed by the University of Georgia Press).
- 1975 Symbolic Studies. In *Annual Review of Anthropology*, Volume Four. Bernard J. Siegel, Alan R. Beals, and Stephen A. Tyler, eds. pp. 145-161. Palo Alto, California: Annual Reviews, Incorporated.

NOTES

1. Many of Victor Turner's books and articles have been translated and reprinted in the following languages: French, German, Italian, Japanese, Portuguese, Spanish, and Russian.
2. Help in proofreading this bibliography was kindly provided by Harriet Lyons of Wilfrid Laurier University.